Project: IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs)

Submission Title: [Comment resolutions on the parameters for color function support (T-CID 124 and 221)]

Date Submitted: [13th September, 2010]

Source: [Sang-Kyu Lim, Ill Soon Jang, Dae Ho Kim, You Jin Kim, Kang Tae-Gyu]   Company [ETRI]
Address: [138 Gajeongno, Yuseong-Gu, Daejeon, Korea]
Voice:[+82-42-860-1573], FAX: [+82-42-860-5218], E-Mail:[sklim@etri.re.kr]

Re: [Response to LB57]

Abstract: [This document describes LB57 comment resolution related to the parameters for color function support (T-CID 124 and 221).]

Purpose: [To resolve LB57 comment resolution related to the parameters for color function support (T-CID 124 and 221)]

Comment resolutions on the parameters for color function support
(T-CID 124 and 221)

Sang-Kyu Lim

sklim@etri.re.kr

ETRI

CID 124 (= CID 125 in 694/r2)

CID	Name	Clause	Subclause	Page	Line	Comment	SuggestedRemedy	Accepted Remedy
124	Rick Roberts	6	Table 35	72	47	Why do we need both "ColorRecived" and "ColorNotReceived" parameters. Doesn't the failure of one imply the other.	Discuss in committee and consider the removal of the "ColorNotReceived" parameter.	Accepte - delete "ColorNotReceived" and indicate that a False ColorReceived implies ColorNotReceived. Do this throughout the text.

Table 35 - MCPS-DATA.request parameters

Name	Type	Valid range	Description
ColorReceived	Boolean	TRUE/FALSE	ColorReceived shall be set as TRUE, if CVD frame is sent when data frame is successfully received.
ColorNotReceived	Boolean	TRUE/FALSE	ColorNotReceived shall be set as TRUE, if CVD frame is sent when data frame is not received.

CID 124 (= CID 125 in 694/r2) (cont.)

- 'ColorReceived' parameter does not imply that data frame is successfully received.
- Similarly, 'ColorNotReceived' parameter does not imply that data is not received or the received data has some errors.
- 'ColorReceived' is the parameter which decide to send or not to send the CVD frame to indicate ACK state which means data frame is successfully received.
- 'ColorNotReceived' is the parameter which decide to send or not to send the CVD frame to indicate non-ACK state which means data frame is not received or the received data has some errors.
- In conclusion 'ColorNotReceived' does not mean when 'ColorReceived' is FALSE.

- **Therefore we need both 'ColorReceived' and 'ColorNotReceived' parameters in table 35.**

CID 124 (= CID 125 in 694/r2) (cont.)

Table 35 - MCPS-DATA.request parameters

Name	Type	Valid range	Description
ColorReceived	Boolean	TRUE/FALSE	ColorReceived shall be set as TRUE, if ~~CVD frame is sent when data frame is successfully received.~~ if data frame is successfully received and then the CVD frame to indicate this ACK state is sent. ColorReceived shall be set as FALSE, if data frame is successfully received but the CVD frame to indicate this ACK state is not sent.
ColorNotReceived	Boolean	TRUE/FALSE	ColorNotReceived shall be set as TRUE, ~~if CVD frame is sent when data frame is not received.~~ if data frame is not received or the received data has some errors and then the CVD frame to indicate this non-ACK state is sent. ColorNotReceived shall be set as FALSE, if data frame is not received or the received data has some errors but the CVD frame to indicate this non-ACK state is not sent.

CID 124 (= CID 125 in 694/r2) (cont.)

- **Recommendation/Instruction to editor**
  - Accepted in principle.

    'ColorNotReceived' is OK. Need 'ColorNotReceived' as well as 'ColorReceived'. But change the descriptions for 'ColorReceived' and 'ColorNotReceived' parameters in table 35 to the sentences on slide 5 in 10/715/r0.

CID 221 (= CID 219 in 694/r2)

CID	Name	Clause	Subclause	Page	Line	Comment	SuggestedRemedy
221	Rick Roberts	6	Table 91	173	47	*macColorNotReceived*	**How can you tell you have not received something? Committee needs to discuss this. My inclination is to delete this MAC PIB attribute unless it is explained why this should be kept.**

Table 91 - MAC PIB attributes

Attribute	Identifier	Type	Range	Description	Default
macColorNotReceived	0x66	Unsigned	0-6	Use macColorNotReceived for CVD Frame which denotes 'not received'. The unsigned integer variable represents the desired visible light wavelength as shown in the band plan code of Table 1.	0

CID 221 (= CID 219 in 694/r2) (cont.)

- '*macColorReceived*' parameter is not a parameter telling us that data frame is successfully received.
- Similarly, '*macColorNotReceived*' parameter is not a parameter telling us that data is not received or the received data has some errors.
- '*macColorReceived*' is the parameter to assign a color to the CVD frame when the CVD frame for the ACK state indication is sent.
- '*macColorNotReceived*' is the parameter to assign a color to the CVD frame when the CVD frame for the non-ACK state indication is sent.

- **Therefore we need '*macColorNotReceived*' parameter as well as ''*macColorReceived*' in table 91.**

CID 221 (= CID 219 in 694/r2) (cont.)

Table 91 - MAC PIB attributes

Attribute	Identifier	Type	Range	Description	Default
macColorReceived	0x65	Unsigned	0-6	Use macColorReceived for the color assignment of CVD Frame when the CVD frame for the ACK state indication is sent. ~~which denotes 'received'.~~ The unsigned integer variable represents the desired visible light wavelength as shown in the band plan code of Table 1.	0
macColorNotReceived	0x66	Unsigned	0-6	Use macColorNotReceived for the color assignment of CVD Frame when the CVD frame for the non-ACK state indication is sent. ~~which denotes 'not received'.~~ The unsigned integer variable represents the desired visible light wavelength as shown in the band plan code of Table 1.	0

CID 221 (= CID 219 in 694/r2) (cont.)

- **Recommendation/Instruction to editor**
  - Accepted in principle.

    '*macColorNotReceived*' is OK. Need '*macColorNotReceived*' as well as '*macColorReceived*'. But change the descriptions for '*macColorReceived*' and '*macColorNotReceived*' parameters in table 91 to the sentences on slide 9 in 10/715/r0.