**IEEE P802.15**

**Wireless Personal Area Networks**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Project | IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs) | |
| Title | **Proposed Resolutions for Metric Comments CIDs #** **R16, R18, R37, R41, R42, R75, R80, R104, R113, R161** | |
| Date Submitted | 8 June 2015 | |
| Source | [Charlie Perkins],  [Futurewei],  [2330 Central Expressway,  Santa Clara,  CA 95050] | Voice: [+1-408-330-4596]  Fax: [+1-408-330-5088]  E-mail: [charliep@computer.org] |
| Re: | 802.15.10 Consolidated Comment Entry Form, CIDs # R16, R18, R37, R41, R42, R75, R80, R104, R113, R161 | |
| Abstract | Provides a proposed resolution to CIDs # R16, R18, R37, R41, R42, R75, R81, R104, R113, R161 | |
| Purpose | To be used by the technical editor to apply the necessary changes to the draft to resolve CIDs # R16, R18, R37, R41, R42, R75, R80, R104, R113, R161 | |
| Notice | This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.15. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. | |
| Release | The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by P802.15. | |

**Comments #** **R16, R18, R37, R41, R42, R75, R80, R104, R113, R161**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Page | Sub-clause | Line # | Comment | Proposed Change |
| R16 | 3 | 3.1 | 44 | Is a mesh root restricted to enabling access to just one entity? | Explain why, or modify definition |
| R18 | 3 | 3.1 | 50 | mesh tree providing connectivity | connectivity to what? |
| R37 | 10 | 4.3 | 38 | "A mesh tree is organized into a hierarchical mesh tree" | Circular characterization <unnecessary for a tree> |
| R41 | 10 | 4.3 | 52 | is allowed by the mesh root | Explain motivation for the restriction |
| R42 | 10 | 4.3 | 52 | is allowed by the mesh root | Allow device to decide for itself |
| R75 | 21 | 5.2.1 | 35 | Section cross-reference needed for discussion | section 5.4.1.4 |
| R80 | 23 | 5.2.1 | 51 | 'N' conflicts with rows 9 and 10 of table 3 | Pick new variable for one of the 'N's |
| R104 | 34 | 5.3.3 | 14 | What reasons are NOT good reasons for recovery? | Give some examples, or reword sentence. |
| R113 | 39 | 5.4.1.4 | 15 | "E2E Retry Limit are set by the device forwarding the aggregated frame" | This makes the individual payloads NOT E2E. |
| R161 | 53 | 6.2.1.1 | 25 | "backhaul" is undefined | Create definition (or re-word) |

**Resolution: AiP**

**CIDs R16, R18:** Definition for mesh root should allow for connectivity to one or more services.

* ***Replace definition of mesh root as follows:***

“Device with the depth 0 in a L2R mesh providing access to a service. It may act as a gateway connecting to one or more external services.”

**CID R37**: Statement is redundant and amounts to a circular definition.

* ***Modify first sentence on line 37 of page 10 as follows:***

A mesh ~~tree~~ is organized into a hierarch~~ical~~y ~~mesh tree~~.

**CIDs R41, R42:** The mesh root does not need to control the use of brother routing.

* ***Delete the following phrase from last sentence on line 52 of page 1:***

“if brother routing is allowed by the mesh root.”

**CID R80:** The use of variable name 'N' conflicts with rows 9 and 10 of table 3.

* ***Modify contents of the first cell on line 35 of page 23 as follows:***

Number of metrics ~~N~~M

**CID R104:** There is no need to illustrate the reasons for data recovery; to do so could be erroneously interpreted as listing all such reasons.

* ***Delete the following phrase from last sentence on line 52 of page 1:***

“due to reasons such as an empty NT or power outage”.

**CID R113:** The mechanism for frame aggregation causes the retry limit to no longer be end-to-end. This suggests renaming the limit to simply be a “Retry Limit”

* ***Replace “E2E Retry Limit” by “Retry Limit” throughout the document.***

**CID R161**: The term backhaul should be defined (if used at all).

* ***Insert the following definition for backhaul*** ***in section 3.1:***

The portion of the network connecting one PAN to another, or to an external network (or Internet)