

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Roger Marks

Membership Status:

Date: 2012/01/18

Comment #

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment

Type General

Part of Dis

Satisfied

Page i

Line 10

Fig/Table#

Subclause

Can you please submit a late WG comment on the P802.16Rev3 draft to correct the title of that draft?

Suggested Remedy

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

Change the document title in Page i and Page 1 as "IEEE Standard for Air Interface for Broadband Wireless Access Systems"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Turner, Michelle

Membership Status:

Date: 9-Jan-2012

Comment # 01

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type General Part of Dis Satisfied Page 0 Line 0 Fig/Table# Subclause 0

Please update the Patent Statement.

Suggested Remedy

Attention is called to the possibility that implementation of this standard may require use of subject matter covered by patent rights. By publication of this standard, no position is taken by the IEEE with respect to the existence or validity of any patent rights in connection therewith. If a patent holder or patent applicant has filed a statement of assurance via an Accepted Letter of Assurance, then the statement is listed on the IEEE-SA Website <<http://standards.ieee.org/about/sasb/patcom/patents.html>>. Letters of Assurance may indicate whether the Submitter is willing or unwilling to grant licenses under patent rights without compensation or under reasonable rates, with reasonable terms and conditions that are demonstrably free of any unfair discrimination to applicants desiring to obtain such licenses.

Essential Patent Claims may exist for which a Letter of Assurance has not been received. The IEEE is not responsible for identifying Essential Patent Claims for which a license may be required, for conducting inquiries into the legal validity or scope of Patents Claims, or determining whether any licensing terms or conditions provided in connection with submission of a Letter of Assurance, if any, or in any licensing agreements are reasonable or non-discriminatory. Users of this standard are expressly advised that determination of the validity of any patent rights, and the risk of infringement of such rights, is entirely their own responsibility. Further information may be obtained from the IEEE Standards Association.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Turner, Michelle

Membership Status:

Date: 9-Jan-2012

Comment # 02

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 0 Line 0 Fig/Table# Subclause 0

IETF RFC 1213 and ISO/IEC 8824 are not cited in text, if they are not needed for the implementation of the standard, they should be moved to the bibliography.

Suggested Remedy

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Turner, Michelle

Membership Status:

Date: 9-Jan-2012 9:13:

Comment # 03

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 0 Line 0 Fig/Table# Subclause 0

IETF 2132 is cited in Bibliography and the normative reference clause. It cannot be cited in both.

Suggested Remedy

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

Remove the reference of IETF RFC 2132 in Bibliography.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

Comment by:

Ruck, Herbert

Membership Status:Date: 10-Jan-2012 17:11:52Comment # 04Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3Ballot ID: sb00R3

| <u>Comment</u> | <u>Type</u> | <u>Technical</u> | <u>Part of Dis</u> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <u>Satisfied</u> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Page</u> ? | <u>Line</u> 3 | <u>Fig/Table#</u> | <u>Subclause</u> 8.4.13.3.3 |
|----------------|-------------|------------------|--------------------|--|--------------------------|---------------|---------------|-------------------|-----------------------------|
|----------------|-------------|------------------|--------------------|--|--------------------------|---------------|---------------|-------------------|-----------------------------|

The RMS constellation error is calculated using Equation (149). should read
The RMS constellation error is calculated using Equation (164).

In addition I have editorial comments:

Editorial Comments

- 1) Equation 7 - 1/N NOT CORRECT
- 2) Equation 19 S is cut off
- 3) Eq. 20 "x" should be g(x)?
- 4) page 1307 line 63

k mod(length of permutation sequenc
should be k mod(length of permutation sequence)

- 1)page 950 line 29 in Eq. (26) "j sub k =" "j" not visible
- 2)page 950 line 40 in Eq (27) "m sub j" missing
- 3)page 950 line 45 in Eq. (28) k is cut off
- 4)page 1012 line 8 in Eq. (53) "rror sub RMS" should be "Error sub RMS"

- 1)page 1012 lines 20 and 23 left parantheses should be straight (not italic)
- 1)page 1476 line 9 Eq. (164) (check the square above the =)
- 2)page 1017 line 24 "F sub s" and "8000" is cut off
- 3) page 1017 line 41 Eq. (56) left and right side of equation is cut off
- 4) page 1077 line 34 Eq. (59) left side is cut off
- 5) page 1272 line 51 Eq. (61) left and right side cut off
- 6) page 1293 line 61 Eq. (61b) left side cut off
- 1)page 1304 line 50 Eq. (63) left side cut off
- 2)page 1311 line 58 Eq. (65) left side cut off
- 3)page 1312 line 22 Eq. (66) left side cut off
- 4)page 1324 line 3 Eq. (69) left side cut off
- 5)page 1324 line 13 Eq. (70) left side cut off

6)page 1325 line 7 Eq. (71) left and right side cut off
7)page 1327 line 46 Eq. (73) left side cut off
8)page 1328 line 14 Eq. (74) left side cut off
9)page 1330 line 44 Eq. (75) left and right side cut off
10)page 1375 line 47 Eq. (109) left cut off
11)page 1375 line 54 Eq. (110) left cut off
12)page 1418 line 24 Eq. (120) left cut off
13)page 1421 line 55 Eq. (122) left and right cut off
14)page 1422 line 1 Eq. (123) left cut off
15)page 1422 line 6 Eq. (124) left cut off
16)page 1425 line 11 Eq. (127) left cut off
17)page 1469 line 63 Eq. (150) left cut off (SSI -> RSSI)
18)page 1476 line 9 Eq. (164) shift = to the right so that the square is not above the equal sign

19)page 1476 line 52 Eq. (165) left cut off
add space between RMS and = so that "square" is not above = sign
20)page 1675 line 46 Eq. (172) left cut off
21)page 2562 line 20 Eq. (G.2) left cut off
22) page 2562 line 25 Eq. (G.3) left cut off

Suggested Remedy

The RMS constellation error is calculated using Equation (164).

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

Remedy 1 : On page 1476, Line 3,

The RMS constellation error is calculated using Equation (~~149~~~~</delete>~~~~<insert>~~164~~</insert>~~).

Remedy 2 : Resolve following editorial comments

- 1) Equation 7 - $1/N$ NOT CORRECT
- 2) Equation 19 S is cut off
- 3) Eq. 20 "x" should be $g(x)$?
- 4) page 1307 line 63
 $k \bmod(\text{length of permutation sequenc}$
should be $k \bmod(\text{length of permutation sequence})$

- 1)page 950 line 29 in Eq. (26) " j sub k =" " j " not visible
- 2)page 950 line 40 in Eq (27) " m sub j " missing
- 3)page 950 line 45 in Eq. (28) k is cut off

4)page 1012 line 8 in Eq. (53) "rror sub RMS" should be "Error sub RMS"

1)page 1012 lines 20 and 23 left parantheses should be straight (not italic)

1)page 1476 line 9 Eq. (164) (check the square above the =)

2)page 1017 line 24 "F sub s" and "8000" is cut off

3) page 1017 line 41 Eq. (56) left and right side of equation is cut off

4) page 1077 line 34 Eq. (59) left side is cut off

5) page 1272 line 51 Eq. (61) left and right side cut off

6) page 1293 line 61 Eq. (61b) left side cut off

1)page 1304 line 50 Eq. (63) left side cut off

2)page 1311 line 58 Eq. (65) left side cut off

3)page 1312 line 22 Eq. (66) left side cut off

4)page 1324 line 3 Eq. (69) left side cut off

5)page 1324 line 13 Eq. (70) left side cut off

6)page 1325 line 7 Eq. (71) left and right side cut off

7)page 1327 line 46 Eq. (73) left side cut off

8)page 1328 line 14 Eq. (74) left side cut off

9)page 1330 line 44 Eq. (75) left and right side cut off

10)page 1375 line 47 Eq. (109) left cut off

11)page 1375 line 54 Ea. (110) left cut off

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012

Comment # 05

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 44 Line Fig/Table# Subclause 5.2.2

Fig 9 includes 5 erroneous references to "STID+FID." Neither STID nor FID is defined in this draft, and neither has any meaning in this context.

Suggested Remedy

Recreate Fig 9 without reference to STID or FID.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

Replace the Fig. 9 in IEEE 802.16Rev3 by the Fig.9 in IEEE 802.16-2009

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012
08:10:05 EST

Comment # 06

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 45 Line Fig/Table# Subclause 5.2.2

Fig 10 includes 5 erroneous references to "STID+FID." Neither STID nor FID is defined in this draft, and neither has any meaning in this context.

Suggested Remedy

Recreate Fig 10 without reference to STID or FID.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

Replace the Fig.10 in IEEE 802.16Rev3 by the Fig.10 in IEEE 802.16-2009

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012

Comment # 07

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page ? Line 51 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.15.6

12 bits are assigned for "STID." STID is not defined in this draft has no meaning in this context.

Suggested Remedy

Remove reference to STID.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Rejected

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Actually, It is related to 16.1 AMS capable of Direct HO from 16 Rev3 BS to 16.1 ABS. This 16m AMS is connecting to 16 Rev3 BS now and It wants to handover to 16.1 ABS. 'Neighbor ABS information' is used for the 16.1 AMS to use it during direct HO to 16.1 ABS. Therefore, STID should be kept.

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012

Comment # 08

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page ? Line 39 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.15.6

The text erroneously refers to "AAI MS." This term is undefined and has no meaning in this standard.

Suggested Remedy

Define "AAI MS" in meaningful and technically complete fashion, or delete the TLV.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

[Modify the sentence on page 1623, line 38, as follows:]

This TLV shall be used for only AAI MS <insert>[which supports Std. IEEE802.16.1](#)</insert>.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012 23:00:00

Comment # 09

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page ? Line 9 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.1.16

The text erroneously refers to "AAI capable MS." This term is undefined and has no meaning in this standard.

Suggested Remedy

Define "AAI capable MS" in meaningful and technically complete fashion, or delete the TLV.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

[Modify the sentence on page 1447, line 9, as follows:]

When more than one TLV (i.e. type 117) are included MOB_BSHO-REQ or MOB_BSHORSP message, those TLVs shall be used only for AAI capable MS <insert>which supports IEEE Std. 802.16.1</insert> and the order of these TLV shall be the same as the order of Neighbor_ABS_Index in Neighbor ABS Information (see 11.15.6) which is included together in the MOB_BSHO-REQ or the MOB_BSHO-RSP message.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Actually, It is related to 16.1 AMS capable of Direct HO from Rev3 BS to 16.1 ABS. This 16.1 AMS is connecting to 16Rev3 BS now and the 16.1 AMS wants to handover to 16.1 ABS. . Therefore, that TLV should be kept.

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012 23:01:50

Comment # 10

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page ? Line 5 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.1.16

The term "16m-only ABS" (used is both Lines 5 and 6) is meaningless.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "16m-only ABS" with defined term "AAI-only ABS".

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

On page 1447, Line 5,

The TLV encodings defined in this subclause are specific to the direct HO from 16e BS to <delete>16m</delete><insert>AAI</insert>-only ABS.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012 23:01:50

Comment # 11

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page ? Line 57 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.1.16.2

Reference to "IEEE 802.16m-2011" will be obsolete when this standard is approved.

Suggested Remedy

Replace with reference to equivalent table in P802.16.1 draft.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Insert the following texts after the IEEE 802.16m-2011

<insert> [Editor's note: Need to update cross reference before sponsor ballot finalization]</insert>

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

The reference IEEE 802.16m-2011 will be updated to IEEE 802.16.1 when IEEE 802.16Rev3 gets approved from the EC.

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012 23:00:00

Comment # 12

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page ? Line 4 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.1.16.3

Reference to "IEEE 802.16m-2011" will be obsolete when this standard is approved.

Suggested Remedy

Replace with reference to equivalent table in P802.16.1 draft.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

Insert the following texts after the IEEE 802.16m-2011

<insert> [Editor's note: Need to update cross reference before sponsor ballot finalization]</insert>

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

The reference IEEE 802.16m-2011 will be updated to IEEE 802.16.1 when IEEE 802.16Rev3 gets approved from the EC.

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012

Comment # 13

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page ? Line 16 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.1.16.4

Reference to "IEEE 802.16m-2011" will be obsolete when this standard is approved.

Suggested Remedy

Replace with reference to equivalent table in P802.16.1 draft.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

Insert the following texts after the IEEE 802.16m-2011

<insert> [Editor's note: Need to update cross reference before sponsor ballot finalization]</insert>

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

The reference IEEE 802.16m-2011 will be updated to IEEE 802.16.1 when IEEE 802.16Rev3 gets approved from the EC.

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012
00:10:00 EST

Comment # 14

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page ? Line 8 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.15.7

The text erroneously refers to "16m ABS." This term is undefined and has no meaning in this standard.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "16m ABS" with defined term "AAI-only ABS".

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Replace "16m ABS" with defined term "AAI-only ABS".

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012

Comment # 15

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 642 Line 18 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.20.2.10

The text refers to the undefined and meaningless term "16e BS." A similar error occurs as follows:

p 642 line 20

p 1445 line 4

p 1591 line 64

p 1624 line 8

Suggested Remedy

Revise to accurately refer to intended entity using terms defined in this standard.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

In p 642 line 18, p 642 line 20, p 1445 line 4, p 1591 line 64, and p 1624 line 8,
Remove "16e" from them

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012

Comment # 16

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 683 Line 56 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.27.2

Text refers to an obsolete standard (IEEE Std 802.16e).

Suggested Remedy

Delete "(as defined in IEEE Std 802.16e)".

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012

Comment # 17

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 737 Line 33 Fig/Table# Subclause 7.2.2.2.11

Text refers to obsolete standard ("IEEE Std 802.16e-2005/Cor1").

Suggested Remedy

Rewrite to refer to defined entities in this standard, or delete item (c).

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Rejected

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

"Legacy mobiles" is defined only here not used in other places. Therefore, there is no harm even if we keep it. The "Legacy mobiles" indicates special MS and BS specified by only 16e-2005/Cor1 which could be tracked in IEEE802 web server.

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012

Comment # 18

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page ? Line 23 Fig/Table# Subclause Annex I

Cross-references in Annex I (7.2.2.2.9, 7.2.2.4.1, and 11.8.4.3) may be incorrect.

Suggested Remedy

Check and confirm cross-reference accuracy.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Rejected

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

7.2.2.2.9 is correct (It is related to CMAC Key stuff)

7.2.2.4.1 is correct (The section I.3 describes AK derivation and 7.2.2.4.1 is related to AK context)

11.8.4.3 is correct (11.8.4.3. is related to MAC mode in SBC-REQ)

There seem no problem.

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012

Comment # 19

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page ? Line 17 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.1.3

Reference to "IEEE Std 802.16m-2011" is incorrect. It will be obsolete when this standard is approved. Furthermore, though, why would a device conformant to this standard need to transmit information regarding its conformance to another standard?

Suggested Remedy

Delete Value 10. Add 10 to the Reserved list.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Rejected

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

We will wait the response from WiMAX Forum.

Group's Notes

The comment is correct. However, we can wait for more informaiton from WiMAX Forum to confirm the change.

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012

Comment # 20

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 9 Line Fig/Table# Subclause 2

IEEE Std. 802.16.1 is referenced in Definition 3.1 but not included in the list of normative references.

Suggested Remedy

Add "IEEE Std. 802.16.1-2012" to list of normative references.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/10

802.16-12-0117-02

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date: 15-Jan-2012

Comment # 21

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16Rev3/D3

Ballot ID: sb00R3

Comment Type Editorial

Part of Dis Satisfied

Page

Line

Fig/Table#

Subclause

Page headers are incorrect.

Suggested Remedy

Re-create all page headers with correct information and no strikeout marks.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions