IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes - RCM ad-hoc – 17 September 2020 | | | | |
| Date: 2020-09-17 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Joseph LEVY | InterDigital Communication, Inc. | 111 W 33rd Street New York, NY 10120 | +1.631.622.4139 | [joseph.levy@interdigital.com](mailto:joseph.levy@interdigital.com) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains the minutes of the IEEE 802.11 Random and Changing MAC Addresses (RCM) Ad Hoc teleconference held on 17 September 2020, 13:30 – 15:30 h EDT.

Note: Highlighted text are action items.

Q- proceeds a question asked at the meeting

A- proceeds an answer given by the presenter

C- proceeds a comment

Contents

[Thursday 17 September 2020, 13:30 hrs EDT: 3](#_Toc54107183)

[Administrative: 3](#_Toc54107184)

[Status Update: 4](#_Toc54107185)

[Discussion: 4](#_Toc54107186)

[Motions: 5](#_Toc54107187)

[Review upcoming Telecon Schedule 6](#_Toc54107188)

[Closing Statement 6](#_Toc54107189)

[Adjourn: 15:30 hrs. EDT 6](#_Toc54107190)

[Attendance: 8](#_Toc54107191)

[References: 9](#_Toc54107192)

# Thursday 17 September 2020, 13:30 h EDT:

## Administrative:

**Administration:**

**Chair: Carol Ansley, CommScope**

**Acting Secretary: Joseph Levy, InterDigital**

**The teleconference was called to order by Chair 13:30 h EDT,**

Joseph Levy, InterDigital volunteered to be acting secretary.

Agenda slide deck: [11-20/0995r8](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0995-08-0rcm-rcm-sg-agenda.pptx) proposed agenda (slide 10) copied here for reference:

* **Administrative**
  + **Motion to approve minutes from past teleconferences**
    - **Doc 11-20/1428r1 31 August 2020**
    - **Doc 11-20/1241r0 17 August 2020**
    - **Doc 11-20/1184r0 4 August 2020**
    - **Doc 11-20/1118r0 20 July 2020**
    - **Doc 11-20/1021r0 6 July 2020**
    - **Doc 11-20/941r0 22 June 2020**
    - **Doc 11-20/873r0 6 June 2020**
    - **Doc 11-20/766r0 11 May 2020**
    - **Doc 11-20/664r0 27 April 2020**
    - **Thanks to Peter Yee, Joseph Levy, Amelia Andersdotter, Rob Sun, and Lili Hervieu for volunteering to record minutes for the group.**
  + D**iscussion**
    - **Doc 854r4 RCM PAR draft (Privacy)**
    - **Doc 1346r1 RCM CSD draft (Privacy)**
  + Motions
    - **Approve PAR draft for RCM amendment – 20/854r4**
    - **Approve CSD draft for RCM amendment – 20/1117r3**
    - **Possible motions: to approve PAR/CSD for Privacy amendment**
  + Review upcoming Telecon Schedule
    - **September 28 Monday 10:00amEDT**
    - **October 12 Monday 10:00amEDT**
    - **October 26 Monday 10:00amEDT**
  + Adjourn

**Approval of the Agenda:**

The Chair reviewed the agenda and called for comments or amendments to the agenda.

- there was no response to the call.

The proposed agenda was approved without objection.

The Chair reviewed the Administrative information in the agenda document [11-20/0733r2](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0733-02-0rcm-rcm-sg-telecon-agenda-may.pptx) (Slides 6-9), there was no discussion. The Chair stated that since this meeting is occurring during the 802.11 Interim meeting motion are in order.

**Motion to approve minutes from past teleconferences:**

The Chair call for a motion to approve the minutes of the past teleconferences:

Move to approve the following minutes of the past teleconferences:

* + - Doc 11-20/1428r1 31 August 2020
    - Doc 11-20/1241r0 17 August 2020
    - Doc 11-20/1184r0 4 August 2020
    - Doc 11-20/1118r0 20 July 2020
    - Doc 11-20/1021r0 6 July 2020
    - Doc 11-20/941r0 22 June 2020
    - Doc 11-20/873r0 6 June 2020
    - Doc 11-20/766r0 11 May 2020
    - Doc 11-20/664r0 27 April 2020

Moved by Steward Kerry

Seconded by Amelia Andersdotter

Approved by unanimous consent (26 participants, see attendance).

## Status Update:

The Chair provided an RCM SG status update, reviewing [11-20/0733r2](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0733-02-0rcm-rcm-sg-telecon-agenda-may.pptx) slides 11 and 12.

## Discussion:

**Doc** [**11-20/854r4**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0854-04-0rcm-par-proposal-for-privacy.docx) **RCM PAR draft (Privacy):**

**Regarding the title: “Amendment: Enhanced service with Data Privacy Protection”,**

Q – Should “with” be replaced with “for”?

Discussion resulted in agreement that “with” should be used.

**Regarding 5.2b:**

Q – Should this amendment be restricted to be MAC only, in the past 802.11 has come very close to PHY when dealing with these issues.

A – We would need a compelling use case to change the PAR so it would allow PHY changes.

Discussion resulted in agreement that the PAR be limited to MAC only.

**Regarding 5.5**

Q – Do the use cases we discussed align with this need statement?

C - Not really, but this need does align with the concerns in 802E

C – Can we balance this need statement with additional information on what steps have already been taken. Adding the work that was done in TGaq and state the focus is to extend this prior work.

Q – Why do we only call out mobile devices? What about tablets and laptops

Agreement on using the term “devices incorporating IEEE std 802.11”.

C – Suggest changing the first sentence to state “sometime enables user tracking”

C – The focus on mobile should be removed, even fixed devices can expose things. We should protect user privacy in cases, we should be concerned about user profiling.

C – IEEE 802E is a recommended practice for privacy consideration for IEEE 802 technology.

C – We need to go beyond IEEE 802E and provide solution in the 802.11 space.

C – This text should be in the present tense.

Other editorial comments were provided.

This discussion yielded significant changes to 5.5 addressing, see below.

Original text (from r4):

*“Mobile devices incorporating IEEE Std 802.11 are ubiquitous, and IEEE Std 802.11 compliant devices have been the target of various privacy related attacks, e.g. user tracking and user profiling, which have created substantial privacy concerns. Personal mobile devices have been and currently are being used to obtain sensitive, personal information about the devices’ users such as where they go, when they go, to whom they speak to, what information they access, etc.*

*“To ensure continued growth and support for IEEE Std 802.11, modifications are needed that address these user privacy concerns.*

*“IEEE P802E develops privacy threat models and associated solutions. This proposed amendment will work to standardize user privacy solutions applicable to IEEE Std 802.11 technology. The privacy compliance guidelines provided in IEEE P802E will be considered in this proposed amendment.”*

Updated text (from r5):

*“Users and regulatory agencies are concerned about protecting personal information such as locations, movements, contacts and activities, etc. Devices incorporating IEEE Std 802.11 are ubiquitous, and being compliant with IEEE Std 802.11 does not sufficiently protect users from user tracking and user profiling attacks.*

*“Work has been done in this area in IEEE Std 802.11aq-2018. To ensure continued growth and support for IEEE Std 802.11, this project standardizes user privacy solutions applicable to IEEE Std 802.11.”*

**Straw Poll:**

Are you comfortable bringing 11-20/0854r5 to the 802.11 WG tomorrow for approval?

Agreed by unanimous consent

**Doc** [**11-20/1346r1**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1346-01-0rcm-csd-draft-for-privacy-amendment-of-rcm-project.docx) **RCM CSD draft (Privacy)**

The document was discussed, multiple small wording changes were proposed, and IEEE 802E was added as reference. The changes agreed during the meeting are in **Doc** [**11-20/1346r2**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1346-02-0rcm-csd-draft-for-privacy-amendment-of-rcm-project.docx)

## Motions:

**Motion to approve the RCM PAR:**

Believing that the RAP contained in the document referenced below meets IEEE-SA guidelines:

Request that the PAR contained in 802.11-20/0742r3 be posted to the IEEE 802 Executive Committee (EC) agenda for WG 802 preview and EC approval to submit to NesCom.

Moved Graham Smith

Second Edward Au

Approved by unanimous consent (17 participants, see attendance)

**Motion to approve the RCM CSD:**

Believing that the CS contained in the document referenced below meets IEEE 802 guidelines:

Request that the SC contained in 802.11-20/1117r3 be posted to the IEEE 802 Executive Committee (EC) agenda for WG 802 preview and EC approval.

Moved: Graham Smith

Seconded: Edward Au

Approved by unanimous consent (17 participants, see attendance)

**Motion to approve the Privacy PAR**

Believing that the PAR contained in the document referenced below meets IEEE-SA guidelines:

Request that the PAR contained in 802.11-20/0854r5 be posted to the IEEE 802 Executive Committee (EC) agenda for WG 802 preview and EC approval to submit to NesCom

Moved: Jouni Malinen

Seconded: Rob Sun

Agreed by unanimous consent (16 participants, see attendance)

**Motion to approve the Privacy CSD**

Believing that the CSD contained in the document referenced below meets IEEE 802 guidelines:

Request that the CSD contained in 802.11-20/1345r2 be posted to the IEEE 802 Executive Committee (EC) agenda for WG 802 preview and EC approval.

Moved: Jouni Malinen

Seconded: Rob Sun

Agreed by unanimous consent (16 participants, see attendance)

## Review upcoming Telecon Schedule

* + - **September 28 Monday 10:00amEDT**
    - **October 12 Monday 10:00amEDT**
    - **October 26 Monday 10:00amEDT**

## Closing Statement

The Chair stated: We have completed two PAR/CSD sets – We will have to decide how to proceed – We will discuss this at our next meeting.

## Adjourn: 15:30 h EDT

Note: final agenda slide deck is: [11-20/0995r9](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0995-09-0rcm-rcm-sg-agenda.pptx)

# Attendance:

The following recorded their attendance in the 802.11 IMAT attendance tool or were noted on the Webex attendee list; this list also provides indication of presence for the motions passed by unanimous consent:

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **Present for Motion:** | | |
| **Name** | **Affiliation** | **Minutes** | **RMC (2)** | **Privacy (2)** |
| Aboulmagd, Osama | Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd |  |  |  |
| Andersdotter, Amelia | None - Self-funded | X |  |  |
| Ansley, Carol\* | Self | X | X | X |
| Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |  | X | X |
| Bajko, Gabor |  | X | X | X |
| Berkema, Alan | HP Inc. | X | X | X |
| Bredewoud, Albert | Broadcom Corporation | X |  |  |
| Carney, William | Sony Corporation | X | X | X |
| Derham, Thomas | Broadcom Corporation |  | X | X |
| Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope | X | X | X |
| Henry, Jerome | Cisco Systems, Inc. | X |  |  |
| Hervieu, Lili | Cable Television Laboratories Inc. (CableLabs) | X | X | X |
| Huang, Po-Kai | Intel Corporation | X |  |  |
| Jones, Allan | Activision | X |  |  |
| Kandala, Srinivas | SAMSUNG | X |  |  |
| Kerry, Stuart | OK-Brit; Self | X |  |  |
| Krieger, Ann | US Department of Defense | X |  |  |
| Lee, Il-Gu | Sungshin University |  |  |  |
| Levy, Joseph\* | InterDigital Communications, Inc. | X | X | X |
| Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Incorporated | X | X | X |
| Murti, Wisnu | SeoulTech |  |  |  |
| Naribole, Sharan | SAMSUNG | X |  |  |
| Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation | X |  |  |
| Rantala, Enrico-Henrik | Nokia |  |  |  |
| Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |  | X | X |
| Sedin, Jonas | Ericsson AB | X |  |  |
| Smith, Graham | SR Technologies | X | X | X |
| Stanley, Dorothy | Hewlett Packard Enterprise | X | X | X |
| Sun, Sheng | Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd | X | X | X |
| Torab Jahromi, Payam | Facebook | X | X | X |
| Wang, Lei | Huawei R&D USA | X |  |  |
| Yee, Peter | NSA-CSD | X | X | X |
| yi, yongjiang | Futurewei Technologies | X | X |  |

\*did not indicate attendance via IMAT – though did attend/contribute to the teleconference, in Webex.

Note: Motion participation based on Webex status at the time of the motion.

# References: