IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVmd CRC- Aug 21 and Aug 26 2020 | | | | |
| Date: 2020-08-26 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This file contains the minutes for the 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecons from August 21 to August 28th, 2020.

R0: Minutes for August 21, 2020

R1: Minutes for August 26, 2020 added.

1. **IEEE 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecon Friday, August 21, 2020 10:00-12:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order at 10:03 a**m ET by the TG Chair Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
   2. **Review Patent and Participation Policy**
      1. No Issues noted.
   3. **Attendance:** -please log with IMAT:
      1. About 12 attendees reported by WebEx

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Aboulmagd, Osama | Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus Wireless |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Kwon, Young Hoon | NXP Semiconductors |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | McCann, Stephen | Self |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Montemurro, Michael | Self |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Stanley, Dorothy | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Wentink, Menzo | Qualcomm Incorporated |

* + 1. Missing from IMAT: None reported
  1. Review agenda: 11-20/1211r1
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1211-01-000m-2020-august-sept-agendas.docx>
     2. **The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance> ), and patent policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA ([patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.      Patent, Participation and policy related slides: See slides 4-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0323-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2020.pptx>

2.       Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU – see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156> .

3.       Comment resolution and motions

1. **2020-08-21 Friday 10 am Eastern 2 hours** 
   1. Mark Rison <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435> CIDs 4220, 4477, 4523, 4629, 4602, 4527, 4699, **“**Proposed additional changes” page 118 of the r12 document.
   2. Menzo WENTINK CIDs 4761, 4169, 4811 <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0150>
2. **Announce next set of teleconferences**

4.       AOB

Review TGmd schedule –target D 4.0 in August; D5.0 in September

(August 7th motion for recirculation, August 21 – Editors have draft, 15 day recirc, end by September 8. 🡨 update

Hold several meetings during September plenary for comment resolution.

Sept – D5.0 Unchanged recirc

28 Sept – Unchanged recirc must start

6 Oct – 802 EC Aproval, Draft TGme PAR (next revision)

13 October – Draft to RevCom

2020 Dec RevCom/SASB

5. Adjourn

* + 1. No objection to the agenda as described.
  1. **Editor report** – Emily QI/Edward AU –
     1. see doc 11-19/2156r19
        1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156-19-000m-revmd-sponsor-ballot-comments.xls>
     2. D4.0 is available in members area
     3. Redline is also available
     4. Motion submission tracking spreadsheet posted: 11-20/1839r5
  2. **Status of IEEE-SA Ballot**
     1. The IEEE-SA Ballot has been started.
     2. Note that the ballot recirc has opened
     3. Question on the process we are doing now.
        1. We are reviewing some CIDs that had been rejected as insufficient details, that now have the details available. We are trying to do work in parallel as the ballot will close on September 4th, and then we have only two weeks to process the new comments.
  3. **Review doc 11-209/0435r13** - Mark Rison (Samsung)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-13-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
     2. CID 4220 (EDITOR) (Was PHY)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review proposed changes
        3. No comments on the proposed changes.
        4. ACTION ITEM: Mark RISON will take responsibility to submit this on the next SA ballot round.
     3. CID 4477 (EDITOR) (was PHY)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review proposed changes
        3. Request time to get feedback from Youhan KIM.
        4. Discussion on the delayed signal extension process and how it is described.
        5. Discussion on the bands that this applicable.
        6. Discussion on the need to make the change.
        7. If the signal extension is defined in 18, and the receive process is cited in clause 17, the proposed sentence is not needed if 18.3.2.4 has the definition already.
        8. The suggestion was to change the reference from clause 17 to clause 18.3.2.4.
        9. ACTION ITEM: Mark RISON will take responsibility to submit this on the next SA ballot round.
     4. CID 4523 (EDITOR) (was PHY)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review proposed changes
        3. Need off-line review, especially CMMG feedback
        4. ACTION ITEM: Edward to check with CMMG folks.
        5. Put on Agenda for Wednesday 26th August.
     5. CID 4629 (EDITOR) (nee PHY)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review proposed changes
        3. Cleans up to make consistency language changes.
        4. Discussion on why there is not a reference to Clause 9 in Clause 25 (20.3.10).
        5. Need off-line review, especially CMMG feedback
        6. ACTION ITEM: Edward to check with CMMG folks.
        7. Put on Agenda for Wednesday 26th August.
     6. CID 4602 (EDITOR) (nee PHY)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review proposed changes
        3. Discussion on why the changes should not be made.
        4. Request to get review Jouni to review as well.
        5. Discussion on if “session key” is not defined or not.
        6. Discussion on the use of “temporal key” may be better.
        7. Question on the 5 locations of “session key” – could they be “Master Session Key” or do they need “temporal key”
        8. CID 4602: Need input from security experts (Jouni, etc.). Bring back on Wednesday.
        9. ACTION ITEM: Mark to check with Jouni
        10. Put on Agenda for Wednesday 26th August.
     7. CID 4527 (EDITOR)(nee PHY)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review proposed changes
        3. Discussion on what is protected frame.
        4. Request to get feedback from Jouni
        5. The change is to add a “shall” and an “an”
        6. ACTION ITEM: Emily to check on the proper use of calling a primitive “a primitive name”, “the primitive name” or “an primitive name”
        7. Put on Agenda for Wednesday 26th August.
     8. CID 4699 (EDITOR)(nee PHY)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review proposed changes
        3. Proposed changes are mostly just clean up of language and figures.
        4. Discussion on the reason/justification for the changes.
        5. Discussion on 10.23.3.3 changes that define the TXOP duration. The transmissions need to stop by the end of the TXOP duration. The TXNAV being used may not be correct.
        6. There is only one technical change being made in Annex 0, and the rest are primarily clean up
        7. ACTION ITEM: Mark H to provide some feedback to Mark R
        8. Put on Agenda for Wednesday 26th August.
        9. “Proposed Additional Changes”
        10. Review the proposed change
        11. Show the context in d3.4.
        12. Review the changes offline has been done, and the feedback is that they are ok.
        13. ACTION ITEM: Mark RISON will take responsibility to submit this on the next SA ballot round.
     9. This is a complete first pass through the document.
     10. CID 4625 (EDITOR)
         1. The issue is this CID is being worked on by Menzo.
  4. **Review doc 11-20/0150r17** Menzo WENTINK (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0150-17-000m-assorted-crs-revmd-draft-3-0.docx>
     2. CID 4761 (EDITOR) (nee MAC)
        1. Review comment.
        2. Review proposed changes.
        3. Measurement pilot issue.
        4. MIB attribute for MeasurementPilotAtribute, and MeasurementPilot.
        5. The text for “attribute” should be true/false and for “MeasurementPilot” is a value.
        6. Discussion on the fact that this may be in TGax, and so we may need to ensure what the relationship is between the MIB variable and multiple BSSID.
        7. The proposed changes come from TGax
        8. Need to review and maybe revisit this more in REVme.
        9. Discussion on the equation in 9.4.2.45.
        10. Is “:” operator used on other MAC frame fields also, or only for MAC addresses. (AID?)
        11. More discussion offline may be a good plan.
        12. If the colon operator is used in AID processing, then we may need more work in that area, and the fact is that the AID processing with the colon operator may be wrong and need more discussion.
        13. All MAC address has a LSB/MSB ordering defined.
        14. Review figure 9-1 –
        15. Disagreement with the change in 1.5 terminology – p152.38 “b is not larger than c”
        16. More work may be needed and if we can agree great, if not, we may need to continue in REVme.
        17. ACTION ITEM: Menzo and Mark R to converge their different proposals.
     3. CID 4169 (EDITOR) (nee GEN)
        1. Review Comment
        2. The reject reason was “REJECTED (GEN: 2020-08-06 02:39:11Z) The CRC discussed this comment and did not come to consensus to make the change. Concerns raised centered around the impact of making existing implementations non-compliant if a change is made in the direction proposed by the commenter, and the need for a MIB attribute or something similar because ProbeDelay is a local variable limited in scope to the scanning procedure.”
        3. Discussion on the rational for the rejection.
        4. A new MIB variable may need to be created.
        5. Discussion on the Channel Switch process.
        6. We need a proposal to take forward.
     4. CID 4811 (EDITOR) (nee MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Discussion on how the state of the spec got here.
        3. When changes for Channel switch subelement was made, the Wide Bandwidth Channel switch subelement did not get changed. We may need to talk with the implementors and then ensure it is documented as it is implemented in the field.
        4. This may be a TGme or next PHY amendment change that can be done later.
        5. More work to be done.
        6. Would like to make some changes now, but no consensus on making some changes until we understand the full issue.
        7. Ok to leave rejected for now and bring up in the future.
     5. CDI 4143 (EDITOR) (nee PHY)
        1. Review Comment
        2. This is a S1G comment, and there has been a lot of discussion, but not having any consensus.
        3. It will be up to the commenter to decide if he will bring back or not.
     6. CID 4149 (EDITOR) (nee MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Rejection reason proposed was accepted.
        3. No further action needed.
  5. **Review Agenda going forward.**
     1. Lili document was presented in TGax, and it was approved by motion there, so not sure it is needed in TGmd?
     2. Discussion on when changes being applied would be available to all PHYs unless excluded.
     3. So not sure the value of revisiting.
     4. If it has been added to TGax, then we can get an update next week in TGmd to find out if we need to do anything or not.
     5. The question on the “colon operator” not being on the agenda but can be added if a proposal is created.
     6. See 11-20/1211r2.
  6. **Reminder that the IEEE-SA ballot is open.**
  7. **AOB:**
     1. Can a comment on BSSMaxIdlePeriod be in order to review during this ballot time?
     2. The best thing would be to get agenda time and present to discuss.
     3. We want to get as much consensus on changes in parallel to be ready for the ballot processing.
     4. Signal quality feedback presented in a previous telecon, would like to update on Wednesday’s call if possible.
     5. Both items can be added to Wednesday Agenda
  8. **Adjourned 12:00pm**

1. **IEEE 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecon Wednesday, August 26, 2020 16:00-18:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order at 4:03** pm ET by the TG Chair Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
   2. **Review Patent and Participation Policy**
      1. No Issues noted.
   3. **Attendance:** -please log with IMAT:
      1. About 12 attendees reported by WebEx

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Aboulmagd, Osama | Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus Wireless |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Kwon, Young Hoon | NXP Semiconductors |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | McCann, Stephen | Self |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Montemurro, Michael | Self |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Stanley, Dorothy | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
|  | TGmd | 8/21 | Wentink, Menzo | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  |  |  |  |  |

* + 1. Missing from IMAT: None reported
  1. **Review Agenda 11-20/1211r2**:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1211-02-000m-2020-august-sept-agendas.docx>
     2. Draft Agenda:

1.       Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance> ), and patent policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA ([patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.      Patent, Participation and policy related slides: See slides 4-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0323-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2020.pptx>

2.       Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU – see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156> .

3.       Comment resolution and motions

1. **2020-08-26 Wednesday 4-6pm Eastern 2 hours**
   1. Mark RISON <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435> CIDs 4247, 4523, 4629, 4602, 4527, 4699
   2. Lili HERVIEU – 5.9 band, https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0143
   3. Srini KANDALA– BSS Max Idle period presentation
   4. Mark HAMILTON - <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1168-00-000m-timely-link-quality-feedback-text.docx>
2. **Announce next set of teleconferences**

4.       **AOB**

Review TGmd schedule –target D 4.0 in August; D5.0 in September

(August 7th motion for recirculation, August 21 – Editors have draft, 15 day recirc, end by September 8. 🡨 update

Hold several meetings during September plenary for comment resolution.

Sept – D5.0 Unchanged recirc

28 Sept – Unchanged recirc must start

6 Oct – 802 EC Approval, Draft TGme PAR (next revision)

13 October – Draft to RevCom

2020 Dec RevCom/SASB

5. **Adjourn**

* + 1. Discuss Agenda:
       1. Sri asked to move to Friday
       2. Lili asked to be first today.
    2. No objection to adjusted Agenda – see R3
  1. **Editor Report** – Emily QI (Intel)
     1. D4.0 is available in Member area.
     2. RTF version is also available for preparing submissions – not official document.
     3. Discussion on the size of some of the document files.
  2. **Review doc 11-20/0143r2** –Lily HERVIEU (CableLabs)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0143-02-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4108.docx>
     2. CID 4108 (EDITOR) (Nee GEN)
        1. Review status
        2. CID 4108: No change. Leave as rejected, as is.
  3. **Review doc 11-20/435r13** – Mark RISON (Samsung)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-13-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
     2. CID 4247 (EDITOR (Nee GEN)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review long list of attribute names.
        3. Review list of attributes assigned to Youhan and Menzo
        4. Many assignments to check were still pending.
        5. Still in Progress; Offline homework ongoing.
     3. CID 4523 (EDITOR) (nee (PHY)
        1. Not ready
        2. Edward reviewed the proposed changes and the direction is good.
        3. The proposed edits are ok,
        4. ACTION ITEM: Mark RISON to submit comment with the proposed chances to the current IEEE-SA Ballot.
     4. CID 4629 (EDITOR) (nee PHY)
        1. Review status
        2. No objection to the direction specified.
        3. ACTION ITEM: Mark RISON to submit comment with the proposed chances to the current IEEE-SA Ballot.
     5. CID 4602 (EDITOR) (nee PHY)
        1. Review status
        2. Still in progress, off-line work to do.
     6. CID 4527 (EDITOR) (nee PHY)
        1. Review Status
        2. Still in progress, off-line work to do.
     7. CID 4699 (EDITOR) (nee PHY)
        1. Review Status
        2. TXNAV direction is ok, but there are several issues also that need to be address.
        3. ACTION ITEM: Mark Hamilton will send specific changes and proposed wording to avoid circular argument. Mark RISON to submit comment to the current IEEE-SA Ballot
     8. CID 4746 (EDITOR) (nee MAC)
        1. This was completed last week and confirmed by email over the last week.
  4. **Review doc 11-20/1167r1 –** Mark Hamilton (Ruckus/Commscope)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1167-01-000m-timely-link-quality-feedback.pptx>
     2. Review submission.
     3. Discussion on Submission.
        1. Discussion on other mechanism that are carrying similar to the information being proposed to be passed.
        2. Discussion on determining just what we are trying to standardize on. Fewer modes is better and do not want duplicate ways to do the same thing. This may be useful and beneficial, but the details to be worked out.
        3. Discussion on RSNI being used predominantly for 20 Mhz.
        4. Concern that this not the right direction.
     4. More work to be done to address the points noted during the discussion. The BlockAck size changing may need more review to ensure it does not cause problem with the hardware folks.
  5. **Completed today’s agenda:**
  6. **Review Upcoming calls agenda**
     1. Sri would prefer next Wednesday for his presentation.
     2. Mark RISON would prefer Wednesday agenda as well.
     3. Mark HAMILTON would like to be on Wednesday agenda as well.
     4. Cancel August 28 telecon.
  7. **Reminder that the IEEE-SA ballot** is open until Sept 4th.
     1. Review comments and determine if you are satisfied with prior comments.
     2. If you change vote to yes, it indicates you are satisfied, if not, please let Dorothy know.
  8. **Adjourned 5:02pm**

**References:**

**Aug 21:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1211-01-000m-2020-august-sept-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0323-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2020.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156-19-000m-revmd-sponsor-ballot-comments.xls>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-13-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0150-17-000m-assorted-crs-revmd-draft-3-0.docx>

**Aug 26:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1211-02-000m-2020-august-sept-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0323-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2020.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0143-02-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4108.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-13-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1167-01-000m-timely-link-quality-feedback.pptx>