IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Proposed resolutions for technical comments on D2.0 - Part 1 |
| Date: 2023-09-21 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Claudio da Silva | Meta Platforms |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains proposed resolutions for technical comments on D2.0 (LB276). The text used as reference is D2.1.

CIDs: 3442, 3369, 3443, 3444, 3445, 3446, 3447, 3448, 3449, 3450, 3451, 3452, 3453, 3454, 3455, 3456, 3457, 3458, 3459, 3460, 3461, 3462, 3463, 3464, 3018, 3019, 3020

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3442 | B.4.4.1 | 208.51 | There exists no PC65, PC67, PC64, PC66. | PC65 should be replaced with PC57, PC67 with PC59, PC64 with PC56, PC66 with PC58, PC66.2 with PC58.2, PC66.1 with PC58.1 on P207 and P208. |

**Proposed resolution**: Accepted

**Discussion**: For reference, in D2.0,



References were correct in D1.0,



Summary D1.0 and D2.0:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **D1.0** | **D2.0** |
| Support for coordinated monostatic DMG sensing | PC64 | PC56 |
| Support for bistatic DMG sensing | PC65 | PC57 |
| Support for coordinated bistatic DMG sensing… as a sensing transmitter… as a sensing receiver | PC66PC66.1PC66.2 | PC58PC58.1PC58.2 |
| Support for EDMG multistatic sensing | PC67 | PC59 |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3369 | B.4.4.1 | 208.39 | Can't find "PC64", "PC65" or "PC66" in this draft or in 802.11az, 802.11be or REVme.  | Define missing requirements. Several occurrences throughout this appendix. |

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Modifications:** TGbf Editor – In pages 207 and 208, replace PC65 with PC57, PC67 with PC59, PC64 with PC56, PC66 with PC58, PC66.2 with PC58.2, and PC66.1 with PC58.1.

Note: Same resolution as that for CID3442.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3443 | B.4.4.2 | 209.58 | Wrong reference to PC58. | Please replace PC58 with PC52 |
| 3444 | B.4.4.2 | 210.04 | Wrong reference to PC59. | Please replace PC59 with PC53 |
| 3445 | B.4.4.2 | 210.10 | Wrong reference to PC58 and PC59 | Please replace PC58 with PC52 and PC59 with PC53 |

**Proposed resolution**: Accepted

**Discussion**: Summary D1.0 and D2.0:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **D1.0** | **D2.0** |
| Support for the role of SBP initiator in an SBP procedure | PC58 | PC52 |
| Support for the role of SBP responder in an SBP procedure | PC59 | PC53 |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3446 | B.4.4.2 | 210.17 | Wrong reference to PC58 and PC59 | Please replace PC58 with PC52 and PC59 with PC53 |

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Discussion**: Comment is on FT85,





In D1.0, PC58 is “Support for the role of the SBP initiator in an SBP procedure” and PC59 is “Support for the role of the SBP responder in an SBP procedure”.

In D2.0, “Support for the role of the SBP responder in an SBP procedure” is PC53.

**Modifications:** TGbf Editor – In 210.16 replace “(PC58 OR PC59): M” with “PC53: M”.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3447 | B.4.4.2 | 210.56 | Wrong reference to PC60 | Please replace PC60 with PC54 |
| 3448 | B.4.4.2 | 211.03 | Wrong reference to PC61 | Please replace PC61 with PC55 |
| 3449 | B.4.4.2 | 211.09 | Wrong reference to PC60 and PC61 | Please replace PC60 with PC54 and PC61 with PC55 |
| 3450 | B.4.4.2 | 211.15 | Wrong reference to PC60 and PC61 | Please replace PC60 with PC54 and PC61 with PC55 |

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Discussion**: Comments are on FT90, FT91, FT92, and FT93:







Summary D1.0 and D2.0:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **D1.0** | **D2.0** |
| Support for the role of sensing initiator in a DMG sensing procedure | PC60 | PC54 |
| Support for the role of sensing responder in a DMG sensing procedure | PC61 | PC55 |
| Support for the role of SBP initiator in a DMG SBP procedure | PC70 | PC62 |
| Support for the role of SBP responder in a DMG SBP procedure | PC71 | PC63 |

**Modifications:** TGbf Editor –

* In 210.56, replace “PC60: M” with “PC62: M”.
* In 211.03, replace “PC61: M” with “PC63: M”.
* In 211.09, replace “(PC60 OR PC61): M” with “PC33: M”.
* In 211.15, replace “(PC60 OR PC61): M” with “(PC62 OR PC63): M”.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3451 | B.4.4.2 | 212.29 | Wrong reference to PC58 | Please replace PC58 with PC52 |
| 3452 | B.4.4.2 | 212.35 | Wrong reference to PC59. | Please replace PC59 with PC53 |
| 3453 | B.4.4.2 | 212.42 | Wrong reference to PC58 and PC59 | Please replace PC58 with PC52 and PC59 with PC53 |
| 3454 | B.4.4.2 | 212.49 | Wrong reference to PC58 and PC59 | Please replace PC58 with PC52 and PC59 with PC53 |

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Discussion**: Comments are on FR82, FR83, FR84, and FR85:





Summary D1.0 and D2.0:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **D1.0** | **D2.0** |
| Support for the role of SBP initiator in an SBP procedure | PC58 | PC52 |
| Support for the role of SBP responder in an SBP procedure | PC59 | PC53 |

**Modifications:** TGbf Editor –

* In 212.29, replace “PC58: M” with “PC53: M”.
* In 212.35, replace “PC59: M” with “PC52: M”.
* In 212.42, replace “(PC58 OR PC59): M” with “(PC52 OR PC53): M”.
* In 212.49, replace “(PC58 OR PC59): M” with “PC52: M”.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3455 | B.4.4.2 | 213.29 | Wrong reference to PC60 | Please replace PC60 with PC62 |
| 3456 | B.4.4.2 | 213.34 | Wrong reference to PC61 | Please replace PC61 with PC63 |
| 3457 | B.4.4.2 | 213.40 | Wrong reference to PC60 and PC61 | Please replace PC60 with PC62 and PC61 with PC63 |
| 3458 | B.4.4.2 | 213.46 | Wrong reference to PC60 and PC61 | Please replace PC60 with PC62 and PC61 with PC63 |

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Discussion**: Comments are on FR90, FR91, FR92, and FR93:





Summary D1.0 and D2.0:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **D1.0** | **D2.0** |
| Support for the role of sensing initiator in a DMG sensing procedure | PC60 | PC54 |
| Support for the role of sensing responder in a DMG sensing procedure | PC61 | PC55 |
| Support for the role of SBP initiator in a DMG SBP procedure | PC70 | PC62 |
| Support for the role of SBP responder in a DMG SBP procedure | PC71 | PC63 |

**Modifications:** TGbf Editor –

* In 213.29, replace “PC60: M” with “PC63: M”.
* In 213.34, replace “PC61: M” with “PC62: M”.
* In 213.40, replace “(PC60 OR PC61): M” with “PC62: M”.
* In 213.46, replace “(PC60 OR PC61): M” with “(PC62 OR PC63): M”.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3459 | B.4.41.1 | 214.40 | Wrong reference to PC52 | Please replace PC52 with PC49 |
| 3460 | B.4.41.1 | 214.55 | Wrong reference to PC54 | Please replace PC54 with PC50 |
| 3461 | B.4.41.1 | 215.36 | Wrong reference to PC64 | Please replace PC64 with PC56 |
| 3462 | B.4.41.1 | 215.44 | Wrong reference to PC65 | Please replace PC65 with PC57 |
| 3463 | B.4.41.1 | 215.50 | Wrong reference to PC66 | Please replace PC66 with PC58 |

**Proposed resolution**: Accepted

**Discussion**:









Summary D1.0 and D2.0:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **D1.0** | **D2.0** |
| Support for the SR2SR variant of a TF sounding phase | PC52 | PC49 |
| Support for threshold-based reporting phase | PC54 | PC50 |
| Support for coordinated monostatic DMG sensing | PC64 | PC56 |
| Support for bistatic DMG sensing | PC65 | PC57 |
| Support for coordinated bistatic DMG sensing | PC66 | PC58 |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3464 | B.4.41.1 | 215.58 | Wrong reference to PC69 | Please replace PC69 with PC59 |

**Proposed resolution**: Accepted

**Discussion**:





**Discussion**: Summary D1.0 and D2.0:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **D1.0** | **D2.0** |
| Support for DMG passive sensing | PC69 | PC61 |
| Support for EDMG multistatic sensing | PC67 | PC59 |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3018 | B.4.41.1 | 209.55 | "Incorrectly conditional on PC54 (Support for the role of sensing initiator in a DMG sensing procedure). Should be PC50 (Support for threshold-based reporting phase) instead?" | Change the Status to: PC50: M |

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Discussion**: Summary D1.0 and D2.0:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **D1.0** | **D2.0** |
| Support for threshold-based reporting phase | PC54 | PC50 |

**Modifications:** TGbf Editor – In 214.56, replace PC54 with PC50.

Note: Wrong page number given by the commenter.

Note: Same resolution as that proposed for CID 3460.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3019 | B.4.41.1 | 215.15 | Circular conditional on WS9! | Change the Status to the correct condition: WS8: M |

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Discussion**: Comment is on WS9,





Summary D1.0 and D2.0:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **D1.0** | **D2.0** |
| SBP | WS9 | WS8 |

**Modifications:** TGbf Editor – In 215.15 and 215.18, replace “WS9: M” with “WS8: M”.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3020 | B.4.4 | 207.32 | Should the status be "WS8: O" instead? Same for PC53. | Change the status of PC52 and PC53 to "WS8: O" |

**Proposed resolution**: Rejected

**Justification:** Current text correctly reflects the fact that, in D2.0, “Support for the role of SBP initiator in an SBP procedure” and “Support for the role of SBP responder in an SBP procedure” are optional MAC protocol capabilities of a sensing STA.

**Discussion**: In 207.32, in B.4.4 (MAC protocol) -> B.4.4.1 (MAC protocol capabilities),





In 206.35,



Also, in B.4.41 (Wireless sensing (WS) features) -> B.4.41.1 (WS MAC features),

