IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID 170 comment resolution for CC-35 | | | | |
| Date: 2021-10-26 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Joseph LEVY | InterDigital, Inc. | 111 W 35th St., NY, New York | +1 631.622.4239 | joseph.levy@interdigital.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document reviews and provides a check of the impact of accepting CID 170 by reviewing if this requirement is provided elsewhere in the draft for both Individual and Group addressed cases. Please see the TGme minutes (11-21/1612r17) 2.10.4.

The comments are available in: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0684-09-000m-revme-wg-cc35-comments.xlsx>.

Status: Highlighting in CID column indicates the status of the discussion on the CID:

Not Discussed (not highlighted)

Discussed additional discussion required (date of discussion(s) is(are) located below CID number)

Discussed / ready for SP (date of discussion(s) is(are) located below CID number)

SP run / ready for Motion (date of the SP is located below the date of discussion)

Motioned (date of Motion is located below the date of the SP)

Resolution Status: Highlighting in the Resolution column indicates:

Yellow highlighted text needs to be discussed

Red highlighted text has been discussed and additional discussion is required

**CID for Clause 9.3.2.1.1, Page 981, lines 17-40 and 65:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 170 | "A QoS STA always uses QoS Data frames for data transmissions to other QoS STAs. A QoS STA uses  frames with the QoS subfield of the Subtype subfield set to 0 for data transmissions to non-QoS STAs." is not clear as to what happens for data transmissions to both QSTAs and non-QSTAs. Also, this is behaviour not format | Delete the cited text. In 10.2.3.2 HCF contention based channel access (EDCA) at 1695.24 add "A QoS STA that transmits a group addressed frame with the Type subfield indicating Data shall transmit it with the QoS subfield of the Subtype subfield set to 0 if non-QoS STAs are among the intended receivers, should transmit it with the QoS subfield set to 0 if non-QoS STAs might be among the intended receivers, and should transmit it with the QoS subfield set to 1 if no non-QoS STAs are among the intended receivers.". | Accept |

The phrase “QoS subfield of the Subtype subfield set to 0” is in 4 locations in the specification all are in clause 9.3.2.1.1 (D0.3)

The “QoS subfield” is found in the specification at 12 locations (D0.3):

1. 874.50 – 9.2.4.1.3 – where the QoS subfield is defined as B7 of the Subtype subfield.
2. 887.47 – 9.2.4.5.1 – where a QoS subfield equal to 1 is used as a test to include the QoS Control field.
3. 980.48 – 9.3.2.1.1 – where a QoS subfield equal to 1 is used identify that the QoS Control is present.
4. 981.9 – 9.3.2.1.1. – where a QoS subfield equal to 1 is used to identify which data frames should contain the QoS in their names.
5. 981.18 - 9.3.2.1.1 – in the sited text in the comment.
6. 981.19 – 9.3.2.1.1 – in the sited text in the comment.
7. 981.20 – 9.3.2.1.1 – where the QoS subfield is set to 0 for nonconcealed GCR broadcast Data frames unless …
8. 981.24 – 9.3.2.1.1 – where the QoS subfield is set to 0 for nonconcealed GCR group addressed Data frames unless …
9. 981.28 – 9.3.2.1.1 – where APs or mesh STAs using GCR set the QoS subfield is set to 1 for concealed GCR frames
10. 1044.27 – 9.4.1.4 – where a STA sets the QoS subfield to 1 if QoS is implemented.
11. 2062.45 – 10.3.2.14.1 – where it appears in a NOTE – which states that data frames with the QoS subfield set to 1 are “QoS Data frames”
12. 2864.22 – 11.21.15.3.4 – where it appears in a parenthetical statement: “GCR frames shall be QoS Data frames (with QoS subfield of the Subtype subfield set to 1).”

The Subtype subfield is mentioned in 50 locations (D0.3)

Title of Figures 9-3, 9-4, 9-6, 9-39, 9-40, 9-38 (two locations for each ToC and the figure title (12 locations) + 6 references to the figures. A total of 18),

1. 873.30 – 9.2.4.1.1 – where the format of a frame carried in a non-S1G PPDU is defined when the Subtype subfield is not 1 or 6.
2. 874.48 – 9.2.4.1.1 – where the format of a frame carried in a non-S1G PPDU is defined when the Subtype subfield is 1 or 6.
3. 874.17 – 9.2.4.1.1 – where the format of the Frame control field is defined where the Subtype subfield is equal to 1.
4. 874.50 – 9.2.4.1.3 – where the QoS subfield is defined as B7 of the Subtype subfield.
5. 876.29 – 9.2.4.1.3 – where the Subtype subfield is used to indicate a specific modification basic Data Frame (subtype 0).
6. 887.47 – 9.2.4.5.1 – where a QoS subfield equal to 1 is used as a test to include the QoS Control field.
7. 930.60 – 9.3.1.1 – where the format of a frame caried in an S1G PPDU with Subtype subfield not equal to 3 or 10 is defined.
8. 931.13 – 9.3.1.1 – where the format of the frame caried in an S1G PPDU with Subtype subfield equal to 3 is defined.
9. 931.29 – 9.3.1.1 – where the format of the frame caried in an S1G PPDU with Subtype subfield equal to 10 is defined.
10. 980.48 – 9.3.2.1.1 – where a QoS subfield equal to 1 is used identify that the QoS Control is present.
11. 981.9 – 9.3.2.1.1. – where a QoS subfield equal to 1 is used to identify which data frames should contain the QoS in their names.
12. 981.18 - 9.3.2.1.1 – in the sited text in the comment.
13. 981.19 – 9.3.2.1.1 – in the sited text in the comment.
14. 981.20 – 9.3.2.1.1 – where the QoS subfield is set to 0 for nonconcealed GCR broadcast Data frames unless …
15. 981.24 – 9.3.2.1.1 – where the QoS subfield is set to 0 for nonconcealed GCR group addressed Data frames unless …
16. 981.28 – 9.3.2.1.1 – where APs or mesh STAs using GCR set the QoS subfield is set to 1 for concealed GCR frames
17. 983.62 – 9.3.2.1.3 – where QoS control field is determined by the Subtype subfield.
18. 2062.45 – 10.3.2.14.1 – where it appears in a NOTE – which states that data frames with the QoS subfield set to 1 are “QoS Data frames”
19. 2864.22 – 11.21.15.3.4 – where it appears in a parenthetical statement: “GCR frames shall be QoS Data frames (with QoS subfield of the Subtype subfield set to 1).”

Note: reference to the Management Frame Subtype subfield, the PTID/Subtype subfield, related to RTS or CTS, or construction of the AAD (13 instances are noted but not discussed, as these are different subfields)

* *19 noted uses + 18 figure titles and references + 13 other non-related to QoS subfield reference = 50 locations.*

There appear to be no normative references on how to set the QoS subfield outside of clause 9, as only a note a parenthetical statement are provided in clause 10 and 11, respectively.

Therefore moving the behavior as proposed by the commentor to clause 10.2.3.2 is preferred.

**References:**