Project: IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs)

Submission Title: [Comment resolutions for SFD – Part I]

Date Submitted: [July , 2010]

Source: [Alina Liru LU, Hiroshi HARADA, Ryuhei FUNADA , Fumihide KOJIMA]
Company [NICT]
Address [3-4, Hikarino-oka, Yokosuka, 239-0847, Japan]
Voice: [+81-46-847-5092], FAX: [+81-46-847-5440], E-Mail: [liru@nict.com.sg, harada@nict.go.jp]

Re: []

Abstract: [This document provides resolutions to part of comments for SFD]

Purpose: [This document provides resolutions to comments of LB51]

SFD CID 829

- Comment: Distinguish between 2-FSK and 4-FSK in Table 27 or remove the "symbols" column entirely, since each PHY has a unique way of converting from octets to symbols anyway..
- Response: Accept in principle
- Resolution: Change Table 27 to

Table 27—SFD field length

PHY	Length	
MR-FSK	2 octets	16 bits

SFD CID 830

- Comment: Recommend that a guideline be produced to help distinguish between bits, symbols and also bits/s - coded or uncoded.
- Response: Accept
- Resolution: Guide line will be provided by Gilb. Resolved as CID829

SFD CID 837

- Comment: First sentence: "The MR-FSK SFD field consists of 2 bytes" (1) "octet" is the appropriate term for 8-bit entity, and (2) 2 octets is the same as 16 bits as stated in the next sentence, so the first sentence is redundant.
- Response: Accept
- Resolution: Change the text to 'The SFD used by the MR-FSK PHY shall be a 16-bit sequence selected from the list of values shown in Table 28a.' by deleting the first sentence

SFD CID 1118

- Comment:. rename the attribute as "phySUNMRFSKMode"
- Response:Reject
- Resolution:The atrribute “phySUNMRFSKSFD” defines which SFD pair to be used. It is not to specify “Mode”. It would be fine to change to “phySUNMRFSKSFD”.

SFD CID 839

- Comment: Change table 28a so col 1 says "not FEC coded" and "FEC coded"; Remove PIB attribute phyMRFSKSFD.
- Resolution: resolved by comment 845

SFD CID 840

- Comment:. Delete sentence.
- Response: Accept in principle
- Resolution: change the text to 'The SFD used by the MR-FSK PHY shall be a 16-bit sequence selected from the list of values shown in Table 28a. All devices shall be capable of supporting the SFD for uncoded PSDU+PHR as shown in Table 28a with phyMRFSKSFD=0. Devices which support FEC shall be capable of supporting the SFDs for both coded and uncoded PSDU+PHR as shown in Table 28a with phyMRFSKSFD=0. Devices may also support the SFD values shown in Table 28a with phyMRFSKSFD=1. The SFD is transmitted starting from the leftmost bit.'

SFD CID 845, 846, 847

- Comment:.

  Remove the second row of table 28a(845)

  If a second SFD is necessary it should use the same RX structure as the first(846)

  Remove optional pair of SFDs (associated with a value of phyMRFSKSFD == 1) (847)

- Resolution:TBD

SFD CID 848, 1117, 1119

- Comment:.

  The parameter phyMRFSKSFD shows which SFD to transmit, but does it signal which SFD pair to search for? - or must the RX search for all 4 SFD's(848)

  This seems to be unnecessary complexity. It should be only one set of values not two or more. Suggest to select only one set and adopt it.(1117)

  If a second SFD is necessary it should use the same RX structure as the first (1119)

- Response: Accept in principle
- Resolution: resolved by comment 845