**Wireless Personal Area Networks**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Project | IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs) | |
| Title | **<IEEE802.15 SCMan and SCWNG minutes>** | |
| Date Submitted | [20 May 2013] | |
| Source | [] [] [Chicago, IL] | Voice: [+1.847.960.3715] Fax: [] E-mail: [pat.kinney@ieee.org] |
| Re: | [802.15 Main and WNG Meeting in Waikoloa] | |
| Abstract | [IEEE 802.15 Man and WNG Standing Committee Minutes] | |
| Purpose | [Official minutes of the Working Group Session] | |
| Notice | This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.15. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. | |
| Release | The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by P802.15. | |

**IEEE 802.15 Plenary Meeting – Session #84**

**Hilton Waikoloa, Hawaii**

**May 12-16, 2013**

**Tuesday 15 May 2013**

**13:32** SC Maintenance called to order by Pat Kinney (Kinney Consulting)

* Agenda
  + Presentations responding to ETSI TC ERM change requests
  + email responses to ETSI TC ERM change requests
  + Other SC maintenance requests
    - Hendricus De Ruijter
    - Cristina Seibert
* Chair referred participants to ETSI TC ERM change requests in document 15-13-0218
* Presentations responding to ETSI TC ERM change requests
  + Larry Taylor presented “802.15.4 use by external SDOs” (doc 15-13-0194-01)
  + Chair read Jonathan Simon’s presentation (15-13-243-01)
  + Chair Pat Kinney read email responses from read Ludwig Winkel’s presentation (15-13-312-00)
  + Tim Harrington made a presentation (doc 15-13-0316-03)
  + Tom Herbst made a presentation (doc 15-13-0326-00)
  + Ben Rolfe made a presentation (doc 15-13-0323-01)
* Email responses to ETSI TC ERM change requests from Craig Harmon, Andrew Myles, and Paul Duffy were read by the chair (Annex A)
* Discussion on ETRSI TC ERM’s change requests
  + Comment that although external SDO change requests to IEEE standards are within the process, they are not practical; instead allow for a consistent process not requiring a formation of a task group
  + Commenter urged against non-backward compatible changes as they would give the IEEE 802.15.4 standard a black mark against it
  + Comment made that the first two requests were reasonable but the TLV change would result in backward incompatibility
  + Proposal made that changing the TLV order could be done for extended frame types without causing issues to legacy devices
  + Comment that the previous proposal seemed possible
  + Comment that the extension proposal of the frame type was not byte-wide
  + Question that the extended frame types would only be affected by b111? Reply was yes
* Straw Polls
  + The following straw polls were conducted:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Change request 1 | Change request 2 | Change request 3 |
| Those who support doing nothing to address the change request | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Those who support addressing the change request (not necessarily the ETSI change requested) | 20 | 14 | 11 |
|  | For | Against |  |
| Those who support changing the order of LTV for legacy and future devices | 4 | 8 |  |
| Those who support changing the order of LTV for only future devices | 13 | 0 |  |

* As a result of the above straw polls taken it was agreed to form three teams to work on each of the three ETSI TC ERM requests, these teams will report back to SC-mag at the July plenary
  + Team addressing the extension range of values of the 802.15.4 Frame Types consists of Ben Rolfe, Larry Taylor, Tom Herbst, Jussi Haapola, Tim Harrington, and Bill Verso
  + Team to define a mechanism suitable for allocation/management of 802.15.4 IE IDs for all requests including external SDOs consists of Ben Rolfe, and Larry Taylor
  + Team to review the Information Element TLV structure disconnect with ETSI and propose a resolution consists of Ben Rolfe, Larry Taylor, and Tom Herbst
* Other maintenance requests
  + - Hendricus De Ruijter
  + Submission Date: 4/19/2013  
    Name: Henk de Ruijter  
    Affiliation: Silicon Labs  
    E-Mail: hendricus.deruijter@silabs.com  
      
    Document's title (include revision/year): d5P802-15-4k\_Draft\_Standard.pdf  
    Clause number: 9.3 PHY PIB attributes  
    Page: 68
  + Issue, concern, or question: On line 27, the description in the table says: “The valid symbol rates per band are given in Table 66b.” The issue is that table 66b list the Bit Rate and not the symbol rate.
  + Proposed change: Insert the following sentence to the end of sub-clause 19.2.2.6 as follows: “When spreading is enabled, the spreading bit rate shall be the value of the bit rate shown in Table 66b.”
  + In addition, change the description of  *phyLECIMFSKSymbolRate* in sub-clause 9.3 as follows: “When *phyLECIMFSKSpreading* is FALSE, the valid symbol rates per band are given as the bit rates shown in Table 66b. When *phyLECIMFSKSpreading* is TRUE, the valid symbol rates per band correspond to the spreading bit rates shown in Table 66b, divided by the value of *phyLECIMFSKSpreadingFactor*.”
    - Cristina Seibert
  + Date Submitted: 3/28/2013 Name: Cristina Seibert Affiliation: Silver Spring Networks E-Mail: cseibert@silverspringnet.com  Document's title (include revision/year): 802.15.4e-2012 Clause number: 5.2.2.8.1
  + Page: 79
  + Issue, concern, or question: Figure 48m has two errors. The first one is the length of the Frame Control field which should be 2 instead of 1 (octets). This is being fixed via the 4k amendment which replaces Figure 48m. The second error is that the Sequence Number is shown as always included when in fact it can be suppressed.
  + Proposed change: Change Figure 48m to show a length of “0/1” octets for the Sequence Number field. Change sentence in section that states “The Sequence Number field shall be set to the current value of *macDSN*.” to “When the Sequence Number field is present, it shall be set to the current value of *macDSN.”*
* Hendricus De Ruijter’s and Cristina Seibert’s requests for changes were approved by unanimous consent to be recommended to the 802.15 WG for consideration during the next 802.15.4 revision.

**15:30** SC Maintenance meeting adjourned

**Wednesday 15 May 2013**

No WNG meeting was held

**Annex A**

* **Craig Harmon:**
  + JTC 1/SC 31 is interested in any modification of 802.15.4 and 8802.15.4, respectively. Might we see a marked up copy of the standard reflecting the changes?
  + Absent the detail to see how the ETSI recommendations would be implemented, you are correct . . . there is insufficient information to accept or reject their suggestions.
* **Andrew Myles:**
  + I assume you are sending this to me based on my involvement in ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6. I am not aware of any activity in SC6 that is related in any way to 802.15.4. Hope this helps
* **Paul Duffy:**
  + Cisco Connected Energy is the Cisco business unit which has developed and is now globally deploying network solutions providing critical communications capabilities for utility grid moderation efforts.  A key piece of this solution is our Field Area Network, which is based on the IEEE 802.15.4e/g MAC/PHY. Of the three issues/resolutions discussed within IEEE 802.15-<15-13-0194-01-0mag>
  + Frame ID extension.  Cisco agrees that the issue must be addressed and supports the proposed resolution.
  + IE namespace management.  Cisco agrees that the issue must be addressed, but DOES NOT support the proposed resolution.  We are happy to work with IEEE to produce a satisfactory solution.
  + IE Descriptor format. Cisco DOES NOT agree this is an issue that must be addressed and DOES NOT support the proposed resolution, nor any change which will break compatibility with current implementations of 802.15.4e.  We see no technical merit in this proposed change, which will break compatibility with millions of devices deployed to peoples homes.