IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Proposed resolutions for comments on D3.0 |
| Date: 2024-02-27 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Claudio da Silva | Meta Platforms |  |  |  |
| Cheng Chen | Intel |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains proposed resolutions for technical comments on D3.0 (LB281). The text used as reference is D3.0.

CIDs: 4272, 4273, 4274, 4076, 4139, 4089, 4137, 4302, 4303, 4182, 4183, 4205, 4206, 4002, 4003, 4213, 4220, 4221, 4223, 4224, 4225, 4227, 4228, 4229, 4230, 4231, 4232, 4233, 4234, 4235, 4236, 4237, 4238, 4239, 4240, 4241, 4263, 4265, 4222, 4226, 4198, 4305, 4069

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4272 | 9.3.1.22.14.6 | 40.28 | For SR2SR Sounding Trigger frame, it should be EHT Ranging NDP, not EHT TB Ranging NDP. | Please change 'EHT TB Ranging NDP' to 'EHT Ranging NDP'. |
| 4273 | 9.3.1.22.14.6 | 40.31 | For SR2SR Sounding Trigger frame, it solicits HE Ranging NDP or EHT Ranging NDP, not HE TB Ranging NDP or EHT TB Ranging NDP. | Please change 'HE TB Ranging NDP' to 'HE Ranging NDP'. |
| 4274 | 9.3.1.22.14.6 | 40.36 | For SR2SR Sounding Trigger frame, it solicits HE Ranging NDP or EHT Ranging NDP, not HE TB Ranging NDP or EHT TB Ranging NDP. | Please change 'EHT TB Ranging NDP' to 'EHT Ranging NDP'. |

**Proposed resolution**: Accepted

**Discussion**: As defined in page 154,



In 40.28



In 40.31



In 40.36



|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4076 | B.4.4.1 | 215.03 | Comparing PC57.1 with PC58.1 and PC57.2 with PC58.2, both PC57.1 and PC57.2 are optional but with PC58.1 and PC58.2 at least one is mandatory, In the case of PC57.1 and PC57.2 should there be at least one option mandatory? | Change PC57.1 status to ""(PC57 AND NOT PC57.2):M(PC57 AND PC57.2): O""andPC57.2 status to "(PC57 AND NOT PC57.1):M(PC57 AND PC57.1): O" |

**Discussion**: For reference,





**Proposed resolution**: Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4139 | 9.3.1.22.14.3 | 38.43 | Add a sentence to specify minimum number of User Info field in the SR2SI Sounding Trigger frame just like the corresponding text in SR2SR Sounding Trigger frame P39L48-49. | The SR2SI Sounding Trigger frame contains at least one User Info field with AID12/USID12 subfield set to less than 2008, and one User Info field with the AID12/USID12 subfield set to 2008. |

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Modifications:** TGbf Editor – Please add the following to 38.43:

The SR2SI Sounding Trigger frame contains at least one User Info field with AID12/USID12 subfield set to less than 2008, and one User Info field with the AID12/USID12 subfield set to 2008.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4089 | 9.3.1.22.1 | 34.45 | Table 9-54 is not updated to the 11bk D1.0 | Please udpate Table 9-54 to 11bk D1.0 |
| 4137 | 9.3.1.22.1 | 34.51 | Replace Table 9-54 with Table 9-29j in 802.11bk D1.0 and make appropriate changes to reflect the corresponding text for sensing | As per comment |

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Discussion**: For reference,



**Modifications:** TGbf Editor – Please re-number Table 9-54 to 9-29j, and replace the current Description of the “UL Target Receive Power subfield” with

The STA transmits the TB PPDU at the STA’s maximum transmit power for the assigned MCS.

If the Trigger frame is a Sounding Ranging, ~~or~~ Passive Sounding Ranging, SR2SI Sounding, or sensing responder to sensing responder (SR2SR) Sounding Trigger frame that does not assign an MCS, then the STA’s transmit power is that used for HE-MCS 0 for an HE TB PPDU or that used for EHT-MCS 0 for an EHT TB PPDU.

If the Trigger frame is a Secured Sounding Ranging Trigger frame that does not assign an MCS, the assigned MCS is assumed to be HE-MCS 6 in terms of setting the STA’s transmit power for an HE TB PPDU or to be EHT-MCS 6 for an EHT TB PPDU.

NOTE—The expected receive signal power is then the STA's maximum transmit power for the assigned MCS minus the path loss.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4302 | 3.2 | 18.45 | The descrption is unclear. | Suggest to change "sensing receiver: A station (STA) that is the intended recipient of PPDUs sent by a sensing transmitter..." to "sensing receiver: A station (STA) that is the intended recipient of NDPs sent by a sensing transmitter" |
| 4303 | 3.2 | 18.55 | The descrption is unclear. | Suggest to change "sensing transmitter: A station (STA) that transmits PPDUs used for measurements..." to "sensing transmitter: A station (STA) that transmits NDPs used for measurements..." |

**Proposed resolution**: Rejected

**Justification:** The definitions “sensing receiver” and “sensing transmitter” are also valid for DMG sensing procedures, which mainly rely on BRP frames. (NDPs are not defined in 802.11ad nor 802.11ay.) Also, in passive sensing, measurements are obtained using PPDUs that carry DMG Beacon frames.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4182 | 9.3.1.22.14.3 | 37.31 | Why isn't P160 required in SR2SI Sounding Trigger frame? | Add P160 subfield. |
| 4183 | 9.3.1.22.14.6 | 39.45 | Why isn't P160 required in SR2SR Sounding Trigger frame? | Add P160 subfield. |

**Proposed resolution**: Rejected

**Justification:** The PS160 field is used for RU/MRU allocation in OFDMA transmission. SR2SI and SR2SR Sounding Trigger frames trigger NDP transmissions. Since OFDMA NDP transmissions are not defined, the PS160 field is not defined for these two frames. It is worth noting, however, that the PS160 field is defined for Polling and Reporting Trigger frames, both of which can solicit OFDMA transmissions (CTS-to-self for Polling TF, and data PPDU for Reporting TF).

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4205 | 9.3.1.22.14.6 | 40.15 | Figure 9-102g should be 'Transmitter User Info field for SR2SR Sounding Trigger frame if AID/USID is not equal to 2008'. Fix the title. | As in comment. |
| 4206 | 9.3.1.22.14.6 | 40.56 | Figure 9-102h should be 'Receiver User Info field for SR2SR Sounding Trigger frame if AID/USID is not equal to 2008'. Fix the title. | As in comment. |

**Proposed resolution**: Accepted

**Discussion**: For reference,







|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4002 | 9.3.1.22.14.6 | 40.23 | The "TX/RX field" in the Transmitter User Info field shall indicate sensing transmitter role. The current text is not clear. | Change to: The TX/RX field indicates the addressed sensing responder is the sensing transmitter in the current SR2SR variant of the trigger frame (TF) sounding phase. The TX/RX field in the Transmitter User Info field is set to 0. |

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Discussion**: For reference,





**Modifications:** TGbf Editor – Please replace 40.23-40.25 with the following:

The TX/RX field indicates that the addressed sensing responder is a sensing transmitter in the current SR2SR variant of the trigger frame (TF) sounding phase. The TX/RX field in the Transmitter User Info field is set to 0.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4003 | 9.3.1.22.14.6 | 40.64 | The "TX/RX field" in the Receiver User Info field shall indicate sensing receiver role. The current text is not clear. | Change to: The TX/RX field indicates the addressed sensing responder is a sensing receiver in the current SR2SR variant of the TF sounding phase. The TX/RX field in a Receiver User Info field is set to 1. |

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Discussion**: For reference,





**Modifications:** TGbf Editor – Please replace 40.63-40.65 with the following:

The TX/RX field indicates that the addressed sensing responder is a sensing receiver in the current SR2SR variant of the TF sounding phase. The TX/RX field in a Receiver User Info field is set to 1.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4213 | 9.4.1.73.2.2 | 53.11 | "Ng" should be in the form of a mathematical symbol | Fix the format |
| 4220 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 58.48 |
| 4221 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 58.52 |
| 4223 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 59.01 |
| 4224 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 59.34 |
| 4225 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 59.37 |
| 4227 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 59.47 |
| 4228 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 59.51 |
| 4229 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 59.55 |
| 4230 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 60.02 |
| 4231 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 60.11 |
| 4232 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 60.16 |
| 4233 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 60.19 |
| 4234 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 61.01 |
| 4235 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 61.43 |
| 4236 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 61.46 |
| 4237 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 62.01 |
| 4238 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 63.02 |
| 4239 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 63.07 |
| 4240 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 64.01 |
| 4241 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 65.01 |
| 4263 | 27.2.2 | 203.31 |
| 4265 | 36.2.2 | 212.31 |

**Proposed resolution**: Rejected

**Justification:** FrameMaker does not support equations in titles of figures and tables.

**Discussion**: For reference,





|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4222 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 58.54 | "Ng" should be in the form of a mathematical symbol | Fix the format |
| 4226 | 9.4.1.73.4 | 59.40 |

**Proposed resolution**: Accepted

**Discussion**: For reference,



|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4198 | 9.4.2.322 | 81.08 | Figure 1-1001bl is inserted in the paragraph instead of between the paragraphs. Please modify it. | As in comment. |
| 4305 | 11.55.1.2 | 138.41 | Table 11-32a should be drawn before starting 11.55.1.3 Clause | As comment |

**Proposed resolution**: Rejected

**Discussion**: For reference,





**Justification:** As defined in 16.64 (Editorial Notes), “The default IEEE-SA style for tables is to "float". This means that they be repositioned later, usually at the head of the next page, to avoid splitting the table and reduce the amount of blank space. The table can appear to move out of the subclause it is referenced first from, and can even split a paragraph. This is the intended IEEE-SA behavior, please do not report it as a defect in the draft. In many cases, additional line feeds have been inserted to force tables to follow text, rather than float beyond sequential text. The additional line feeds will be removed before publication, please do not report them as a defect in the text.” Same is applicable to figures.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4069 | 9.4.2.25 | 68.30 | The Extended Capabilities field in Table 9-192 is under ANA control, but 11bf has not obtained ANA numbers. For Instance Value 103 is already in use by 11be. | Please obtain for Extended Capabilities field Bit for "Sensing", "SBP" and "Collocated DMG sensing AP" an ANA number and updated numbers "103", "104", and "105" subsequently. |

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Modifications:** TGbf Editor – Please request ANA assignment to TGbf Extended Capabilities field, and replace the values 103, 104, and 105 with the correct ones.