IEEE 802ECSG  
OmniRAN

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes of OmniRAN EC SG Meeting in Dallas, TX, USA | | | | |
| Date: November 12-14, 2013 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Juan Carlos Zuniga | InterDigital | 1000 Sherbrooke W  10th Floor  Montreal, QC, Canada | +1 (514) 904 6300 | j.c.zuniga@ieee.org |

Abstract

Minutes of the OmniRAN EC SG meeting from November 12th to 14th, 2013.

**Tuesday, November 12th, 2013**

Chair: Max Riegel

Recording secretary: Juan Carlos Zuniga

**Call to order**

* Meeting called to order on Tuesday November 12th by Max Riegel at 13:35 hrs (CST).

**Appointment of secretary**

* Secretary position remains open a no volunteer showed up.
* Juan Carlos Zuniga volunteered to take notes

**Roll Call**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Name** | **Affiliation** |
| Max Riegel | NSN |
| Juan Carlos Zuniga | InterDigital |
| Walter Pienciak | IEEE SA |
| Farrokh Khatibi | Qualcomm |
| Behcet Sarikaya | Huawei |
| Anthony Chan | Huawei |
| Charles Perkins | Futurewei |
| Daniel Borges | Apple |
| Filip Mestanov | Ericsson |
| Jeffrey Handal | LSU |
| Yonggang Fang | ZTE |
| Diego Vincentin | Princeton University |
| Antonio de la Oliva | UC3M |
| Paul Congdon | Tallac |
| Zhuang Yan | Huawei |
| Lisa Perry | IEEE SA |
| Hyunho Park | ETRI |
| Hyeong-Ho Lee | ETRI |
| Michael Montemurro | Blackberry |
| Jongsup Baek | LG |

**Agenda**

* <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0088-01-ecsg-nov-2013-dallas-f2f-meeting-slides.pptx>
  + Call Meeting to Order
  + Attendance recording, secretary
  + Approval of minutes
  + Reports
  + Technical presentations on OmniRAN related matters
  + Comment resolution and responses on PAR & 5C comments
  + Organizational set-up requirements
  + Liaison activities
  + Presentation to closing EC meeting
  + Conditional extension of OmniRAN EC SG
  + AOB
  + Adjourn
    - Comment resolution will happen in Wed AM1 and PM1 meeting
    - Technical presentation on Tue PM1 meeting
* Organizational requirements and liaison activities added to the agenda for Thu AM1 meeting
* Farrokh and Paul proposed corrections.
* Amended agenda approved without objections

**Approval of minutes**

* <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0087-00-ecsg-meeting-minutes-for-10-october-2013-teleconference.docx>
* Minutes of Oct 10th call approved without objections

**Technical Reports**

* Max Riegel: Presentation to 802.1
  + <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0090-00-ecsg-nov2013-opening-report-to-8021.pptx>
  + To introduce OmniRAN to University Outreach participants chair went through complete slideset comprising also slides presented to EC and contained for reporting in this slide deck.
* Discussion:
  + Charles: Can be an issue if this OmniRAN group would meet on F2F meetings with 802.1
    - Max: this kind of discussion is scheduled for Thursday, although the understanding is that the group will meet with the wireless guys
  + Farrokh: Why not in 802.21?
    - Max: OmniRAN has a close relationship with bridging and security functions, which belong to 802.1
* Max Riegel: Presentation to 802 EC
  + <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0089-00-ecsg-nov2013-ec-opening-report.pptx>
  + Short presentation to show content of report
  + Following reporting slides were skipped as already presented.
* Paul Congdon: Communications with ONF
  + OmniRAN considered officially as one of the Use Cases considered by the ONF Wireless and Mobile WG
* Juan Carlos Zuniga: Communications with IETF
  + OmniRAN PAR presented at the Internet Area WG. Brian Haberman, Internet Area Director for IETF, encouraged strongly the IETF mobility community to participate in IEEE OmniRAN in the future.

**Technical presentations on OmniRAN related matters**

* Yonggang Fang: IEEE 802 OmniRAN Architecture Proposal
  + <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0067-00-0000-omniran-architecture-suggestions.pptx>
  + Presentation created discussions about relation and scope of OmniRAN
    - Proposal is not comprehensive in providing rationale for the split between control plane and management plane.
    - 3GPP related examples are out of scope of OmniRAN, as OmniRAN exclusively addresses existing IEEE 802 technologies

**Comment resolution and responses on PAR & 5C comments**

* Comment resolution and responses on PAR & 5C comments starts in Wed AM1 meeting
* Comments will be submitted until Tue, 5pm
* Chair will assemble and sort received comments in spreadsheet after 5pm and will upload document probably at about Tue 7pm for preparation of discussions on Wednesday
* Participants are kindly asked to browse spreadsheet and consider potential solutions before Wed AM1 meeting.

Meeting recessed at 15:30 hrs (CT)

**Wednesday, November 13th, 2013 AM1**

**Call to order**

* Meeting called to order on Wednesday November 13th by Max Riegel at 8:05 hrs (CST).

**Comment resolution and responses on PAR & 5C comments, cont.**

* Comment resolution sheet containing comments submitted until the deadline on Tue 5pm as uploaded by chair on Tue, 7:37pm
  + <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0091-00-ecsg-nov-2013-collected-comments-on-draft-par-proposal.xlsx>
* Max: Comments received by private email after the deadline and not distributed to the 802 EC reflector will not be considered, however the submitter can bring up his concerns and proposals during the discussion of the comments.
  + Charlie: After a discussion with Paul Nikolich, the understanding was that I could send comments about the PAR.
  + Max: Individuals can indeed send comments, but your comments were send 7 hours after the deadline and were not channeled through the EC, as requested.
  + Charlie: Can I ask the EC for consideration?
  + Max: Yes, we can ask the EC what to do about these comments.
* Group reviewed comment by comment in the spreadsheet, introduced appropriate changes to the PAR text and captured agreed resolution in the last columns of the comments spreadsheet.
* Spreadsheet with comment resolution as agreed in the meeting:  
  <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0091-01-ecsg-nov-2013-collected-comments-on-draft-par-proposal.xlsx>
* PAR text with modifications as agreed in the meeting:  
  <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0086-01-ecsg-proposed-par-and-5c.docx>
* Meeting recessed at 10:02 hrs (CT)

**Wednesday, November 13th, 2013 PM1**

**Call to order**

* Meeting called to order on Wednesday November 13th by Max Riegel at 13:30 hrs (CST).

**Comment resolution and responses on PAR & 5C comments, cont.**

* Group continued the review comment by comment in the spreadsheet, introduced appropriate changes to the PAR and 5C text and captured agreed resolution in the last columns of the comments spreadsheet.
* Spreadsheet with comment resolution as agreed in the meeting:  
  <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0091-02-ecsg-nov-2013-collected-comments-on-draft-par-proposal.xlsx>
* PAR and 5C text with modifications as agreed in the meeting:  
  <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0086-02-ecsg-proposed-par-and-5c.docx>
* Motion to approve the outcome of the comment resolution:

*The OmniRAN EC SG approves the documents*

* + [*https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0091-02-ecsg-nov-2013-collected-comments-on-draft-par-proposal.xlsx*](https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0091-02-ecsg-nov-2013-collected-comments-on-draft-par-proposal.xlsx)
  + [*https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0086-02-ecsg-proposed-par-and-5c.docx*](https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0086-02-ecsg-proposed-par-and-5c.docx)

*as the outcome and the conclusion of the comment resolution on the draft PAR proposal submitted to EC on Oct. 10th subject to editorial clean-up by the chair.*

* + Moved: Paul Congdon, Tallac
  + Seconded: Jeffry Handal, LSU
  + Motion carried by 10y/0n/2a
* Meeting recessed at 15:42 hrs(CT)

**Thursday, November 14th, 2013**

**Call to order**

* Meeting called to order on Thursday November 14th by Max Riegel at 8:10 hrs (CT).

**Organizational set-up requirements**

* Max Riegel introduced the topic by bringing up his initial thoughts captured on slide 18 of  
  <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0088-01-ecsg-nov-2013-dallas-f2f-meeting-slides.pptx>
* Group discussion on organizational setup arrangements led to a list of issues to be considered for setting up the OmniRAN project within IEEE 802.1
* Organizational set-up requirements:
  + Group status
    - Project assigned to TG within 802.1 named ‘OmniRAN TG’
  + Co-location of F2F sessions
    - OmniRAN TG SHOULD meet on interims with the wireless WGs
    - Depending on topic needs OmniRAN TG MAY decide to meet at interim with the other 802.1 TGs
  + Alignment of meeting schedules
    - Avoid scheduling OmniRAN at plenary meeting slots of the other WGs
    - Should meet during usual meeting hours during the day (not regularly pushed out in evening meetings)
    - Keep F2F meetings focused (usually max 4x 2-hours meetings during a F2F)
  + Conference calls
    - Should be used whenever feasible to allow participation out of other WGs
    - Using WebEX
    - Setting up an IEEE 802 wide calendar of electronic meetings to avoid collisions
  + Arrangement of agenda to enable ‘joint’ meetings
    - Specific text in agenda
    - Define precisely the question, which should be discussed and clarified
    - Solicitate participation of experts of other WGs
  + Mailing list
    - Maintain separate mailing list for OmniRAN
    - Move over current subscribers to the new list
  + Attendance credits
    - Initial voting rights in the TG when moving over to 802.1 to be set up
    - Attendance credits for teleconferences?
    - Reciprocal credits for F2F meetings
  + Communication to the WGs
    - Liaison person for each of the WGs
    - Only for communication, no special role in balloting process
  + Peer groups in the WGs
    - If peer groups are available (like 11ARC), they should be specifically addressed
  + Participation in ballots
    - Commenting in the TG/WG ballots open to whole 802
  + Participation in the votings
    - Voting reserved to the members of 802.1
  + Access to the documents
    - Keep mentor
  + Submission of documents
    - Can happen without interception by the TG chair
    - Maintain current templates

**Presentation to closing EC meeting**

* Chair will put slides together based on the following facts:
  + Draft PAR proposal (PAR + 5C) submitted to EC on Oct 10th
  + 44 comments received until Tue, 5pm CT
  + All comments addressed and resolved
    - Most leading to modifications in the text of PAR and 5C
  + Revised PAR proposal submitted to EC before Wed, 5pm CT
  + Presentation to 802.1 to support the idea that 802.1 is running the project
  + Discussions in OmniRAN EC SG how to keep interested people engaged in the project
    - EC SG participants mainly members of the wireless WGs
    - Results to be discussed with 802.1 and in the EC workshop
  + Motions:
    - Two motions on approval of PAR and extension of ECSG

**Extension of OmniRAN EC SG**

* What happens when PAR gets approved?
* Two options:
  + Extend OmniRAN EC SG until March 2014 to allow the group to further develop the foundation of the project until PAR is approved by NesCom.
  + Less preferred solution would be to establish Study Group in IEEE 802.1 to allow OmniRAN to to further develop the foundation of the project until PAR is approved by NesCom.
* OmniRAN EC SG prefers to get extension until March because of established environment.
* Motion to extend ECSG until March 2014:

*Extend OmniRAN EC SG until March 2014 to allow the group to further develop the foundation of the project until PAR is approved by NesCom.*

* + Moved: Harry Bims, Bims Labs.
  + Seconded: Juan Carlos Zuniga, Interdigital
  + Motion carries by 9y/0n/0a.

**AOB**

* no other topics brought up

**Adjournment**

* Meeting adjourned at 10:03 CST