IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| CR for some SA2 CIDs  |
| Date: 2024/06/14 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Company | Address | Phone | email |
| Stephen McCann | Huawei Technologies | Southampton, United Kingdom |  | stephen.mccann@ieee.org |

# Revision Notes

Abstract

This submission contains proposed comment resolutions to comments on P802.11be D6.0.

The following comment resolutions are proposed for CIDs:

23116, 23117

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| R0 | Initial revision |

**Discussion (23116, 23117)**

The comment about the phrase “Otherwise, the STA shall not” being untestable may be correct, but editorially these 2 comments do not cover all 4 newly created cases in Draft P802.11be\_D6.0.

In addition, there are 18 instances of the phrase “Otherwise, the STA shall not” in the updated baseline Draft P802.11REVme\_D5.0.

My recommendation to the commenter is to create a similar comment for the next 802.11 revision project P802.11REVmf addressing all of these specific instances.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Page.Line | Clause Number | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 23116 | 340.32 | 10.3.2.9 | The "otherwise" is entirely unneeded, poor specification practice ("shall not") and untestable (proving a negative). Yes the base standards does this (wrong) but should not continue the mistake. | Delete the list item "otherwise". | REJECTEDThe comment is out of scope: i.e., it is not on changed text, text affected by changed text or text that is the target of an existing valid unsatisfied comment. |
| 23117 | 340.12 | 10.3.2.9 | The "otherwise" is entirely unneeded, poor specification practice ("shall not") and untestable (proving a negative). Yes the base standards does this (wrong) but should not continue the mistake. | Delete the list item "otherwise". | REJECTEDThe comment is out of scope: i.e., it is not on changed text, text affected by changed text or text that is the target of an existing valid unsatisfied comment. |