IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVmd CRC- Aug 3-7 2020 | | | | |
| Date: 2020-08-03 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This file contains the minutes for the 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecons from August 3rd to August 7th, 2020.

R0: Minutes for Aug 3, 2020

1. **IEEE 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecon Monday, August 03, 2020 15:00-17:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order at 3:04** pm ET by the TG Chair Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
   2. **Review Patent and Participation Policy**
      1. No Issues noted.
   3. **Attendance:** -please log with IMAT:
      1. About 14 attendees reported by WebEx

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Breakout | SA PIN | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
|  | TGmd | 12585 | 8/3 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 53922 | 8/3 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
|  | TGmd | 57126 | 8/3 | Derham, Thomas | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 8114 | 8/3 | Fischer, Matthew | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 11843 | 8/3 | Goodall, David | Morse Micro |
|  | TGmd | 8390 | 8/3 | Kwon, Young Hoon | NXP Semiconductors |
|  | TGmd | 4622 | 8/3 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 61032 | 8/3 | Lindskog, Erik | SAMSUNG |
|  | TGmd | 8193 | 8/3 | Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 61804 | 8/3 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
|  | TGmd | 5030 | 8/3 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 14845 | 8/3 | Smith, Graham | SR Technologies |
|  | TGmd | 2948 | 8/3 | Stanley, Dorothy | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |

* + 1. Missing from IMAT: None reported
  1. Review Agenda 11-20/1001r10:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1001-10-000m-2020-july-august-agendas.docx>
     2. **The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance> ), and patent policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA ([patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.      Patent, Participation and policy related slides: See slides 4-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0323-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2020.pptx>

2.       Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU –

see https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156. Total of 820 comments.

See <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0920-27-000m-802-11revmd-editor-s-report.ppt> .

D3.4 is available and includes resolution approved in May and June motions.

3.       Comment resolution

1. **2020-08-03 Monday 3-5pm Eastern 2 hours**
   1. Edward AU – CID 4162, see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0634-01-000m-resolution-for-gen-cids-4162-4256-4122-and-4102.docx>
   2. Mark HAMILTON
      1. MAC CIDs 4723, 4422, 4154
      2. CIDs 4806, 4805 – prepare reject for insufficient detail if resolution not available
      3. CIDs 4708 and 4709 – prepare reject for insufficient detail if resolution not available
      4. CID 4700
      5. CID 4205 – prepare reject for insufficient detail if resolution not available
      6. CID 4206
      7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1167-00-000m-timely-link-quality-feedback.pptx> and <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1168-00-000m-timely-link-quality-feedback-text.docx>
      8. Prepare reject for insufficient detail if complete resolutions not available: 4135, 4149, 4263, 4353, 4364, 4365, 4379, 4516, 4529, 4557, 4566, 4571, 4574, 4636, 4659, 4744, 4745
   3. Graham SMITH CID 4694 <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0272-12-000m-cids-from-mike-to-graham-2.docx>
   4. Matthew FISCHER – CID 4157, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1778-05-000m-india-ch-167-169-173.pptx>
   5. Mark RISON – CIDs 4229/4266, 4616, 4620, and 4623 for direction, 4808 (re-visit), , see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
   6. Menzo WENTINK – including CIDs 4725, 4143, 4761, 4811 <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0150-17-000m-assorted-crs-revmd-draft-3-0.docx>,
2. **2020-08-04 Tuesday 3-5pm Eastern 2 hours**
   1. Osama ABOUL-MAGD - https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0814-02-000m-proposed-resolutions-to-cids-4145-4146-and-4147.docx
   2. Jon ROSDAHL – GEN CIDs 4458
   3. Mark Hamilton MAC CIDs
   4. Mark Rison – CIDs 4565, 4616, 4620, and 4623 for direction, 4808 (re-visit), 4229/4266, see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
3. **2020-08-05 Wednesday 4-6pm Eastern 2 hours**
   1. Jon ROSDAHL – GEN CIDs
   2. Mark Rison – CIDs 4565, 4616, 4620, and 4623 for direction, 4808 (re-visit), 4229/4266, see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
   3. Gaurav PATWARDHAN - non-AP STA TXOP frame bursting, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1076-01-000m-non-ap-sta-txop-frame-bursting.pptx> and <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1104-01-000m-proposed-changes-in-scs-10-23-2-2-and-10-23-2-9.docx>
4. **2020-08-07 Friday 10 am Eastern 2 hours: Proposed motions, Motion for recirculation**
   1. **Motion – MAC**
   2. **Motion- GEN**
   3. **Motion – PHY**
   4. **Motion – Additional fixes – Remove vestigial occurrences of "DLS" and “PCO” outside the MIB**
      1. **Incorporate the changes indicated in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0150-15-000m-assorted-crs-revmd-draft-3-0.docx**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0150-15-000m-assorted-crs-revmd-draft-3-0.docx) **on page 3, under “CID y” and “CID z” “two issues were found”, pages 3 and 4**
      2. **Moved:**
      3. **Seconded:**
      4. **Result:**
   5. **Motion – Additional fixes – Backoff procedure editing correction**
      1. **Incorporate the changes indicated in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1114-02-000m-revmd-backoff-procedure-correction.docx**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1114-02-000m-revmd-backoff-procedure-correction.docx)
      2. **Moved:**
      3. **Seconded:**
      4. **Result:**
   6. **Motion - Additional CDMG fixes**
      1. **Incorporate the changes indicated in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1136-00-000m-sb1-resolution-to-cid-4763.docx**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1136-00-000m-sb1-resolution-to-cid-4763.docx) **after “two issues were found”, pages 3 and 4**
      2. **Moved:**
      3. **Seconded:**
      4. **Result:**
   7. **Motion – MAC Insufficient detail**
      1. **Announce next set of teleconferences:**

4.       AOB

Review TGmd schedule –

Target D 4.0 in August; D5.0 in September

(August 7th motion for recirculation, August 21 – Editors have draft, 15-20 day recirc, end by September 8. )

Hold several meetings during September plenary for comment resolution.

Sept/early Oct D5.0 WG approval to send to EC for forwarding to RevCom – likely electronic

Sept/Oct – D5.0 Unchanged recirc

6 Oct – 802 EC Approval, Draft TGme PAR (next revision)

13 October – Draft to RevCom

2020 Dec RevCom/SASB

5. Adjourn

* + 1. Review Agenda
    2. No objections to agenda as described.
  1. **Editor Report** Emily QI (Intel)
     1. No changes since Friday.
     2. No Questions
  2. **CID 4162 -** Edward AU (Huawei)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0634-01-000m-resolution-for-gen-cids-4162-4256-4122-and-4102.docx>
     2. CID 4162 (GEN)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review proposed change:
        3. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (GEN: 2020-08-03 19:42:28Z); Incorporate the changes in 11-20/634r1 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0634-01-000m-resolution-for-gen-cids-4162-4256-4122-and-4102.docx>> which makes changes in Table E-5.
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  3. **MAC CIDS –** Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-15-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx>
     2. CID 4723 (MAC)
        1. Not ready for today – move to Tuesday Agenda.
     3. CID 4422 (MAC)
        1. Hold off until we finish Osama’s set of CIDs.
     4. Mark Dropped off…move to Graham’s Document.
  4. **CID 4694** - Graham SMITH (SR Technology)
     1. Review document 11-20/272r12
     2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0272-12-000m-cids-from-mike-to-graham-2.docx>
     3. CID 4694 (MAC)
        1. Review history of submission.
        2. We have reviewed most of the proposed changes already.
        3. P1717.64 D3.0 change to P1707.61 D3.4.
        4. Review changes for P1707.61 and P1721.14 (both in D3.4).
        5. The Changes reviewed are in R13 not in R12.
        6. Needed to have R13 posted
        7. Posted R13, but R14 in display was to catch the changes on the call.
        8. Discussion on proposed changes – final version of the changes to be captured in R14.
        9. Review changes at 1721.14 in D3.4 – Review the two options. Need to change another location to remove an “off the BSS”.
        10. Proposed Resolution: Revised incorporate the changes in R14
        11. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  5. **MAC CIDS –** Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-15-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx>
     2. CID 4422 (MAC)
        1. Waiting on Osama.
        2. If no changes or even if some changes, this may be just an Accept.
        3. Proposed Resolution: Accept
        4. May be some relation to some CIDs in Mark RISON’s submission as well, but he would need to adjust if needed.
        5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4154 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Mark RISON has some changes in bullet A, and this CID is changing the leading sentence.
        3. Related to CID 4365, CID 4364, CID 4574. These three are included in 11-20/435r10.
     4. CID 4806 and 4805 (MAC)
        1. Review comments
        2. Not ready until tomorrow.
     5. CID 4708 and 4709 (MAC)
        1. Review comments.
        2. May need to merge CMMG rules into an earlier clause to clean up some confusion.
        3. More work will need to be done.
        4. This will have to be an Insufficient Detail on these two CIDs.
        5. Proposed resolution: Reject – Insufficient details.
        6. No-objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     6. CID 4700 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review submission discussion.
        3. Proposed resolution: Revised.

Replace the bullet at P1475.29 with:

"The Language Code field contains an ASCII-encoded language code selected from ISO 639, and defines the language used in the Venue Name field. A two-character language code has 0 (ASCII NUL) appended."

Replace the paragraph at P1488.56 with:

"The Language Code field contains an ASCII-encoded language code selected from ISO 639, and defines the language used in the Cost Information field. A two-character language code has 0 (ASCII NUL) appended."

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  1. **Using the MAC CID database:**
     1. CID 4205 and 4206 (MAC)
        1. Look for resolution on Tuesday.
     2. CID 4135 (MAC)
        1. Assigned to Laurent.
        2. Prepare insufficient detail resolution in case no response.
        3. Proposed from Laurent for last Friday.
        4. Mark Ready for Motion – insufficient detail
     3. CID 4149 (MAC)
        1. Prepare for Insufficient Detail.
        2. Mark Ready for Motion – insufficient detail
     4. CID 4529 (MAC)
        1. Prepare for Insufficient Detail.
        2. Mark Ready for Motion – insufficient detail
     5. CID 4571 (MAC)
        1. Prepare for Insufficient Detail.
        2. Mark Ready for Motion – insufficient detail
     6. CID 4636 (MAC) and 4637 (EDITOR)
        1. Prepare for Insufficient Detail.
        2. Mark Ready for Motion – insufficient detail
        3. CID 4637 indicates a document that is not complete was being prepared.
     7. CID 4659 (MAC)
        1. Prepare for Insufficient Detail.
        2. Mark Ready for Motion – insufficient detail
     8. CID 4744 (MAC)
        1. Prepare for Insufficient Detail.
        2. Mark Ready for Motion – insufficient detail
     9. CID 4745 (MAC)
        1. Prepare for Insufficient Detail.
        2. Mark Ready for Motion – insufficient detail
     10. CID 4616 (EDITOR)
         1. Discussion on the need for “Std” when citing standards.
         2. Direction noted that “Std” is needed when talking about a standard.
         3. Prepared for Insufficient Detail.
         4. Mark Ready for Motion – insufficient detail
     11. CID 4620 (EDITOR)
         1. Review Comment
         2. Rejection has been prepared.
         3. Already fixed in D3.4, so no change is necessary.
         4. Please change the resolution to revised and indicate the CID that caused the changes.
         5. Mark Ready for Motion
     12. CID 4623 (EDITOR)
         1. Prepared for Insufficient Detail.
         2. Mark Ready for Motion – insufficient detail
  2. **Review doc 11-20/1167r0** Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1167-00-000m-timely-link-quality-feedback.pptx>
     2. Abstract: A proposal is made to provide transmitters with real-time feedback on the remote peer’s perception of received signal strength.
     3. Review submission.
     4. Proposal: Use a similar immediate and constant feedback, to understand the transmit direction link quality. Note it is Too late to add this to PPDU headers, like DMG did, but, we can add/negotiate additional “BA information” in BlockAck frames, without backward compatibility concerns
     5. Text changes about a page and a half in doc 11-20/1168 r0
        1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1168-00-000m-timely-link-quality-feedback-text.docx>
     6. Belief is minimal changes.
     7. Review proposed changes as described in 11-20/1168r0.
     8. Discussion on possibly similar proposal being discussed in TGbe, but they are looking to use MCS. Why not pass MCS information?
     9. At time.
  3. **CID 4157 –** see doc 11-19/1778r5 - Matthew FISCHER (Broadcom)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1778-05-000m-india-ch-167-169-173.pptx>
     2. CID 4157 (GEN)
        1. Review Comment and the history of the document.
        2. Review changes being proposed.
        3. Discussion on the use of “Operating classes”
        4. Discussion on the changes shown in the underline.
        5. Discussion on the other alternatives in the submission are not part of the CID.
        6. Proposed resolution: Revised; incorporate the changes on slide 5 in document 11-19/1778r5 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1778-05-000m-india-ch-167-169-173.pptx> > which adds the updates to the India Operating Classes.
        7. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  4. **Review doc 11-20/435r10** – Mark RISON (Samsung)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-10-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
     2. CID 4229 (MAC) and 4266 (PHY)
        1. Review comments.
        2. Review submission discussion.
        3. Review proposed changes.
        4. An Alternate proposal see 11-20/1081r0 Sean Coffey (Realtek).
           1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1081-00-000m-operational-rates-and-mcss-8213-revmd-sb1-cid-4229.docx>
           2. Review abstract:

CID 4229 and doc. 11-20/0435r6 propose modifying a note in 11.1.4.6 to add the underlined text:

“NOTE 1—A STA is not required to include all mandatory rates or MCSes in its operational rate or MCS set, respectively”.

and to add a definition for operational MCS set, with some sundry supporting changes.

We should not adopt the proposed resolution, because

Many (most?) STAs are required to include all mandatory MCSs in (the proposed definition of) their operational MCS set, so the addition is incorrect;

Many (most?) STAs are required to include all mandatory rates in their operational rate set, so the note is incorrect.

A separate note in 10.3 is similar but not identical, and 11.1.4.6 proposes extending that note to MCSs also. The applicability of that note is at best limited, since it would not apply for HT or VHT STAs, and its wording needs work anyway. The changes hardly seem worth it, and in any case do not match the comment.

The comment should be rejected.

* + - * 1. This submission proposes a reject resolution:
      1. Proposed resolution: “Rejected. Many (most?) STAs are required to include all mandatory MCSs in (the proposed definition of) their operational MCS set. See 11/20-1081r0 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1081-00-000m-operational-rates-and-mcss-8213-revmd-sb1-cid-4229.docx>>.”
      2. Discussion on what is required or not for supporting Mandatory MCS rates.
      3. Discussion on the fact that the alternate proposal is just to reject CID 4229.
      4. Review the proposed Changes in 11-20/435r10 for the Notes.
      5. Review history of these notes being added during the TGmd process, the NOTE was purported to not be present in TGmc. The NOTE in 10.3.1 was in 802.11-2016. Added via REVmc CID 8171.
      6. One proposal was to just delete the NOTE as they are not normative, and just informative.
      7. Discussion on the Operational Rate Set definition is incorrect and should be updated/corrected.
      8. Discussion on the rational to keep the Notes was given.
      9. Proposal to just leave them as is and not constantly tinker with them.
      10. Need to have a straw poll on these CIDs later in the week.
  1. Reviewed Agenda for tomorrow. Aug 4 – 3-5pm ET
  2. Adjourned 5:03pm

**References:**

**Aug 3rd:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1001-10-000m-2020-july-august-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0323-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2020.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0634-01-000m-resolution-for-gen-cids-4162-4256-4122-and-4102.docx><https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-15-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0272-12-000m-cids-from-mike-to-graham-2.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-15-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1167-00-000m-timely-link-quality-feedback.pptx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1168-00-000m-timely-link-quality-feedback-text.docx>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1778-05-000m-india-ch-167-169-173.pptx>
9. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-10-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
10. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1081-00-000m-operational-rates-and-mcss-8213-revmd-sb1-cid-4229.docx>