IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 802.11bi – Comment resolution Clauses 9.6.42.4, 9.6.42.5, 9.6.42.6, 9.6.42.7 | | | | |
| Date: March 10, 2024 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Antonio de la Oliva | Interdigital Ltd, UC3M |  |  | aoliva@it.uc3m.es |

Abstract

This submission addresses the comments with CID:

1016, 1017, 62, 218, 858, 859, 909, 922, 1018, 63, 217, 1019, 123, 219, ~~936~~, 951, 1020

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page(C)** | **Line(C)** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 1016 | 9.6.42.4 | 71 | 58 | EDP Epochs are only available for MLDs, but "STA" and "AP are used here. | "STA and "AP" should be "non-AP MLD" and "AP MLD" respectively. | REVISED  Editor please change the phrase to " A CPE non-AP MLD may send an EDP Epoch Request frame to request a new EDP epoch group creation, assignment to a particular EDP epoch group, or leave from the current EDP epoch group, as defined in 10.71.2.1 (General(#1091)) and 10.71.2.2 (EDP group operations(#1091))”  As tagged with [218] in document 25/558r0. |
| 1017 | 9.6.42.4 | 71 | 59 | This is a request frame sent by a non-AP MLD to an AP MLD. The text "or to be assigned" and "or to maintain" can suggest that the message is used by the AP MLD for assignment and maintaining. | Replace "or to be assigned" with "or to request assignment" . Replace "or to maintain" with "or to request maintaining" . | REVISED  Editor please change the phrase to " A CPE non-AP MLD may send an EDP Epoch Request frame to request a new EDP epoch group creation, assignment to a particular EDP epoch group, or leave from the current EDP epoch group, as defined in 10.71.2.1 (General(#1091)) and 10.71.2.2 (EDP group operations(#1091))”  As tagged with [218] in document 25/558r0. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page(C)** | **Line(C)** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 62 | 9.6.42.5 | 71 | 58 | "...CPE STA provides an AP to request a..." Should be "provides to an AP" | At cited location insert "to" after "provides". | REVISED  Editor please change the phrase to " A CPE non-AP MLD may send an EDP Epoch Request frame to request a new EDP epoch group creation, assignment to a particular EDP epoch group, or leave from the current EDP epoch group, as defined in 10.71.2.1 (General(#1091)) and 10.71.2.2 (EDP group operations(#1091))”  As tagged with [218] in document 25/558r0. |
| 218 | 9.6.42.5 | 72 | 28 | Unclear sentence. | Please change to:" A CPE non-AP MLD may send an EDP Epoch Request frame to request a new EDP epoch group creation, assignment to a particular EDP epoch group, or leave from the current EDP epoch group, as defined in 10.71.2.1 (General(#1091)) and 10.71.2.2 (EDP group operations(#1091)).." | ACCEPT |
| 858 | 9.6.42.5 | 71 | 58 | Why only a "new" EDP Epoch request can be requested for the action frame EDP Epoch Request frame ? | This action frame could be modified such as a STA can request also an update of an EDP Epoch group. | REJECTED  Updating the parameters of an EDP Epoch sequence would cause problems for other non-AP MLD which have already joined that group. |
| 859 | 9.6.42.5 | 71 | 58 | Why an EDP Epoch request frame can be sent only by a STA and not by an AP ? An AP would like to update characteristics of an existing EDP Epoch group or to request a STA to move to another EDP Epoch group. | This action frame should enable also for an AP. | REVISED  Editor please implement the changes tagged as [859] in document 25/558r0. |
| 909 | 9.6.42.5 | 71 | 58 | Why can a STA send an EDP Epoch request frame, while an AP cannot? | AP should too | REVISED  Editor please implement the changes tagged as [859] in document 25/558r0. |
| 922 | 9.6.42.5 | 71 | 58 | Why an EDP Epoch request frame can be sent only by a STA and not by an AP ? An AP would like to update characteristics of an existing EDP Epoch group or to request a STA to move to another EDP Epoch group. | This action frame should enable also for an AP. | REVISED  Editor please implement the changes tagged as [859] in document 25/558r0. |
| 1018 | 9.6.42.5 | 71 | 65 | This sentence is between a table caption and the corresponding table. | Move sentence before caption or after table. | ACCEPT |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page(C)** | **Line(C)** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 63 | 9.6.42.6 | 72 | 30 | "...provides a STA in response..." Should be "provides to" | At cited location insert "to" after "provides". | REVISED Changed to Please change to:" The EDP Epoch Response frame contains a response to a EDP Epoch Request frame.”, tagged as [217] in document 25/558r0. |
| 217 | 9.6.42.6 | 73 | 3 | Unclear sentence. | Please change to:" The EDP Epoch Response frame contains a response to a EDP Epoch Request frame." | ACCEPT |
| 1019 | 9.6.42.6 | 72 | 29 | EDP Epochs are only available for MLDs, but "STA" and "AP are used here. | "STA and "AP" should be "non-AP MLD" and "AP MLD" respectively. | REVISED  Changed to Please change to:" The EDP Epoch Response frame contains a response to a EDP Epoch Request frame.”, tagged as [217] in document 25/558r0. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page(C)** | **Line(C)** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 123 | 9.6.42.7 | 73 | 1 | Inconsist use of "ota" and "OTA". | Change to: OTA MAC Collision Warning frame | ACCEPT |
| 219 | 9.6.42.7 | 73 | 42 | Unclear sentence. | Please change to:" The otaMAC Collision Warning frame warns on upcoming MAC address collision with another STA". | REVISED  Revised to The OTAMAC Collision Notification frame warns of an upcoming MAC address collision with another STA in a given epoch.  See resolution tagged with [219] in document with DCN 25/558r0. |
| 951 | 9.6.42.7 | 73 | 3 | Bad grammar. We typically use "indicate" not "signal". It is not clear what the adjective "OTA" adds. Do we use MAC addresses in some other manner? It is not obvious what collision means (e.g., it could mean that to transmissions overlap). I don't see how a calculation can predict collision. Isn't it a comparison operation? Does it matter if the MAC addresses are used in different epochs? Presumably not. | Change to "The OTA MAC Collision Warning frame is used to indicate that a MAC address that will be used by an EDP non-AP MLD in an upcoming epoch is the same as a the MAC address that will be used by another STA in that epoch." Since we don't want to repeat information, change the sentence at 61.54 to "The OTA MAC Collison Warning element is sued in the OTA MAC Collision Warning frame (see 9.6.42.7). | REVISED  Editor to modifiy the text to “The OTAMAC Collision Notification frame warns of an upcoming MAC address collision with another STA in a given epoch.” As tagged with [219] in document 25/558r0. |
| 1020 | 9.6.42.7 | 73 | 3 | "is used to signal when an OTA MAC address expected to be used by an EDP non-AP MLD in an upcoming epoch is calculated". Two issues. First, it is not used justby the AP MLD to signal when this ocurs, but is also used in a response from the non-AP MLD. Also, the description does nto clarify who does the calculation | Replace "is used when an OTA MAC address expected to be used by a non-AP MLD in an upcoming epoch is calculated (by the AP MLD)" | REVISED  Editor to modifiy the text to “The OTAMAC Collision Notification frame warns of an upcoming MAC address collision with another STA in a given epoch.” As tagged with [219] in document 25/558r0. |

**9.6.42.4 EDP Groups [1011] [315] Parameter frame format**

The EDP Groups [1011] [315] Parameter frame is used to carry the EDP epoch settings for one or more [1012] EDP groups [499] using the procedures defined in 10.71.2.2 (EDP group operations) and 10.71.2.3 (EDP epoch transitions operations). The EDP Groups [1011] [315] Parameter frame contains the information shown in Table 9-658z (EDP Groups [1011] [315] Parameter frame Action field format).

**Table 9-658z—EDP Group**s [1011] **Parameter frame Action field format**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Order** | **Meaning** |
| 0 | Category |
| 1 | EDP Action |
| 2 | Dialog Token |
| 3 | [1013] Number of EDP Epoch Settings ~~Number of EDP Epoch Settings Included~~ |
| 4 | EDP Epoch Settings List |

The Category field is defined in 9.4.1.11 (Action field).

The EDP Action field is defined in 9.6.42.1 (EDP Action field).

The [1013] [1014] Number of EDP Epoch Settings ~~Number of EDP Epoch Settings Included~~ field specifies the number of EDP Epoch Settings fields that are in the EDP Epoch Settings List field [1014] (i.e., the number of EDP groups for which parameters are conveyed). The length of this field is one octet. [500] The v~~V~~alue 0 is reserved.

The EDP Epoch Settings List field contains one or more EDP Epoch [501] Settings [501] fields (as defined in 9.4.1.83 (EDP Epoch Settings field)) indicating the parameters of EDP groups that the AP MLD wants to convey to the non-AP MLD.

**9.6.42.5 EDP Epoch Request frame format**

[218] ~~The EDP Epoch Request frame contains the information that a CPE STA provides [63] to an AP to request a new EDP epoch group, or to be assigned to a particular EDP epoch group, or to maintain its current EDP epoch group, as defined in 10.71.2.1 (General) and 10.71.2.2 (EDP group operations).~~

[218] A CPE non-AP MLD may send an EDP Epoch Request frame to request a new EDP epoch group creation, assignment to a particular EDP epoch group, or leave from the current EDP epoch group, as defined in 10.71.2.1 (General) and 10.71.2.2 (EDP group operations).

**Table 9-658aa—EDP Epoch Request frame Action field format**

[1018] ~~The Category field is defined in 9.4.1.11 (Action field).~~

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Order** | **Meaning** |
| 0 | Category |
| 1 | EDP Action |
| 2 | Dialog Token |
| 3 | Epoch [502] R~~r~~equest |
| 4 | EDP Epoch Settings |

[1018] The Category field is defined in 9.4.1.11 (Action field).

The EDP Action field is defined in 9.6.42.1 (EDP Action field).

The Dialog Token field is defined in 9.4.1.12 (Dialog Token field) and is set to a nonzero value to identify the request/response transaction.

The Epoch Request field is defined in 9.4.1.84 (Epoch Request field).

The EDP Epoch Settings field is defined in 9.4.1.83 (EDP Epoch Settings field).

**9.6.42.6 EDP Epoch Response frame format**

The EDP Epoch Response frame contains [217] the response to an EDP Epoch Request frame. ~~information that an AP provides [63] to a STA in response to the STA's EDP Epoch Request frame.~~

**Table 9-658ab—EDP Epoch Response frame Action field format**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Order** | **Meaning** |
| 0 | Category |
| 1 | EDP Action |
| 2 | Dialog Token |
| 3 | Status Code [504] |
| 4 | EDP Epoch Settings (Optional) |

The Category field is defined in 9.4.1.11 (Action field).

The EDP Action field is defined in 9.6.42.1 (EDP Action field).

The Dialog Token field is defined in 9.4.1.12 (Dialog Token field) and is set to a nonzero value to identify the request/response transaction.

The Status field is defined in 9.4.1.9 (Status code field).

The EDP Epoch Settings field is optional and is defined in 9.4.1.83 (EDP Epoch Settings field).

***Note to editor: Please add the following clause after 9.6.42.6.***

**9.6.42.7 EDP Epoch Assignment frame format [859]**

An EDP AP MLD may send an EDP Epoch Assignment frame to request a CPE non-AP MLD to transition to a different EDP group.

**Table 9-XX—EDP Epoch Assignment frame Action field format**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Order** | **Meaning** |
| 0 | Category |
| 1 | EDP Action |
| 2 | Dialog Token |
| 3 | EDP Epoch Settings |

The Category field is defined in 9.4.1.11 (Action field).

The EDP Action field is defined in 9.6.42.1 (EDP Action field).

The Dialog Token field is defined in 9.4.1.12 (Dialog Token field) and is set to a nonzero value to identify the request/response transaction.

The EDP Epoch Settings field is defined in 9.4.1.83 (EDP Epoch Settings field).

***Note to editor: Modify the paragraph starting at line 56 of page 77 in section 10.71.2.2***

At any point in time, the CPE AP MLD may request the associated CPE non-AP MLD to transition to a different EDP group, by sending an EDP Epoch Assignment [859] frame to the associated CPE non-AP MLD, including the EDP Epoch Settings field with the parameters of the suggested EDP group. The CPE non-AP MLD may report the status of the operation by responding with an EDP Response frame. This operation allows the CPE AP MLD to reorganize the EDP groups in use. Following this reorganization, the resulting EDP groups should maintain the same level of restrictiveness or be even more restrictive, i.e., shorter epoch durations, while also respecting any pacing limits indicated in the Minimum Epoch Pacing Parameters field that the CPE non-AP MLD has specified in (Re)Association Request frame.

**9.6.42.7 [123] [950] OTA ~~ota~~MAC Collision ~~Warning~~ [211] Notification frame format**

[219] ~~The~~ **~~[123] OTA~~** ~~otaMAC Collision Warning frame is used to signal when an OTA MAC address expected to be used by an EDP non-AP MLD in an upcoming epoch is calculated to collide with the MAC address of another STA.~~

[219] The [123] [950] OTAMAC Collision ~~Warning~~ [211] Notification frame warns of an upcoming MAC address collision with another STA in a given epoch.

**Table 9-658ac—[123] [950] OTA ~~ota~~MAC Collision ~~Warning~~ [211] Notification frame Action field format**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Order** | **Meaning** |
| 0 | Category |
| 1 | EDP Action |
| 2 | [211] Dialog Token |
| ~~2~~ 3 | OTA MAC Collision Warning element |

The Category field is defined in 9.4.1.11 (Action field).

The EDP Action field is defined in 9.6.42.1 (EDP Action field).

The Dialog Token field is defined in 9.4.1.12 (Dialog Token field).

The OTA MAC Collision Warning element is defined in 9.4.2.349 (OTA MAC Collision Warning element).

***Note to editor: Please add the following clause after 9.6.42.7.***

**[211] 9.6.42.8 OTA ~~ota~~MAC Collision ~~Warning~~ [211] Response frame format**

The OTAMAC Collision ~~Warning~~ Response frame indicates the action the STA will take based on the information on the OTA MAC Collision Notification frame.

**Table 9-658ac—[123] OTA ~~ota~~MAC Collision Response frame Action field format**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Order** | **Meaning** |
| 0 | Category |
| 1 | EDP Action |
| 2 | Dialog Token |
| ~~2~~ 3 | OTA MAC Collision Warning element |

The Category field is defined in 9.4.1.11 (Action field).

The EDP Action field is defined in 9.6.42.1 (EDP Action field).

The Dialog Token field is defined in 9.4.1.12 (Dialog Token field).

The OTA MAC Collision Warning element is defined in 9.4.2.349 (OTA MAC Collision Warning element).