IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| LB271 Resolution for CIDs on bandwidth indication |
| Date: July 6, 2023 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Morteza Mehrnoush | Apple Inc |  |  | morteza.mehrnoush@apple.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

 Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for following 5 CIDs received for TGbe LB271:

15139, 17560, 17751, 17758, 17759

**Revisions:**

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.
* Rev 1: Minor change for CID#17560
* Rev 2: adding the rejection (no consensus) reason for CID#17560

***TGbe editor: The baseline for this document is 11be D3.2***

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGbe Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGbe Draft (i.e., they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGbe Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGbe Editor” are instructions to the TGbe editor to modify existing material in the TGbe draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGbe editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGbe Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause** | **Pg/Ln** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 15139 | Po-Kai Huang | 9.4.2.174 | 241.56 | There is a spec conflict here. Future Channel Guidance element is extended, but Future Channel Guidance element is not extensible. See Table 9-128. | There are several ways to resolve that. If the frame that includes the future channel guidance element maybe received by legacy, then the texts will not work. Remove the texts or disallow extension when it is included in frame like beacon that maybe received by legacy STA. | **Revised**Since the future channel guidance element is not extensible, it’s more straightforward to remove the text related to BW indication using this element. There are still other ways (instead of using the future channel guidance element) like CSA/eCSA which can indicate the channel BW indication before switching to the new channel.**Tgbe editor: please make the changes indicated in this doc 11-23/1161r1 tagged with 15139.** |
| 17560 | Brian Hart | 9.4.2.162 | 237.55 | Really a question for the editorship team, but BI element has "element ID Extension" but subelements as defined in 9.4.3 (REVme) do not, so "The format of the Bandwidth Indication subelement is the same as the Bandwidth Indication element (see 9.4.2.319 (Bandwidth Indication element)). " is impossible | Option 1) follow (ugly) convention at P230L50 - P231L15, and define new subelement IDs here.Option 2a) (preferred) (and which seems to be assumed here already) update fig 9-1005 in 9.4.3 to include the optional Element ID Extension field as shown in Fig 9-193 and further, optionally 2b) replace P230L50 - P231L15 by that style of subelement. | **Rejected**The change for this CID, i.e. subelement ID assignment for the optional subelements of Channel Switch Wrapper element, is discussed within the group but we could not reach consensus on a solution.  |
| 17751 | Brian Hart | 9.4.2.319 | 300.55 | "that can be used" is weak; description limits itself to channel bandwidth information so seems to hide that center frequencies are provided too; curious articles | Assuming that the channel center frequencies are not reserved in the Bandwidth Indication element (if so, say so!!!), then try "The Bandwidth Indication element contains channel bandwidth, channel center frequency and (optionally) punctured subchannel information." | **Revised**The part related to “that can be used” is already removed by another comment. The text is updated for the 2nd part of the comment.**Tgbe editor: please make the changes indicated in this doc 11-23/1161r1 tagged with 17751.** |
| 17758 | Brian Hart | 9.6.7.3 | 302.48 | No "shall"s in clause 9 after 9.1. | "Try The Restricted TWT Traffic Info Present subfield is reserved ..."is not an 80+80" | **Revised**This comment is already fixed in doc#11/23-733r3 using CID#17534.**Tgbe editor: no change required for this CID.** |
| 17759 | Brian Hart | 9.6.7.7 | 303.36 | If this is broadcast, missing how to reconcile WBCS and BI elements, as present at P302L38-50 | After any improvements dsuring comment reoslution, copy P302L38-50 to here | **Rejected**The rules and normative text for how to use (or reconcile) the BI element and Wide bandwidth Channel Switch element is discussed in subclause 35.15.3, 3rd paragraph and so we don’t need to explain that in 9.6.7.7 |

**9.4.2.173 Future Channel Guidance element**

***Tgbe editor: Please change the contents of this Figure as shown below:***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Element ID | Length | Element ID Extension | New Channel Number | Secondary Channel Offset element | Mesh Channel Switch Parameters element | Wide Bandwidth Channel Switch element | New Transmit Power Envelope element |  |
| Octets: | 1 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 0 or 3 | 0 or 6 | 0 or 5 | variable |  |

**Figure 9-710— Future Channel Guidance element format[#15139]**

***TGbe editor: Please remove the 7th paragraphs as below***

[#15139]**11.8.10 Future Channel Guidance operation**

***TGbe editor: Please remove the 7th paragraphs as below***

[#15139]

**9.4.2.161 Channel Switch Wrapper element**

***Insert the Table 9-xxx (Optional subelement IDs for Channel Switch Wrapper element) as follows:***

**Figure 9-695—Channel Switch Wrapper element format[#17560]**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Element ID | Length | Optional Subelements  |  |  |  |

[#17560]The Subelement ID field values for the defined subelements are shown in Table 9-xxx (Optional subelement

IDs for Channel Switch Wrapper element).

**[#17560]Table 9-xxx—Optional subelement IDs for Channel Switch Wrapper element**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Subelement ID** | **Name** | **Extensible** |
| 0-6 | Reserved |  |
| 7 | New Country |  No |
| 8-193 | Reserved |  |
| 194 | Wide Bandwidth Channel Switch  |  Yes  |
| 195 | New Transmit Power Envelope |  Yes |
| 196-254 | Reserved |  |
| 255 | Bandwidth Indication |  Yes |

**9.4.2.319 Bandwidth Indication element**

***TGbe editor: Please update the 1st paragraph as shown below:***

The Bandwidth Indication element contains [#17751]channel bandwidth, channel center frequency, and optionally punctured subchannels. The format of the Bandwidth Indication element is shown in Figure 9-1001ba (Bandwidth Indication ele­ment format).