IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| TGbi Teleconference Minutes December 14th 2023 | | | | |
| Date: 2023-12-15 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Stéphane Baron | Canon | Cesson-Sévigné, France |  | [Stephane.baron](mailto:Stephane.baron)@crf.canon.fr |

Abstract

This document contains the minutes for the IEEE 802.11bi task group meetings that took place Thursday December 14th.

Note: Highlighted text are action items.

Q – proceeds a question

A - proceeds an answer

C - proceeds a comment

Yellow highlight - action point

**December 14th:**

**Chair: Carol Ansley, Cox Communications**

**Secretary: Stéphane Baron**

**Vice-chairs: Jerome Henry, Cisco; Stephen McCann, Huawei**

**Technical editor: Po-Kai Huang, Intel**

Chair calls meeting to order at 10:01 ET.

Agenda slide deck: [11-23-2162r2](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2162-02-00bi-agenda-for-dec-telecons.pptx):

1. Reminder to do attendance
2. Review of policies and procedures.
   1. IEEE individual process slides were presented.
3. The chair mentioned the call for essential patents
   1. No one responded to the call for essential patents but there is a comment.

Comment on slide 5 :

C: I don’t think individuals are responsible of their entity.

A: Those slides are the same for years now, if you think there is an issue, contact PATCOM.

1. The chair covered the IEEE copyright policy and participation rules.
   1. Questions

C: I don’t think we are representing any entity or organization so the sentence is not correct.

A: Again, this is the PATCOM communication so if you disagree with part of those slides, please contact PATCOM.

Commenter to contact PATCOM.

1. **Discussion of agenda 11-23-2162r2 (slide #15)**
   1. Discussion on agenda

No discussion

* 1. Adoption of agenda by unanimous consent (15 participants).

1. **Administrative**
   1. Upcoming teleconference meeting times:
      * Jan. 4th 2024: 10:00 to 12:00 EDT
      * Jan. 11th 2024: 10:00 to 12:00 EDT

Q: we are currently in conflict with 11bn for the Thursday teleconferences, or will be on conflict in January. Can we avoid this conflict in the future?

A: Currently 11bn do not have meeting scheduled for January, but I recommend to contact 11bn chair and indicate that this timeslot is already in use by TGbi task group.

Chair take the action to contact 11bn chair for this purpose

1. **Technical Submissions**
   1. [11-23/2098r2](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2098-02-00bi-frame-anonymization-fa-normative-text-for-11bi.docx) – Frame Anonymization (FA) normative text for 11bi -- Philip Hawkes

Chair ask how to proceed, we could go section by section

Philip then starts presenting section by section.

* + 1. Discussion

Discussion on the definition part:

C: definition depends on the context so this is a chicken and egg problem, so let go to the context and then we can update the definition.

Q: on definition of Frame anonymization. I don’t think it mitigate presence monitoring; rather hiding user device identify. But don’t focus now on this an let discuss mechanisms first.

C: I think we should not focus to much on MLD, otherwise it seems that everything is about AP\_MLD.

A: Previous decision on the group was that the for these mechanisms we agree on MLD support and have no agreement on the non-MLD. If anyone bring a solution for non-MLD this is still acceptable but for the moment the only thing we have is for MLD.

C: I would like to make the chapter in another way. First put the problem in general and then indicate the solution for the MLD.

A: agree. The proposal is to replace non-AP MLD by “client” to make it more general.

Discussion on unencrypted fields.

Q: the AID may be in several places, not only trigger frame, so can we make the sentence more general? For instance, any frame with an AID?

A: agree, let’s indicate list the elements and indicate all the frames including those element in clear.

Q: We do not also need to indicate MPDU, but let it more general to cover control frames for instance.

A: Ok, so let just say nothing and remove the mention of MPDU.

Discussion on the association side effects of EDP:

C: I agree with the problem setting, but we can make it simpler.

Commenter then propose alternative text.

A: Agree and text is shortened

Q: I think we are discussing on the general problem here, why don’t move it to the top of the chapter? We can solve the problem by re-associating but this creates issues on data traffic, so we introduce Frame anonymization.

A: OK.

Q: I think we should remove the PRF here since we can use other function.

A: OK, we can remove it for now.

C: We should put general consideration on Epoch above the FAPU definition.

A: agree.

C: For AID randomization, keep it simple and just indicate the definition. Its usage will be described later

A: OK

Q: here, FA AID is at MLD level, right?

A: yes.

Q: For MAC address randomization, we should not remove the A1 filtering since this is not something people are familiar with, so by keeping it here people will keep in mind.

A: agree.

C: I prefer to remove the “internal” adjective for the SN and PN, and just keep the “obfuscated” for the values transmitted over the air.

A: ok.

The complete computation indicating the usage of the offset to obfuscate the SN and PN is removed from this introduction part and will be reintroduced in further detailed part.

C: the term obfuscated seems a little complex for just a jump in SN or PN counter using a simple offset.

A: ok, we can say by applying offset rather than talking of obfuscated values.

Text is then modified accordingly.

Q: General comment on SN and PN. Those values are used for other frame types encryption, so let’s keep it general here.

A: OK.

C: I think we should move the text related to the architecture consideration on the chapter that is dedicated to that (clause 5), and then work on it to make it more complete especially regarding the AID usage part.

Presenter display corresponding part of document 1679r4 and shows where it can be included.

Presenter then propose to merge this part to this document, but for now the group focus of the current 11-23/2098r2 document.

Chair request a 5 minutes extension to finalize this chapter.

No objection received.

Presenter indicated that the text after a tag <the text following this pint is not agreed> is not agreed and will be further discussed.

Presenter then upload R3 including all previous modification.

The group agreed that the text on 11-23/2098r3 before the tag is agreed and can be added to the spec text.

No other questions.

1. **AoB**
   1. No other business.
2. Chair adjourned the meeting at 12:04 EDT.

**Attendance**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| |  |  |  |  | | --- | --- | --- | --- | | Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation | | TGbi | 12/14 | Ansley, Carol | Cox Communications Inc. | | TGbi | 12/14 | baron, stephane | Canon Research Centre France | | TGbi | 12/14 | DeLaOlivaDelgado, Antonio | InterDigital, Inc. | | TGbi | 12/14 | Hawkes, Philip | Qualcomm Incorporated | | TGbi | 12/14 | Huang, Po-Kai | Intel | | TGbi | 12/14 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. | | TGbi | 12/14 | Magrin, Davide | Meta Platforms Inc. | | TGbi | 12/14 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd | | TGbi | 12/14 | Mutgan, Okan | Nokia | | TGbi | 12/14 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | | TGbi | 12/14 | Sam, Harvey | Broadcom Corporation | | TGbi | 12/14 | Sevin, Julien | Canon Research Centre France | | TGbi | 12/14 | Smith, Graham | SRT Wireless | | TGbi | 12/14 | Smith, Luther | Cable Television Laboratories Inc. (CableLabs) | | TGbi | 12/14 | Thakore, Darshak | Cable Television Laboratories Inc. (CableLabs) | | TGbi | 12/14 | Yee, Peter | NSA-CSD | | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  | |  | |  | |  | |
|  |  | |  | |  | |
|  |  | |  | |  | |
|  |  | |  | |  | |
|  |  | |  | |  | |
|  |  | |  | |  | |
|  |  | |  | |  | |
|  |  | |  | |  | |
|  |  | |  | |  | |
|  |  | |  | |  | |
|  |  | |  | |  | |
|  |  | |  | |  | |