

July, 2010

doc.: IEEE 802.15-10-0523-00-004g

Project: IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs)

Submission Title: [Comment resolutions for SFD]

Date Submitted: [July , 2010]

Source: [Alina Liru LU, Hiroshi HARADA, Ryuhei FUNADA]

Company [NICT]

Address [3-4, Hikarino-oka, Yokosuka, 239-0847, Japan]

Voice: [+81-46-847-5092], FAX: [+81-46-847-5440], E-Mail: [liru@nict.com.sg, harada@nict.go.jp]

Re: []

Abstract: [This document provides resolutions to comments for SFD]

Purpose: [This document provides resolutions to comments of LB51]

Notice: This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.15. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.

Release: The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by P802.15.

SFD CID 829

- Comment: Distinguish between 2-FSK and 4-FSK in Table 27 or remove the "symbols" column entirely, since each PHY has a unique way of converting from octets to symbols anyway..
- Response: Accept in principle
- Resolution: Change Table 27 to

Table 27—SFD field length

PHY	Length	
MR-FSK	2 octets	16 bits

SFD CID 830

- Comment: Recommend that a guideline be produced to help distinguish between bits, symbols and also bits/s - coded or uncoded.
- Response: Accept
- Resolution: Guide line will be provided by Gilb. Resolved as CID829

SFD CID 837

- Comment: First sentence: "The MR-FSK SFD field consists of 2 bytes" (1) "octet" is the appropriate term for 8-bit entity, and (2) 2 octets is the same as 16 bits as stated in the next sentence, so the first sentence is redundant.
- Response: Accept
- Resolution: Change the text to 'The SFD used by the MR-FSK PHY shall be a 16-bit sequence selected from the list of values shown in Table 28a.' by deleting the first sentence

SFD CID 839

- Comment: Change table 28a so col 1 says "not FEC coded" and "FEC coded"; Remove PIB attribute phyMRFSKSFD.
- Resolution: resolved by comment 845

SFD CID 840

- Comment: Delete sentence.
- Response: Accept in principle
- Resolution: change the text to ‘The SFD used by the MR-FSK PHY shall be a 16-bit sequence selected from the list of values shown in Table 28a. All devices shall be capable sending and receiving the SFD for uncoded PSDU+PHR as shown in Table 28a when phyMRFSKSFD=0. Devices which support FEC shall be capable of transmitting and receiving the SFDs for both coded and uncoded PSDU+PHR as shown in Table 28a when phyMRFSKSFD=0. The SFD values shown in Table 28a when phyMRFSKSFD=1 are optional for all devices. The SFD is transmitted starting from the leftmost bit.’

SFD CID 845, 846, 847

- Comment:.

- Remove the second row of table 28a(845)

- If a second SFD is necessary it should use the same RX structure as the first(846)

- Remove optional pair of SFDs (associated with a value of phyMRFSKSFd == 1)
(847)

- Resolution:TBD

SFD CID 848, 1117, 1119

- Comment:

The parameter phyMRFSKSFID shows which SFD to transmit, but does it signal which SFD pair to search for? - or must the RX search for all 4 SFD's(848)

This seems to be unnecessary complexity. It should be only one set of values not two or more. Suggest to select only one set and adopt it.(1117)

If a second SFD is necessary it should use the same RX structure as the first (1119)

- Response: Accept in principle

- Resolution: resolved by comment 845

SFD CID 1118

- Comment:. rename the attribute as "phySUNMRFSKMode"
- Response:Reject
- Resolution:The attribute "phySUNMRFSKSFD" defines which SFD pair to be used. It is not to specify "Mode". It would be fine to change to "phySUNMRFSKSFD".