IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| LB272 CR for MLME CID – Part 1 |
| Date: 2023-05-23 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Narengerile | Huawei | Shenzhen, China |  | narengerile@huawei.com |
| Rui Du |  |  |  |
| Mengshi Hu |  |  |  |
| Zhuqing Tang |  |  |  |
| Yiyan Zhang |  |  |  |

**Abstract**

This document proposes the comment resolutions for 30 MLME CIDs that can be resolved by accepting the proposed draft texts proposed in 625r1: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0625-01-00bf-pdt-on-new-clause-6.docx>.

The motion for the contribution 625r1 was passed during May Interim.

CID: 1000, 1222, 1223, 1237, 1238, 1777, 1816, 1843, 2161, 2260, 1211, 1212, 1213, 1214, 1220, 1221, 1297, 1320, 1321, 1542, 1543, 1544, 1568, 1663, 1935, 1944, 1945, 1946, 1947, 1958

R0: initial version on May 23, 2023, editorial change.

R1: revised version on June 2, 2023, changed a typo in the CID list in SP

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause**  | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 1000 | 6.3.136 | 25.9 | The MLME-SAP interface section contains 3 intricate Figures. Clause 6 is not the place to describe important procedures and it needs to be established if these diagrams should be in main text or in Clause 6. In 802.11 me D2.0 it will be seen that a new Clause 6 has been adopted. In writing this new Clause 6 some figures were moved from CLause 6 to the main text (e.g., Clause 11) and words added there such that the primitives could be simply added to a Table. Would the TG please look at this section to see if they would require the clause to be inserted as is or whether they could re-edit so as to be added to the Table? | Please investigate how to add primitives to clause 6 with reference to 802.11me D2.0. If 802.11bf completes before 802.11me, then still we would need to know how to make the change to the new format in 11me, i.e., anticipate the change and make it easy |
| 1222 | 6.3.138 | 51.32 | The tables in the definition of the primitives are different from the relevant tables in the baseline spec. See for example in 6.5.2.2.2 | Align the tables with the format in the baseline spec. |
| 1223 | 6.3.139 | 60.49 | The tables in the definition of the primitives are different from the relevant tables in the baseline spec. See for example in 6.5.2.2.2 | Align the tables with the format in the baseline spec. |
| 1237 |  | 0.00 | MLME Setup primitives are supposed to be aligned with the baseline Type 1 form of the primitives | Align the MLME setup primitives with the baseline general format of the primitives, see Table 6-1-- MLME SA interface and Type 1 form of the primitive |
| 1238 |  | 0.00 | MLME Termination primitives are supposed to be aligned with the baseline Type 2 form of the primitives | Align the MLME termination primitives with the baseline general format of the primitives, see Table 6-1-- MLME SA interface and Type 2 form of the primitive |
| 1777 | 6.3 | 25.04 | I know this is known, but just for official tracking, the 802.11bf draft needs to have clause 6 updated to match the new style adopted in REVme. | Adopt the tabular style for subclause 6.3, per REVme. |
| 1816 | 6 | 25.04 | Clause 6 needs to be re-written to meet the new structure of 802.11REVme D2.0 | Re-write clause 6 based on the format provided by 802.11REVme D2.0 |
| 1843 | 6 | 25.01 | It looks as though Clause 6 has not been updated to align with REVme and hence is not based on REVme D2.0 | Update the text in the clause to align with the updated MLME SAP format. |
| 2161 | 6.3 | 0.00 | The format of Clause 6 needs revising to align with the baseline. | As in the comment |
| 2260 | 6.3 | 25.04 | Clause 6 is not updated to the new "style" as provided in the 802.11-REVme D2.0 baseline. | Update the "style" of clause 6.3 to the current baseline. |

**Proposed resolution: REVISED to all.**

**Modifications: No specific changes. *To TGbf editor: Please refer to 625r1 for corresponding modifications.***

The 10 comments above are about the format of clause 6 in D1.0. I agree with the commenters in principle. These comments can be resolved automatically by accepting the proposed draft texts proposed in 625r1: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0625-01-00bf-pdt-on-new-clause-6.docx>. The motion for 625r1 was passed during May Interim.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause**  | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 1211 | 6.3.136.7.4 | 34.28 | "On receipt of this primitive, the SME should operate according to the procedure in 11.55.1 (WLAN sensing procedure)." Suggest replace with "shall" and provide the accurate reference | Replace with "On receipt of this primitive, the SME shall operate according to the procedure in 11.55.1.6 (Sensing measurement setup termination). |
| 1212 | 6.3.136.9.1 | 35.54 | "This primitive is used by the SME of an AP STA to request a TB sensing measurement instance to be performed with one or more non-AP STAs as defined in 11.55.1 (WLAN sensing procedure)." Provide more accurate reference | Replace the reference with "11.55.1.5.2 (TB sensing measurement instance)" |
| 1213 | 6.3.136.9.4 | 36.37 | "As defined in 11.55.1 (WLAN sensing procedure), an NDPA sounding phase ..." Provide more accurate reference | Replace the reference with "11.55.1.5.2 (TB sensing measurement instance)" |
| 1214 | 6.3.136.16.4 | 41.47 | "On receipt of this primitive, the SME should operate according to the procedure in 11.55.1 (WLAN sensing procedure)." Provide more accurate reference | Replace the reference with "11.55.1.5.2 (TB sensing measurement instance)" |
| 1220 | 6.3.138.3.4 | 53.04 | "...to the procedure in 11.55.3 (DMG sensing procedure)..." Provide more accurate reference | Replace the reference with "11.55.3.4 (DMG sensing measurement setup)" |
| 1221 | 6.3.138.5.4 | 54.56 | "...to the procedure in 11.55.3 (DMG sensing procedure)." Provide more accurate reference | Replace the reference with "11.55.3.4 (DMG sensing measurement setup)" |

**Proposed resolution: REVISED to all.**

**Modifications: No specific changes. *To TGbf editor: Please refer to 625r1 for corresponding modifications.***

The 6 comments above are about providing more accurate reference to the primitives. I agree with the commenters in principle. The new PDT on Clause 6 has already used the correct references as indicated in these comments. So, these comments can be resolved automatically by accepting the proposed draft texts proposed in 625r1: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0625-01-00bf-pdt-on-new-clause-6.docx>. The motion for 625r1 was passed during May Interim.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause**  | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 1297 | 6.3.138.1 | 51.33 | There is no DMG sensing procedure primitives flow chart in subclause 6.3.138 DMG sensing procedure. | Add DMG sensing primitives flow chart similar to Figure 6-29 into subclause 6.3.138.1 General. |
| 1320 | 6.3.136.1 | 28.34 | Sentence from line number 34 explains three type of "NDPA sounding" in Figure 6-29b, but little hard to tie explanation to corresponding part of the Figure 6-29b. | How about to categorize those type to "NDPA sounding(a)", "NDPA sounding(b)" and "NDPA sounding(c)" to recognize corresponding part of the sentence and the Figure. |
| 1321 | 6.3.136.1 | 28.38 | Description "is not shown in the figure" is ambiguous. SR2SI NDP really exist but is not shown OR SR2SI NDP really does NOT exist ? The latter would be intention but little confuse. | as in comment |
| 1542 | 6.3.136.1 | 26.10 | The name of the Polling trigger frame is not correct in Figure 6-29a | Change 'Sensing Poll frame' to 'Sensing Poll Trigger frame' or 'Sensing Polling Trigger frame' |
| 1543 | 6.3.136.1 | 26.22 | It is not clear what "Sensing Trigger frame" in Figure 6-29a refers to? | Change "Sensing Trigger frame" to "SR2SI Sounding Trigger frame" |
| 1544 | 6.3.136.1 | 26.16 | If present, the basic reporting phase shall be the last phase of a TB sensing measurement instance. However, in Figure 6-29a, there is a TF sounding phase following the reporting phase. | Change the order of the Reporting phase and the TF sounding phase in Figure 6-29a |
| 1568 | 6.3.136.7.2 | 34.08 | While the specs differentiate between two types of instances (TB and non-TB), it names only one type of sensing measurement setups. | Name two types of sensing measurement setups, TB sensing measurement setup to which TB sensing measurement instances correspond and non-TB sensing measurement setup to which non-TB sensing measurement instances correspond. This should apply to clause 11 and other related clauses. |
| 1663 | 6.3.136.1 | 26.18 | According to 11.55.1.5.2.1, TF sounding phase should be before reporting phase. | Change the figure to reflect the correct sequence. |
| 1935 | 6.3.136.1 | 26.22 | As part of the TF sounding phase, the initiator MLME is shown to transmit a "Sensing Trigger frame" to the responder MLME. However in both section 9.3.1.22.14.3 and 11.55.1.5.2.4, it is referred to as a "SR2SI Sounding Trigger frame". | As part of the TF sounding phase, the initiator MLME is shown to transmit a "Sensing Trigger frame" to the responder MLME. However in both section 9.3.1.22.14.3 and 11.55.1.5.2.4, it is referred to as a "SR2SI Sounding Trigger frame". |
| 1944 | 6.3.136.1 | 26.05 | It is not immediately clear that the dotted circle around the different phases indicates something is optional. Suggest adding a small legend in the top corner to indicate a dotted circle represents an optional exchange. Also, polling phase in Figure 6-29a is not labelled or circled, which it should be since it is now also optional. | Update figure to add legend and label/circle polling phase as in comment. |
| 1945 | 6.3.136.1 | 25.27 | The condition text "except that the reporting phase, if present, shall be the last phase of a TB sensing measurement instance" adds confusion to the figure. | Remove condition text cited in comment, and update Figure 6-29a to illustrate the correct ordering of the phases in the TB measurement instance. |
| 1946 | 6.3.136.1 | 27.05 | It is not immediately clear that the dotted circle around the different phases indicates something is optional. Suggest adding a small legend in the top corner to indicate a dotted circle represents an optional exchange. | Update figure to add legend as in comment. |
| 1947 | 6.3.136.1 | 28.05 | It is not immediately clear that the dotted circle around the different phases indicates something is optional. Suggest adding a small legend in the top corner to indicate a dotted circle represents an optional exchange. Also, polling phase in Figure 6-29c is not labelled or circled, which it should be since it is now also optional. | Update figure to add legend and label/circle polling phase as in comment. |
| 1958 | 6.3.136.1 | 26.10 | As part of the TF sounding phase, the initiator MLME is shown to transmit a "Sensing Poll frame" to the responder MLME. However in both section 9.3.1.22.14.2 it is referred to as "Sensing Poll Trigger frame". | Update figure to match with section 9.3.1.22.14.2 by renaming "Sensing Poll frame" to "Sensing Poll Trigger frame" |

**Proposed resolution: REVISED to all.**

**Modifications: No specific changes. *To TGbf editor: Please refer to 625r1 for corresponding modifications.***

The 14 comments above are about revising the flow charts in D1.0 for clarification, which are valid comments. Since we’ve removed figures 6-29a, b and c in subclause 6.3, the problems described in these comments can be solved automatically by accepting the proposed draft texts proposed in 625r1: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0625-01-00bf-pdt-on-new-clause-6.docx>. The motion for 625r1 was passed during May Interim.

SP:

Do you agree to the resolutions provided for CIDs 1000, 1222, 1223, 1237, 1238, 1777, 1816, 1843, 2161, 2260, 1211, 1212, 1213, 1214, 1220, 1221, 1297, 1320, 1321, 1542, 1543, 1544, 1568, 1663, 1935, 1944, 1945, 1946, 1947, 1958 to be included in the latest 11bf Draft?

Y/N/A