IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVme - March 9-11 2021 | | | | |
| Date: 2021-03-11 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm, Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the initial meetings of 802.11me (REVme) March 9 and 11, 2021

1. **March 9th TGme (REVme) 4-6pm ET -** 
   1. **Called to order** by Michael Montemurro, Chair TGme at 4:03pm ET.
      1. REvme Agenda doc see 11-21/0284r0
         1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0284-00-000m-tgm-agenda-march-2021-session.pptx>
      2. Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy see 11-21/0284r0 Slides 18-26
         1. No issues noted
   2. **Review Draft Agenda**

Tuesday Mar 9, 4pm ET

1. Chair’s Welcome, Policy & patent reminder
2. Approve agenda
3. TGm Leadership Confirmation
4. Draft workplan & schedule discussion
5. Issues List/Presentations
6. CC Motion (if applicable)
7. Plan for teleconferences
   * 1. No objection to the draft agenda – proceeds as planned
   1. **TGme Leadership Confirmation**
      1. Plan to keep the same leadership structure as we had in TGmd.
      2. **Motion: Secretary Confirmation**
         1. Move to confirm Jon Rosdahl as TGme Secretary
         2. Moved: Menzo Wentink
         3. 2nd: Amelia Andersdotter
         4. Results: Unanimous consent – 102 people on Webex
      3. **Motion: Vice Chair Confirmation**
         1. 2 Vice Chair nominees.
         2. Move to Elect Mark Hamilton and Elect Mark Rison as TGme Vice Chairs
         3. Moved: Sai Nandagopalan
         4. Second: Jerome Henry
         5. Results: ~~61-0-1~~ – Motion Passes.
            1. Post meeting validation of vote = 57 – 0 - 1
      4. **Motion: Editor Confirmation:**
         1. Confirm Emily Qi and Edward Au as TGme Technical Editors
         2. Moved: Stuart Kerry
         3. 2nd: Mark Hamilton
         4. Discussion
            1. Is Eward going to be overloaded? Edward has verified he has support from his affiliation and with Emily to be able to handle the work required in TGme.
         5. Result: No objection – Unanimous consent – 126 on Webex.
   2. **Draft workplan & schedule discussion**
      1. Sandard and Amendment Ratification
         1. IEEE Std 802.11-2020 approved & published Feb/Mar 2021
         2. IEEE Std 802.11ax-2021 approved & published ??
         3. IEEE Std 802.11ay-2021 approved & published ??
         4. IEEE Std 802.11ba-2021 approved & published ??
         5. P802.11az – Dec 2022
         6. P802.11bd – Sep 2022
         7. P802.11bc – Sep 2022
         8. P802.11bb – July 2022
         9. P802.11bh - ?
         10. P802.11be – May 2024
         11. P802.11bf – Sep 2024
         12. P802.11bi – ?
      2. Discussion of timeline and the accuracy of the timeline.
      3. Review possible set of amendments to roll in.
      4. Historic REVmc and REVmd
         1. REVmc
         2. Amendments: 802.11-2012, 11ae, 11aa, 11ad, 11ac, 11af
         3. PAR approved: Aug 2012
         4. Initial LB: Mar 2013
         5. Initial SB: Apr 2015
         6. Final WG Approval: Sep 2016 (3 yrs, 11 months)
         7. REVmd:
         8. Amendments: 802.11-2016, 11ai, 11ah, 11aj, 11ak, 11aq
         9. PAR Approved: Mar 2017
         10. Initial LB: Mar 2018
         11. Initial SB: Dec 2019
         12. Final WG Approval: Sep 2020 (3 yrs, 6 months)
      5. Initial TGme Timeline
         1. Feb 2021 – PAR Approval
         2. March 2021– Initial meeting, issue comment collection on IEEE Std 802.11-2020 (if published)
         3. May 2021 – Process CC input, 11ax, 11ay, 11ba integration begins
         4. Nov 2021 – Initial D1.0 WG Letter ballot
         5. May 2022 –D2.0 Recirculation LB
         6. Nov or Jan 2022 – D3.0 Recirculation LB (11az + other amendments <11bc, 11bd, 11bb>)
         7. Mar or May 2023 – D4.0 Recirculation (other amendment integration)
         8. Jul or Sep 2023 – D5.0 Initial SA Ballot (pending integration)
         9. Jan or Mar 2024 – D6.0 Recirculation SA Ballot
         10. May or Jul 2024 – D7.0 Second Recirculation
         11. Sep or Dec 2024 – RevCom/SASB Approval
      6. Discussion on the number of Amendments should be included.
         1. 6 amendments (ax, ay, ba, az, bc?, bd?)
         2. Planning for unknowns are hard to out guess.
         3. New features should fix things that are broke in the standard.
         4. The Draft name has changed, and line numbers have been added to the base doc for comment collection draft.
         5. Suggest pulling the Date for TGme in by 6 months if possible.
         6. Change the end date to June 2024
         7. Try to have our timeline complete prior to TGbe projected end date.
         8. Discussion on when the completion of the final recirc will need to be.
         9. Remember this is the initial target, things will change.
         10. This is a good starting point.
      7. Final initial TGme Timeline
         1. Feb 2021 – PAR Approval
         2. March 2021– Initial meeting, issue comment collection on IEEE Std 802.11-2020 (if published)
         3. May 2021 – Process CC input, 11ax, 11ay, 11ba integration begins
         4. Nov 2021 – Initial D1.0 WG Letter ballot
         5. May 2022 –D2.0 Recirculation LB
         6. 2023 – D3.0 Recirculation LB (11az + other amendments <11bc, 11bd, 11bb>)
         7. May 2023 – D4.0 Recirculation (other amendment integration)
         8. Jul 2023 – D5.0 Initial SA Ballot (pending integration)
         9. Jan 2024 – D6.0 Recirculation SA Ballot
         10. April 2024 – D7.0 Recirculation SA Ballot
         11. May 2024 – D7.0 Recirc SA Ballot (Clean Recirculation)
         12. Sept 2024 – RevCom/SASB Approval
      8. **Motion: Initial Timeline**
         1. Move To approve the timeline posted on Slide 11 of 11-20/0284r0 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0284-00-000m-tgm-agenda-march-2021-session.pptx>> document as the initial timeline for REVme.
         2. Moved: Harry Bims
         3. Seconded: Emily Qi
         4. Results: Unaniomou Approval – 130 people on the call
   3. **Issues List/Presentations**
      1. Initial list:
         1. Deprecation of 802.1D
         2. ESS and HESSID – Arch contribution – Mark Hamilton
         3. QoS re-work – Osama
         4. Annex G removal proposal – Graham/Menzo
         5. Peer to peer – Payam/Mark Rison (reflector)
         6. EAPol-Key Notation -Mike Montemurro
      2. Deprecation of 802.1D
         1. Presentation from 802.1 WG Chair – Glenn Parsons
            1. <https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2021/maint-parsons-802.1D_withdrawal_status-0321-v1.pdf>
            2. Review presentation.
            3. 802.1D amistrative withdrawal
            4. Features and definitions in 802.1D have been moved to 802.1Q
            5. Outstanding references need to be resolved.
            6. Review of 802 Standards for reference to 802.1D.
            7. Slide 7 has list of references in 802.11-2020 that need to be updated in REVme.
            8. 802.1D has been superceded and a motion in July is expected and will be withdrawn later in the year.
            9. 802.11 will need to update the references.
            10. Discussion:

Question on if 802.1Q Bridge or 802.1Q MAC or VLAN bridge.

The distinction may not be needed now that it is in 802.1Q.

The reason would be if VLAN is recognized or not.

The references cited on slide 7 are the clause numbers in the 802.11-2020 standard.

The GLK distinction is when 802.1D vs 802.1Q is used. Now that 802.1 has combined 802.1Q, is there a distinction that still needs to be made.

802.1D will no longer be an active standard to be referenced.

What the adjustments need to be made will need to be specifically worked out later.

Backward compatibility table may need to be created, but 802.1 does not see a need.

* + - * 1. Plan going forward

Comment collection about to be started, and it is expected that 802.11 will drive this change, but 802.1 is here to help. User Priority may need a longer discussion.

Looking for volunteer for shepherding the issue in the maintenance.

Osama to lead the discussion for 802.11.

* + 1. Review the rest of the issues list.
       1. Discussion on who would lead the discussion.
       2. ESS/HESSID – Mark Hamilton to present this week.
       3. QoS Rework – Osama will be bringing it back.
       4. Annex G Removal proposal – Graham lead the effort
          1. This is being discussed in ARC
          2. Potentially come back to REVme at after some dissucsion there.
       5. Peer to Peer/Direct – Emily Qi to lead
       6. What is “QoS Data Frame?
          1. Discussed in REVmd, but the solution is not complete.
          2. We may leave as it, but there is a preseation in 11-20/0435 under CID 4259. Initial discussion material.
          3. Mark Rison to present later this week.
       7. What does “a beacon interval” mean?
          1. See 19-0856 under CID 2316 for initial point to start discussion.
          2. Mark Rison to present later this week.
    2. Other issues can come from the comment collection.
    3. Add Data Rate Limiting feature to the issues list. – Mark Hamilton
    4. Add Use of passive Requiments to the specification – Joeseph Levy
  1. **CC Motion -- D0.0 Comment Collection.**
     1. Move to Approve a 30-day comment collection on TGmd D0.00 (IEEE Std 802.11™-2020)
     2. Moved: Jon Rosdahl
     3. Seconded: Joseph Levy
     4. Result: Unanimous Consent - Motion passes – 122 on the call
  2. **Plan for teleconferences**
     1. Discussion on what days and times should be used.
     2. Requst to not use Fridays as it is Saturday in Asia.
        1. Monday 10 am ET April 19
        2. Thursday 10 am ET April 29
     3. ACTION ITEM: Mike to check with Alfred for the TGbe Schedule and we will alternate opposite them taking the old TGax slot times.
  3. **Recess at 5:43pm ET**

1. REVme (802.11me) March 11th Telecon 16:00-18:00 ET
   1. **Called to order** by Michael Montemurro, Chair TGme at 4:01pm ET.
      1. REVme Agenda doc = 11-21/0284r1
         1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0284-01-000m-tgm-agenda-march-2021-session.pptx>
      2. Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy see 11-21/0284r1 Slides 17-25
         1. No issues noted
      3. Motions were validated – 57-0-1 for the motion to confirm Vice Chairs
      4. Comment Collection request was made to WG chair and will open on March 17th.
   2. **Review Draft Agenda** 
      1. Thursday March 11
2. Call to Order, review Patent Policy, announcements.
3. Approve Agenda
4. Presentations
   1. ESS/HESSID – Mark Hamilton
   2. REVmd – Mark RISON
5. Teleconferences
6. AoB
7. Adjourn
   * 1. No objection to approving the agenda as proposed.
   1. Presentations
      1. ESS/HESSID – Mark Hamilton -20/177r9
         1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0177-09-0arc-liaison-to-revmd-on-ess.docx>
         2. Review submission.
         3. Discussion on the definition of ESS/BSS/IBSS and how it is defined relative to the DS.
         4. Security parameters requirements discussed.
         5. Discussion on multiple BSS in a common SSID.
         6. Definition of HeSS introduced.
         7. IEEE 802.1Q Bridge network question
         8. Question on how to refer to standards – when to include “std”.
         9. Discussion of a STA being a member of ESS vs only a BSS.
         10. Discussion of Association requirements.
         11. Going forward use ARC as a resource for more discussion.
         12. Request to not hold back on comments when the Comment Collection opens. We can use ARC as a resource.
      2. Note that doc 11-21/269 may need to be reviewed for an 11ax related issues presented in TGbe this week.
      3. REVmd Issues– Mark RISON – 21/448r0
         1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0448-00-000m-miscellaneous-11me-d0-0-issues.pptx>
         2. Review Submission
         3. Issues carried over from 11md.
         4. “QoS Data Frame”
            1. See Slide 3 for older definition
            2. See Slide 4 for 802.11-2020 definition.
            3. Is ther a better solution?

Aprox 185 instances of QoS Data frame.

To resolve, we need to identify which are Qos Data Type vs QoS Data Frame.

* + - * 1. The Issue is determining if QoS Data Frame is explicitly 1000 or all frames with 1xxx.
      1. “beacon interval”
         1. See Slide 6 for current definition
         2. Slide 7 illustrates the vague period revered to as beacon interval.
         3. ~800 instances of “beacon interval” and ~120 “beacon period”
         4. Discussion on if A to D on slide 7 may be the right definition.
      2. “Non-QoS in QBSS (Data)”
         1. See slide 10 for description
         2. Potential answer to question was noted today, 9.3.2.1.1 as a possible explanation of the behaviour.
         3. Clause 9 is not normative behaviour, so we may want to add a “shall” clause elsewhere to solve the issue.
         4. Concern with some Implentations that have different behaviour than what is described in the discussion here.
         5. There are over 100 “Non-QOS in QBSS (DATA)”
      3. Non-QoS in a QBSS (Null)
         1. See slide 12 for description
         2. “QoS Null” is an option listed (see slide 13), it can not be a regular “Null”
         3. Discussion on possible future topical discussion.
  1. Comment Collection
     1. Scheduled for March 17 to April 17th.
  2. Teleconference – Meeting Plan Through May
     1. Monday 10 ET, 2h April 19, 26, May 3, 24
     2. Electronic Interim is May 10-18
     3. Concerns on May 3 being May Day in Europe.
     4. Note that Mondays have more Bank Holidays than other days.
     5. Request 3 slots for May Interim Tues-Wed-Thurs at 4-6pm ET.
  3. Adjourn at 5:50pm ET.

**References:**

**Tuesday March 9, 2021:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0284-00-000m-tgm-agenda-march-2021-session.pptx>
2. <https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2021/maint-parsons-802.1D_withdrawal_status-0321-v1.pdf>

**Thursday, March 11, 2021:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0284-01-000m-tgm-agenda-march-2021-session.pptx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0177-09-0arc-liaison-to-revmd-on-ess.docx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0448-00-000m-miscellaneous-11me-d0-0-issues.pptx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0284-02-000m-tgm-agenda-march-2021-session.pptx>