IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Proposed resolution for miscellaneous LB273 comments – Part 1 |
| Date: 2023-05-15 |
| Author: |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Edward Au | Huawei Technologies | Ottawa, Ontario, Canada |  | edward.ks.au@gmail.com  |

##### This submission present proposed resolutions for the following 20 ED2 CIDs:

4375, 4037, 4038, 4076, 4077, 4080, 4081, 4082, 4078, 4094,

4095, 4032, 4033, 4035, 4050, 4154, 4161, 4182, 4227, 4316

##### The proposed changes are based on REVme/D3.0.

##### Revision history:

##### R0 – Initial version

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4375 |  | 170 | 1 | Extra parenthesis | Delete ( |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter that the “ (” is not needed.



***Proposed resolution for CID 4375:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4037 | 20.5.3.1.2 | 3359 | 62 | In "... support for pi/2-8-PSK or MCS 10 is optional": "or" is a typo of "for". | Please replace "or" with "for" in P3359L62. |
| 4038 | 20.5.3.1.2 | 3359 | 63 | In "...the support for pi/2-8-16-QAM for MCS 11 is mandatory": "pi/2-8-16-QAM" is a typo for "pi/2-16-QAM."Note: "pi/2-16-QAM" for MCS 11 is defined in Table 20-15. | As in the comment. |

***Discussion:***

For CID 4037: The MCS and the modulation are closely related to one another as per Table 20-15 and Table 20-16. Agree with the commenter that “or” be replaced with “for”.

For CID 4038: Agree that it is a typo because there is no modulation “pi/2-8-16-QAM”. The correct mandatory modulation for MCS 11 is “pi/2-16-QAM”.



***Proposed resolution for CID 4037:***

Accepted

***Proposed resolution for CID 4038:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4076 | Tables | 97 | 43 | In the Table list, the following Table references are not placed in the ascending order.Table 9-19 and Table 9-20;Table 9-84 and Table 9-85;Table 9-135 and Table 9-136;Table 9-139 and Table 9-140;from Table 9-192 to Table 9-200;from Table 9-238 to Table 9-240;from Table 9-248 to Table 9-250;Table 9-271 and Table 9-272;Table 9-284 and Table 9-285;Table 9-290 and Table 9-291;Table 9-382 and Table 9-383;Table 9-393 and Table 9-394;Table 9-399 and Table 9-400;from Table 9-407 to Table 9-409;from Table 9-440 to Table 9-443;Table 9-458 and Table 9-459;from Table 9-471 to Table 9-473;Table 9-485 and Table 9-486;from Table 9-494 to Table 9-499;Table 9-503 and Table 9-504;Table 9-509 and Table 9-510;from Table 9-529 to Table 9-540;Table 9-545 and Table 9-546;Table 9-558 and Table 9-559;Table 9-571 and Table 9-572;from Table 9-575 to Table 9-583. | Please reorder the positions of Table references in the right way. |
| 4077 | Tables | 109 | 1 | In the Table list, the following Table references are not placed in the ascending order.from Table 9-601 to Table 9-603;Table 9-613 and Table 9-614;from Table 9-621 to Table 9-623;Table 12-9 and Table 12-10;Table 14-28 and Table 14-29;Table 17-4 and Table 17-5;from Table 20-27 to Table 20-29;Table 22-3 and Table 22-4;Table 22-11 and Table 22-12;Table 23-25 and Table 23-26;from Table 25-24 to Table 25-26;from Table 25-40 to Table 25-42;Table 25-45 and Table 25-46;Table 28-79 and Table 28-80;Table 28-84 and Table 28-85;Table 28-94 and Table 28-95;Table I-20 and Table I-21. | Please reorder the positions of Table references in the right way. |

***Discussion:***

For both CIDs, agree that the orders of the identified tables are not displayed in a correct order. It is mainly because the “markers” of these tables (in framemaker) are not placed probably, which need some manual adjustment.

***Proposed resolution for CID 4076:***

Accepted

***Proposed resolution for CID 4077:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4080 | Figures | 128 | 36 | In the Figure list, the following references are not placed in the ascending order.from Figure 9-2 to Figure 9-4;from Figure 9-18 to Figure 9-20;Figure 9-24 and Figure 4-25;from Figure 9-39 to Figure 9-41;from Figure 9-59 to Figure 9-61;Figure 9-72 and Figure 4-73;from Figure 9-76 to Figure 9-78;from Figure 9-126 to Figure 9-133;from Figure 9-145 to Figure 9-153;from Figure 9-159 to Figure 9-163;Figure 9-227 and Figure 4-228;Figure 9-248 and Figure 4-249;Figure 9-266 and Figure 4-267;from Figure 9-337 to Figure 9-339;Figure 9-348 and Figure 4-349;Figure 9-363 and Figure 4-364;from Figure 9-368 to Figure 9-371;from Figure 9-385 to Figure 9-387;from Figure 9-419 to Figure 9-421;from Figure 9-455 to Figure 9-457;Figure 9-476 and Figure 4-477;from Figure 9-487 to Figure 9-491;Figure 9-496 and Figure 4-497;Figure 9-528 and Figure 4-529;Figure 9-538 and Figure 4-539 | Please reorder the positions of Figure references in the right way. |
| 4081 | Figures | 139 | 9 | In the Figure list, the following references are not placed in the ascending order.from Figure 9-555 to Figure 9-557;from Figure 9-573 to Figure 9-575;Figure 9-582 and Figure 4-583;Figure 9-590 and Figure 4-591;Figure 9-595 and Figure 4-596;Figure 9-605 and Figure 4-606;Figure 9-629 and Figure 4-630;Figure 9-635 and Figure 4-636;Figure 9-644 and Figure 4-645;from Figure 9-661 to Figure 9-666;Figure 9-677 and Figure 4-678;Figure 9-682 and Figure 4-683;from Figure 9-696 to Figure 9-701;from Figure 9-707 to Figure 9-709;from Figure 9-717 to Figure 9-722;from Figure 9-732 to Figure 9-735;from Figure 9-761 to Figure 9-763;from Figure 9-780 to Figure 9-782;from Figure 9-808 to Figure 9-810;from Figure 9-827 to Figure 9-831;Figure 9-837 and Figure 4-838;from Figure 9-855 to Figure 9-858;from Figure 9-862 to Figure 9-864. | Please reorder the positions of Figure references in the right way. |
| 4082 | Figures | 147 | 23 | In the Figure list, the following references are not placed in the ascending order.from Figure 9-988 to Figure 9-993;from Figure 9-1008 to Figure 9-1016;from Figure 9-1025 to Figure 9-1033;from Figure 9-1036 to Figure 9-1038;from Figure 9-1043 to Figure 9-1045;from Figure 9-1066 to Figure 9-1068;Figure 9-1071 and Figure 4-1072;from Figure 9-1081 to Figure 9-1083;Figure 9-1087 and Figure 4-1088;from Figure 9-1095 to Figure 9-1099;from Figure 9-1106 to Figure 9-1108;Figure 9-1113 and Figure 4-1114;Figure 9-1119 and Figure 4-1120;Figure 9-1134 and Figure 4-1135;from Figure 9-1157 to Figure 9-1165;from Figure 9-1183 to Figure 9-1185;from Figure 9-1225 to Figure 9-1227;Figure 10-40 and Figure 10-41;Figure 10-78 and Figure 10-79;from Figure 10-162 to Figure 10-164;from Figure 12-36 to Figure 12-41;from Figure 13-25 to Figure 13-29;from Figure 23-19 to Figure 23-26;from Figure 23-30 to Figure 23-36;Figure 27-13 and Figure 27-14;Figure 27-49 and Figure 27-50;Figure 27-53 and Figure 27-54;Figure AA-1 and Figure AA-2. | Please reorder the positions of Figure references in the right way. |

***Discussion:***

For these 3 CIDs, agree that the orders of the identified figures are not displayed in a correct order. It is mainly because the “markers” of these figures (in framemaker) are not placed probably, which need some manual adjustment.

***Proposed resolution for CID 4080:***

Accepted

***Proposed resolution for CID 4081:***

Accepted

***Proposed resolution for CID 4082:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4078 | Tables | 110 | 7 | Please remove the duplicated reference (the first one) of table 10-10. | As in comment. |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter to remove the first appearance of “Table 10-10”.



***Proposed resolution for CID 4078:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4094 | 11.22.3.2.1 | 2625 | 58 | Figures 11-46, 11-44, 11-47, and 11-45 appear in this order. | Please reorder these figures in the ascending order. |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter that these 4 figures need to be reordered so that they appear in the ascending order.

***Proposed resolution for CID 4094:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4095 | 23 | 3572 | 1 | "3811" in the heading of Clause 23 seems to be a comment number. If so, please fix the notation. Otherwise, please remove it. | As in comment. |

***Discussion:***

“3811” is not a comment number related to clause 23 (CID 3811 was related to clause 12). Agree to remove “3811”.



***Proposed resolution for CID 4095:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4032 | 28.3.4 | 4295 | 30 | "(see 28.3.4 (Channelization))" is a recursive reference since it's \*in\* clause 28.3.4. | Delete the phrase. |

***Discussion:***

Agree that “(see 28.3.4 (Channelization))” is redundant especially since Table 28-20 is in the same subclause 28.3.4.



***Proposed resolution for CID 4032:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4033 | 28.3.4 | 4295 | 52 | An EDMG STA can use more than one channel if multiband support is enabled. | Delete 'one'. |

***Discussion:***

Agree that the phrase “one” is not necessary.



***Proposed resolution for CID 4033:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4035 | 28.3.4 | 4296 | 40 | The lines only appear dotted at high zoom, and may not print clearly. | Change "and is shown near the vertical dotted lines" to "and are indicated as Channel Idx in the figure." |

***Discussion:***



Agree with the commenter that the dotted lines only appear at high zoom. Agree with the commenter that the proposed text change is better. Note that it will be a revised rather than accepted resolution because of the change from “are indicated” to “is indicated”.

***Proposed resolution for CID 4035:***

Revised

At 4296.40, replace “and is shown near the vertical dotted lines” to “and is indicated as Channel Idx in the figure”.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4050 | 25.3.2.3.6 | 3749 | 59 | Missing space (-78(see Note)) | Add space. |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter than a space is missing.



***Proposed resolution for CID 4050:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4154 | 26.8.7.2 | 3929 | 63 | (Re-)Association should not have a hyphen | As it says in the comment |

***Discussion:***

Agree that (Re)Association should not have a hyphen.



***Proposed resolution for CID 4154:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4161 | 26.11.10 | 3955 | 16 | What is the weird dot above the first 2 in [1 / 2, 2 ] in 26.11.10 POWER\_BOOST\_FACTOR? | Delete the dot |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter that the dot above the first 2 is not needed (and agree that it is weird!).



***Proposed resolution for CID 4161:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4182 | R.2.4 | 5738 | 63 | "The user requests the WLAN via their laptop's UI to search for guest networks." not clear | Change to "The user requests WLAN guest access via their laptop's UI." |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter that their proposed text change is better.



***Proposed resolution for CID 4182:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4227 | 13 | 2975 | 43 | "00-0F-AC:17(Fast BSS Transition over FILS)" should have a space after 17 | As it says in the comment |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter than a space is missing.



***Proposed resolution for CID 4227:***

Accepted

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4316 | 26.10.3.2 | 3945 | 11 | In the first equation in 26.10.3.2, the R in RPL\_PSRR,20MHz has the wrong font | As it says in the comment |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter. The font size “R” needs to be increased to make it consistent with the rest of the term.



***Proposed resolution for CID 4316:***

Accepted