*Responses to EC Comments on*

*Draft P802.16r PAR in IEEE 802.16-12-0587-02*

# Abstract

This document proposes responses to EC Comments on draft P802.16r PAR in IEEE 802.16-12-0587-02.

# Background

On 24 September 2012, the IEEE 802.16 Working Group Chair [notified](http://ieee802.org/secmail/msg15322.html) the IEEE 802 EC reflector of draft PAR P802.16r ([IEEE 802.16-12-0587-02](http://doc.wirelessman.org/16-12-0587-02) [“*IEEE Std 802.16 Amendment for Small Cell Backhaul (SCB) Applications: Proposed PAR*”]) for consideration at the November 802 Plenary. Per the IEEE 802 LMSC Operations Manual, comments received by other WGs by 5:00 p.m. on Tuesday of the plenary session must be addressed with a response to the EC reflector by 5:00 p.m. on Wednesday.

# Comments Received from EC Chair

EC Chair Paul Nikolich [submitted a comment](http://ieee802.org/16/arc/802-16list2/msg06752.html) reading:

*Roger,*

*I have one comment regarding the 802.k16r PAR.*

*Please explain the WG's rationale behind labeling the PAR with a particular application (SCB) as opposed to a generic label with it's functional capabilities (e.g., a BWA PHY/MAC with xxxxGbps peak capacity or throughput, etc.).*

*Another alternative is to take an approach similar to the 802.3 WG which labels some of their PHY projects simply with the peak data rate and physical media supported. This has the advantage, in my opinion, keeping the perception of the applications for the project wide open and, hence, may encourage wider participation.*

*Regards,*

*--Paul*

# Proposed Response to Comments Received from EC Chair

This contribution proposes the following response to comments received from the EC Chair:

Dear Paul,

Thank for your comments on the draft P802.16r PAR.

We appreciate your observations. Still, we would like the PAR title to reflect a focus on a particular deployment scenario for which industry bodies are actively developing technical requirements. Also, we do not believe that a peak data rate can be meaningfully assigned.

To address your comment, we will make the following changes:

*Title: Standard for Air Interface for Broadband Wireless Access Systems – Amendment for Small Cell Backhaul (SCB)*

*This project will develop an amendment specifying enhancements to the WirelessMAN-OFDMA air interface for effective use in wireless fixed and nomadic Ethernet transport, including small cell backhaul applications, providing core network services to radio access networks.*

# Comments Received from IEEE 802.11 WG

*The IEEE 802.11 WG* [*submitted a comment*](http://ieee802.org/16/arc/802-16list2/msg06753.html) *reading:*

*PAR 5.2b – suggest that you do not need the phrase “particularly below 6 GHz” or change to say that this is just below 6 GHz.*

*General Question: What is the expected data rate that you are looking to define?*

*What is the new standard providing that is not being provided by LTE?*

# Proposed Response to Comments Received from IEEE 802.11 WG

This contribution proposes the following response to comments received from the IEEE 802.11 WG:

Dear IEEE 802.11 WG,

Thank for your comments on the draft P802.16r PAR.

We appreciate your observation regarding the frequency range. To address your comment, we will make the following changes:

*It will focus on backhaul operating in licensed bands below ~~11 GHz, particularly below~~ 6 GHz*

In response to your question about data rates, we prefer not to state that in the PAR, since it will depend on factors such as the available spectral bandwidth. We are seeking views from external organizations regarding their capacity requirements. Numbers cited in our references are in the range of several tens of Mbit/s of backhaul capacity per subscriber station.

In response to your question “What is the new standard providing that is not being provided by LTE?”, the requirements addressed demand Ethernet transport, which is not supported by LTE-based networks. Furthermore, we believe that an optimized solution for this problem will operate with far more efficiency than one designed to support full mobility.