IEEE 802 EC SG  
Privacy Recommendation

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes of EC Privacy Recommendation SG Teleconference  January 12-16, 2015 | | | | |
|  | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Karen Randall | Randall Associates |  |  | [karen@randall-consulting.com](mailto:karen@randall-consulting.com) |
| Juan Carlos Zuniga | InterDigital |  |  | [j.c.zuniga@ieee.org](mailto:j.c.zuniga@ieee.org) |

Abstract

Minutes of the EC Privacy Recommendation SG face-to-face meeting during the IEEE 802 January 2015 Interim meeting in Atlanta, GA, USA.

**Tuesday, January 13th, 2015**

Chair: Juan Carlos Zuniga

Recording secretary: Karen Randall

**Call to order**

* Meeting called to order at 19:32 hrs.
* The chair slides were posted:
* <https://mentor.ieee.org/privecsg/dcn/15/privecsg-15-0003>

**IEEE WG Guidelines**

* The chair read the IEEE guidelines and asked for declaration of Potentially Essential Patents.
  + No IPR issues were brought up

**Appointment of recording secretary**

* Karen Randall volunteered to take notes

**Agenda**

* Welcome
* Chair's slides
  + IEEE Slides
  + Call meeting to order
* Group’s updates
  + Local Space Address SG (802c PAR)
* Technical Presentations
  + IETF MAC Address Randomization Trial Results and Next Steps
  + Secure Moderated Random MAC Addresses
  + Privacy Threat Model
* Next Steps

**Minutes**

* November Plenary and Dec 10 teleconference minutes were approved with no comments.
* Approval of minutes as posted: 9/0/1

**Group’s updates**

* **IEEE 802c PAR**
* Juan Carlos noted that continuing discussion on IEEE 802c PAR is occurring in Local Address Study Group. That SG is planning to develop a PAR and CSD text. Anyone interested in this topic is encouraged to participate and express opinions directly in the LASG.
* **WiFi Privacy Experiment at IETF 91**
* Juan Carlos provided an overview on the WiFi Privacy network experiment held during IETF91 in November 2014. Updated presentation is available at
* [*https://mentor.ieee.org/privecsg/dcn/14/privecsg-14-0025-01-0000-wifi-privacy-network-experiment-at-ietf91.pptx*](https://mentor.ieee.org/privecsg/dcn/14/privecsg-14-0025-01-0000-wifi-privacy-network-experiment-at-ietf91.pptx)
* Plans are to:
* repeat the trial at next IETF meeting in Dallas in March.
* prepare a “wish list” for network administrators of future trial experiments.
* prepare address randomization tools for more platforms/OSes, including mobile ones (e.g., Android)
* make a more detailed study of collision effects under different scenarios. At this trial, there were forced collisions in a constrained environment; would like to have more to study. is there a need to change the script to see collisions?
* Probably hold trial at the IEEE interim meeting in May in Vancouver.
* Dan Harkins suggested that DCN 11-14-0367-02-000m-privacy-enhancements might be useful. He also noted that there is also a corresponding presentation at 11-14-0430-02-000m-random-macs-for-privacy.
* **Secure Moderated Random MAC Addresses**
* Bob Moskowitz presented on Secure Moderated Random MAC Addresses, available at:
* <https://mentor.ieee.org/privecsg/dcn/14/privecsg-14-0026-01-0000-secure-moderated-random-mac-addresses.ppt>
* He noted that this is a revised version from Dec 10 telecon. The problem statement is that it is a free-for-all in Local Scope MAC address space and randomized address selection has no method of dealing with collisions. This proposal is for an enhanced Moderator Protocol.
* **Next Steps**
* Proposed Next Steps for the Privacy SG is to consider developing a PAR/CSD on recommended privacy practices for IEEE 802 protocols. Will continue the call for proposals to discuss technical topics.
* Paul Nikolich suggested that the group consider the possible scope of the draft PAR at this meeting. JC agreed to generate a scope, purpose and CSD for review at the next meeting slot on Thursday evening.
* Paul also asked if the draft PAR goes forward, which WG would be the most likely home for this work?
* JC: if scope will apply to all of IEEE 802, then either IEEE 802.1 or new WG.

Meeting recessed at 20:57 hrs

**Thursday, January 15th, 2015**

The second session was called to order at 19:37 hrs on Thurs, January 15, 2015.

This session will review the proposal for PAR and CSD text. Draft generated by JC was posted to mentor site ([dcn 15-0005-privacy-recommendation-PAR-proposal](https://mentor.ieee.org/privecsg/dcn/15/privecsg-15-0004-00-0000-privacy-recommendation-par-csd-proposal.pptx)). If there is agreement, it can be considered for approval at the March Plenary. No need to rush; can decide after next teleconference call.

Suggested TITLE

IEEE Recommended Practice for Information technology-- Telecommunications and information exchange between systems-- Local and metropolitan area networks: Privacy considerations for IEEE 802 Protocols.

Brian Weis commented that Paul N recommended a threat model/analysis.

JC - yes, privacy threat model/analysis and recommendations to mitigate those threats.

Pat Thaler – may prefer to see a PAR for a threat model then mitigations could follow.

Brian Weis – commented that his observation is that this is too broad. want to tightly describe solutions.

Will coordinate with IETF (and ISOC) on threat model; model should be similar but may have some slight differences (IEEE deals with over the air, for example). So recommendations could complement.

Agreed that to try to get the detailed threat model set between now and July.

SCOPE

Considerations for designers of new protocols and advice for future protocols. Not looking at current protocols at this time. Some follow-on work to look at current protocols?

*This document specifies a privacy threat model for IEEE 802 protocols and provides recommendations for protocol developers and implementers on how to protect against privacy threats.*

PURPOSE

*The recommended practice document will provide recommendations to address privacy threats applicable to link layer technologies, including threats such as Surveillance, Monitoring, Stored Data Compromise, Intrusion, Misattribution, Correlation, Identification, Secondary Use, Disclosure and Exclusion.*

NEED

fourth bullet: *This document will provide recommendations on how to consider privacy as part of protocol design and implementation*

Reviewed all proposed text again with some word-smithing and editing. Revised version will be uploaded to ECPrivacy site on Mentor.

Some discussion about which WG should be assigned the PAR. Think IEEE 802.1. If so, will be a good idea to present to the full IEEE 802.1 group; present at the IEEE 802.1 opening plenary at the March meeting for consideration, comments. Then will have 2 sessions at the meeting for technical discussion (possibly Tuesday evening and Thursday morning), followed by the IEEE 802.1 closing plenary on Thursday afternoon.

Glenn Parsons – think more than the PAR needs to be considered. SG status: done in Berlin or extended? And will need to recommend if the proposed PAR will be in IEEE 802.1 security task group or a separate task group. SG can pre-circulate a PAR for IEEE 802.1 and submit it to the EC before March OR can present everything to IEEE 802.1 first and refine prior to submission in July.

Pat Thaler recommended pre-circulating PAR/CSD for approval in March.

Next steps

* refine PAR, CSD
* continue to work on threat model
* any other tech presentations
* do want to continue the trial… present at the teleconferences

Teleconference calls on February 4, 25 at 10am ET.

Privacy SG will have face to face meeting at the March Plenary in Berlin; expect to present at the WG1 opening plenary on Monday; a SG session on Tuesday (evening), Thursday (morning), and then the closing IEEE 802.1 plenary (Thursday afternoon).

* Meeting adjourned at 21:14 hrs