IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Comment Resolutions for CC36 D1.0 ML retransmission CIDs |
| Date: 2021-08-18 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Rojan Chitrakar | Panasonic |  |  | Rojan.chitrakar@sg.panasonic.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions of comments received from TGbe comment collection 36 (TGbe Draft 1.0).

* CIDs: 7824, 6740, 6379, 6378, 6323, 4756, 4485, 4420, 4418 (9 CIDs)

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.
1. **Introduction**

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGbe Draft. The introduction and the explanation of the proposed changes are not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGbe Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11be editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGbe Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGbe Editor” are instructions to the TGbe editor to modify existing material in the TGbe draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGbe editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGbe Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Commenter | Clause  | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 4418 | Arik Klein | 35.3.14.8 | 281 | 3 | Replace "the" with "that" in the following sentence:"If an MLD has a established block ack agreement with another MLD for a TID, and the transmission of a QoS Data frame of \*the\* TID on a link is unsuccessful,..." to emphasize that the uinsuccessful trnamission is related to the MSDU that corresponds to the same TID to which the Block ACK agreements is referred. | Consider revising the sentence as follows:"If an MLD has a established block ack agreement with another MLD for a TID, and the transmission of a QoS Data frame of \*that\* TID on a link is unsuccessful,..." | **Rejected.**The cited “the” already makes it clear that the TID being referred to is the same TID for which the block ack agreement is established. |
| 4420 | Arik Klein | 35.3.14.8 | 281 | 5 | According to the following cited text: "the MLD may attempt retransmissions of the frame on any link \*that has the TID mapped to it\*,...".However, it contradicts with the TID-to-Link mapping element (802.11 D1.0 section 9.4.2.295d) where for each of the TIDs there is a Link Mapping field which indicates all the links that are mapped to this TID. | Revise the sentence as follows: "the MLD may attempt retransmissions of the frame on any link \*which is mapped to that TID\*,..." | **Rejected.**A TID is mapped to a link; a link is not mapped to a TID. There are many occurrences of TID being mapped to links in D1.1. |
| 4485 | Arik Klein | 35.3.14.8 | 281 | 5 | typo - remove the word "it" in the following sentence "...the MLD may attempt retransmissions of the frame on any link that has the TID mapped to \*it\*, subject to the applicable" | As in comment | **Revised.**The cited sentence is rephrased as: “...on any link to which the TID is mapped,…”TGbe editor to make the changes shown in IEEE 11-21-1276r0 under all headings that include CID 4485. |
| 4756 | Chunyu Hu | 35.3.14.8 | 281 | 1 | This subclause is not directly about channel access. The subclause 35.3.7 (Multi-link block ack) seems to be a more relevant place to host this subject. | As commented | **Rejected.**Since the subclause also deals with retransmissions without block ack agreement, 35.3.7(Multi-link block ack) is not appropriate. If we refer to baseline, the retransmit procedure subclause is also placed under the EDCA clause. |
| 6323 | Ming Gan | 35.3.14.8 | 281 | 10 | The retransmission for Management frame without BA is missing | Please add it | **Revised.**Agree with the comment. Reference is added to 35.3.13 (Multi-link device individually addressed Management frame delivery) which already covers the retransmissions of individually addressed Management frames.TGbe editor to make the changes shown in IEEE 11-21-1276r0 under all headings that include CID 6323. |
| 6378 | Morteza Mehrnoush | 35.3.14.8 | 281 | 12 | By failed transmission in below sentense, do you mean retry failed (retry limit reached) or the unseccessful transmission like the above paragraph? Please clarify."that TID with failed transmission attempts are delivered following the rules defined in" | as in comment | **Rejected.**Frames with failed transmission attempts here mean frames that were not acknowledged. This language is also used in the baseline. |
| 6379 | Morteza Mehrnoush | 35.3.14.8 | 281 | 3 | Please change the "a established" to "an established" | as in comment | **Accepted.** |
| 6740 | Rojan Chitrakar | 35.3.14.8 | 281 | 11 | Since individually addressed Management frames also use MLD level SN space, failed management frames may also be retransmitted on other links. | Add similar text for delivery of failed individually addressed Management frames | **Revised.**Agree with the comment. The resolution is same as that for CID 6323: reference is added to 35.3.13 (Multi-link device individually addressed Management frame delivery) which already covers the retransmissions of individually addressed Management frames.Notes to TGbe editor: No further action required for CID 6740. |
| 7824 | Yiqing Li | 35.3.14.8 | 281 | 3 | "a" should be "an" | As commented. | **Accepted.**The resolution is same as that for CID 6379.Notes to TGbe editor: no further action required for CID 7824. |

**Discussion:** None.

SP: Do you agree to incorporate the changes provided in IEEE 11-21-1276r0 for CIDs 7824, 6740, 6379, 6378, 6323, 4756, 4485, 4420, 4418 to the next revision of 802.11be draft?

35.3.13 Multi-link channel access

35.3.13.8 Multi-link retransmit procedures (CIDs 4485, 6379, 6323)

***TGbe editor: Modify the subclause as the following (Track Changes ON):***

(#2909)If an MLD has (#6379) an established block ack agreement with another MLD for a TID, and the transmission of a QoS Data frame of the TID on a link is unsuccessful, and if the frame is not a fragment, the MLD may attempt retransmissions of the frame on any link (#4485) to which the TID is mapped, subject to the applicable lifetime limit for that frame and subject to any other restrictions that apply to the link where the retransmission is scheduled(#2714)(#2761).

(#3381)If an MLD does not have a block ack agreement with another MLD for a TID, then the frames for that TID with failed transmission attempts are delivered following the rules defined in 35.3.12 (Multi-link device individually addressed data delivery without block ack negotiation).

(#2598)NOTE—A retransmitted frame is not encapsulated with a new PN when retransmitted on another link.

(#6323) Individually addressed management frames with failed transmission attempts are delivered following the rules defined in 35.3.13 (Multi-link device individually addressed Management frame delivery).