**IEEE P802.15**

**Wireless Personal Area Networks**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Project | IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs) |
| Title |  |
| Date Submitted | [10 July 2010] |
| Source | [][][address] | Voice: [ ]Fax: [ ]E-mail: [ ] |
| Re: | [Task Group 802.15.4e Ad Hoc Meeting in San Diego] |
| Abstract | [Task Group 802.15.4e Minutes.] |
| Purpose | [Minutes of the Task Group Ad Hoc |
| Notice | This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.15. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. |
| Release | The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by P802.15. |

**IEEE 802.15 Ad Hoc Meeting**

**July 2010**

**Task Group 4e Minutes**

[Wednesday, 7 July 2010, 8:00 (PM1) 2](#_Toc266525375)

[Wednesday, 7 July 2010, 16:05 (PM2) 3](#_Toc266525376)

[Thursday, 8 July 2010, 8:00 (AM1) 4](#_Toc266525377)

[Thursday, 8 July 2010, 10:30 (AM2) 4](#_Toc266525378)

[Thursday, 8 July 2010, 13:30 (PM1) 4](#_Toc266525379)

[Thursday, 8 July 2010, 16:00 (PM2) 4](#_Toc266525380)

[Friday, 9 July 2010, 8:00 (AM1) 5](#_Toc266525381)

[Friday, 9 July 2010, 10:30 (AM2) 5](#_Toc266525382)

[Friday, 9 July 2010, 13:30 (PM1) 5](#_Toc266525383)

[Friday, 9 July 2010, 16:00 (PM2) 5](#_Toc266525384)

# Wednesday, 7 July 2010, 8:00 (PM1)

**13:50** Pat Kinney, TG4e chair, called the meeting to order.

Attendance is captured in annex 1. Chair presented opening report 15-10-0294-00-004e:

Chair reminded attendees that this Ad Hoc session would abide by the IEEE rules including the patent rules, antitrust, and competition rules.

**Agenda for San Diego Ad Hoc**

Chair presented the agenda 15-10-0416-00. The following enhancements were agreed upon:

* Joint meeting with TG4g on Thursday, PM1 to discuss common issues such as Channel hopping, etc.
* Wednesday PM1 and PM2 and Thursday AM1 and AM2 will be allocated to General and Metrics comments
* Thursday PM1 and PM2 along with Friday AM1 and AM2 will be allocated to DSME comments.
* Friday PM1 and PM2 will be allocated to TSCH comments.

There was no opposition to these enhancements.

**14:00 Review of** **Comment Resolution Process**

The chair advised the group on the IEEE requirements of letter ballot comment resolution. The chair further advised the group to treat all comments as per their merits and not by the commenter’s vote; the rationale being that the primary purpose of the comments is to improve the quality of the draft and not to turn “no” voters to “yes” voters.

The group agreed to the following comment resolution process:

1. Define comment resolution categories and name team leads
2. Assign categories to each comment
3. Categorize comments as per team
4. First review of comments into resolution classes
	* More information from commenter needed
	* Out of scope
	* Straightforward resolution (i.e. just do it)
	* Contradictory/contentious
5. Send out emails to commenters requesting additional information
	* If no response within ~1-2 week(s), comment will be rejected
6. Comment resolution team to work on non-contentious comments
7. Those comments with high potential for conflict should be scheduled for a face-face meeting

**Resolutions**

The group agreed to the following resolutions:

* Accept (A) – comment and proposed change are agreed upon
* Accept in Principle (AiP) – comment is agreed upon but with a different propose change
* Reject (R) – comment and proposed change are not agree upon, reason for rejection will be stated in the comment database
* Withdrawn (W) – comment and proposed change were withdrawn by commenter

**Categorization**

The group agreed to categorize the comments as per the following categories and leads:

* DSME Myung Lee (Liang Li will be acting lead for this ad hoc)
* TSCH Jonathan Simon
* LE Wei Hong
* LL Michael Bahr
* EBR Pat Kinney
* ESOR Ben Rolfe/Robert Cragie
* General Pat Kinney
* 4F Tim Harrington
* 4G Wun-Cheol Jeong/Greg Gillooly
* Metrics Tim Godfrey
* FastA Betty Zhao

**Comments categorized as General** (15-10-321-03)

The group reviewed the General comment resolutions as per 15-10-0321-03 capturing all changes in document 15-10-0321-04. It was agreed to defer conclusion on CID 522 for guidance from J Simon.

**15:35** meeting recessed

# Wednesday, 7 July 2010, 16:05 (PM2)

**15:55** Chair called the meeting to order

General comment categorization continued with results captured in document 15-10-0321-04. CID 583 resolution needs guidance from J Gilb. Problem with duplicating tables due to different values for each mode, ask J Gilb if we should include changes in each table.

**17:55** Upon reaching CID 613, meeting recessed by chair

# Thursday, 8 July 2010, 8:00 (AM1)

**8:10** Meeting called to order. Attendance noted in Annex 2.

General comment categorization continued until completion with results captured in document 15-10-0321-04.

Significant discussion ensued as to the formatting of the amendment; should each mode’s behavior be organized into a specific section for that mode or should the behavior be grouped into behavior types?

Significant discussion on the issue of beacon flags allowing an unassociated device to better understand the network’s mode along with combining this change to include coexistence information. Liang Li volunteered to lead this effort with a report to the TG4e on Monday afternoon.

**10:00** Chair recessed the meeting, stopping at CID1068.

# Thursday, 8 July 2010, 10:30 (AM2)

**10:40** Chair called meeting to order.

Discussion ensued as to the comments marked as Metrics, led by T Godfrey (15-10-0458-00). Changes were captured in 15-10-483-00.

General comment resolution effort continued and was completed by the break, changes were captured in 15-10-0321-04.

**12:15** meeting recessed until Thursday PM1

# Thursday, 8 July 2010, 13:30 (PM1)

**13:43** Chair called meeting to order

The group started reviewing DSME comments led by Liang Li. Resolutions are captured in document 15-10-0482-01. Group agreed that comments 522, 523, 524, 529, 530, 821, 1469, and 1515 should be reassigned to TSCH.

**15:47** Chair recessed until PM2

# Thursday, 8 July 2010, 16:00 (PM2)

**16:07** Chair called meeting to order

The group continued reviewing DSME comments led by Liang Li. Resolutions are captured in document 15-10-0482-01.

**17:54** Meeting recessed

# Friday, 9 July 2010, 8:00 (AM1)

**8:24** Meeting called to order. Attendance noted in Annex 3.

The group continued reviewing DSME comments led by Liang Li. Resolutions are captured in document 15-10-0482-01.

**10:00** Chair recessed the meeting

# Friday, 9 July 2010, 10:30 (AM2)

**10:40** Chair called meeting to order

The group continued reviewing DSME comments led by Liang Li. Resolutions are captured in document 15-10-0482-01.

**12:00** meeting recessed until Thursday PM1

# Friday, 9 July 2010, 13:30 (PM1)

**13:43** Chair called meeting to order

The group started reviewing TSCH comments led by Jonathan Simon (15-10-0466-00). Resolutions are captured in document 15-10-0466-01. J Simon agreed that comments 523, 524, 529, 530, 1469, and 1515 should be reassigned to TSCH but disagreed with 522 and 821.

Discussion ensued as to the issue of MAC support for Channel Hopping with the agreement that J Simon and Wun-Cheol Jeong would define a proposal that should address the LB53 comments pertaining to hopping including a default hop sequence. The DSME hopping requirement and TG4g perceived requirements would be addressed by this proposal.

**15:47** Chair recessed until PM2

# Friday, 9 July 2010, 16:00 (PM2)

**16:07** Chair called meeting to order

The group continued reviewing TSCH comments led by J Simon. Resolutions are captured in document 15-10-0482-01. All comments marked TSCH were reviewed.

**17:24** Meeting adjourned

**Annex 1**

7 July attendees:

Pat Kinney Kinney Consulting

Kazuyuk Yasukawa Fuji Electric

Kiyoshi Fukai Oki

Ludwig Winkel Siemens

Liang Li Vinno

Tim Godfrey EPRI

Betty Zhao Huawei

Quan Wang CQUPT

**Annex 2**

8 July attendees:

Pat Kinney Kinney Consulting

Kiyoshi Fukai Oki

Kazuyuki Yasukawa Fuji Electric

Betty Zhao Huawei

Liang Li Vinno

Tim Godfrey EPRI

Ludwig Winkel Siemens

Wun-Cheol Jeong ETRI

Chan-Sub Shin ETRI

**Annex 3**

9 July attendees:

Pat Kinney Kinney Consulting

Ludwig Winkel Siemens

Liang Li Vinno

Betty Zhao Huawei

Kazuyuki Yasukawa Fuji Electric

Wun-Cheol Jeong ETRI

Chang-Sub Shin ETRI

Jonathan Simon Dust

Ben Rolfe BCA