IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Resolution for Miscellaneous CIDs related to Clause 25.2.1.2 (CC34) |
| Date: Feb 17, 2021 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Yanjun Sun | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | yanjuns@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |
| George Cherian | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | gcherian@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Abhishek Patil | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | appatil@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Duncan Ho | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | dho@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Gaurang Naik | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | gnaik@qti.qualcomm.com |

 Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for following 8 comments received for TGbe CC34 and 2 comments from in [21/0218r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0218-00-00be-review-of-p802-11be-d0-3-for-cc34.docx):

* 8 CIDs: 1086, 1667, 1936, 2147, 2148, 2180, 3120, 3151
* 2 comments from in [21/0218r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0218-00-00be-review-of-p802-11be-d0-3-for-cc34.docx) on subclause 35.2.1.2

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.

***TGbe editor: Please note Baseline is REVmd D5.0, 11ax D8.0, and 11be D0.3***

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGbe Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGbe Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGbe Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGbe Editor” are instructions to the TGbe editor to modify existing material in the TGbe draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGbe editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGbe Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Commenter | Page | Clause | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 3151 | Yongho Seok | 125.40 | 35.2.1.2.2 | "When an EHT STA transmits an RTS, MU-RTS Trigger, or CTS frame in a non-HT duplicate PPDU,..."The CF-End frame and PS-Poll frame can be sent in a non-HT duplicated PPDU with a preamble puncturing.Please add the CF-End frame and PS-Poll frames. | As in comment. | **Revised**Agree with the commenter in principle. Generalized the spec text so that the puncturing rules are applicable to any Control frame. **Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/**0455r0 **tagged as 3151, 3120, 2180, 1086.** |
| 3120 | Yanjun Sun | 125.40 | 35.2.1.2.2 | It's not defined how to handle control frames other than RTS, CTS, MU-RTS based on INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS | Apply the same rule to other controls frames: Ack, PS-Poll, CF-End, BAR, BASuggested change: replace "RTS, MU-RTS Trigger, or CTS" with "RTS, MU-RTS Trigger, CTS, Ack, PS-Poll, CF-End, BAR, or BA" | **Revised**Agree with the commenter in principle. Generalized the spec text so that the puncturing rules are applicable to any Control frame. **Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/**0455r0 **tagged as 3151, 3120, 2180, 1086.** |
| 2180 | Li-Hsiang Sun | 125.40 | 35.2.1.2.2 | INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS TXVECTOR should alos be aplicablle to NDPA, other trigger frames, BA, Ack, CF-End in non-HT duplicate format | adding the additional control frames into this subclause | **Revised**Agree with the commenter in principle. Generalized the spec text so that the puncturing rules are applicable to any Control frame. **Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/**0455r0 **tagged as 3151, 3120, 2180, 1086.** |
| 1086 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 125.28 | 35.2.1.2 | 1) Need to specify how preamble puncturing is signaled (i.e., where these INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS are obtained from). 2) Also the subclause seems to specify the behavior for (MU) RTS/CTS frames. What happens to the other control frames and PPDU formats? Please call out explicitly the punctured rules for all the PPDUs that can be exchanged in this type of TXOP and what subchannel the STA can or cannot transmit. 3) Is the STA that receives this signaling required to puncture all specified subchannels? 4) In 11ax this parameter was provided in NDPA but EHT NDPA does not have this anymore. Please ensure that there is no conflicts between the two. | As in comment. | **Revised**Agree with the commenter in principle. 1) Added text to specify how preamble puncturing is indicated in management frames (e.g. beacons)2) Generalized the spec text so that the puncturing rules are applicable to any Control frame. In additional, text has been added to clarify that the rules are applicable to EHT PPDU as well3) Added subclause 35.9.x (Preamble Puncturing Operation) to require a STA that has received the signaling to puncture all the specified subchannels.4)**Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/0455r0 tagged as 3151, 3120, 2180, 1086, 1667, 2148, 2147.** |
| 1667 | GEORGE CHERIAN | 125.40 | 35.2.1.2.2 | The indication of which subchannels are punctured in an RTS, MU-RTS Trigger, or CTS frame that is carried in a non-HT duplicate PPDU is conveyed from the MAC to the PHY through the TXVECTOR parameter INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS.":How the non-AP STA MAC knows whether a channel is punctured or not is not specified. Please specify, | As in the comment | **Revised**Agree with the commenter in principle. Added text to specify how preamble puncturing is indicated in management frames (e.g. beacons)**Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/**0455r0 **tagged as 1086, 1667, 2148, 2147.** |
| 2148 | Laurent Cariou | 0.00 | 35.2.1.2 | Define procedure for static puncturing, which is the puncturing flavor that should be defined for R1 (dynamic puncturing being for R2) | as in comment | **Revised**Agree with the commenter in principle. Added text to specify how preamble puncturing is indicated in management frames (e.g. beacons)**Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/**0455r0 **tagged as 1086, 1667, 2148, 2147.** |
| 2147 | Laurent Cariou | 0.00 | 35.2.1.2.2 | Inactive\_Subchannels in the TxVector should be also used for any PPDU types when we do static puncturing, which is the puncturing mode that is defined for R1 (dynamic puncturing being R2). The Inactive\_Subchannels are derived from the Transmit Power element transmitted by the AP. | as in comment | **Revised**Agree with the commenter in principle. 1) Generalized the spec text so that the puncturing rules are applicable to EHT PPDU as well2) Added text to specify how preamble puncturing is indicated in management frames (e.g. beacons). Instead of the Transmit Power element, the proposed text is based on a bitmap in EHT Operation element, which offers lower overhead in most common cases.**Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/0455r0 tagged as 1086, 1667, 2148, 2147**. |
| 1936 | Jeongki Kim | 125.47 | 35.2.1.2.2 | When any 20 MHz subchannel is punctured, how or where does the STA send CTS frame?Define the rule how the STA send a CTS frame in case that there are puctured channels or busy channels. | Define the rule how the STA send a CTS frame in case that there are puctured channels or busy channels. | **Revised**Agree with the commenter in principle.Added rules on CTS response in subclause 10.3.2.9.**Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/**0455r0 **tagged as** 1936**.** |
| [21/0218r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0218-00-00be-review-of-p802-11be-d0-3-for-cc34.docx)a | Mark Rison | 125.40 | 35.2.1.2 | Why do we need this? We don’t say it for HE. “When an EHT STA transmits an RTS, MU-RTS Trigger, or CTS frame in a non-HT duplicate PPDU, the STA shall not transmit on any 20 MHz subchannel that is punctured.” | PC: delete this para | **Revised**The paragraph corresponds to the motion that defined punctured transmission of RTS, MU-RTS Trigger and CTS frame in a non-HT duplicate PPDU, which is a new EHT feature. Added a NOTE to clarify why this paragraph is needed.**Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/0455r0 tagged as 21/0218r0a.** |
| [21/0218r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0218-00-00be-review-of-p802-11be-d0-3-for-cc34.docx)b | Mark Rison | 125.47 | 35.2.1.2 | Is this trying to say that it cannot be present for any other kind of PPDU?“The parameter INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS may be present in the TXVECTOR of a non-HT duplicate PPDU that carries an RTS, MU-RTS Trigger, or CTS frame”  | PC: change to “shall not be present in the TXVECTOR of a PPDU that is not a non-HT duplicate PPDU that carries […]” | **Revised**Agree with the commenter in principle that it’s unclear if this rule is applicable to other PPDU types.Revised text to clarify that INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS is applicable to EHT PPDU as well.**Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/0455r0 tagged as 21/0218r0b.** |

**35.2.1.2 Preamble puncturing**

**35.2.1.2.2 INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS**

***Discussion: Proposed changes below address CID 3151, 3120, 2180, 1086, 2147, 21/0218r0b.***

* ***CID 3151, 3120, 2180, 1086 suggested to apply the rules of punctured transmissions (already defined for (MU) RTS and CTS) to other control frames such as Ack, PS-Poll, CF-End, BAR, BA, NDPA.***
* ***CID 1086, 2147, 21/0218r0b suggested to call out explicitly the punctured rules for all the applicable PPDU types***

***TGbe editor: Please update the first two paragraphs as follows***

[CID 3151, 3120, 2180, 1086] When an EHT STA transmits a Control, Data or Management frame in a non-HT duplicate PPDU or EHT PPDU, the STA shall not transmit on any 20 MHz subchannel that is punctured. [CID 1086, 2147, 21/0218r0b]

NOTE: This rule is not needed for a pre-EHT STA. This is because a pre-HE STA does not send any PPDU over a bandwidth with punctured subchannel(s). An HE STA transmits a punctured HE MU PPDU (see Table 9-322b (Subfields of the HE PHY Capabilities Information field)) or an HE NDP or NDP Announcement frame as defined in 26.11.7 (INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS and RU\_ALLOCATION). [CID 21/0218r0a]

[CID 3151, 3120, 2180, 1086] The indication of which subchannels are punctured in a Control, Data or Management frame that is carried in a non-HT duplicate PPDU is conveyed from the MAC to the PHY through the TXVECTOR parameter INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS (see Table 36-1 (TXVECTOR and RXVECTOR parameters)). The parameter INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS may be present in the TXVECTOR of a non-HT duplicate PPDU or EHT PPDU that carries a Control, Data or Management frame. [CID 3151, 3120, 2180, 1086, 2147, 21/0218r0b]

***Discussion: Proposed changes below address CID 1086, 1667, 2148, 2147. These CIDs suggested to define how preamble puncturing is signaled.***

* ***CID 2147 suggested to define static puncturing and to derive INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS based on the Transmit Power element (TPE) to indicate.***
* ***Contribution*** [***21/162r0***](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0162-00-00be-signaling-on-static-puncture-info.pptx) ***discusses the related topic and proposes to use a bitmap in the EHT Operation element instead of the TPE in order to reduce Beacon overhead***
* ***TPE had some “bug”*** [***fixed***](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1710-00-00ax-sa2-cid-25039-25040.docx) ***only recently, which may add uncertainty in inter-op if we build EHT preamble puncturing on top of it.***

***In order to reduce Beacon overhead and to avoid uncertainty caused by the recent bug fixes for TPE, we added text for the bitmap-based approach.***

***TGbe editor: Please change the subclause below as follows:***

45 **9.4.2.295a EHT Operation element**

46

47 The operation of EHT STAs in an EHT BSS is controlled by the following:

48

1. — The HT Operation element, HE Operation element, and EHT Operation element if operating in the
2. 2.4 GHz band

51

1. — The HT Operation element, VHT Operation element (if present), HE Operation element, and EHT
2. Operation element if operating in the 5 GHz band
3. — The HE Operation element and EHT Operation element if operating in the 6 GHz band

55

56

57 The format of the EHT Operation element is shown in Figure 9-788ee (EHT Operation element format).

58

59

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Element ID | Length | Element ID Extension | EHT Operation Information | **Disabled Subchannel Bitmap** |

60

61

62

63 Octets: 1 1 1 TBD **0 or 2**

64

65 **Figure 9-788ee—EHT Operation element format** [CID 1086, 1667, 2148, 2147]

1 The Element ID, Length, and Element ID Extension fields are defined in 9.4.2.1 (General).

2

1. The EHT STA obtains the channel configuration information from the EHT Operation element if operating
2. in the 6 GHz band. The subfields of EHT Operation Information field are defined in Table 9-322al (EHT Operation Information subfields).

5

7

8

9 **Table 9-322al—EHT Operation Information subfields** [CID 1086, 1667, 2148, 2147]

10

11

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Subfield** | **Definition** | **Encoding** |
| Channel Width | This field defines the EHT BSS band- width. | Set to 0 for 20 MHz EHT BSS band- width.Set to 1 for 40 MHz EHT BSS band- width.Set to 2 for 80 MHz EHT BSS band- width.Set to 3 for 160 MHz EHT BSS band- width.Set to 4 for 320 MHz EHT BSS band- width.Other values are reserved. |
| CCFS | TBD | TBD |
| **Disabled Subchannel Bitmap Present** | **Indicates whether the Disabled Subchannel Bitmap field is present or not.** | **Set to 1 if the Disabled Subchannel Bitmap field is present; set to 0 otherwise.** |

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

The Disabled Subchannel Bitmap field is present if the Disabled Subchannel Bitmap Present subfield is 1 and provides a list of subchannels that are not active within the BSS bandwidth; otherwise it is not present. [CID 1086, 1667, 2148, 2147]

The Disabled Subchannel Bitmap field is a 16-bit bitmap where the lowest numbered bit corresponds to the 20 MHz subchannel that lies within the BSS bandwidth and that has the lowest frequency of the set of all 20 MHz subchannels within the BSS bandwidth. Each successive bit in the bitmap corresponds to the next higher frequency 20 MHz subchannel. A bit in the bitmap is set to 1 to indicate that no energy is to be transmitted on the corresponding subchannel when exchanging PPDUs within the BSS (i.e., the subchannel is punctured). If a bit in the bitmap corresponds to a 20 MHz subchannel within the BSS bandwidth that is not disabled, then the bit is set to 0. [CID 1086, 1667, 2148, 2147]

***Discussion: Proposed changes below address CID*** ***1086, 1667, 2148, 2147:***

* ***To address CID 1086, 1667, 2148, 2147, the corresponding procedures are defined on how an AP signals a puncturing pattern in BSS Operation parameters***
* ***To address CID 1086, text have been added to explicitly say call out that an EHT NDPA obtains puncturing information from BSS Operation parameter, unlike an HE NDPA which obtains puncturing information from a STA Info field with the AID11 set to 2047***

***TGbe editor: Please add a new subclause 35.9.x as follows***

**35.9 EHT BSS operation** [CID 1086, 1667, 2148, 2147]

**35.9.x Preamble Puncturing Operation**

[CID 1086, 1667, 2148, 2147] An EHT AP may add the Disabled Subchannel Bitmap field in the EHT Operation elements it includes in transmitted Management frames. The AP may set each bit in the Disabled Subchannel Bitmap field to any value except that:

- A bit in the bitmap that corresponds to a 20 MHz subchannel outside the BSS bandwidth shall be set to 1.

- The bit in the bitmap that corresponds to the primary 20 MHz subchannel shall be set to 0.

In an EHT BSS set up by an EHT AP that has included the Disabled Subchannel Bitmap field in the EHT Operation element, an EHT STA shall set the TXVECTOR parameter INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS based on the value indicated in the most recently exchanged Disabled Subchannel Bitmap field in the EHT Operation element for that BSS. If a 20MHz subchannel is indicated as a punctured subchannel in the Disabled Subchannel Bitmap field in the EHT Operation element, the corresponding bit in the TXVECTOR parameter INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS shall be set to 1.

[CID 1086] NOTEthe INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS of an EHT NDP Announcement frame is also set based on the value indicated in the most recent Disabled Subchannel Bitmap field in the EHT Operation element if the field is present, unlike an HE NDP Announcement frame which sets its INACTIVE\_SUBCHANNELS based on a STA Info field with the AID11 of 2047.

***Discussion: Proposed changes below address CID 1936:***

* ***To address CID 1936, rules have been defined on how to handle CTS responses if there are punctured or busy subchannels***

***TGbe editor: Please add the following paragraphs to subclause 10.3.2.9 as follows***

**10.3.2.9 CTS and DMG CTS procedure** [CID 1936]

An EHT STA that is addressed by an RTS frame in a non-HT or non-HT duplicate PPDU that has a bandwidth signaling TA and that has the RXVECTOR parameter DYN\_BANDWIDTH\_IN\_NON\_HT equal to Static behaves as follows:

—If the NAV indicates idle, the STA is not NSTR limited, and CCA has been idle for all secondary channels (secondary 20 MHz channel, secondary 40 MHz channel, secondary 80 MHz channel, and secondary 80 MHz channel, **excluding any punctured subchannel indicated in the in the most recently exchanged Disabled Subchannel Bitmap field in the EHT Operation element for that BSS**) in the channel width indicated by the RTS frame’s RXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH\_IN\_NON\_HT for a PIFS prior to the start of the RTS frame, then the STA shall respond with a CTS frame carried in a non-HT or non-HT duplicate PPDU after a SIFS. The CTS frame’s TXVECTOR parameters CH\_BANDWIDTH and CH\_BANDWIDTH\_IN\_NON\_HT shall be set to the same value as the RTS frame’s RXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH\_IN\_NON\_HT.

* If all of the conditions in the previous paragraph are met, except for the condition “the STA is not NSTR limited”, then the STA may respond with the CTS frame as described in that paragraph.

— Otherwise, the STA shall not respond with a CTS frame.

An EHT STA that is addressed by an RTS frame in a non-HT or non-HT duplicate PPDU that has a bandwidth signaling TA and that has the RXVECTOR parameter DYN\_BANDWIDTH\_IN\_NON\_HT equal to Dynamic behaves as follows:

—If the NAV indicates idle, and the STA is not NSTR limited, then the STA shall respond with a CTS frame in a non-HT or non-HT duplicate PPDU after a SIFS. The CTS frame’s TXVECTOR parameters CH\_BANDWIDTH and CH\_BANDWIDTH\_IN\_NON\_HT shall be set to any channel width for which CCA on all secondary channels, **excluding any punctured subchannel indicated in the in the most recently exchanged Disabled Subchannel Bitmap field in the EHT Operation element for that BSS**, has been idle for a PIFS prior to the start of the RTS frame and that is less than or equal to the channel width indicated in the RTS frame’s RXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH\_IN\_NON\_HT.

* If all of the conditions in the previous paragraph are met, except for the condition “the STA is not NSTR limited”, then the STA may respond with the CTS frame as described in that paragraph.

—Otherwise, the STA shall not respond with a CTS frame.

**Do you support the resolutions for the following CIDs in doc 11-21/0455r0:**

1086, 1667, 1936, 2147, 2148, 2180, 3120, 3151 and Mark’s comments on subclause 35.2.1.2