Minutes IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| IEEE 802.11 TGbh Interim Meeting Minutes, May 15-18, 2023  Randomized and Changing MAC addresses (RCM) | | | | |
| Date: 2023-07-10 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Peter Yee | NSA-CSD | Mountain View, CA, US |  | [peter@akayla.com](mailto:peter@akayla.com) |

Abstract

This document contains the minutes of the IEEE 802.11bh interim meeting of May 15-18, 2023.

Note: Highlighted text are action items.

Q- proceeds a question asked at the meeting

A- proceeds an answer

C- proceeds a comment

**Meeting May 15th, 2023, 10:30 a.m. to 12:30 p.m. ET**

**Chair: Mark Hamilton (Ruckus/CommScope)**

**Vice Chair: Peter Yee (NSA-CSD/AKAYLA)**

**Vice Chair: Stephen Orr (Cisco)**

**Secretary: Peter Yee**

**Editor: Carol Ansley (Cox Communications)**

**The teleconference was called to order by the Chair at 11:07 a.m. EDT.**

Agenda slide deck [11-23/0575r03](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0575-03-00bh-agenda-tgbh-2023-may-interim.pptx)

1. **Policies and procedures were presented by Chair Mark Hamilton. (Slides 4 to 15)**

There were no Patent declarations.

Copyright policy slides were presented (Slides 11 and 12)

1. **Agenda:**

* **Attendance, noises/recording, meeting protocol**
* **Policies, duty to inform, participation rules**
* **Organization topics:**
  + May Interim meetings: Monday, 10:30-12:30; Tuesday, 13:30-15:30 (if needed); Thursday 8:00-10:00 (if needed)
  + Approve March plenary and April/May teleconference minutes
  + Timeline review
* **Issues Tracking:** [**11-21/0332r37**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0332-37-00bh-issues-tracking.docx)
* **Motions record:** [**11-22/0651r18**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0651-18-00bh-tgbh-motions-list.pptx)
* **Results of Comment Collection on D0.2:** [**11-22/0973r27**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0973-27-00bh-cc41-comments-against-d0-2.xlsx)
* **Motion to approve CC41 resolutions (Motion #17 of motion deck)**
* **Consider motion for Initial Letter Ballot on D1.0 (Motion #18)**
* **Discussion on response to WBA liaisons:** [**11-21/0703r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0703-00-0000-2021-april-liaison-from-wba.docx)**,** [**11-21/1141r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1141-00-00bh-excerpts-of-wba-document-wi-fi-id-scope.pptx)**,** [**11-22/0668r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0668-00-0000-liaison-statement-from-wba-re-wi-fi-devices-identification-group.pdf)**,** [**11-22/0653r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0653-00-0000-2022-march-wba-whitepaper-re-device-identification.pdf)
* **Teleconference and July planning**

The agenda was approved with unanimous consent.

1. **Approval of Minutes**

Minutes of the March plenary ([11-23/0450r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0450-01-00bh-minutes-tgbh-plenary-meeting-march-2023.docx)), and the April 4th ([11-23/0830r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0830-01-00bh-802-11bh-telecon-minutes-april-4-2023.docx)), April 11th ([11-23/0629r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0629-00-00bh-802-11bh-telecon-minutes-april-11-2023.docx)), April 18th ([11-23/0659r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0659-00-00bh-802-11bh-telecon-minutes-april-18-2023.docx)), April 25th ([11-23/0724r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0724-00-00bh-802-11bh-telecon-minutes-april-25-2023.docx)), and the May 2nd ([11-23/0737r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0737-00-00bh-802-11bh-telecon-minutes-may-2-2023.docx)) teleconferences were approved by unanimous consent of a motion made by Peter Yee and seconded by James Gilb (GA-ASI).

1. **Timeline Review**

The current timeline shows an initial letter ballot to be initiated coming out of this meeting, with a recirculation posited for November. The hope is to wrap up all approvals by September 2024.

1. **Results of the Comment Collection on D0.2**

The results of the comment collection are tracked in [11-22/0973r27](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0973-27-00bh-cc41-comments-against-d0-2.xlsx).

1. **Motion to approve CC41 Resolutions**

A motion (#17) covering approval of CIDs 19, 20, 35, and 62 as given in [11-22/0973r27](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0973-27-00bh-cc41-comments-against-d0-2.xlsx) was made by Jerome Henry (Cisco) and seconded by Carol Ansley. The motion reads:

“Move to approve the resolutions to CIDs 19, 20, 35 and 62, per resolutions recorded in [11-22/0973r27](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0973-27-00bh-cc41-comments-against-d0-2.xlsx) (Note this overrides the existing resolution for CID 62) and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbh draft.”

It passed with unanimous consent.

1. **Motion for Initial Letter Ballot on D1.0**

A motion (#18) covering WG approval of the initial letter ballot on (the to-be-created) Draft 1.0 was made by Jerome Henry and seconded by Joe Levy (InterDigital). There appears to be no feedback on Draft 0.3 that needs to be incorporated into Draft 1.0. The motion reads:

‘Having approved [11-22/0651r18](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0651-18-00bh-tgbh-motions-list.pptx) Motions: 9, 11, 12, 13, 16 and 17, instruct the editor to prepare P802.11bh D1.0, and approve a 30 day Working Group Technical Letter Ballot asking the question “Should P802.11bh D1.0 be forwarded to SA Ballot?”’

The motion passed on a vote of 21/1/1 (Y/N/A).

1. **Discussion on response to WBA liaisons**

Stephen Orr has been working on responses to the WBA liaisons ([11-21/0703r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0703-00-0000-2021-april-liaison-from-wba.docx), [11-21/1141r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1141-00-00bh-excerpts-of-wba-document-wi-fi-id-scope.pptx), [11-22/0668r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0668-00-0000-liaison-statement-from-wba-re-wi-fi-devices-identification-group.pdf), [11-22/0653r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0653-00-0000-2022-march-wba-whitepaper-re-device-identification.pdf)). Hamilton plans for liaison response approval during the July meeting once the initial letter ballot results are available to confirm that the WG is generally in alignment with document text. It was suggested there be a meeting (even in an ad hoc manner) to discuss the liaison response and how it should be structured. That discussion will take place during the Thursday morning time slot.

1. **Teleconference and July planning**

There will be 4 meeting slots during the July plenary, which will be used for comment resolution from the initial ballot. Teleconferences are not currently planned because of the letter ballot timing and the July 4th holiday in the US.

**Meeting recessed at 11:31 a.m.**

**Meeting May 18th, 2023, 8:00 a.m. to 10:00 a.m. EDT**

**Chair: Mark Hamilton (Ruckus/CommScope)**

**Vice Chair: Peter Yee (NSA-CSD/AKAYLA)**

**Vice Chair: Stephen Orr (Cisco)**

**Secretary: Peter Yee**

**Editor: Carol Ansley (Cox Communications)**

**The teleconference was called to order by the Chair at 8:09 a.m. EDT.**

Agenda slide deck [11-23/0575r06](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0575-06-00bh-agenda-tgbh-2023-may-interim.pptx)

1. **Policies and procedures were presented by Chair Mark Hamilton. (Slides 4 to 15)**

There were no Patent declarations.

Copyright policy slides were presented (Slides 11 and 12)

1. **Agenda:**

* **Attendance, noises/recording, meeting protocol**
* **Policies, duty to inform, participation rules**
* **Organization topics:**
  + **May Plenary meetings: Monday, 10:30-12:30; Tuesday, 13:30-15:30; Thursday 8:00-10:00**
  + **Timeline review**
* **Discussion on response to WBA liaisons:** [**11-21/0703r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0703-00-0000-2021-april-liaison-from-wba.docx)**,** [**11-21/1141r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1141-00-00bh-excerpts-of-wba-document-wi-fi-id-scope.pptx)**,** [**11-22/0668r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0668-00-0000-liaison-statement-from-wba-re-wi-fi-devices-identification-group.pdf)**,** [**11-22/0653r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0653-00-0000-2022-march-wba-whitepaper-re-device-identification.pdf)
* [**11-23/0888r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0888-00-00bh-wba-liaison-discussion.pptx) **Stephen Orr**

1. **Discussion on response to WBA liaisons**

Stephen Orr presented [11-23/0888r00](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0888-00-00bh-wba-liaison-discussion.pptx), which brings together thoughts on the WBA liaison responses by mapping between TGbh use cases and WBA use cases. There are three WBA use cases (8, 9, and 11) that we don’t cover, but otherwise there’s a mapping between WBA use cases and TGbh use cases. For now, the mapping is basic, without any details of how the TGbh features handle the use cases, but more detail will be added prior to the response to the WBA. That might include pointers at existing IEEE 802.11 functionality that is applicable. It might also make sense to have mention of how TGbi’s work might impact the use cases, but that’s probably a bit premature at this point given the state of the TGbi draft and TGbi’s focus on privacy and not RCM primarily.

The hope is to have a response to WBA ready out of the July meeting. This may be affected by whether the initial letter ballot passes. We will also have an opportunity to speak with a representative of the WBA who will be attending the July plenary, albeit mostly for ARC not TGbh. In order to be ready, discussion will need to take place over the reflector and possibly in teleconferences.

Teleconferences will be scheduled for May 30th and June 13th, with the 13th cancelled if it doesn’t work for the primary presenters. These will be held at 9:30 a.m. to 11:30 a.m. EDT.

The final agenda document reflecting decisions taken regarding teleconferences is found in [11-23/0575r07](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0575-07-00bh-agenda-tgbh-2023-may-interim.pptx).

1. **July planning**

Four slots are planned for the July plenary meeting. These will be dedicated to comment resolution on Draft 1.0 and the WBA liaison response.

There aren’t too many changes on top of Draft 0.3 to create Draft 1.0. With an exhaustive cross check, the draft should be ready by the end of next week.

**The meeting was adjourned at 8:59 a.m. EDT.**