**IEEE P802.15**

**Wireless Personal Area Networks**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Project | IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs) | |
| Title |  | |
| Date Submitted | [June 25, 2010] | |
| Source | [] [] [Pleasanton, CA] | Voice: [ (925) 997 0576 ] Fax: [ ] E-mail: [Shearer\_inc @ yahoo.com ] |
| Re: | [802.15.4g] TG4g LB51 Comment Resolution | |
| Abstract | Meeting notes for conference call comment resolution, June 24, 2010 | |
| Purpose | Record of discussions and decisions | |
| Notice | This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.15. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. | |
| Release | The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by P802.15. | |

# Attendees

Charles Razzel, Shusaku Shimada, Steve Shearer, Mark Wilbur, Tim Schmidl, Kuor-Hsin Chang, Sangsung Choi, Khurram Waheed, Chuck Millet, Larry Taylor, Rishi Mohindra, Cristina Seibert, Jay Ramasastry, Monique Brown, Emmanuel Monnerie

(Steve Shearer: I’m sure I missed some people, please email me if you wish to have your name included)

# General discussion on the document #418:

Thanks to Emmanuel and Tim for preparing a first cut at proposed resolutions for many of the OFDM related comments.

Several comments were labeled as editorial where they would have been more correctly labeled as editorial. These were discussed first and it was agreed that the remaining editorial comments included in the spreadsheet (Doc 418) would be left to the Technical editors. The technical editors will review them and decide what to do with them.

The resolution status (A/AP/R) for the editorial comments will be removed in the next version. The technical editors will handle this column.

Several documents proposing resolutions were posted to the reflector and referred to in some of the proposed resolutions. The group agreed that all needed time to review those documents.

# Comments that are flagged as Editorial but should be treated as technical comments:

CID 182: Action item for the OFDM subgroup: specify the exact bandwidth for each one of the 5 OFDM option. Some discussion around the bandwidth specification (20dB or 6dB?). Steve to provide further input.

CID 485: Change category to Generic PHY/Channel page

CID 1091: This comment has two parts: OFDM and O-QPSK. The OFDM subgroup provided a proposed resolution for the OFDM part. The OQPSK subgroup should also look at this comment and provide a proposed resolution.

# Technical Comments:

Comments around LIFS and SIFS (CID 683, 825, 876) are reassigned to another subgroup (radio specification)

964 Tim will get info to resolve

STF definition (CID 974, 975, 976, 982, 984, 996, 997): Cristina, Steve, Tim, Sangsung to discuss off line and make a proposal.

CID 1014 and 1011. The value in the table is 10\*LOG(1.25), which is easier to implement than 2dB. Some further discussion took place and we decided to defer this comment resolution.

CID 1029: request clarification from James Gilb

Comment around HCS (CID 1035, 1036, 1037, 1038, 1039, 1045, 1055). Defer. Let the participants review the documents #417, #425, #426 first.

CID 1040 and 1041: request clarification from Sangsung. Agree later

CID 1050: general agreement on rejecting this comment. Will contact the author to ask for clarification.

CID 1056: update the diagram in doc 425

CID 1059: send to bit order sub group Larry Taylor

CID 1064: defer

CID 1065: Steve to refer to 425 for possible solution

CID 1092 & 1091: Agree with the proposed resolution for OFDM, request clarification from MR-O-QPSK

CID 1105: modified proposed resolution Contact James

CID 1125, 1130: Discussion between Monique and Tim. Mostly editorial issue.

CID 1338 : this is actually an editorial comment

Common data rates for OFDM (CID:1341, 1042, 1044): Steve to add a clarifying text around the mandatory/default data rates and MCS levels

DCM-related comments (CID 1374, 1373, 1388, 1390): defer

Scrambler (CID 1379, 1380, 1381). Defer. Let the group review documents #417 and #426 first.

CID 1382: Defer. See document #426.

CID 1405, 1406, 1408: comment is actually editorial. Accept

CID 1423: review doc 423 first

CID 1430: Tim to review 423

CID 1439: Tim to ensure that the term ndbps is defined before it is used. Add acronym to clause 3,4

CID 1439, 1440: were accepted 5/20/2010, so remove them from this discussion

CID 1444, 1449: Tim presented doc 417. Cristina requested scrambling last according to CID 1381. Defer

CID 1451, 1460: AP. Tim to provide sensitivity levels