IEEE 802ECSG  
Privacy Recommendation

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes of EC Privacy Recommendation SG Teleconference  October 21st, 2015 | | | | |
|  | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Karen Randall | Randall Consulting |  |  | [karen@randall-consulting.com](mailto:karen@randall-consulting.com) |
| Juan Carlos Zuniga | InterDigital |  |  | [j.c.zuniga@ieee.org](mailto:j.c.zuniga@ieee.org) |

Abstract

Minutes of the EC Privacy Recommendation SG teleconference on Wednesday, October 21st, 2015.

Chair: Juan Carlos Zuniga

Recording secretary: Karen Randall

**Call to order**

* Meeting called to order on at 10:06am EDT.
* The chair slides were posted:
* <https://mentor.ieee.org/privecsg/dcn/15/privecsg-15-0038>

**IEEE WG Guidelines**

* The chair read the IEEE guidelines and asked for declaration of Potentially Essential Patents.
  + No IPR issues were brought up

**Appointment of recording secretary**

* A call for an EC SG Secretary was made, but no one volunteered for the position
* Karen Randall volunteered to take notes
* No one opposed to recording meeting for keeping minutes

**Roll call**

|  |
| --- |
| **Name** |
| Juan Carlos Zuniga (Chair) |
| Carlos Bernardos |
| Mathieu Cunche |
| Soo Bum Lee |
| Piers O’Hanlon |
| Walter Pienciak |
| Karen Randall |
| Mick Seaman |

**Agenda**

* Welcome
* Chair's slides
  + IEEE Slides
  + Call meeting to order
* Group’s updates
  + IEEE 802 Privacy EC SG PAR/CSD -> IEEE 802.1 SEC TG
* Technical Topics
  + Threat Model for Privacy at Link Layer
  + Privacy Recommendations
  + Other
* Next Steps

JC asked if there were any comments on the minutes that had been uploaded.

**Agenda discussion**

Karen suggested adding a discussion about the IEEE P1912 (Privacy and Security Architecture for Consumer Wireless Devices) Working Group.

No other comments on the agenda.

JC reported that the IEEE SA Board approved the proposed PAR IEEE 802E, and it has been agreed to be adopted into the IEEE 802.1 Security group.

The Privacy EC SG will end life at November 2015 plenary meeting. He noted that the group is not done, just now changing gears. The main concepts that have been discussed in the SG will be captured in a draft to use moving forward. And the group will also continue discussions about the privacy threat model (e.g., referencing the IETF/IAB draft), functionalities to improve privacy, etc. It was mentioned that JC and Piers co-authored a contribution for discussion at this meeting.

The group would like to continue working with various WGs in IEEE 802 as well as external communities. It was recommended that the Privacy group meet during co-located meetings (e.g., Plenary meetings primarily) but will continue to meet via teleconference as well with advance announcement.

* **Technical topics**

Internet Privacy Recommendations - A Survey

Juan Carlos Zuniga (InterDigital), Piers O’Hanlon (Oxford Internet Institute)

<https://mentor.ieee.org/privecsg/dcn/15/privecsg-15-0039-00-0000-internet-privacy-recommendations-a-survey.docx>

This document captures some (Internet) privacy recommendations that have been developed in the industry recently. JC stepped through the contribution and reviewed the documents referenced:

* RFC 6973 – comprehensive view, misses some threats, still has some applicable concepts.
* RFC 7624 – more recent (post-2013) and has focus on pervasive surveillance. Particularly relevant is the description about the tracking of link-layer identifiers
* W3C Sec & Privacy Questionnaire – informal questionnaire to help understand security/privacy implications

This is a good starting point for Recommendations.

Mick S: seems to be more focus on higher layer stuff – not link/lower layers. “information that has been transferred”. It might be useful to state what we aren’t going to do in the IEEE 802E standard. For example, data that is outside our knowledge and control, stored data compromise. Suggest that “our data, our protocol” might be a good place to start.   
Mick also pointed out that the security considerations section of the MIB often touch on the data storage/access issue. But, we might want to think about expanding beyond MIB concerns.

Any other documents? Karen remarked that these ISO standards have been mentioned in P1912 and may be relevant (tho she hasn’t reviewed them):

* ISO 27018-2014: Information technology — Security techniques — Code of practice for protection of Personally Identifiable Information (PII) in public clouds acting as PII processors
* ISO 29100:2011, Information technology – Security techniques — Privacy framework
* **P1912**

Karen gave a brief overview of the IEEE P1912 (Privacy and Security Architecture for Consumer Wireless Devices Working Group) that has recently been formed. The group meets via teleconference call and is chaired by Lillie Coney, Bruce Corporation and US House of Representatives. The approved PAR scope is

*This standard describes a common communication architecture for diverse wireless communication devices such as, but not limited to, devices equipped with near field communication (NFC), home area network (HAN), wireless area network (WAN) wireless personal area network (WPAN) technologies or radio frequency identification technology (RFID) considering proximity; and specifies approaches for end user security through device discovery/recognition, simplification of user authentication, tracking items/people under user control/responsibility, and supports alerting; while supporting privacy through user controlled sharing of information independent of the underlying wireless networking technology used by the devices.*

Currently, the group is working on a list of Security Requirements. Cryptography, Multilayered Security, Monitoring and Metering Devices, Biometrics, Tamper Resistance/Detection, Network Security, Insider Threats, Backdoor Attacks, Manufacturer/Vendor Security, Security Culture, Vulnerability Monitoring, Vulnerability Mitigation, Spoofing, Hijacking, Countermeasures, Network Security, and much more.

Other document sections are

* Requirements for the Protection of Personal Data and Privacy (in particular relating to Fair Information Practices as well as ease of access, PI/PII data collection, mechanisms to secure PI/PII data, and more),
* Software Requirements,
* Engineering Requirements, and
* Other Uses.

There was concern that the PAR is quite broad and the group does not have a clear focus. The question of liaison with this group was discussed – do we want a liaison, how to liaise, does either group have documents ready to share, etc.

The next meeting of P1912 will be on Friday, November 6, 2015from 11:00 am until 1:00 pm ET. Join the meeting by using this link: <https://join.me/ieeesa_coney>. Contact Karen for more information.

The overview of the P1912 work led to further discussion about distinguishing between passive and active attacks. Is there technical input to legislation/policy that needs to be considered?

* **Next Steps**

Continue contributions. JC asked to please submit any contributions in time for review before the November meeting.

The Privacy group will now meet with IEEE 802.1 Security TG at the IEEE 802 Plenary meeting in Dallas, TX, November 9-13, 2015, with one dedicated privacy session (Tuesday evening) to allow for participation from other IEEE 802 working groups, which would be busy druing other slots.

Next teleconferences:

2 December 2015 (10:00 AM ET).

* **Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 11:03am