IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Proposed resolution for CID 4783 |
| Date: 2020-08-05 |
| Author: |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Edward Au | Huawei Technologies | 303 Terry Fox Drive, Suite 400, Ottawa, Ontario K2K 3J1 |  |  |

##### This submission present a resolution for CID 4783. The proposed changes are based on REVmd/D3.4.

##### Revision history:

##### R0 – initial version

R1 – update based on feedback received during the August 4th CRC call.

R2 – update based on feedback received during the August 5th CRC call.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 4783 | C.3 | 4140 |  | Errors in MIB description: dot11DynamicChannelTransferImplemented appears to be the capability variable, and ...Activated is the status variable. Presumably, an external entity would set this, based on the requirement for DCS per regulations.dot11OpportunisticTransmissionsActivated appears to be a capability variable.dot11CDMGSpatialsharingActivated is never mentioned in body text. It appears to be handled in concept, in 9.4.2.219.3 and 11.31.1, with written out text determining if spatial sharing is supported. Similarly, for dot11CDMGClusteringActivated. | Change "This is a capability variable" to "This is a status variable." Change "Its value is determined by device capabilities." to "Its is written by an external management entity."Change the name "dot11OpportunisticTransmissionsActivated" throughout, to "dot11OpportunisticTransmissionsImplemented"Delete MIB entries for dot11CDMGSpatialsharingActivated and dot11CDMGClusteringActivated. |

***Discussion:***

*First comment of the commenter: dot11DynamicChannelTransferImplemented and dot11DyanmicChannelTransferActivated*

As per the document 15/0355r13, a feature is dynamic or it is not (i.e., static). It cannot be both:

• dot11<XXX>Implemented: A static implementation pattern is for a feature that is an inherent capability of a given implementation. As an “inherent” capability, this pattern is for features that are permanently operational in an instantiation of an implementation that supports it – that is, it is not enabled or disabled dynamically during the lifetime of an instance of the implementation.

• dot11<XXX>Activated: This pattern is for a feature that, when present in an implementation, becomes operational or non-operational dynamically within the lifetime of a particular instance of the implementation. Such dynamic changes occur as a result of behaviors or interactions described within Std 802.11, for example, based on a protocol exchange, or receiving an enablement indication from a peer entity, or as a result of an external entity writing to the MIB attribute. It is critical to unambiguous description of the behavior that only one entity be able to change the attribute, whether that is an internal or external entity.

dot11DynamicChannelTransferImplemented and dot11DynamicChannelTransferActivated are the MIB objects that are used for describing the procedure of the dynamic channel selection for a CDMA STA. Dynamic channel selection is a feature that becomes operational or non-operational dynamically within the lifetime of a particular instance of the implementation.

*Second comment of the commenter: dot11OpportunisticTransmissions Activated*

Opportunitistic transmissions depend on the capability of the CDMG STA. Therefore, it is a capability value and its MIB object is dot11OpportunisticTransmissionsImplemented, rather than dot11OpportunisticTransmissionsActivated.

*Third comment of the commenter: dot11CDMGSpatialsharingActivated*

Agree with the commenter that this MIB object is never mentioned in body text, and the concept is written explicity in subclauses 9.4.228 and 10.41 determining if spatial sharing is supported.

*Last comment of the commenter: dot11CDMGClusteringActivated*

Agree with the commenter that this MIB object is never mentioned in body text, and the concept is written explicity in subclause 10.41 determining if spatial sharing is supported.

***Proposed resolution:***

***Revised***

**To TGmd editors, please make the following change regarding dot11DynamicChannelTransferActivated and dot11DynamicChannelTransferImplemented:**

* please replace “dot11DynamicChannelTransferImplemented” with “dot11DynamicChannelTransferActivated” at 2526.56 and 2527.4 in subclause 11.48.1.
* please delete “dot11DynamicChannelTransferImplemented” from Dot11CDMGSTAConfigEntry at 4147.15.
* as per 19/0040r2, decreprate dot11DynamicChannelTransferImplemented and the corresponding MIB group dot11CDMGComplianceGroup, and create a new MIB group dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1.
* Replace “This is a capability variable. Its value is determined by device capabilities.” with “It is a status variable. It is written by an external management entity” at 4147.60 and 4147.61 for the description of “dot11DynamicChannelTransferActivated”.

**To TGmd editors, please make the following change regarding dot11OpportunisticTransmissionsActivated:**

* please replace “dot11OpportunisticTransmissionsActivated” with “dot11OpportunisticTransmissionsImplemented” at 1661.28 (in Table 9-488), 1990.8 (in subclause 10.39.11), and 4147.20 (in Annex C.3).
* as per 19/0040r2, decreprate dot11OpportunisticTransmissionsActivated and the corresponding MIB group dot11CDMGComplianceGroup, and create a new MIB group dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1.
* add the following to 4148.42:

dot11OpportunisticTransmissionsImplemented OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX TruthValue

 MAX-ACCESS read-only

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "This is a capability variable.

 Its value is determined by device capabilities.

 If dot11OpportunisticTransmissionsImplemented true, the STA is capable of

 supporting opportunistic transmissions."

 DEFVAL { false }

 ::= { dot11CDMGSTAConfigEntry 7 }

* add dot11OpportunisticTransmissionsImplemented to the Dot11CDMGSTAConfigEntry.

**To TGmd editors, please make the following change regarding dot11CDMGSpatialsharingActivated:**

* please delete “dot11CDMGSpatialsharingActivated” from Dot11CDMGSTAConfigEntry at 4147.15.
* as per 19/0040r2, decreprate dot11CDMGSpatialsharingActivated and the corresponding MIB group dot11CDMGComplianceGroup, and create a new MIB group dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1.

**To TGmd editors, please make the following change regarding dot11CDMGClusteringActivated:**

* please delete “dot11CDMGClusteringActivated” from Dot11CDMGSTAConfigEntry at 4147.15.
* as per 19/0040r2, decreprate dot11CDMGClusteringActivated and the corresponding MIB group dot11CDMGComplianceGroup, and create a new MIB group dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1.