

P802.16.1 to RevCom: Conditional Approval Request

15 March 2012

Rules: OM (2010-07-16) Clause 14

motions requesting conditional approval to forward when the prior ballot has closed shall be accompanied by:

- Date the ballot closed
- Vote tally including Approve, Disapprove and Abstain votes
- Comments that support the remaining disapprove votes and Working Group responses.
- Schedule for recirculation ballot and resolution meeting.

Date the ballot closed

Stage	Open	Close
Sponsor Ballot	16 Dec	15 Jan
Sponsor Ballot Recirc #1	20 Feb	6 Mar

Vote tally including Approve, Disapprove and Abstain votes

115 Approve (99%)

- 1 Disapprove with comment
- 0 Disapprove without comment
- 8 Abstain
- Return ratio requirement met (86%)

Comments that support the remaining disapprove votes and Working Group responses

- 13 comments from Avi Freedman
- Detail following...

2012/12/15

802.16-12-0118-02

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:

Date: 4-Jan-2012

Comment # 01

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16.1/D3

Ballot ID: sb01R0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 1 Line 43 Fig/Table# Subclause 1

The draft submitted to sponsor ballot still contains editor's notes, and is not ready for SB yet

Suggested Remedy

Correct the draft according to the editor's notes and remove them

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

Adopt proposed texts in contribution IEEE 802.16-12-0128-01-01R0.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

This resolution only resolves the first four editor's notes. The remaining editor's notes are related to cross-reference of IEEE 802.16.1 and IEEE 802.16Rev3. Because these two books can not be completed right now, we can not refer to IEEE 802.16.1 and IEEE 802.16Rev3. Therefore, these comments will be resolved during 802 EC. Our approach is to request approval of these two books and an editorial instruction to 802 editors at the same time. When these two books are approved as standards, the related reference will be updated to IEEE 802.16.1 and IEEE 802.16Rev3 instead of IEEE 802.16m-2011 and IEEE 802.16-2009 respectively.

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/15

802.16-12-0118-02

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:

Date: 4-Jan-2012

Comment # 02

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16.1/D3

Ballot ID: sb01R0

Comment Type General Part of Dis Satisfied Page 3 Line 3 Fig/Table# Subclause 2

As a separate document, the reference list should contain all the relevant references from the original IEEE 802.16 standard

Suggested Remedy

Add all relevant references from IEEE 802.16-2009 and IEEE 802.16m amendment documents.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

Include the following normative reference in Subclause 2.

<insert>

IEEE Std 802.16-2009, IEEE Standard for Local and metropolitan area networks-Part 16: Air Interface for Broadband Wireless Access Systems,

IEEE Std 802.16m-2011, IEEE Standard for Local and metropolitan area networks-Part 16: Air Interface for Broadband Wireless Access Systems, Amendment 3: Advanced Air Interface.</insert>

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/15

802.16-12-0118-02

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:

Date: 4-Jan-2012

Comment # 03

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16.1/D3

Ballot ID: sb01R0

Comment Type General Part of Dis Satisfied Page 6 Line 23 Fig/Table# Subclause 3.115

Is the information related to WirelessMAN-OFDMA relevant to this document?

Suggested Remedy

Delete the first sentence.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

3.115 frame number: <delete>In WirelessMAN-OFDMA, the frame number is a 24-bit number transmitted in every frame. Frame numbers are not necessarily synchronized across base stations.</delete> In WirelessMAN-Advanced Air Interface, the frame number is obtained by concatenating the 12-bit superframe number (transmitted in every superframe) and the 2-bit frame index. Superframe numbers are synchronized across base stations.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/15

802.16-12-0118-02

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:

Date: 4-Jan-2012 7:10:50 AM

Comment # 04

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16.1/D3

Ballot ID: sb01R0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 899 Line 11 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.8

Where are Cluase 6 and clauce 14 in this document?

Suggested Remedy

Change for the right section numbers

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

The Basic LBS support (6.8.2) capability involves support of similar functionality and framework as in Clause 6 to Clause 14 <insert>in IEEE802.16-2009 [Editor's note: Need to update cross reference before sponsor ballot finalization]</insert>adapted to new frame and control channel structure in the AAI.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Clause 6 to Clause 14 refers to IEEE 802.16-2009

Group's Notes

The reference IEEE 802.16-2009 will be updated to IEEE 802.16Rev3 when IEEE 802.16.1 get approved from the EC.

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/15

802.16-12-0118-02

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:

Date: 4-Jan-2012 7:
201507

Comment # 05

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16.1/D3

Ballot ID: sb01R0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 899 Line 23 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.8.1

The first reference (and link) is for the AAI-SON-ADV message and not to the AAI-REG-REQ

Suggested Remedy

Change "6.2.3.7" to "6.2.3.8" with the associated link.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Change "6.2.3.7" to "6.2.3.8" with the associated link.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/15

802.16-12-0118-02

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:

Date: 4-Jan-2012 7:
201507

Comment # 06

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16.1/D3

Ballot ID: sb01R0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 899 Line 39 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.8.2.1

Is "trilaterization" the right word?

Suggested Remedy

Change "trilaterization" to "trilateration"

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Change "trilaterization" to "trilateration"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/15

802.16-12-0118-02

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:

Date: 4-Jan-2012

Comment # 07

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16.1/D3

Ballot ID: sb01R0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 899 Line Fig/Table# Subclause 6.8.2

The reference to the LBS-ADV is wrong. It points to the (non AAI)-LBS-ADV message of 802.16-2009, which is not in this document. Is it still relevant?

Suggested Remedy

Delete the sentence or change 6.3.2.3.59 to 6.2.3.62. Add a link.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

The content of this message and its functionality is consistent with LBS-ADV message in 6.3.2.3.59 <insert>in IEEE802.16-2009 [Editor's note: Need to update cross reference before sponsor ballot finalization])<\insert>.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

6.3.2.3.59 refers to the clause in IEEE 802.16-2009

Group's Notes

The reference IEEE 802.16-2009 will be updated to IEEE 802.16Rev3 when IEEE 802.16.1 get approved from the EC.

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/15

802.16-12-0204-00-Gdoc

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:

Date: 26-Feb-2012

Comment # r01-1

Document under Review:

Ballot ID: sb01R0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 2 Line 58 Fig/Table# Subclause 1.4

The sentence refering to the coexistence protocol is not relevant here.

Suggested Remedy

Delete "The Management/Control Plane may also include the "CX Management part" of WirelessMAN-CX composed of the "Distributed Coexistence Information Database," "Distributed Radio Resource Management," and "Coexistence Protocol (CXP)."

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

<delete>The Management/Control Plane may also include the "CX Management part" of WirelessMAN-CX composed of the "Distributed Coexistence Information Database," "Distributed Radio Resource Management," and "Coexistence Protocol (CXP)."</delete>

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:Date: 26-Feb-2012Comment # r01-4Document under Review:Ballot ID: sb01R0Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 3 Line 52 Fig/Table# Subclause 1.4.2.1

It seems the sentence is not complete.

Suggested Remedy

Replace the subsection with subsection 1.4.4.1 of IEEE 802.16-2009: This standard observes the following correlation:

- MAC management PDUs that are exchanged on the basic management connection trigger or are triggered by primitives that are exchanged over the C-SAP.
- MAC management PDUs that are exchanged on the primary management connection trigger or are triggered by primitives that are exchanged over either the C-SAP or the M-SAP depending on the particular management or control operation.
- Messages that are exchanged over the secondary management connection trigger or are triggered by primitives that are exchanged over the M-SAP.

GroupResolutionDecision of Group: RejectedReason for Group's Decision/Resolution

In 6.2.10.1 of this draft, there is only Control Connection. MAC management PDU and secondary management connection are not used in IEEE 802.16.1.

Group's NotesEditor's NotesEditor's Actions

2012/12/15

802.16-12-0204-00-Gdoc

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:

Date: 26-Feb-2012

Comment # r01-5

Document under Review:

Ballot ID: sb01R0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 3 Line 62 Fig/Table# Subclause 1.4.2.2

The reference to the figure is wrong

Suggested Remedy

Change "Figure 3" to "Figure 2"

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/15

802.16-12-0204-00-Gdoc

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:

Date: 26-Feb-2012

Comment # r01-8

Document under Review:

Ballot ID: sb01R0

Comment Type General Part of Dis Satisfied Page 9 Line 12 Fig/Table# Subclause Historical

This comment refers to the front matter (page ix and not 9).
It is customary to include all the names of the officers during the time frame mentioned

Suggested Remedy

Add: "Carl Eklund: Task Group Vice Chair Avraham Freedman: Task Group Secretary"

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/15

802.16-12-0204-00-Gdoc

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:

Date: 26-Feb-2012

Comment # r01-9

Document under Review:

Ballot ID: sb01R0

Comment Type General Part of Dis Satisfied Page 12 Line Fig/Table# Subclause

This comments reates to the front matter:Names of sponsor ballot pariticpants are missing

Suggested Remedy

Add names of sponsor ballot participants.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Rejected

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

According to the 2012 IEEE Standard Style Manual, the sponsor ballot commitee is inserted by IEEE editorial staff prior to publication.

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/15

802.16-12-0204-00-Gdoc

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:

Date: 26-Feb-2012

Comment # r01-10

Document under Review:

Ballot ID: sb01R0

Comment Type General Part of Dis Satisfied Page 9

Line 5

Fig/Table#

Subclause Historical

This comment refers to page ix in the front matter:
The reference here should be made to 802.16.1 and not to 802.16

Suggested Remedy

Change "802.16" to "802.16.1"

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

Schedule for recirculation ballot and resolution meeting

- 15 day Recirculation (approximately 2012-03-30 to 2012-04-15)
- if conditions not met:
 - Comment resolution telecon: 2012-04-18,
followed by confirmation recirc

802.16 WG Motion

802.16 Closing Plenary: 2012-03-15

Motion: To request Conditional Approval to forward
P802.16.1 for RevCom

- Proposed: Zheng Yan-Xiu
- Seconded:
- Approved:

LMSC Motion

- To grant conditional approval, per Clause 14 of the IEEE 802 Operations Manual, to forward P802.16.1 to RevCom
- Moved:
- Seconded:
- Approve:
- Disapprove:
- Abstain: