IEEE P802.22  
Wireless RANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Meeting Minutes of the IEEE 802.22a and IEEE 802.22b ISO PSDO Ballot Comment Resolutions | | | | |
| Date: 2016-07-21 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Company | Address | Phone | email |
| Apurva Mody | WhiteSpace Alliance |  |  | [Apurva.mody@WhiteSpaceAlliance.org](mailto:Apurva.mody@WhiteSpaceAlliance.org) |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document provides the minutes of the ISO IEEE 802.22a and IEEE 802.22b Comment Resolutions for the PSDO Process

**1. July 21st 2016 –**

**Notice:** This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.22. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.

**Release:** The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE’s name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE’s sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.22.

**Patent Policy and Procedures:** The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802 Patent Policy and Procedures

<[**http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws/sb-bylaws.pdf**](http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws/sb-bylaws.pdf)>, including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard." Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair <[**Carl R. Stevenson**](mailto:carl.stevenson@ieee.org)> as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.22 Working Group. **If you have questions, contact the IEEE Patent Committee Administrator at <**[**patcom@ieee.org**](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)**>**.

1. Attendance

Apurva N. Mody (WhiteSpace Alliance)

Chang-woo Pyo (NICT)

Mike Cotton (NTIA)

Roger Hislop (Data Dimension)

William Suriaputra (Cognitive Systems)

Jerry Kalke (CBS)

Gianfranco Miele (University of Pegaso)

Gabriel Villardi (NICT)

Ranga Reddy (Chair, IEEE 802.22a Task Group)

Masayaki Oodo (NICT)

2.1 Agenda

* Attendance
* IEEE Patents and Anti-Trust Policy
* ISO/IEC/JTC1 Standardization of 802.22a and 802.22b under the IEEE PSDO Process. Comments and Resolutions
* New business

Reference Document:

[11-16-0761-00-0jtc-ieee-802-jtc1-sc-agenda-for-july-2016.pptx](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/16/11-16-0761-01-0jtc-ieee-802-jtc1-sc-agenda-for-july-2016.pptx)

**Minutes and Discussions**

* Dr. Apurva N. Mody, Chair of the IEEE 802.22 WG called the Meeting to order at 10 am ET
* Attendance Taken
* The Chair discussed the IEEE Patents and Anti-Trust Policy

**MOTION**

Move to Approve the Agenda as shown above.

Move: Jerry Kalke

Second: Chang-woo Pyo

Any objection.

No objections heard

Motion Passes

* Agenda - IEEE 802.22a and IEEE 802.22b

**IEEE 802.22a ISO/IEC/JTC1 Comments and Resolutions**

* IEEE 802.22a 60-day pre-ballot passed on 3 April 2016 but a response is required
* Drafts sent to SC6: sent
* IEEE 802.22a was liaised in July 2015 to SC6 to allow them to become familiar with it before submission for approval under the PSDO process
* 60-day pre-ballot: passed on 3 April 2016 and a response is required
* IEEE 802.22a was submitted for 60-day ballot in December 2015, and after a delay the ballot passed on 3 April 2016 (N16414)
* Support need for ISO standard? Passed 10/0/8
* Support this submission being sent to FDIS? 9/1/8
* The only substantive comment was the usual security related comment from the China NB
* **The China NB has submitted their usual security comment in relation to 802.22a**
* **China NB comment 1**
  + *The security in both ISO/IEC/IEEE 802.22a (6N16378) and ISO/IEC/IEEE 802.22b (6N16379) is based on IEEE 802.1X. Since the technical concerns China NB proposed in 6N15555 still haven’t been reasonably disposed in this text, China NB has to vote against on this ballot*
* **China NB request 1**
  + *Remove the IEEE 802.1X-2010-related descriptions from the text.*
* **Proposed IEEE 802 response to China NB comment & request 1**
* The China NB has requested that IEEE 802.1X-2010 related descriptions are removed from the text of IEEE 802.22a.
* IEEE 802 declines to make this change because:
* IEEE 802.22a does not contain any IEEE 802.1X-2010 related descriptions and does not require conformance to or use IEEE 802.1X-2010
* There is no technical justification to remove any IEEE 802.1X-2010 related descriptions from any standard
* While the base IEEE 802.22-2011 specification does reference various IEEE 802.1 specifications including IEEE 802.1X, only IEEE 802.1Q is referenced directly in IEEE 802.22a. IEEE 802.1Q explains how it can be used in conjunction with IEEE 802.1X. However, conformance to and use of IEEE 802.1X is not a requirement of any of the possible claims of conformance to IEEE 802.1Q.
* IEEE 802 recognizes that the China NB has asserted this in past that man-in-the-middle (and other) attacks are possible against IEEE 802.1X based systems. However, the technical details of such an attack (or a demonstration of an attack) have not yet been supplied by the China NB. In the absence of technical substantiation of the claims, there is no justification to remove references to IEEE 802.1X-2010 from any standard.

**MOTION 802.22a**

Move to Approve the Proposed IEEE 802 Response in regards to the ISO Approval of the IEEE 802.22a Standard to the China NB Comment 1 and Request 1 as contained in Document [11-16-0761-00-0jtc-ieee-802-jtc1-sc-agenda-for-july-2016.pptx](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/16/11-16-0761-01-0jtc-ieee-802-jtc1-sc-agenda-for-july-2016.pptx)

Move: Jerry Kalke

Second: Chang-woo Pyo

Approve: 6

Disapprove: 0

Abstain: 1 (Apurva N. Mody)

Motion Passes

**IEEE 802.22b ISO/IEC/JTC1 Comments and Resolutions**

* IEEE 802.22b 60-day pre-ballot passed on 3 April 2016 but a response is required
* **Drafts sent to SC6: sent**
* IEEE 802.22b was liaised in July 2015 to SC6 to allow them to become familiar with it before submission for approval under the PSDO process
* **60-day pre-ballot: passed on 3 April 2016 and a response is required**
* IEEE 802.22b was submitted for 60-day ballot in December 2015, and after a delay the ballot passed on 3 April 2016 (N16415)
* Support need for ISO standard? Passed 9/1/8
* Support this submission being sent to FDIS? 8/2/8
* Substantive comments were received from China NB & Japan NB
* **China NB comment 1**
* *The security in both ISO/IEC/IEEE 802.22a (6N16378) and ISO/IEC/IEEE 802.22b (6N16379) is based on IEEE 802.1X. Since the technical concerns China NB proposed in 6N15555 still haven’t been reasonably disposed in this text, China NB has to vote against on this ballot*
* **China NB request 1**
* *Remove the IEEE 802.1X-2010-related descriptions from the text.*
* **IEEE 802 response to China NB comment & request 1**
* The China NB has requested that IEEE 802.1X-2010 related descriptions are removed from the text of IEEE 802.22b.
* IEEE 802 declines to make this change because:
* IEEE 802.22b does not contain any IEEE 802.1X-2010 related descriptions
* There is no technical justification to remove any IEEE 802.1X-2010 related descriptions from any standard
* While the base IEEE 802.22-2011 specification does reference various IEEE 802.1 specifications including IEEE 802.1X, IEEE 802.22b includes no such references.
* IEEE 802 recognizes that the China NB has asserted this in past that man-in-the-middle (and other) attacks are possible against IEEE 802.1X based systems. However, the technical details of such an attack (or a demonstration of an attack) have not yet been supplied by the China NB. In the absence of technical substantiation of the claims, there is no justification to remove references to IEEE 802.1X-2010 from any standard.
* **Japan NB comment 1**
* *There is Radio Act before using the frequency band for analog television broadcasting service in Japan.*
* **Japan NB request 1**
* *Align technology with Radio Act.*
* **IEEE 802 response to Japan NB comment & request 1**
* *During the next revision of IEEE 802.22b, IEEE 802.22 will add a paragraph in an Annex that will ensure that 802.22 systems will adhere to the Japanese Radio Act for co-existence with the analog TV*

**MOTION 802.22b**

Move to Approve the Proposed IEEE 802 Response in regards to the ISO Approval of the IEEE 802.22b Standard to the China NB Comment 1 and Request 1, and Japan NB Comment 1 and Request 1 as contained in Document [11-16-0761-00-0jtc-ieee-802-jtc1-sc-agenda-for-july-2016.pptx](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/16/11-16-0761-01-0jtc-ieee-802-jtc1-sc-agenda-for-july-2016.pptx)

Move: Chang-woo Pyo

Second: Jerry Kalke

Approve: 6

Disapprove: 0

Abstain: 1 (Apurva N. Mody)

Motion Passes