IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 11bd D4.0 Comment Resolution | | | | |
| Date: 2022-05-26 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Liwen Chu | NXP |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission resolve the following comments of 802.11bd D4.0:

* 5083, 5102, 5103, 5082, 5101, 5003

Revisions:

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGbd Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGbd Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGbd Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGbd Editor” are instructions to the TGbd editor to modify existing material in the TGbd draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGbd editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGbd Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 5083 | 24 | 28 | The sentence "If the PPDU has value 2…." seems in wrong place. | Move it to the previous paragraph on the data rate/NGV-MCS member. | **Accepted** |
| 5102 | 24 | 28 | "If the PPDU format has value 2, the data rate/NGV-MCS member is set to value 14 indicating that the actual data-rate/MCS is decided by the MAC layer. (#3009)" - This sentence should be included in the previous paragraph, since the paragraph starting 26 is talking about the number of spatial streams member. | Move the sentence as in the comment. | **Accepted** |
| 5103 | 25 | 29 | "with values in the range 0 to 60 representing -20 dBm / 10 MHz to 40 dBm / 10 MHz" - value 60 looks inclusive. Reserved values should be from 61 to 126. | Replace "Values from 60" to "Values from 61" | **Accepted** |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5082 | 26 | 21 | It's odd to include "decided by the MAC layer" upon the received PPDU that carries the MPDU of interest. | Remove the phrases or sentences that address "decide by the MAC layer." | Revised  Discussion: this sentence is in subclause about reception. “0” for MAC layer decision is not needed.  TGbd editor:Please change “The data rate can be either 0 (decided by MAC layer), 3, 4.5, 6, 9, 12, 18, 24, or 27 Mb/s as  defined in Table 17-4 (Modulation-dependent parameters).” to “The data rate can be ~~either 0 (decided by MAC layer), or~~ one of 3, 4.5, 6, 9, 12, 18, 24, or 27 Mb/s as  defined in Table 17-4 (Modulation-dependent parameters).” |
| **5101** | 26 | 25 | "with an exception that the value 14 means the actual MCS is decided by MAC layer." "If the PPDU format has value 2, the data rate/NGV-MCS member is set to value 14 indicating that the actual data-rate/MCS is decided by the MAC layer. (#3009)" A primitive that includes this member is issued based on reception. Thus "decided by the MAC layer" is not relevant. | Remove the text indicated in the comment. | Acepted |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **5003** | 44 | 6 | Here it is unclear what is meant, since the new version of following sentence could be interpreted differently than the previous version:"A STA that is not an AP, a mesh STA, or an NGV STA shall not transmit an A-MPDU containing an MPDU with an RA that is a group address." I guess what is meant is: When NOT(a OR b OR c) do NOT transmit... But it could also be read: When NOT(a) OR b OR c do NOT transmit... This interpretation would not be in line with the previous version of IEEE 802.11 | When my guess is right, than following applies: NOT(a OR b OR c) = NOT(a) AND NOT(b) AND NOT(c) And the sentence could either be written as follows: "A STA that is not an AP, not a mesh STA, and not an NGV STA shall not transmit an A-MPDU containing an MPDU with an RA that is a group address." Or even simpler, when taking out all the negations: "Only STAs that are an AP, a mesh STA, or an NGV STA shall transmit an A-MPDU containing an MPDU with an RA that is a group address." In case my guess is wrong, rewrite the requirement in an unambiguous way, please. | Revised  TGbd editor:Please change “ A STA that is not an AP, a mesh STA, or an NGV STA shall not transmit an A-MPDU containing an MPDU with an RA that is a group address” to “ A STA that is not one of an AP, a mesh STA, ~~or~~ and an NGV STA shall not transmit an A-MPDU containing an MPDU with an RA that is a group address” |