IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Proposed Comment Resolutions for NSEP and MLD (CC36) |
| Date: 2022-01-27 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Company | Address | Phone | email |
| Subir DasJohn Wullert | Peraton Labs |  |  | (sdas, jwullert) @peratonlabs.com |
| An Nguyen Frank Suraci | DHS/CISA/ECD |  |  | (an.p.nguyen, frank.suraci) @cisa.dhs.gov |

Abstract

This document proposes comment resolutions for the following 24 CIDs related to support for NSEP priority access and MLD devices from the IEEE 802.11be D1.0 comment collection 36 (CC36): 7534, 5578, 5580, 5588, 5591, 7358, 6027, 7357, 5596, 5857, 7531, 7532, 7533, 7535, 7536, 7537, 7539, 7540, 7541, 7542, 7543, 7546, 6031, 6039

The proposed resolutions shown below use Draft 1.3 as a basis.

Revisions:

- Rev 0: Initial version of the document.

- Rev 1: add CIDs 6031. 6039 and set of editorial fixes

- Rev 2: Removed the editorial texts, updated 6031 and 6039 rejection reasons.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGbe Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

**Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGbe Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).**

**TGbe Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGbe Editor” are instructions to the TGbe editor to modify existing material in the TGbe draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGbe editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGbe Draft.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number** | **Page/****Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 7358 | 9.4.1.9 | 110.55 | The terms "non-AP MLD or non-AP EHT STA" are used within several of the NSEP clauses. It's not known what an non-AP EHT STA is and this term should be removed. | Change all occurances of "non-AP MLD or non-AP EHT STA" to "non-AP MLD" throughout the draft. | RevisedAgree in principle since NSEP is negotiated at the MLD level. **Editor:** In sub-clauses 9.4.1.9, 9.6.35.5, 9.6.35.6, 9.6.35.7, and 35.15. please (1) change all occurrences of "non-AP MLD or non-AP EHT STA" to "non-AP MLD" (i.e., by deleting “or non-AP EHT STA”) and (2) change all occurrences of “MLD or non-AP EHT STA” to MLD” (i.e., by deleting “or non-AP EHT STA”), |
| 5578 | 4.5.11a | 49.18 | The description of the behavior in this section uses AP/STA rather than MLD. Unless and until there are changes to make the NSEP feature apply beyond EHT devices, this text should be updated to use AP/non-AP MLD. | Update section text to use MLD | RevisedAddressed by resolution captured in CRs 510/r5 and 1197/r2. **Editor:** No further change is required |
| 5580 | 4.5.11a | 49.39 | There is a reference to a "non-AP" that is missing the acronym 'STA'. (Note: this comment becomes moot if text is updated to reflect MLD) | Insert "STA" after "non-AP" | RevisedIssue was addressed in response to other CIDs in CRs 510/r5 and 1197/r2. **Editor:** No further change is required. |
| 5588 | 6.3.126 | 70.47 | NSEP priority access primitives include PeerSTAAddress to indicate remote device. Depending on consensu decision on MLD and EHT STAs, these references may need to be revised to PeerMLDAddress. | As in comment | RevisedIssue was handled in response to multiple CIDs found in CR 1238/r5. **Editor:** No further change is required. |
| 5591 | 9.4.1.9 | 110.55 | Meaning of NSEP\_DENIED\_UNAUTHORIZED includes reference to ML and EHT STA. This should be corrected based on consensus decision on this topic | As in comment | RevisedAddressed as part of resolution of CID #7358. **Editor:** No further change is required. |
| 6027 | 9.6.35.5 | 163.16 | change the paragraph to "The NSEP Priority Access Enable Request frame is an Action frame of category Protected EHT. It is transmitted by a requesting MLD or non-AP EHT STA not associated with MLD to request that NSEP priority access has enabled......". | As in comment | RevisedAgree in principle. Per resolution of CID#7358, “or non-AP EHT STA” is deleted. No further change is required.**Editor:** No further change is required |
| 7357 | 9.6.35.5 | 163.17 | The sentence "It is transmitted by a requesting MLD or non-AP EHT STA to request that NSEP priority access has enabled." does not need to differentiate between an MLD and a non-AP EHT STA. NSEP is negotiated between STAs or MLDs. | Change the cited sentence to "It is transmitted by a requesting STA or MLD to request that NSEP priority access is enabled". | RevisedAddressed as part of resolution of CID #7358. **Editor:** No further change is required. |
| 5596 | 9.6.35.5 | 163.18 | Text includes reference to ML and EHT STA. This should be corrected based on consensus decision on this topic | As in comment | RevisedAddressed as part of resolution of CID #7358. **Editor:** No further change is required. |
| 5857 | 35.11.2.1 | 305.38 | For MLDs, the NSEP authorization and enable/disable are specified at per non-AP MLD level in Section 35.11, however, in Section 3.1, the NSEP is defined at per non-AP STA level. | Please clarify if NSEP for MLDs is at per non-AP MLD level or at per non-AP STA level, and then keep it in Section 35.11 and Section 3.1 consistently. | RevisedAddressed as part of resolution of CID #7358. **Editor:** No further change is required. |
| 7531 | 35.11.2.2.2.1 | 306.46 | "..., a non-AP MLD or non-AP EHT STA with dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated equal to true and with NSEP priority access disabled shall enable NSEP priority access using the following procedure." The "non-AP MLD or non-AP EHT STA" can be expressed as an "NSEP non-AP STA". And it's odd that the MIB attribute name is ...Activated but the operation itself is not activated and is disabled. | Change it to read "..., an NSEP non-AP STA with NSEP priority access disabled shall enable NSEP priority access using the following procedure."Change dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated to dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessImplemented throughout the draft. | Revised. First comment in this CID is addressed by resolution of CID #7358. No further change is required.Regarding the second comment, the term “Activated” is used in this MIB variable to indicate that the feature is active on the device. Devices for which this variable is not set to true may be capable but are not offering the NSEP priority access feature.**Editor:** No further change is required |
| 7532 | 35.11.2.2.2.1 | 306.50 | "The initiating non-AP MLD or non-AP EHT STA shall transmit an NSEP Priority Access Enable Request frame (9.6.35.5 (NSEP Priority Access Enable Request frame format(#1119)(#1488))) to an associated AP MLD with dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated set to true." The STA judges the support at the AP by the subfield in the EHT Capabilities element and such AP is an NSEP AP. | Change it to read "The initiating NSEP non-AP STA shall transmit an NSEP Priority Access Enable Request frame (9.6.35.5 (NSEP Priority Access Enable Request frame format(#1119)(#1488))) to an associated NSEP AP." | RevisedAgree in principle. Part of the comment is addressed by CR 1238. Resolution of CID #7358 further addresses the remainder of this comment. **Editor:** No further change is required. |
| 7533 | 35.11.2.2.2.1 | 307.17 | "..., a non-AP MLD or non-AP EHT STA with dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated set to true and with NSEP priority access enabled shall disable NSEP priority access using the following procedure." Similar comment with the one for pp.ll 306.46. | Change it to read "..., an NSEP non-AP STA with NSEP priority access enabled shall disable NSEP priority access using the following procedure."(Expecting the change from dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated to dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessImplemented by the previous comment for pp.ll 306.46.) | RevisedRegarding the first comment in this CID.**Editor:** Please change “a non-AP MLD or non-AP EHT STA with dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated set to true” to “a NSEP non-AP MLD” throughout the section 35.15.Regarding the second comment, the term “Activated” is used in MIB variable to indicate that this feature is active on the device. Devices for which this variable is not set to true may be capable but are not offering the NSEP priority access feature. |
| 7534 | 35.11.2.2.2.1 | 0.00 | "The initiating non-AP MLD or non-AP EHT STA shall transmit an NSEP Priority Access Teardown frame (9.6.35.5 (NSEP Priority Access Enable Request frame format(#1119)(#1488))) to an associated AP MLD with dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated set to true." The STA judges the support at the AP by the subfield in the EHT Capabilities element and such AP is an NSEP AP. | Change it to read "The initiating NSEP non-AP STA shall transmit an NSEP Priority Access Teardown frame (9.6.35.5 (NSEP Priority Access Enable Request frame format(#1119)(#1488))) to an associated NSEP AP." |  Rejected.It was agreed that NSEP feature negotiation is an MLD level feature and accordingly the text was modified in response to multiple CIDs (see document 1238/r5). |
| 7535 | 35.11.2.2.2.2 | 307.33 | "An AP MLD with dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated equal to true and with NSEP priority access disabled may have the functionality to enable NSEP priority access." Similar comment with the one for pp.ll 306.46. | Change it to read "An NSEP AP with NSEP priority access disabled may have the functionality to enable NSEP priority access."(Expecting the change from dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated to dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessImplemented by the previous comment for pp.ll 306.46.) | RevisedCited sentence was deleted in response to other CIDs per CR 1238/r5.**Editor:** No further change is required. |
| 7536 | 35.11.2.2.2.2 | 307.35 | "..., an AP MLD that supports this functionality shall enable NSEP priority access using the following procedure:" The AP MLD here can be expressed as an "NSEP AP". | Change it to read "..., an NSEP AP shall enable NSEP priority access using the following procedure:" | RevisedCited sentence was modified in response to CID #4494 as shown in CR 1238/r5.**Editor:** No further change is required |
| 7537 | 35.11.2.2.2.2 | 307.41 | "The initiating AP MLD shall transmit an NSEP Priority Access Enable Request frame (9.6.35.5 (NSEP Priority Access Enable Request frame format(#1119)(#1488))) to an associated non-AP MLD or non-AP EHT STA with dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated set to true." The AP judges the support at the STA by the subfield in the EHT Capabilities element and such STA is an NSEP non-AP STA. | Change it to read "The initiating NSEP AP shall transmit an NSEP Priority Access Enable Request frame (9.6.35.5 (NSEP Priority Access Enable Request frame format(#1119)(#1488))) to an associated NSEP non-AP STA." | RejectedIt was agreed that NSEP feature negotiation is an MLD level feature and accordingly the text was modified in response to multiple CIDs (see document 1238/r5). |
| 7539 | 35.11.2.2.2.2 | 308.07 | "..., an AP MLD that supports this functionality shall disable NSEP priority access using the following procedure." The AP MLD here can be expressed as an "NSEP AP". | Change it to read "..., an NSEP AP shall disable NSEP priority access using the following procedure." | RevisedCited sentence was modified in response to CID #5856 as shown in document 1238/r5. **Editor:** No further change is required. |
| 7540 | 35.11.2.2.2.2 | 308.12 | "The initiating AP MLD may transmit an NSEP Priority Access Teardown frame (9.6.35.7 (NSEP Priority Access Teardown frame details(#1127))) to an associated non-AP MLD or non-AP EHT STA with dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated set to true." The AP judges the support at the STA by the subfield in the EHT Capabilities element and such STA is an NSEP non-AP STA. | Change it to read "The initiating NSEP AP may transmit an NSEP Priority Access Teardown frame (9.6.35.7 (NSEP Priority Access Teardown frame details(#1127))) to an associated NSEP non-AP STA." | RevisedCited sentence was modified in response to multiple CIDs per CR 1238/r5. **Editor:** No further change is required. |
| 7541 | 35.11.2.2.3.1 | 308.28 | "..., an AP MLD with dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated equal to true and with NSEP priority access disabled shall enable NSEP priority access using the following procedure." Similar comment with the one for pp.ll 306.46. | Change it to read "..., an NSEP AP with NSEP priority access disabled shall enable NSEP priority access using the following procedure."(Expecting the change from dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated to dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessImplemented by the previous comment for pp.ll 306.46.) | RevisedRegarding the first comment in this CID: **Editor:** Please change “an AP MLD with dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated set to true” to “a NSEP AP MLD” throughout section 35.15.Regarding the second comment, the term “Activated” is used in MIB variable to indicate that this variable reflects that the feature is active on the device. Devices for which this variable is not set to true may be capable but are not offering the NSEP priority access feature. |
| 7542 | 35.11.2.2.3.1 | 309.02 | "..., an AP MLD with dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated equal to true and with NSEP priority access enabled shall use the following procedure to disable NSEP priority access." Similar comment with the one for pp.ll 306.46. | Change it to read "..., an NSEP AP with NSEP priority access enabled shall use the following procedure to disable NSEP priority access."(Expecting the change from dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated to dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessImplemented by the previous comment for pp.ll 306.46.) | RevisedResolution of CID #7541 addresses this comment as well.**Editor:** No further change is required.  |
| 7543 | 35.11.2.2.3.2 | 309.16 | "..., a non-AP MLD or non-AP EHT STA with dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated equal to true and with NSEP priority access disabled shall enable NSEP priority access using the following procedure." Similar comment with the one for pp.ll 306.46. | Change it to read "..., an NSEP non-AP STA with NSEP priority access disabled shall enable NSEP priority access using the following procedure."(Expecting the change from dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated to dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessImplemented by the previous comment for pp.ll 306.46.) | RevisedResolution of CID #7533 addresses this comment as well.**Editor:** No further change is required |
| 7546 | 35.11.2.2.3.2 | 309.44 | "..., a non-AP MLD or a non-AP EHT STA with dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated equal to true and with NSEP priority access enabled shall use the following procedure to disable NSEP priority access." Similar comment with the one for pp.ll 306.46. | Change it to read "..., an NSEP non-AP STA with NSEP priority access enabled shall use the following procedure to disable NSEP priority access."(Expecting the change from dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessActivated to dot11EHTNSEPPriorityAccessImplemented by the previous comment for pp.ll 306.46.) | RevisedResolution of CID #7533 addresses this comment as well.**Editor:** No further change is required |
| 6031 | 10 | 165.01 | The QMF is introduced by NSEP. The duplication detection of QMF should be added under MLD. | As in comment | RejectedThe comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the changes that will satisfy the commenter can be determined. |
| 6039 | 11.24 | 207.01 | since QMF is added, the MLD level seuence, duplication detection for QMF needs to be added. | As in comment | RejectedThe comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the changes that will satisfy the commenter can be determined. |

Straw Poll:

Do you support incorporating the proposed draft text in this document (11-21/2020/r2) into the next revision of TGbe to address the following CIDs: 7534, 5578, 5580, 5588, 5591, 7358, 6027, 7357, 5596, 5857, 7531, 7532, 7533, 7535, 7536, 7537, 7539, 7540, 7541, 7542, 7543, 7546, 6031, 6039 and the editorial nits?

Result: Yes/No/Abstain