IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Resolution for CIDs related to UORA | | | | |
| Date: June 10, 2020 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Chittabrata Ghosh | Intel Corporation |  |  | chittabrata.ghosh@intel.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for following (4) CIDs received for TGax SA Ballot 1:

24018, 24019, 24391, 24392

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.
* Rev 1: Revised the proposed resolution for CIDs 24391 and 24392 based on D6.1

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGax Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGax Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGax Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGax Editor” are instructions to the TGax editor to modify existing material in the TGax draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGax editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGax Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Pg/Ln** | **Section** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 24018 | Chitrakar, Rojan | 363/33 | 26.5.4.2 | RUs that are restricted from operations specified in 27.3.2.8 shall be excluded from an eligible RA-RU if the receiving non-AP STA is a 20 MHz operating non-AP HE STA. However, it is not easy to understand it from "26.5.4.2 Eligible RA-RUs". | Change "... if it supports all the transmit parameters indicated in the Common Info field and in the User Info field that allocates that RU ..." to "... if it is capable to transmit an HE TB PPDU in that RU according to the parameters indicated in the Common Info field and in the User Info field that allocates the RU ..." in the paragraphs of L33-L37 and L39-L43,  Further, add the following note after the paragraph of P363L39-43.  Note - RUs that are restricted from operations specified in 27.3.2.8 shall be excluded from eligible RA-RUs if the STA is a 20 MHz operating non-AP HE STA. | **Accepted** |
| 24019 | Chitrakar, Rojan | 363/59 | 26.5.4.2 | RUs that are restricted from operations specified in 27.3.2.8 shall be excluded from an eligible RA-RU if the receiving non-AP STA is a 20 MHz operating non-AP HE STA. It should be clarified in the calculation for determining the number of eligible RA-RUs. | Change "A non-AP HE STA shall determine the number of eligible RA-RUs in a contiguous set by adding the value carried in the Number Of RA-RU subfields plus one for the User Info field corresponding to an eligible RA-RU." to "A non-AP HE STA shall determine the number of eligible RA-RUs in a contiguous set by adding the value carried in the Number Of RA-RU subfields plus one for the User Info field which allocates at least one eligible RA-RU. If the STA is a 20 MHz operating non-AP HE STA, the STA shall further subtract the number of RUs that are restricted from operations specified in 27.3.2.8." | **Accepted** |
| 24391 | RISON, Mark | 363/19 | 26.5.4.1 | [Resubmission of comment withdrawn on D5.0] "Each time a non-AP HE STA associates with a different AP (or a different BSSID for non-AP STA with  dot11MultiBSSIDImplemented set to true), and prior an initial attempt of RA-RU transmission towards it,  the non-AP STA shall set the value of OCW to the OCWmin value, and shall initialize its OBO counter in  the range 0 to OCW as defined in 26.5.4.3 (Transmission procedure for UORA)." -- this is inadequate, because it basically causes the  non-AP STA to keep resetting to OCWmin | As it says in the comment | **Rejected**  The proposal from the commenter is to delete the quoted text. Deletion of the paragraph might make it difficult to define rules for a non-AP STA to select new OBO values when it decides to respond to a TF from a different AP carrying RA-RUs. If we delete the paragraph, then the spec will lack specifying a value that a STA uses when it responds to a TF with RA-RUs coming from different APs or different APs of a multi-BSS set.  Moreover, the quoted text was revised based on CIDs 24382 and 24383 in document 0318r2 (11-20-0318-02-00ax-resolution-for-cids-related-to-uora.docx) with the following text and is incorporated in the 802.11ax Draft 6.1  Each time a non-AP HE STA associates with a different AP, and prior to the(#22272, #22220) initial attempt of RA-RU transmission towards it, the non-AP STA shall set the value of OCW to the *OCWmin* value, and shall initialize its OBO counter in the range 0 to OCW as defined in 26.5.4.3 (Transmission procedure for UORA).  NOTE – For a non-AP STA with dot11MultiBSSIDImplemented set to true, associating with a different AP includes associating with an AP corresponding to a different BSSID in the same multiple BSSID set. |
| 24392 | RISON, Mark | 363/19 | 26.5.4.1 | [Resubmission of comment withdrawn on D5.0] "Each time a non-AP HE STA associates with a different AP (or a different BSSID for non-AP STA with  dot11MultiBSSIDImplemented set to true), and prior an initial attempt of RA-RU transmission towards it,  the non-AP STA shall set the value of OCW to the OCWmin value, and shall initialize its OBO counter in  the range 0 to OCW as defined in 26.5.4.3 (Transmission procedure for UORA)." -- this is inadequate, because it basically causes the  non-AP STA to keep resetting to OCWmin | Delete ", and prior an initial attempt of RA-RU transmission towards it, " from the cited text | **Rejected**  The proposal from the commenter is to delete the quoted text. Deletion of the paragraph might make it difficult to define rules for a non-AP STA to select new OBO values when it decides to respond to a TF from a different AP carrying RA-RUs. If we delete the paragraph, then the spec will lack specifying a value that a STA uses when it responds to a TF with RA-RUs coming from different APs or different APs of a multi-BSS set. |