IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Minutes of TGbe 2023 Sept Interim MAC |
| Date: 2023-01-16 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Liwen Chu | NXP |  |  |  |
| Jeongki Kim | Ofinno |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains the meeting minutes for the TGbe MAC ad hoc teleconferences held in Jan 2023.

Revisions:

* Rev0:
	+ Adding the minutes of AM1 MAC session held on Jan 16, 2023.
* Rev1:
	+ Adding the minutes of PM2 MAC session held on Jan 16, 2023.
	+ Adding the minutes of AM1 MAC session held on Jan 17, 2023.
	+ Adding the minutes of PM1 MAC session held on Jan 17, 2023.
	+ Adding the minutes of PM2 MAC session held on Jan 17, 2023.

**Monday, 16 January 2023, 10:30AM –12:30PM EDT (TGbe MAC F2F session)**

Chairman: Jeongki Kim (Ofinno)

Secretary: Liwen Chu (NXP)

This meeting took place using a mixed webex session and F2F session.

**Introduction**

1. The Chair (Jeongki, Ofinno) calls the meeting to order at 10:30am EDT. The Chair introduces himself and the Secretary, Liwen Chu (NXP)
2. The Chair goes through the registration information, the meeting protocol, the attendance reminder, the copyright policy, the 802 and 802.11 IPR policy and procedures and asks if there is anyone that is aware of any potentially essential patents.
	1. Nobody responds.
3. The Chair recommends using IMAT for recording the attendance.
	* Please record your attendance during the conference call by using the IMAT system:
		1. 1) login to [imat](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), 2) select “802.11 Telecons (<Month>)” entry, 3) select “C/LM/WG802.11 Attendance” entry, 4) click “TGbe <MAC/PHY/Joint> conference call that you are attending.
	* If you are unable to record the attendance via [IMAT](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance) then please send an e-mail to Liwen Chu (liwen.chu@nxp.com) and Jeongki Kim (jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com)

**Recorded attendance through Imat and e-mail:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
|   |   |   |  |

1. The Chair reminds that the agenda can be found in 11-22/2118r3. The Chair asks for the comments about the agenda. There are no comments received. The agenda is approved.
* Technical Submissions:
	1. [**1489r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1489-00-00be-lb266-cr-for-misc-cids.docx) **lb266-cr-for-MISC-CIDs Jason Y. Guo [6C]**

Discussion: None

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1489r1 for the following CIDs?

10098 10941 12714 12715

No Objection

* 1. [**2179r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2179-00-00be-cc36-cr-for-cid-12622.docx) **CC36-CR-for-CID-12622 Arik Klein [1C]**

Discussion:

C: CID 12622. Two type of link disablements: AP MLD’s broadcat of disablement, diablement by non-AP MLD. Please calrify the note.

A: add ”as decribed above”.

C: same CID. Add ”if any such non-AP STA s exist”

A: ok.

C: the above text of ”disabled for” is not clear about which initiate the disablement..

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/2179r0 for the following CIDs?

SP deferred after the next contribution

* 1. [**2177r1**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2177-00-00be-lb266-cr-on-cid-10480.docx) **LB266 CR on CID 10480 Guogang Huang [1C]**

Discussion:

C: confused. The motin of another similar contribution failed.

A: this is another comment transferred to me.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/12177r1 for the following CID?

10480

25Y, 24N, 26A

* 1. [**2179r1**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2179-00-00be-cc36-cr-for-cid-12622.docx) **CC36-CR-for-CID-12622 Arik Klein [1C]**

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/2179r1 for the following CIDs?

12622

No Objection

* 1. [**2196r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2196-00-00be-lb266-cr-for-misc-cids.docx) **CR for Misc. CIDs Insun Jang [7C]**

Discussion:

C: CID 12805. The first two sentences should not be deleted.

A: we have the similar sentences of the first two sentences in other part.

C: would like to do offline discussion.

A: Ok.

11740, 11566 were deferred per the request in chat window.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/2196r0 for the following CIDs?

10847, 13391

No Objection

* 1. [**2199r2**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2199-01-00be-lb266-cr-for-cid-10437.docx) **CR for CID 10437 Liuming Lu [1C]**

Discussion:

C: similar CID is addressed in another contrbution. Pleasr defer this for some offline discussion.

A: ok.

SP deferred

* 1. [**2202r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2202-00-00be-lb266-cr-for-cid-10864.docx) **CR for CID 10864 Yousi Lin [1C]**

Discussion:

C: the proposal is related to implementation choice. The proposal can be achieved through OMI.

A: it is not supported efficiently.

C: it seems you want use scanning radio for frame exchanges. But scanning radio can’t do normal frame transmission. It is more related to MLMR operation, e.g. the first frame has no frame type restriction in the link with full functional radio.

A: don;t think scanning radio has strong Tx capability, i.e. only Tx CTS.

SP deferred

* 1. [**0084r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0084-00-00be-d2-0-misc-cids.docx) **D2.0 Misc CIDs Liwen Chu [5C]**

Discussion:

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-23/0084r0 for the following CIDs?

10351, 10550, 11376, 11902

No Objection

The session was recessed at 12:27PM ET.

**Monday, 16 January 2023, 04:00PM –06:00PM EDT (TGbe MAC F2F session)**

Chairman: Jeongki Kim (Ofinno)

Secretary: Liwen Chu (NXP)

This meeting took place using a mixed webex session and F2F session.

**Introduction**

1. The Chair (Jeongki, Ofinno) calls the meeting to order at 04:00pm EDT. The Chair introduces himself and the Secretary, Liwen Chu (NXP)
2. The Chair goes through the registration information, the meeting protocol, the attendance reminder, the copyright policy, the 802 and 802.11 IPR policy and procedures and asks if there is anyone that is aware of any potentially essential patents.
	1. Nobody responds.
3. The Chair recommends using IMAT for recording the attendance.
	* Please record your attendance during the conference call by using the IMAT system:
		1. 1) login to [imat](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), 2) select “802.11 Telecons (<Month>)” entry, 3) select “C/LM/WG802.11 Attendance” entry, 4) click “TGbe <MAC/PHY/Joint> conference call that you are attending.
	* If you are unable to record the attendance via [IMAT](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance) then please send an e-mail to Liwen Chu (liwen.chu@nxp.com) and Jeongki Kim (jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com)

**Recorded attendance through Imat and e-mail:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
|   |   |   |  |

1. The Chair reminds that the agenda can be found in 11-22/2118r4. The Chair asks for the comments about the agenda. The updated agenda (1844, 1373 removed from the agenda) is approved.
* Technical Submissions:
	1. [1786r2](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1786-00-00be-lb266-cr-for-cid-14071.docx) CR for CID 14071 Liuming Lu

Discussion:

C: latest transmit offset should be announced more regularly than in QoS Characteristic element.

A: do you mean that the QoS Characteristic element is enough?

C: like the idea. But the proposed method can’t address the issue.

C: similar question. Will take offline.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1786r2 for the following CID?

SP deferred

* 1. [1462r3](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1462-01-00be-lb266-cr-for-subclause-35-3-4-4.docx) CR for subclause 35.3.4.4 Ming Gan

Discussion: None

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1462r3 for the following CID?

10625

No Objection

* 1. [1503r4](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1503-02-00be-d2-0-comment-resolution-subclause-35-3-18-part-1.docx) D2.0 comment resolution subclause 35.3.18 part 1 Liwen Chu

Discussion:

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1503r4 for the following CIDs?

SP deferred

* 1. [1768r8](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1768-06-00be-lb266-cr-for-subclause-35-3-16-8-1.docx) LB266 CR for subclause 35.3.16.8.1 Ming Gan

Discussion:

C: EMLSR is similar to EMLMR.

A: there is some concern about EMLSR.

C: EMLSR/EMLMR should be done together.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1768r8 for the following CIDs?

SP deferred

* 1. [1264r6](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1264-05-00be-lb266-cr-for-p2p-buffer-report.docx) LB266 CR for P2P buffer report Yunbo Li

Discussion:

C: BSR already esixts, and SCS can provide the informaiton.

A: the required medium time is not provided by the current BSR. SCS can’t provide the dynamic information.

.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1264r6 for the following CIDs?

10727, 10077, 10016, 12723, 12836, 13654, 13684, 14091, 13340, 12332, 13322, 10711, 10675, 10882

21Y, 17N, 21A

* 1. [2172r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2172-01-00be-lb266-cr-for-cids-in-35-9.docx) LB266 CR for CIDs in 35.9 Abdel Karim Ajami

Discussion:

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/2172r1 for the following CIDs?

10686, 10903, 11112, 12287, 12341, 12463, 13036, 13307

No Objection

* 1. [1369r4](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1369-03-00be-cr-for-some-cids-on-clause-9.docx) CR for some CIDs on clause-9 Morteza Mehrnoush

Discussion: None

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1369r4 for the following CID?

10542

No Ojection

* 1. 2108r3

Discussion: None

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/2108r3 for the following CIDs?

11547, 11548

No Ojection

* 1. 1881r4

Discussion:

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1881r4 for the following CID?

13873

SP deferred.

The session was recessed at 05:52PM ET.

**Tuesday, 17 January 2023, 08:00AM –10:00AM EDT (TGbe MAC F2F session)**

Chairman: Jeongki Kim (Ofinno)

Secretary: Liwen Chu (NXP)

This meeting took place using a mixed webex session and F2F session.

**Introduction**

1. The Chair (Jeongki, Ofinno) calls the meeting to order at 10:30am EDT. The Chair introduces himself and the Secretary, Liwen Chu (NXP)
2. The Chair goes through the registration information, the meeting protocol, the attendance reminder, the copyright policy, the 802 and 802.11 IPR policy and procedures and asks if there is anyone that is aware of any potentially essential patents.
	1. Nobody responds.
3. The Chair recommends using IMAT for recording the attendance.
	* Please record your attendance during the conference call by using the IMAT system:
		1. 1) login to [imat](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), 2) select “802.11 Telecons (<Month>)” entry, 3) select “C/LM/WG802.11 Attendance” entry, 4) click “TGbe <MAC/PHY/Joint> conference call that you are attending.
	* If you are unable to record the attendance via [IMAT](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance) then please send an e-mail to Liwen Chu (liwen.chu@nxp.com) and Jeongki Kim (jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com)

**Recorded attendance through Imat and e-mail:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
|   |   |   |  |

1. The Chair reminds that the agenda can be found in 11-22/2118r3. The Chair asks for the comments about the agenda. There are no comments received. The agenda is approved.
* Technical Submissions:
	1. [**1935r2**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1935-00-00be-lb266-resolution-for-cid-10924.docx) **LB266 - Resolution for CID 10924 Thomas Handte [SP]**

Discussion:

C: this is not necessary. SCS is used by AP for TXOP-based channel access. The beavior can be done anyway.

A: It is important to clarify EDCA-based case.

C: although it is already allowed, I support this clarification.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1935r2 for the following CID?

10924

13Y, 14N, 18A

* 1. [**2159r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2159-00-00be-cr-for-qmf.docx) **CR for QMF Po-Kai Huang [SP]**

Discussion:

C: This is simply extend QMF to MLD level?

A: yes with the following major changes: 1) sequence number extension, 2) Policy Change, 3) Capabilities announement.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/2159r2 for the following CIDs?

SP deferred

* 1. [**2165r2**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2165-00-00be-cr-for-miscellaneous-cids-iii.docx) **CR for Miscellaneous CIDs III Po-Kai Huang [SP]**

Discussion:

C: based on the comment from Jay, it is better to work with Jay about this comment.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/2165r2 for the following CID?

11965

16Y, 15N, 18A

* 1. [**2182r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2182-00-00be-lb266-cr-for-misc-cids-in-35-9-and-35-9-4-1.docx) **LB266 CR for misc CIDs in 35.9 and 35.9.4.1 Chunyu Hu [6C]**

Discussion:

C: CID 12894, the SP for it gives legacy STAs priority than R-TWT supporting STAs.

A: agree.

C: Don’t think this is necessary. This makes non-member R-TWT supporting STA implementation complcated. The AP should give its own high priority so that this amendment is not required.

C: CID 10698. The reject reason assumes that there is some issue. But this may not be the case.

A: can defer it.

SP deferred

* 1. [**1890r4**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1890-03-00be-lb266-cr-for-reconfiguration-ml-element.docx) **CR for Reconfiguration ML element Binita Gupta [Q-SP 11C]**

Discussion:

C: The removing of reporting AP should not be done through Per-STA Profile. It is for the reported AP.

A: this is not for the case.

C: CID 11520. The added text for the receiver side is related to the implementation. They should be removed.

A: can remove the related text.

C: the text is important about the way to set the address.

C: Please defer 11520.

C: please defer 10567.

SP1: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1890r5 for the following CIDs?

11042 11401

No Objection

SP2: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1890r5 for the following CIDs?

13481 13760

28Y, 17N, 14A

1881r4, 1263r5, 1502r2 were added to the agenda per the approval from the group

* 1. **1881r4**

Discussion:

None.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1881r4 for the following CID?

13873

No Objection

* 1. **1263r5**

Discussion:

None.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1263r5 for the following CID?

13989

No Objection

* 1. **1705r2**

Discussion:

None.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1705r2 for the following CID?

13989

No Objection

The session was recessed at 09:59AM ET.

**Tuesday, 17 January 2023, 01:30PM –03:30PM EDT (TGbe MAC F2F session)**

Chairman: Jeongki Kim (Ofinno)

Secretary: Liwen Chu (NXP)

This meeting took place using a mixed webex session and F2F session.

**Introduction**

1. The Chair (Jeongki, Ofinno) calls the meeting to order at 01:30pm EDT. The Chair introduces himself and the Secretary, Liwen Chu (NXP)
2. The Chair goes through the registration information, the meeting protocol, the attendance reminder, the copyright policy, the 802 and 802.11 IPR policy and procedures and asks if there is anyone that is aware of any potentially essential patents.
	1. Nobody responds.
3. The Chair recommends using IMAT for recording the attendance.
	* Please record your attendance during the conference call by using the IMAT system:
		1. 1) login to [imat](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), 2) select “802.11 Telecons (<Month>)” entry, 3) select “C/LM/WG802.11 Attendance” entry, 4) click “TGbe <MAC/PHY/Joint> conference call that you are attending.
	* If you are unable to record the attendance via [IMAT](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance) then please send an e-mail to Liwen Chu (liwen.chu@nxp.com) and Jeongki Kim (jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com)

**Recorded attendance through Imat and e-mail:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
|   |   |   |  |

1. The Chair reminds that the agenda can be found in 11-22/2118r7. The Chair asks for the comments about the agenda. The updated agenda (removing 1427, 1828, 1263, adding 2174, 2175, 1793, 1978) is approved.
* Technical Submissions:
	1. [**1535r2**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1535-01-00be-p2p-communication-with-emlsr-peer-in-triggered-txop-sharing-cid-12422.docx) **P2P Comm. with EMLSR Peer in Triggered TXOP Sharing CID 12422 Juseong Moon**

Discussion:

C: the EMLSR operation and TDLS should be independent from each other.

A: one peer STA doesn’t know the other STA’s behavior.

C: the scheduling can be used.

C: agree with the previous commenter

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1535r2 for the following CID?

12422

SP deferred

* 1. [**1537r1**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1537-01-00be-text-for-edcaf-selection-issue-on-start-time-sync-access-cid-12414.docx) **Text for EDCAF Selection Issue on Start Time Sync Access CID 12414 Juseong Moon**

Discussion:

C: understanding is that the problem is coverred by the current draft.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/r for the following CID?

SP deferred

* 1. [**1417r4**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1417-02-00be-lb266-cr-for-35-3-16-2.docx) **LB266 CR for 35.3.16.2 Yunbo Li**

Discussion:

C: The spec allows NSTR mobile AP MLD with two links. The discussion of the comment is not right.

A: update the discussion to refer the the current spec.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1417r4 for the following CIDs?

13392, 13393

No Objection

* 1. **2174r1**

Discussion:

C: the link bitmap should be in EMLSR Parameter Update.

A: EML Control already includes the link bitmap. EML Control is always included.

C: EMLSR Parameter Update Control can be changed to Link Map Update Control since the parameter change happens after the link bitmap change happens.

A: don’t want to combine the two things together. The EMLSR parameters was announced during association, it is not known which link will be EMLSR link at that time.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/2174r1 for the following CID?

SP deferred

* 1. **2175r1**

Discussion:

C: Do you have condition to allow PM equal to 1?

A: no.

C: Please give some time for reviewing?

A: ok.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/2175r1 for the following CID?

SP deferred

* 1. **1793r6**

Discussion:

C: don’t agree with the reason. The discussion is not true.

A: for the DL transmission, the response frame can be different.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1793r6 for the following CIDs?

10053, 11651

No Objection

* 1. **1978r6**

Discussion:

None

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1978r6 for the following CIDs?

11138 13863

No Objection

The session was recessed at 02:26PM ET.

**Tuesday, 17 January 2023, 04:00PM –06:00PM EDT (TGbe MAC F2F session)**

Chairman: Jeongki Kim (Ofinno)

Secretary: Liwen Chu (NXP)

This meeting took place using a mixed webex session and F2F session.

**Introduction**

1. The Chair (Jeongki, Ofinno) calls the meeting to order at 01:30pm EDT. The Chair introduces himself and the Secretary, Liwen Chu (NXP)
2. The Chair goes through the registration information, the meeting protocol, the attendance reminder, the copyright policy, the 802 and 802.11 IPR policy and procedures and asks if there is anyone that is aware of any potentially essential patents.
	1. Nobody responds.
3. The Chair recommends using IMAT for recording the attendance.
	* Please record your attendance during the conference call by using the IMAT system:
		1. 1) login to [imat](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), 2) select “802.11 Telecons (<Month>)” entry, 3) select “C/LM/WG802.11 Attendance” entry, 4) click “TGbe <MAC/PHY/Joint> conference call that you are attending.
	* If you are unable to record the attendance via [IMAT](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance) then please send an e-mail to Liwen Chu (liwen.chu@nxp.com) and Jeongki Kim (jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com)

**Recorded attendance through Imat and e-mail:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
|   |   |   |  |

1. The Chair asks for the contributions for the discussion. 1369, 2196, 1537, 1503, 1683, 1418 etc. are added in the agenda. The updated agenda () is approved.
* Technical Submissions:
	1. **1369r5**

Discussion: None

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1369r5 for the following CID?

10542

No Objection

* 1. **2196r1**

Discussion:

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/2196r1 for the following CIDs?

12805, 11190, 11191, 11740

No Objection

* 1. **1503r7**

Discussion:

C: some text should be added for option 1 to be in line with the CCA requirement

A: the normative text in 802.11 spec PHY part can be used

C: since option 1 is in line with PHY CCA requirement, the SP should be done for option 1 only.

SP1: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1503r7 for the following CID?

10046, 10047, 12856, 12857, 12858, 12859, 10166, 11463, ~~11464,~~ 12862, 12873, 11589

No Objection

SP2: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1535r2 for the following CID?

12862

32Y, 17N, 13A

SP3: Do you support option 1 as the resolution in 11-22/1503r7 for the following CIDs?

10165, 10167, 12851, 10042, 12893, 13956, 11588, 11590, 12167, 13596

44Y, 4N, 16A

* 1. **1683r9**

Discussion:

C: the solution is specific. We should provide general solution in the future.

A: would like to try the proposed text in this round.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1683r9 for the following CID?

10773

45Y, 11N, 22A

* 1. 1418r2

Discussion:

C: this contribution talks about NSTR capability change after association. Some other document talks about the change of the other capabilities. We should use the unified structure.

A: the design criteria of the related documents is same.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1418r2 for the following CIDs?

12326, 13394, 13699, 13925, 10365, 10082, 12440

38Y, 11N, 22A

* 1. **1890r5**

Discussion:

C: please defer the SP to tomorrow.

A: Do you have suggestion right now?

C: no

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1890r5 for the following CIDs?

SP deferred

* 1. **1537r1**

Discussion:

C: same comment. Don’t see the value.

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1537r1 for the following CID?

12414

9Y, 32N, 26A

* 1. **1436r9**

Discussion:

None

SP: Do you support the resolution in 11-22/1436r9 for the following CID?

10071

No Objection

The session was recessed at 05:40PM ET.