IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| DMG comments resolution part three | | | | |
| Date: 2022-07-12 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Solomon Trainin | Qualcomm |  |  | [strainin@qti.qualcomm.com](mailto:strainin@qti.qualcomm.com) |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Resolution for CIDs 341, 90, 237, 350, 352, 353, 354, 437, 438, 439, 444, and 336

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Subclause** | **page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** | **Resolution** |
| 341 | 11.3.3 | 64.24 | Append to the list of Class 1 frames: 5) DMG Action frames (9.6.19 DMG Action frame details) | Provide the change as explained in the comment | **Revised**  See 11-22-1095-01-00bf cc40-comments DMG comments resolution part three |
| 90 | 11.21.20.1 | 77.19 | Figure names shall be different | Several figures: 11-41h, 11-41i, 11-41j , 11-41, 11-41l, 11-41m and 11-41 have the exact same name. Different names shall be defined. | **Revised**  See 11-22-1095-01-00bf cc40-comments DMG comments resolution part three |
| 352 | 11.21.20.1 | 75.06 | "Examples of DMG sensing procedures are shown in:" There are the same headings of the different figures. Suggest changing the heading to make it more specific to each figure. | Change the heading of the figures as follows: Figure 11-41h--DMG sensing instances with delayed reports Figure 11-41i--DMG sensing instances with the aggregated report Figure 11-41j--DMG sensing instances of the bistatic type Figure 11-41l--DMG sensing instance with two monostatic responders, sequential sounding Figure 11-41m--DMG sensing instance with two monostatic responders, parallel sounding Figure 11-41n--DMG sensing instances of the multistatic sensing with two responders Replace the heading in all appearances. | **Revised**  See 11-22-1095-01-00bf cc40-comments DMG comments resolution part three |
| 237 | 11.21.20.1 | 80.02 | Please define what the nature of the "handshake" between the initiator and the responder. | Add descriptions of handshake. | **Revised**  See 11-22-1095-01-00bf cc40-comments DMG comments resolution part three |
| 350 | 11.21.20.1 | 73.36 | "A DMG sensing procedure is a subset of the WLAN sensing procedure. Unless otherwise noted, the rules for WLAN sensing procedure (11.21.18 (WLAN sensing procedure)) apply to DMG sensing procedure." Too many details of the DMG sensing procedure are different from the WLAN sensing procedure (11.21.18). Hence, the DMG description becomes self-contained. I suggest removing the sentence. | Remove the paragraph | **Accept** |
| 353 | 11.21.20.1 | 76.09 | "The operational attributes ... and include the intra-burst interval." More than one attribute belongs to the setup no need to mention only the intra-burst interval. Suggest removing it. | Remove "and include the intra-burst interval" | **Accept** |
| 354 | 11.21.20.1 | 79.55 | "Figure 11-41l (DMG sensing instance) and Figure 11-41m (DMG sensing instance) illustrate one DMG sensing instance presented in Figure 11-41k ..." Figure 11-41k is about the entire procedure, but the text does not mention it. | Insert "of the DMG sensing procedure" before the word "presented" | **Accept** |
| 437 | 11.21.20.1 | 74.32 | "The DMG sensing procedure defines all DMG sensing types. The behavior of each type of DMG sensing type is defined separately" - this sentence doesn't say much and should be deleted | delete lines P74L32-34 | **Accept** |
| 438 | 11.21.20.1 | 74.36 | "A DMG sensing procedure is a subset of the WLAN sensing procedure. Unless otherwise noted, the rules for WLAN sensing procedure (11.21.18 (WLAN sensing procedure)) apply to DMG sensing procedure." - this sentence is incorret - the DMG sensing procedure is independent. | delete lines P74L35-38 | **Accept** |
| 439 | 11.21.20.1 | 74.40 | "DMG sensing procedure" - missing article | replace with "The DMG sensing procedure" | **Accept** |
| 444 | 11.21.20.1 | 76.57 | "The example starts in the DMG sensing instance number equal to 1 contained in the DMG Sensing Burst ID equal to 1." - sentence is not clear. How can something be contained in an equality? | replace with "The example starts with DMG sensing instance number which is part of the burst with DMG Sensing Burst ID equal to 1." | **Revised**  See 11-22-1095-01-00bf cc40-comments DMG comments resolution part three |
| 336 | 11.21.18.2 | 66.35 | The subclause does not address the DMG sensing dependencies | Insert new subclause "DMG sensing dependencies". Add the following text to the subclause: Implementation of DMG WLAN sensing is optional for a DMG STA. A DMG STA in which dot11DMGSensingMsmtImplemented is true is defined as a STA that supports DMG WLAN sensing. A STA in which dot11DMGSensingMsmtImplemented is true shall set the Sensing support subfield of the Short DMG Sensing Capabilities field in the DMG Sensing Short Capabilities element to 1. A STA in which dot11DMGSensingMsmtImplemented is false shall set the Sensing support subfield of the Short DMG Sensing Capabilities field in the DMG Sensing Short Capabilities element to 0. | **Revised**  See 11-22-1095-01-00bf cc40-comments DMG comments resolution part three |

**CID 341**

Append to the list of Class 1 frames:  
5) DMG Action frames (9.6.19 DMG Action frame details)

**Resolution: Revised**

**Discussion:**

The referred place in the D0.1 is about Class 1a frames, and the comment is relevant for it. Class 1a allows PASN protection of the frames exchanged between the AP and the unassocaited non-AP STA. The mentioned DMG category is suitable to be used as Class 1a frames and the frames will be protected in State 1a.

**TGbf editor, implement as follows**

**P64L24 append**

5) DMG Action frames (9.6.19 DMG Action frame details)

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

**CID 90, CID 352**

Several figures: 11-41h, 11-41i, 11-41j , 11-41, 11-41l, 11-41m and 11-41 have the exact same name. Different names shall be defined.

**Resolution: Revised**

**Discussion:**

The solution is presented for CID352. Keep the same solution

**TGbf editor, change the heading of the figures as follows:**

Figure 11-41h--DMG sensing instances with delayed reports  
Figure 11-41i--DMG sensing instances with the aggregated report  
Figure 11-41j--DMG sensing instances of the bistatic type  
Figure 11-41l--DMG sensing instance with two monostatic responders, sequential sounding  
Figure 11-41m--DMG sensing instance with two monostatic responders, parallel sounding  
Figure 11-41n--DMG sensing instances of the multistatic sensing with two responders

**Replace the heading in all appearances.**

**CID 237**

Please define what the nature of the "handshake" between the initiator and the responder. Add descriptions of handshake.

**Resolution: Revised**

**Discussion:**

**The commented text is:**

‘The handshake between the initiator and the responder provides the responders with the order of the sounding and reporting.’

**There are a few places in the base-line spec that uses the word w/o any definition. For example,**

‘Transmission of fragmented MPDUs by a DMG STA outside of an A-MPDU depends on setting of the No-Fragmentation field in the ADDBA Extension element within the ADDBA Response frame transmitted during the block ack agreement **handshake**.’

‘A DMG protected period is established through an RTS/DMG CTS **handshake**.’

**So, the word does not need to be defined. I propose to clarify the sentence.**

**TGbf editor, change the text as follows:**

**P80L2**

**Replace** ‘The handshake between the initiator and the responder provides the responders with the order of the sounding and reporting.’ **with** ‘At the handshake of the DMG Sensing Request and DMG Sensing Response between the initiator and the responder, the initiator transmits the DMG Sensing Request frame. The frame provides the responders with the order of the sounding and reporting.’

**CID 444**

"The example starts in the DMG sensing instance number equal to 1 contained in the DMG Sensing Burst ID equal to 1." - sentence is not clear. How can something be contained in an equality?

**Resolution: Revised**

**Discussion:**

The intention of the sentence is to introduce the first Sensing Instance in the first DMG Sensing Burst. I agree that the text maybe clarified.

**TGbf editor, change the text as follows:**

**P76L57**

**Replace** The example starts in the DMG sensing instance number equal to 1 contained in the DMG Sensing Burst ID equal to 1.’ **with** ‘The first burst in the example is identified by the DMG Sensing Burst ID equal to 1. The first instance in the burst is identified by the Sensing Instance SN equal to 1.’

**CID 336**

The subclause does not address the DMG sensing dependencies. Inset new subclause.

**Resolution: Revised**

**Discussion:**

Subclause 11.21.18.2 WLAN sensing dependencies does not address the DMG sensing dependencies. New subclause to cover it is needed under 11.21.20 DMG sensing procedure.

**TGbf editor, insert the new sub-clause after 11.21.20.1 Overview and renumerate the subclauses as appropriate. Append the text to the sub-clause.**

**11.21.20.x DMG sensing dependencies**

Implementation of DMG WLAN sensing is optional for a DMG STA. A DMG STA in which dot11DMGSensingMsmtImplemented is true is defined as a STA that supports DMG WLAN sensing. A STA in which dot11DMGSensingMsmtImplemented is true shall set the Sensing support subfield of the Short DMG Sensing Capabilities field in the DMG Sensing Short Capabilities to 1 (9.4.2.321 DMG Sensing Short Capabilities element). A STA in which dot11DMGSensingMsmtImplemented is false shall set the Sensing support subfield of the Short DMG Sensing Capabilities field in the DMG Sensing Short Capabilities element to 0.

**References:**