

Project: IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs)

Submission Title: Resolution for acknowledgement frame (CID 653, 654, 655, 656)

Date Submitted: 9th July, 2010

Source: Jaeseung Son

Company: Samsung Electronics Co.,LTD

Address: Dong Suwon P.O. Box 105, 416 Maetan-3dong, Yeongtong-gu, Suwon-si, Gyeonggi-do, 443-742
Korea

Voice:[82-31-279-5285], **FAX:** [82-31-279-5130], **E-Mail:**[js1007.son@samsung.com]

Re: []

Abstract: Resolution for acknowledgement frame comments

Purpose: Contribution to IEEE 802.15.7 TG-VLC

Notice: This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.15. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.

Release: The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by P802.15.

CID 653 (Subclause 7.2.2.2, page 139)

Comment

- Does this subclause define one or two ack frames? Figure 73 has no frame payload, and Figure 74 has no MHR/MFR, but apparently they are not for the same frame. Also, what is the definition of the sequence number in Figure 73 (i.e., how is it supposed to be set)?

Suggested Remedy

- Either define only a single ack frame or split the subclause into two to define two separate ack frames.

Resolution/instruction to editor

- My suggestion is **Accept**.
- Sequence number is defined in 7.2.2.1.1. and sentence is inserted in 481/r0
- Single ack frame format (Figure 72) is updated with missing part. Please refer 481/r0 document.
- Instruction to editor: Please replace 7.2.2.2 acknowledgement frame format with document 15-10-0481-00-0007

CID 654 (Subclause 7.2.2.2, page 139)

Comment

- (TR) §7.2.2, p. 139ff: The acknowledgement frame has the same format as the corresponding acknowledgement frame with 802.15.4-2006 and, in particular, lacks an acknowledgement payload field (cf. Fig. 73). Nevertheless, from the description on p. 140, l. 3-4 and from Fig. 74, it seems that the so-called B-ACK frame has a payload field. This clearly needs fixing. Suggested remedy: Redefine the syntax and semantics of the acknowledgement frame, so as to take into account inclusion of an acknowledgement payload field.

Suggested Remedy

- Redefine the syntax and semantics of the acknowledgement frame, so as to take into account inclusion of an acknowledgement payload field.

Resolution/instruction to editor

- My suggestion is **Accept**.
- Single ack frame format(Figure 72) is updated with B-ACK frame payload. Please refer 481/r0 document.
- Instruction to editor: Please replace 7.2.2.2 acknowledgement frame format with document 15-10-0481-00-0007

CID 655 (Subclause 7.2.2.2, page 140)

Comment

- Did you happen to copy Figure 75 from 15.3 and the paragraph under it from the WiMedia MAC spec? The former does not look like a bit map as the caption suggests. Further, where is the fragment number field in the MHR? If such a field is present here, isn't it also needed in Figure 73, or the sequence number field in the latter is not warranted?

Suggested Remedy

- Be a bit consistent.

Resolution/instruction to editor

- My suggestion is **Accept**.
- Sequence number is defined in 7.2.2.1.1. and sentence is inserted in 481/r0
- Instruction to editor: Please replace 7.2.2.2 acknowledgement frame format with document 15-10-0481-00-0007

CID 656 (Subclause 7.2.2.2, page 140, line 1)

Comment

- The Acknowledgement frame format contains no payload, but the rest of the text describe extra information that is somehow conveyed

Suggested Remedy

- Remove all text of 7.2.2.2 on page 140

Resolution/instruction to editor

- My suggestion is **Accept**.
- Single ack frame format (Figure 72) is updated with B-ACK frame payload. Please refer 481/r0 document.
- Instruction to editor: Please replace 7.2.2.2 acknowledgement frame format with document 15-10-0481-00-0007