|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Project | **IEEE 802.21.1 Media Independent Services:****<http://www.ieee802.org/21/>**  |
| Title | **Mandatory Editorial Coordination Review for P802.21.1** |
| DCN | **21-16-0092-00-0000\_MEC\_Review** |
| Date Submitted | **July 28, 2016** |
| Source(s) | Subir DasApplied Communication Sciences 150 Mount Airy Road, Basking Ridge, NJ 07920 | Voice:+1 908 748 2483Fax: +1 908 748 2482Mailto: sdas@appcomsci.com |
| Re: | IEEE 802.21.1 Media Independent Services  |
| Abstract | This document provides the IEEE-SA MEC review comments for Draft D03 |
| Purpose | To complete the IEEE-SA MEC review process  |
| Notice | This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE 802.21 Working Group. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. |
| Release | The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE’s name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE’s sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that IEEE 802.21 may make this contribution public. |
| Patent Policy | The contributor is familiar with IEEE patent policy, as outlined in [Section 6.3 of the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual](http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3) <<http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3>> and in *Understanding Patent Issues During IEEE Standards Development* <*http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-material.html* >. |

Re: Pre-ballot Mandatory Editorial Coordination (Pre-ballot MEC)

Dear Mr. Das:

I have reviewed Draft 3 of IEEE P802.21.1™, and I have the following comments. Please note that this review has been organized into two sections and uses the “language of standards” to communicate necessary requirements (shall) of the IEEE-SA standards process versus those issues that are voluntary (should) in nature.

**Section I: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the ballot begins**

The draft cannot be balloted or recirculated until these issues are resolved. Your Staff Liaison will review the updated draft for compliance prior to upload of the PDF for ballot.

**NOTE—Fonts shall be embedded in the draft PDF. Instructions on creating a PDF with embedded fonts can be
 found at:** <http://standards.ieee.org/develop/stdswritten.html>

**Section II: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the final recirculation**

These issues have to be resolved and viewed by balloters. The items will be checked for completion by the Project Editor during the Sponsor ballot, then checked by the Review Committee (RevCom) of the IEEE-SA Standards Board (IEEE-SASB), and will impact approval unless rectified.

Working groups who wish to have a draft that is very close to the published document may want to implement these changes. However, the comments should not affect the approval of the standard.

*Please note that professional editing takes place once the document has been approved and, as such, this MEC does not address all of the editorial items that will be reviewed then (i.e., punctuation, grammar, formatting).*

|  |
| --- |
| The following comments are derived from the *IEEE Standards Style Manual*. The complete *IEEE Standards Style* *Manual,* in viewable/downloadable format, can be found at:<https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf> |

**SECTION I: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the ballot begins:**

**Copyright**

* If applicable, all copyright permission for excerpted text, tables, and figures shall be submitted to the IEEE prior to the start of ballot. If there are missing permission response letters, please submit them immediately to me p.gibbons@ieee.org

**Sample permission letters can be found in Annex A of the** [*IEEE Standards Style* *Manual*](https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf) ***or*** [*http://standards.ieee.org/develop/stdsreview.html*](http://standards.ieee.org/develop/stdsreview.html)*.* **More information on the IEEE SA Copyright Policy can be found at:** <http://standards.ieee.org/ipr/copyright.html>

**Standards designation**

* The correct standard designation and date shall appear on the top of every page, including the body of the standard.

IEEE PXXXX/DX, Month 20XX

**General**

* The draft shall be complete with no missing figures, tables, equations, text, etc.

**SECTION II: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the final recirculation**

**LEGAL REVIEW**

Conduct a legal review of terms such as *safe*, *safety*, *caution*, cost, buy, purchase, warrant, and *warning*. Important safety information should never appear in informative text, notes, or footnotes. Search on the following words (found in doc 2).

**Legal: “Absolute” verbiage**

* Please review the text for any explicit or implicit guarantees made within the document, especially those that are safety-related. Avoid making guarantees if there is a possibility of unforeseen situations or circumstances altering an outcome. For example, words such as “ensure,” “guarantee,” “maximize,” minimize,” etc., should be modified, if they are inaccurate. Substitutions might include “reduce” or “improve.” For example, “to ensure safety” might be changed to “to improve safety” or “to prevent” might be changed to “to reduce.”

**Trademarks or service marks**

* Please review the use of trademarks in the draft, if applicable. References to commercial equipment or products in a standard shall be generic and shall not include trademarks or other proprietary designations. Where a sole source exists for essential equipment or materials, it is permissible to supply the name of the trademark owner in a footnote. The proper use guidelines for trademarks shall be determined by the trademark owner. Trademark owners must grant written permission before their trademarks may be referenced in a standard.
* Trademarks or other proprietary designations that are not commercial equipment or products should be avoided in standards. If used however, all trademarks shall be credited to the trademark owner in the front matter of the standard. The following text shall introduce any mention of specific trademark information:

The following information is given for the convenience of users of this standard and does not constitute

an endorsement by the IEEE of these products. Equivalent products may be used if they can be shown

to lead to the same results.

**For more information on commercial terms and conditions see the IEEE-SA Policy on commercial terms set forth in 6.2 of the IEEE-SA** [*Standards Board Operations Manual*](http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/opman/sb_om.pdf)***.***

**Registration objects**

* If the draft contains a registration of objects (for additional information, visit the IEEE Standards Web site <http://standards.ieee.org/regauth/index.html>), the working group shall submit the document to the IEEE Registration Authority (IEEE-RA) for mandatory coordination (submit to a.n.thomas@ieee.org for review). The text containing the registration information should be highlighted in the draft and the clause should be noted in the email. If the working group believes that the draft may potentially contain a registration of objects or if the working group would like information about setting up a registration, contact the IEEE-RA as early as possible to prevent a delay in approval by the IEEE-SA Standards Board. Search on the following words: object identifier, unique identifier, and assignment of unique numbers.

**Verbs**

* Review use of will/must in all standards; use of shall/should/may/can for recommended practices and guides.
	+ Shall (Standards)
	+ Should (Recommended Practice)
	+ May/can (Guide)
	+ You have a large number of “can”s and “may”s in this draft. Pleaser review and revise as “shall” where appropriate.
	+ You have 13 instances of “must” and 48 instances of the “will.” Pleaser review and revise as “shall” where appropriate.

**More information on use of shall/ should/may/ and can is found in 10.2.2 of the** [*IEEE Standards Style Manual*](https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf)*.*

**Normative and informative text**

* Review normative and informative text; address references and bibliography, use of shall in informative text (notes, footnotes, etc.), instances where normative and informative text are interwoven in clauses or annexes.

**Normative references and bibliography**

* All citations in Clause 2 shall be normatively referenced within the body of the document, and that citations within the text that are informative belong in the bibliography. Have working groups check for proper placement (**See 10.5 of the** [*IEEE Standards Style Manual*](https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf)*).*
* All of your normative references are dated but almost none of the citations to them are. If the date of the version is significant, please make sure to also date the citations. If the date is not important, and the most recent version of the standard will suffice, please undate the references in Clause 2.

**Graphics**

* Point out instances where the quality of line art and photos do not comply with the requirements outlined in Clause 14 of the [*IEEE Standards Style Manual*](https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf).
* Separate electronic files of figures shall be supplied (unless created in Word or Framemaker)

**Please note that the following are next steps for this project.**

**a) After you have implemented this review, create the pdf that will be used for ballot (remember that the draft number shall be rolled to reflect that changes have been made to this document, e.g., P1234™/Dx+1).**

**b) Upon completion of the invitation to ballot please follow the next steps:**

**Instructions:**
1. Login to myProject and click the **Balloting** tab
2. Click **Initiate Sponsor Ballot**
3. Select your project from the PAR drop down list
4. Enter the **Ballot Open Date**
5. Enter the **Ballot Close Date** (should be minimum of 30 days)
6. Enter the **Draft #**: (must match the draft number in the draft )
7. **Select File for Uploading:** Click the Browse button to find your draft file. The file must be in pdf.

**NOTE—Fonts shall be embedded in the draft PDF. Instructions on creating a PDF with embedded fonts can be
 found at:** <http://standards.ieee.org/develop/stdswritten.html>

8. Review the system generated text. If you would like to add additional instruction or information, use the **Sponsor Text** Area.
9. Click **Initiate Ballot.**

**c) Note that compliance with items in Section I will be reviewed by the Staff Liaison when you upload the pdf to the URL in item b). The Project Editor will not review your draft until the Ballot MEC, which occurs during the Sponsor ballot.**

**d) The RevCom MEC will occur after you submit the final balloted draft to RevCom. At that time you will also be required to submit the document source file. If the figures are not native Word or Framemaker graphics, each graphic shall be submitted as a separate file following the requirements outlined in Clause 14 of the**[*IEEE Standards Style Manual*](https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf)***.***

<http://standards.ieee.org/resources/development/writing/writinginfo.html>

**Thank you for the opportunity to review this draft. If you have any queries about the comments in this mandatory editorial coordination, please contact** Choose an item. **via email (** Choose an item. **).**

**cc: Jonathan Goldberg**