IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes for REVme 2023 January 6 & 9 Telecon | | | | |
| Date: 2023-01-06 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee . org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

REVme Telecon Minutes for January 6th and 9th, 2023  
 R0: January 6th Initial Minutes.

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Friday, January 5, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order** 10:02 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
      1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
      2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
      3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
   3. **IMAT Reported attendance**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Hedayat, Ahmadreza | Apple Inc. |
| 2 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
| 3 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 4 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 5 | Petrick, Albert | Jones-Petrick and Associates, LLC. |
| 6 | Qi, Emily | Intel |
| 7 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 8 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 9 | Smith, Graham | SR Technologies |
| 10 | Sun, Bo | Sanechips |
| 11 | Thakore, Darshak | Cable Television Laboratories Inc. (CableLabs) |
| 12 | Wei, Dong | NXP Semiconductors |

* 1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
     1. **Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides: See p4-19 in** <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0856-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2022.pptx>
     2. No issues were noted.
  2. **Review agenda**:11-22/2060r6:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2060-06-000m-november-january-teleconference-agenda.docx>
     2. **Today’s Agenda:**
     3. Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance> ), and patent and copyright policy
     4. Approve Agenda
     5. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU
     6. Comment resolution
        1. CIDs 3514, 3375 – RISON (Samsung)
        2. EDITOR1 CIDs – QI (Intel)
     7. Adjourn
     8. Agenda approved without objection.
  3. **Editor Report** - Emily QI (Intel) / Edward AU (Huawei)
     1. Close to complete roll-in of approved comments.
     2. Hope to have a draft for Review Monday and end of next week have 2.1 ready to post.
  4. **CIDs 3514 (PHY) and 3375 (PHY)** – Mark RISON (Samsung)
     1. CID 3514 and 3375 (PHY)
        1. After posting an email to reflector, received no response.
        2. Discussion on if “STA capabilities” is defined sufficiently
        3. Need to have locations determined to ensure the correct changes are made.
        4. 400 Instances are in c.3
        5. Discussion on why make the change. Device may have more than one STA. So having a Device called out here is going to be overloaded. The use of STA capability is sufficient that no definition is needed.
        6. Proposed Resolution: CID 3375 (PHY) – Accepted.
        7. Proposed Resolution: CID 3514 (PHY): Revised. Replace "device capabilities" with "STA capabilities" (note to Editor, same resolution as CID 3375). Note to commenter, the phrase "STA capabilities" is self-defining as an English phrase.
        8. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  5. **EDITOR1 CIDs** – 11-22/2072r2 - Emily QI (Intel)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2072-02-000m-proposed-resolution-for-revme-lb270-editor1-ad-hoc-comments.docx>
     2. CID 3298 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment
        2. 26 instances of “on the medium” and 29 instances of “on the WM”
        3. Discussion the direction to may be change to “on the WM”.
        4. Need to check each instance to ensure that it works.
        5. Do we review now or refer CID back to the commenter.
        6. The definition section should not use “WM”, but rather “wireless medium”.
        7. CID 3298 (ED1): Direction is to change "on the medium" to "on the WM" (with expansion in Definitions, as needed). Assign to Mark RISON to double-check the instances.
        8. Mark CID “More Work Required
        9. Assign CID to Mark RISON
        10. Schedule CID for Review to telecon in February.
     3. CID 3309 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review discussion in submission.
        3. Discussion on the changes.
           1. “Beacon Frame” exists; DTIM have beacons but are they DTIM Beacon Frames; what happens when it is an S1G Beacon that is also a DTIM.
        4. Discussion on ok to make “DTIM Beacon” to “DTIM beacon”
        5. Straw Poll:
           1. Do you support "change "DTIM Beacon frame" to "DTIM beacon""?

Result: 5 yes, 2 No, 1 abstain.

* + - 1. At this point, the direction would be toward Accept the Comment.
      2. Proposed Resolution: Accept
      3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
      4. Changes to cited Figure 10-147 (p2283) needs to have an updated figure supplied.
      5. ACTION ITEM #1: Mark RISON to provide the VISO figure source for Figure 10-147 (p2283) to the EDITOR.
    1. CID 3361 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. There are more instances than cited.
       3. Mark CID “More Work Required”
       4. Assign CID to Mark RISON
       5. Schedule CID for Review to telecon in February.
    2. CID 3362 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Review discussion in submission.
       3. Mark CID “More Work Required”
       4. Assign CID to Mark RISON
       5. Schedule CID for Review to telecon in February.
    3. CID 3367 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. There are 90 instances of “DL MU-MIMO"; 43 instances of "DL-MU-MIMO". 11ax introduced most of “DL MU-MIMO”.
       3. Discussion on the common practice for “-“
       4. Proposed resolution: CID 3367 (ED1): Revised. Change "DL-MU-MIMO" to "DL MU-MIMO" throughout the draft.
       5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
    4. CID 3369 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
    5. CID 3379 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Review discussion in submission.
       3. There seems to be different types of Vendor Specific information, so they may need a bit of a specific definition.
       4. Mark CID “More Work Required”
       5. Assign CID to Mark RISON
       6. Schedule CID for Review to telecon in February.
    6. CID 3404 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Review discussion submission.
       3. 3 instances were shown for different PHYs, and so if it is specified for the specific PHY, then does it need to be identical?
       4. Move CID to PHY AdHoc
       5. Mark CID “More Work Required”
       6. Assign CID to Mark RISON
       7. Schedule CID for Review to telecon in February.
    7. CID 3419 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Review Context as captured in discussion in submission.
       3. Discussion of lack of consistency of using “bit” or “subfield” in the table.
       4. Editor to take the topic of use of subfield vs field in general to the Editor Group.
       5. Proposed Resolution: Revised; Change “bit” to “subfield” at 983.34/38/42 and change “frame” to “Frame” at 983.42.
       6. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
       7. This is consistent with CIDs 3167 and 3168 already processed.
    8. CID 3428 (ED1)
       1. Review comment
       2. Review discussion in submission.
       3. Discussion on 9.4.2 vs 9.4.3 description usage.
       4. Proposed resolution: Incorporate the “Proposed Resolution” for CID 3428 in doc 11-22/2072r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2072-03-000m-proposed-resolution-for-revme-lb270-editor1-ad-hoc-comments.docx>).
       5. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    9. CID 3430 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Revised. Incorporate the “Proposed Resolution” for CID 3428 in doc 11-22/2072r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2072-03-000m-proposed-resolution-for-revme-lb270-editor1-ad-hoc-comments.docx>).
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    10. CID 3429 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 3462 and 3463 (ED1)
       1. Review Comments
       2. Review discussion in submission
       3. Review context.
       4. Discussion on use of numbers in tables.
       5. Proposed Resolution: CID 3462 (ED1): Rejected. Reject reason: the value of field should not be specified in the figure format.
       6. Proposed Resolution: CID 3463 (ED1): Accepted
       7. No Objection – Mark both CIDs Ready for Motion.
    2. CID 3525 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    3. CID 3619 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolutions:Revised. 2281.1, change “10.23.2.3 (EDCA TXOPs)” to “10.23.2.9 (TXOP limits).
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    4. CID 3112 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Review discussion in submission.
       3. Use of capitalization should match external references when they are made.
       4. Proposed Resolution: Rejected. “Counter Mode” is an external reference. It should be “Counter Mode” according to the style guide.
       5. Check 263.52 (there are two instances that should be made Capital).
       6. It was noted that two locations had lower case, and it needed to be upper case.
       7. Updated Proposed Resolution: CID 3112 (ED1): Revised. At 263.52 and 263.53 change "counter mode" to "Counter Mode". Note to commenter, “Counter Mode” is an external reference. It should be “Counter Mode” according to the style guide.
       8. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    5. CID 3113 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Review discussion in submission.
       3. Basically, the same as CID 3112, but on a different counter.
       4. Proposed Resolution: Revised; At 1105.57 and 2395.33, change “FMS Counter ID” to “FMS counter ID”.
       5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 3621 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review discussion in submission.
       3. Review the instances in the one subclause for changes of recipient to receiver or visa-versa.
       4. Proposed Resolution: CID 3113 (ED1): Revised. Change "recipient" to "receiver" in 12.5.3.4 "BIP replay protection". (2 Instances).
       5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  1. **Reminder Next Telecon is Monday January 9th 10-12 ET.**
  2. **Adjourn at 11:54 AM ET.**

**References:**

January 6th:

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0856-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2022.pptx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2060-06-000m-november-january-teleconference-agenda.docx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2072-02-000m-proposed-resolution-for-revme-lb270-editor1-ad-hoc-comments.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2072-03-000m-proposed-resolution-for-revme-lb270-editor1-ad-hoc-comments.docx>