IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Resolution to CID 7059 – 11bc clause | | | | |
| Date: 2024-03-08 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Michael Montemurro | Huawei |  |  | [montemurro.michael@gmail.com](mailto:montemurro.michael@gmail.com) |

Background

This contribution addresses CID 7059 related to the clause documenting 11bc requirements.

### Comment

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Duplicate of CID** | **Resn Status** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 7059 | 4953.00 | 34 |  |  | During one of the later rounds of SA Ballot, the EBCS clause was moved from a sub-clause of 11 to clause 34 in response to a comment that requested that the EBCS clause be divided between clause 11 and 10. | The commenter will provide a submission to address the comment that restores the clause 11 content and possibly moves some content to clause 10. |

### Discussion:

The comment in the initial SA Ballot for TGbc was:

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 5113 | 79.39 | 11.55 |  | V | The draft appears to inappropriately define MAC sublayer behavior in the MAC sublayer management clause (Clause 11). Behavior that makes use of MLME primitives belongs in Clause 11, but behavior that makes direct use of MAC frames (EBCS Data, EBCS Info frames, etc.) clearly belongs elsewhere. | Move to a MAC sublayer behavioral clause; either define a new "EBCS MAC specification" clause or create a subclause in Clause 10. | Revised.  Move the existing subclause 11.55 to a new top-level clause "Enhanced Broadcast Services procedures". |

There was nothing with respect to discussion on this comment resolution in the TGbc minutes. The comment resolution seems to make a major change.

First of all, Clause 10 generally describes MAC behavior while clause 11 generally describes MAC management. For instance, PS mode is described in Clause 10 while MAC connection states are defined in clause 11. Furthermore, there are features like GAS which are defined in clause 11 and define MAC behavior. EBCS defines both behavior and management.

Looking at the contents of Clause 34, it should not be included in a separate clause following the PHY clauses. It would be difficult to divide the requirements between clause 10 and clause 11. It makes sense to keep EBCS requirements in one clauseThe feature is independent of PHY technology, so it makes sense to be in either clause 10 or clause 11.

### Proposed Resolution:

Either:

REVISED. The EBCS specification includes both MAC behavior and MAC management. Move Clause 34 to a sub-clause of clause 10.

Or

REVISED. The EBCS The EBCS specification includes both MAC behavior and MAC management. Move Clause 34 to a sub-clause of clause 11.