IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| REVme SA Ballot Comment Resolution |
| Date: July 8th, 2024 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Rubayet Shafin | Samsung  | USA |  | r.shafin@samsung.com |
| Srinivas Kandala |  |  |
| Boon Loong Ng |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |

 Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for the following 13 comments received for REVme SAB3:

* 13 CID: 8070 8071 8072 8073 8074 8075 8076 8077 8078 8079 8080 8081 8082

SP: Do you agree to the resolutions provided in doc 11-24/1293r2 for the following CIDs for inclusion in the latest 11be draft?

8070 8071 8072 8073 8074 8075 8076 8077 8078 8079 8080 8081 8082

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version.
* Rev 1: Revised text based on some input received.
* Rev 2: Revised the resolution for CID 8072 and 8074.

***TGme editor: Please note Baseline is REVme D6.0***

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGbe Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8070 | 2789 | 28 | Total number cannot be 8 +8 =16. | delete "of" before "individual TWT agreements". | **Revised.**Revised NOTE-4 for better clarity.**TGme editor, please make change as shown in this doc 11-24/1293r1 tagged by #8070.** |
| 8071 | 2789 | 46 | clarify that the Usage Mode field is within the Channel Usage element in the Channel Usage Request frame. | as in comment. | **Revised**Agree in principle. Revised the sentence for better clarity.**TGme editor, please make change as shown in this doc 11-24/1293r1 tagged by #8071.** |
| 8072 | 2790 | 7 | When the lifetime of the TWT expires, according to the baseline TWT operation, the corresponding TWT agreement is automatically dissolved. It needs to be clarified why there is this additional burden on the AP to send the TWT Teardown frame is added here. | as in comment. | **Rejected.**The comment is not specific enough to identify the issue with the sentence.~~Agree in principle. The lifetime is indicated in the Timeout Interval element. The AP should not be mandated to send a Teardown frame to indicate that lifetime of the peer-to-peer TWT has ended.~~**~~TGme editor, please make change as shown in this doc 11-24/1293r2 tagged by~~** **~~#8072.~~** |
| 8073 | 2790 | 33 | Needs to clarify what "original" means here | as in comment. | **Revised.**Agree in principle. Added the needed clarification.**TGme editor, please make change as shown in this doc 11-24/1293r1 tagged by #8073.** |
| 8074 | 2790 | 34 | the latter part ("unless the AP receives…" ) of the sentence is not complete. What is AP's behavior when the AP receives a frame during the overlapping time? Need to clarify what the AP assumes about the non-AP STA's PS state. | as in comment. | **Revised.**Agree in principle. Added the needed clarification and completed the sentence.**TGme editor, please make change as shown in this doc 11-24/1293r2 tagged by #8074.** |
| 8075 | 2787 | 29 | Usage of "TWT schedule" has specific context, which is in broadcast TWT. Throughout this subclause, the usage of "TWT agreement" and "TWT schedule" are mixed up. | Clarify the distinction throughout this subclause or come up with some other terminology. | **Rejected.**The nomenclature for peer-to-peer TWT is not mandated to exactly follow the nomenclature of individual and broadcast TWT. From the context of the descriptions in this subclause, there is no confusion in the usage of “peer-to-peer TWT agreement” and “peer-to-peer TWT schedule”. |
| 8076 | 2787 | 29 | I believe we can't use any abbreviation of a field or element names. Please check with the editor about the usage of "TIE" abbreviation used in this subclause. | Check the usage of "TIE" throughout this subclause. Same comments for clause 9.6.13.24-25. | **Rejected**The name of the element is TIE. |
| 8077 | 2788 | 50 | delete "up" | as in comment | **Accepted.** |
| 8078 | 2788 | 59 | What is meant by "all" Channel Entry fields? Can there be more than one Channel Entry subfield? Please clarify. | as in comment | **Rejected.** Although a Channel Usage element contains only one Channel Entry field, the Channel Usage Elements field may contain one or more Channel Usage elements. Therefore, the Channel Usage Elements field may contain multiple Channel Entry fields, each corresponding to a different Channel Usage element. |
| 8079 | 2789 | 8 | Can the flow identifier of the request frame be different? Please clarify the scenario when the identifier is different than that in the request frame. | as in comment | **Revised.** The TWT Flow Identifier value in the Channel Usage Response frame can be different from that of the Channel Usage Request frame. Added a note to clarify this.**TGme editor, please make change as shown in this doc 11-24/1293r1 tagged by #8079.** |
| 8080 | 2789 | 23 | Can the AP tear down a p2p TWT? Anytime? Please clarify.If not, then please state that. | as in comment | **Revised**Agree in principle. Clarified that the AP can’t send a TWT Teardown frame to terminate any peer-to-peer TWT SP. **TGme editor, please make change as shown in this doc 11-24/1293r1 tagged by #8080.** |
| 8081 | 2789 | 23 | Can the AP disable a p2p TWT using TWT information frame? Please clarify. | as in comment | **Revised**Agree in principle. Clarified that the AP can’t send a TWT Information frame to suspend/resume any peer-to-peer TWT SP. **TGme editor, please make change as shown in this doc 11-24/1293r1 tagged by #8081.** |
| 8082 | 2787 | 39 | It should be channel usage "aiding" BSS instead of aidable BSS. | as in comment | **Rejected** |

**TGme editor: Please Change NOTE-4 in page 2789 as follows (#8070)**

NOTE 4—A peer-to-peer TWT agreement is a form of individual TWT agreement, and therefore, the total number of individual TWT agreements including peer-to-peer TWT agreements established between a non-AP STA and its associated AP cannot exceed 8, since the TWT Flow Identifier field of the TWT element comprises 3 bits. (#8070)

**TGme editor: Please Change the sentence in page 2789, line 45 as follows**

Upon receiving a Channel Usage Request frame with the Usage Mode field in a Channel Usage element (#8071) set to 0 or 1, the AP supporting channel usage shall send a Channel Usage Response frame including one or more Channel Usage elements.

**TGme editor: Please change the fifth paragraph in page 2790 as follows**

An AP that successfully sets up a peer-to-peer TWT agreement after receiving a Channel Usage Request frame with a TWT Elements field from a non-AP STA may indicate the lifetime of the peer-to-peer TWT agreement for the corresponding TWT element(s) in the Timeout Interval Value field of the TIE that it includes in the Channel Usage Response frame and shall set the corresponding Timeout Interval Type field to 5. An AP that successfully sets up a peer-to-peer TWT agreement shall consider the non-AP STA to be in power save mode and doze state at the start of the peer-to-peer TWT SP and back to its original power management mode (i.e. the power management mode it had before entering the peer-to-peer TWT SP) (#8073) at the end of the peer-to-peer TWT SP unless the AP receives a frame addressed to it from the non-AP STA within the time that overlaps with the peer-to-peer TWT SP, in which case, for the remaining portion of that peer-to-peer TWT SP, the AP shall consider the power management mode and power state of the non-AP STA based on the information carried in the frame received from the non-AP STA.( #8074)

**TGme editor: Please change the last paragraph in page 2788 as follows**

A non-AP STA that supports channel usage and has the TWT Requester Support subfield set to 1 in the HE Capabilities element that it transmits, may negotiate a peer-to-peer TWT schedule with its associated AP, to indicate (#8077)the service period, and optionally the channel operation, of a channel-usage-aidable BSS or an off-channel TDLS direct link, by transmitting a Channel Usage Request frame that includes TWT Elements and Timeout Interval Element fields, if the AP has the Peer-to-peer TWT Support field set to 1 in the Extended Capabilities element. Each TWT element carried in the TWT Elements field includes a single Individual TWT Parameter Set field whose subfields shall be set as described in 26.8.2 (Individual TWT agreements) and 9.4.2.198 (TWT element) except that the TWT Group Assignment subfield shall be set to zero and the Responder PM Mode subfield, the Trigger subfield, the Flow Type subfield, and the TWT Channel subfield shall be reserved. Each TWT element in the TWT Elements field applies to all the Channel Entry subfields of the Channel Usage Elements field. The non-AP STA may indicate the lifetime of the requested peer-to-peer TWT agreement in the Timeout Interval Value field of the TIE that it includes in the Channel Usage Request frame and shall set the Timeout Interval Type field to 5.

**TGme editor: Please add the following NOTE after the first paragraph on page 2789.(** **#8079)**

NOTE—The AP might choose a value for the TWT Flow Identifier field in a TWT element carried in the Channel Usage Response frame that is different from the value of the TWT Flow Identifier field in the received Channel Usage Request frame. (#8079)

**TGme editor: Please add the following two paragraphs after the fourth paragraph on page 2789.(** **#8080, #8081)**

An AP shall not send a TWT Teardown frame to a non-AP STA to teardown any peer-to-peer TWT schedule between them. (#8080)

An AP shall not send a TWT Information frame to a non-AP STA to suspend or resume any peer-to-peer TWT schedule between them. (#8081)