
IEEE P802.15
Wireless Personal Area Networks

Project	IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs)	
Title	Task Group 4m and TG4m BRC Meeting Minutes, Nanjing, Sept 16-19, 2013	
Date Submitted	Sept 20, 2013	
Source	[Alina Liru LU] [NICT]	E-mail: [liru@nict.com.sg]
Re:		
Abstract	Task Group and ballot resolution committee minutes for Interim meeting, September 2013, Nanjing, China.	
Purpose		
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.15. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.	
Release	The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by P802.15.	

IEEE Project 802
Working Group 15, Task Group 4M and Ballot Resolution Committee
Meeting Minutes: September 16-19, 2012

Monday PM1 Session – September 16, 2011

Chair called the TG4m meeting to order at 13.43am.

Chair presents Doc #536 -- Opening report of TG4m, reviewed TG4m Par, history and current status of TG4m, 388 comments were received including 242 editorial and 146 general/technical comments.

Chair reviews Meeting plan of the week. Chair reminds people to claim potentially essential patents. Chair informs that there would be a presentation on OFCOM TVWS related information in pm1 session.

Chair reviews timeline of TG4m.

Chair requests the approval of meeting agenda in Doc #509. There is no discussion and objection. The motion to approve the agenda is moved by Chang and seconded by Powell. The meeting agenda is approved unanimously.

Chair calls to approve previous July meeting minutes (Doc #450). The motion is moved by Powell and seconded by Chang. There is no discussion and objection. The July minutes is approved unanimously.

TG4m BRC Chair Phil presents updates of BRC. BRC call was held through teleconference. Volunteers are called to help in comments resolutions. Comments spread sheet R2 was uploaded showing comments assignment to volunteers.

Phil informs that there is no need to ask for working group approval for starting ballot recirculation and BRC is targeted to close all comments resolutions as soon as possible and start recirculation subsequently. A 10-day recirculation period is required.

Chang presents Doc. #535: Summary of OFCOM consultation, TVWS: approach to coexistence

There is questions on how next step can Task group move to address the functionalities issues indicated in the report.

There is comment that some functionality issues can be addressed through comments resolutions.

Phil called BRC meeting to order. This BRC meeting is a joint meeting with TG4m. BRC Chair reviews comments assignments and the meeting plans to assign all unassigned comments to members so that members can come back with resolutions posted in the mentor and for recirculation in the group.

BRC chair suggests members to check with "no"-voters when they provide the resolutions especially for those must-be-satisfied comments.

BRC chair reviews comments which are with ambiguous grouping and regroup/reassigned them to members.

- Cid 183 is reassigned to Ben to resolve.
- Cid 195 is changed to E group
- Cid 197 is changed to E group, assigned to editors.
- Cid 202 is assigned to Kunal
- Cid 242 is assigned to Sum
- Cid 252 is assigned to Sum
- Cid 261 264 and 266 are given to technical editors to decide.
- Cid 272 is assigned to Ben
- Cid 281 is assigned to editors
- Cid 284 286 288 are assigned to editors
- Cid 388 is assigned to Chang

Comments assignments are done.
Volunteers are requested to provide resolutions when they are ready.

Discussion is done and Chair requests members after resolving comments, post and send email to email reflector to inform the rest members so as to allow people to review provided resolutions.

Powell suggests BRC chair sends out email to inform those who are not present in Nanjing meeting to provide/review the resolutions.

15:13, BRC and TG 4m meeting are recessed until Tuesday PM1.

Tuesday PM1 Session – September 17, 2013

Chair called the TG4m meeting to order at 1.35pm. This is a joint meeting with TG4m BRC.

BRC chair welcome members.

Thirty minutes recess for commenter's' discussion

Meeting resumes.

Chair asks if member would like to present the comment resolutions.

Alina presents Doc #547 resolving Comments with IDs 319 to 382 which are NB-OFDM PHY related comments. There is no comments and discussion on proposed resolutions.

Sum presents Doc #538 resolutions for power saving related comments.

CID 134, comment from Ben, Sum said it would be addressed at last

CIDs 137, 141, AP

CID 145, Ben clarifies his intension for raised comment. Members jointly propose resolutions to CID 145. Add 'To increase the likelihood of detection.' at the beginning of line 7. AP

CID 148, resolution is to reject the comment

CID 149, AP

CID 150, AP, Add in session 5.2.4.30 for Rendezvous Time field and Data Transaction Duration field the following text, 'a value of 0 indicates that the field shall be ignored.'

CID 151, A

CID 156, AP

CID 161, AP

CID 167, AP

CID 168, AP

CIDs 170, 173, 175, 242, 252, AP

CID 134, AP, commenter stressed that there is only one MAC for 802.15. Question: Is it limited and is it necessary for having Power saving technique?

3.29pm, BRC meeting and TG4m meeting are recessed until 4pm.

Tuesday PM2 Session – September 17, 2013

BRC Chair called meeting to order at 4.05pm.

Chang presents Doc #551 to address TG4m OFDM PHY related comments.

The following comments are addressed.

CID 297, AP, editor will rephrase the sentence and include in the comment spread sheet.

CIDs 298, 299, 300, 301, 303, 307, 313, 317, 388, Accepted

There is comment from technical editor on CID 388 resolutions. As the number of pages for informative texts is big, it is tough for editors to complete in a short timeline. Concern is raised if it is possible to include the informative texts in mentor.

Suggestion is made by chair to help speed up the process of draft document to meet the target timeline.

Chang presents Doc #554r3 to address CIDs 277. Resolution is to reject the comment.

There is question on how to deal with comments which are allocated to those who are not present at Nanjing Meeting. Chair answers that he can help present the resolutions when those resolutions are ready and posted to mentor.

Clint requests member to post document in Doc files instead of pdf file so it can help editor speed up the processing of comment resolutions.

There is no more presentation.

BRC and TG4m meetings are recessed until Thursday AM1 at 4.49pm.

Thursday AM1 Session – September 19, 2013

Meeting is called to order at 8.09am.

TG4m Chair announced there are two sessions in this morning. The meeting will be a joint of BRC and TG4m. BRC will continue comment resolutions process.

Technical editor reports the comment resolution status. 100% of comments are assigned to members for resolution. There are 146 technical/general comments. 53 of them are processed.

Clint presents a document regarding to the informative text to provide texts of packet example. He suggests move the three example documents for (FSK PHY, OFDM PHY and NB-OFDM PHY) to mentor to reduce the trouble of editing and avoid inviting more comments. He has included the three documents into a new document with Number #563 and posted to mentor.

Clint said for those comments need activate the link, most of them are those with reference document in 4g document.

For comment CID 353, Clint suggests reject the comment as change of texts order would mess up the existing texts. Members suggest that the revision can be done when it is time for 802.15.4-2011 revision. There is discussion on the resolution. Chair suggests bring the discussion offline.

Chang presents Doc #552 to address TMCTP related comments.

CID 35, Reject

CID 36, AP

CID 43, AP

CID 45, Accept

CID 61, AP

CID 62, Accept

CID 64, AP

CID 66, Accept in principle.

CID 69, Reject due to out of scope, this clause is not in this draft.

CID 73, Accept

CID 76, Accept

CID 80, Accept

CID 83, Reject

CID 85, AP, add "(BO)" at the end of line at page 10

CID 121, Accept in principle

CIDs 122 and 125, AP. It is requested a document indicating detailed changes be provided.

CID 123, Reject

CID 132, Accept

CID 133, accept, Resolved by Doc #549

Chang presents Doc #549.

Chang presents Doc #567 from Cristina.

CID 189, Reject

CID 190, AP resolved by cid 192

CID 271, AP

Chang presents Doc #568

CID 49, AP

CID 56, AP

CID 164, AP

Alina presents Doc #566 and Doc #565 for CID 318 and CID 386.

CID 318, Reject. TG4m par specifies the typical data rate support from 40kbps to 2000kbps range. The previous version of OFDM can only support up to 800kbps data rate. The NB-OFDM is able to provide close to 2Mbps data rate to fulfill the application requirements. One of key considerations for a new setting of parameters for TVWS PHYs is how to optimize the parameters to allow 802.15.4 wireless networks to take advantage of the TV white space spectrum for use in large scale device command and control applications. The parameters for

three PHYs are identified for TVWS services in this standard, considering this optimization. It is inappropriate to include the rationale for the standards. This also applies to CIDs 274 and 297.

CID 386, AP.

Recess is called until 10:30am

Thursday AM2 Session – September 19, 2013

BRC Chairs called meeting to order at 10.36am.

Ben presents resolutions to the following comments:

CID 5, Reject. The commenter does not provide a proposed change. The following information has been provided by the sponsor to the commenter: there is no conflict between 802.11af and 802.15.4m. The two projects have distinct identity serving different application spaces. The TG is aware of the work in 802.11af and was considered in preparation of the coexistence assurance document (Doc #166r3). The commission of 11af in 7.2 was unintentional and unfortunately missed during the 802 PAR review process.

CID 86, revised. Change 'group address' to 'group address as the extended destination address'. Note: change the editing instruction to correctly indicate which text is inserted relative to the base standard.

CID 105, revised. Change title of 5.1.8.4 to "Ranging Exchange without iEs". Change 1st sentence of 5.1.8.5 to "The process described in this subclause shall only be used when all RDEVs in the exchange support IEs." The editor will remove instances of 'that supports IEs' in this subclause.

CID 108, Revised. Change 'will to 'shall'.

CID 113, Revised. Commenter's offer has been accepted and awaiting the revised text suggestion. CID115, accept. Technical editor suggests include detailed changes. Ben will work together with Sum.

CID 165, Accept

CID 166, Accept

CID 183, is deferred and reassigned to NB-OFDM

CID 193, Revise. At line 53 before "When multiple" insert "bit maps aling on octet boundaries; unused bits are reserved".

CID 198 199 200 211 257 accept

CID 272, revised. Use the text from the base standard for the ceiling() function as found in the base standard. See: 802.15.4-2011(6.4.3)

James Gilb presents Doc #570r0 to address CIDs 122 and 125. AP.

There is no objection from Chang for provided resolutions to CIDs 122 and 125.

Mingtuo presents Doc #571 to address comments regarding to Device announcement. There is suggestion to change 'may' to 'shall' at 2nd paragraph and add 'other times' at the last sentence of 2nd paragraph. There is further discussion on the contents provided.

BRC Chair suggests bring the discussion offline due to limited timing.

BRC chair informs that BRC teleconference meeting is scheduled on upcoming Wednesday 3pm pacific time.

TG4m Chair displays future plan/timeline of the task group. Chair announces the target to finish Recirculation ballot I in Oct and finish Recirculation II in November 2013.

Meeting adjourned at 12.23pm.