Minutes IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| IEEE 802.11 TGbh Meeting Minutes, August 2nd, 2022  Randomized and Changing MAC addresses (RCM) | | | | |
| Date: 2022-8-2 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Stephen Orr | Cisco | Santa Clara, CA |  | sorr@cisco.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains the minutes of the IEEE 802.11bh telecon meeting of August 2nd , 2022.

Note: Highlighted text are action items.

Q- proceeds a question asked at the meeting

A- proceeds an answer

C- proceeds a comment

**Meeting August 2nd , 2022 09.30 to 11.30 ET**

**Chair: Mark Hamilton (Ruckus/CommScope)**

**Vice Chair: Peter Yee (NSA-CSD/AKAYLA)**

**Vice Chair: Stephen Orr (Cisco)**

**Secretary: Stephen Orr, acting**

**Editor: Carol Ansley (Cox)**

**The teleconference was called to order by the Chair at 09:37 a.m. EDT.**

Agenda slide deck [11-22/1223r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1223-01-00bh-agenda-tgbh-2022-aug-2.pptx)

1. **Policies and procedures were presented by the chair. (Slides 4 to 14)**

There were no Patent declarations.

Copyright policy slides were presented (Slides 10 and 11)

1. **Agenda:**

* Attendance, noises/recording, meeting protocol reminders
* Policies, duty to inform, participation rules
* Organization topics
  + Chair went over the Agenda
* Issues Tracking: [11-21/0332r37](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0332-37-00bh-issues-tracking.docx)
* Contributions (slide 16)
* Next meetings:
  + August 9th 2022 0930ET

Any comments? None

Any objections to agenda? None

**Agenda accepted unanimously.**

1. **Organization topics**

Discussed covering CIDs not covering Opt-in, Pre/un-assoc, Non-AP STA generated ID

Then Contributions

1. **Issues Tracking**

The Chair noted that the Issues Tracking document is at [r37](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0332-37-00bh-issues-tracking.docx).

1. **Comment Collection D0.2** [**11-22/0973r4**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0973-04-00bh-cc41-comments-against-d0-2.xlsx)
   1. CID 4, 8, 11, 15, 26: Kurt Lumbatis – this will be a full submission 11-22/1218
   2. CID 5: Mark Hamilton

C: May need to separate the MIB into two MIBs

A: Basic capability then an enablement that indicates user consent for a particular network that may also store the ID. Two or three MIB attributes

* 1. CID 10 – Kurt and Mark

C: May need to go into the MIB discussion

* 1. CID 12: Need to wait until Antonio is present
  2. CID 13: Rejected
  3. CID 30, 31, 33: Kurt and Graham working on a submission for 12.2.11 (next week)

C: 12.2.11 – alternative text, Sid to synch with Kurt to exchange notes on Opt-in.

* 1. CID 55 – Mark Hamilton

C: Line 15 – accept change. Kurt to include in his submission

* 1. CID 58

Q: When is the ID opaque or non-opaque? Not clear in the text. May need to have this clarified.

Q: Opaque to whom?

C: Opaque ID is just an example.

* 1. CID 59 – Rejected
  2. CID 60:

Q: Is the Element ID Extensible?

A: It is defined as non-extensible

C: Much better if elements are extensible.

A: It is not extensible – we would need a length field in-front of the ID blob

1. **Contributions**
   1. Graham Smith – contributions deferred until later meeting
   2. Jay Yang covered document 1079r2

C: Discussion of pre-assoc use cases

Chair: Continue discussion off-line or on the reflector

C: Discussion on the reflector has been confusing. As the PAR currently stands do we have to support pre-assoc?

Chair: At the F2F – if we don’t cover all the existing use cases as defined in the issues tracking doc, we are not fulfilling the PAR.

C: Feedback from WBA and WFA indicate there are use cases with concern for pre-assoc and that there are networks that use IDs to help known clients attach to the network in a preferred way. Should we be supporting this in .11 – they are going on in the market but broken by RCM. It does fit within the charter of this group to repair things that are broken in real deployments from RCM. There seems to be a debate on pre-assoc and network troubleshooting. The current proposed pre-assoc techniques could be cleaned up to work.

C: This is why 11-22/1230 was posted

C: On pre-assoc use cases they are dangerous because there is no means to authenticate the AP. In post-assoc we have identified the AP and have more confidence.

C: WFA Agile Multiband has reference to pre-assoc requirements

* 1. Sid 11-22/1084 – nothing new
  2. 11-22/0832r5

C: Discussion on MIB assignments

Q: If its not per SSID then what is it? How can a non-AP STA identify an ESS?

Q: Straw poll 1 needs to be tied into a MIB. Not sure we need the straw poll.

A: Non need to run the straw poll 1

C:Straw Poll 2 – general consensus

* 1. 11-22/1219r0 – Graham Smith

C: bh and bi split comment – it is out of bh scope. Not a problem created by RCM – should be addressed by bi. What is interesting in bh is understanding the scope of the concern.

C: Discussion on is this a bh or bi issue

**Meeting adjoined at 11:30 a.m. ET.**

Attendance

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Ansley, Carol | Cox Communications Inc. |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Chng, Shi Baw | BAWMAN LLC |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Fujimori, Yuki | Canon Research Centre France |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Henry, Jerome | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Kain, Carl | USDoT; Noblis Inc. |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Kneckt, Jarkko | Apple, Inc. |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Lumbatis, Kurt | CommScope, Inc. |
| TGbh | 8/2 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Mutgan, Okan | Nokia |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Orr, Stephen | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Riegel, Maximilian | Nokia |
| TGbh | 8/2 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Sam, Harvey | Broadcom Corporation |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Smith, Graham | SRT Wireless |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Smith, Luther | Cable Television Laboratories Inc. (CableLabs) |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Sosack, Robert | Molex Incorporated |
| TGbh | 8/2 | Yang, Jay | Nokia |