IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVmd CRC-March 25 and 27 2020 | | | | |
| Date: 2020-03-25 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the 802.11md – REVmd CRC Telecon for March 25th and 27th

R0: March 25th

R1: March 27th added

1. **IEEE 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecon Wednesday March 25, 2020 16:00-18:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order at 4:05pm** ET by the TG Chair Dorothy STANLEY
   2. **Attendance:** 
      1. IMAT Report:
         1. Adachi, Tomoko TOSHIBA Corporation
         2. Au, Edward (Kwok Shum) Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd
         3. Coffey, John Realtek Semiconductor Corp.
         4. Derham, Thomas Broadcom Corporation
         5. Fischer, Matthew Broadcom Corporation
         6. Hamilton, Mark Ruckus Wireless
         7. Hansen, Christopher Peraso Technologies Incorporated
         8. Levy, Joseph InterDigital, Inc.
         9. Qi, Emily Intel Corporation
         10. RISON, Mark Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre
         11. Rosdahl, Jon Qualcomm Technologies, Inc.
         12. Stanley, Dorothy Hewlett Packard Enterprise
         13. Ward, Lisa Rohde & Schwarz
      2. did not use IMAT
         1. Jonathan Goldberg (IEEE-SA)
   3. **Review Patent Policy and Participant Slides**
      1. No issues noted.
   4. **Review Agenda**
      1. Standard Agenda plus the comment Resolution:
      2. See doc 11-20/234r18
         1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0234-18-000m-2020-jan-mar-teleconference-and-adhoc-agendas.docx>
      3. Comment Resolution:

**2020-03-25 Wednesday – 4:00-6pm Eastern \*\*\*\*\*Teleconference announced with 10 day notice\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*(London is +4)**

1. Chris Hansen/Tomo ADACHI – CID 4041 <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0507-00-000m-cid-4041-resolution.docx>
2. Christopher HANSEN – <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0225-02-000m-cid-4076-draft-text.docx>
3. Andrew MYLES – <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0227>
4. Michael MONTEMURRO – <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2024-04-000m-mac-address-change.docx>
5. Mark Hamilton – MAC CIDs
6. **Motions:**
   1. **Motion 173: Editor CID 4800**

Approve the resolution to CID 4800 included in the “Motion-EDITOR-T” tab in [https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0010-06-000m-revmd-sa1-comments-for-editor-ad-hoc.xls](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__mentor.ieee.org_802.11_dcn_20_11-2D20-2D0010-2D06-2D000m-2Drevmd-2Dsa1-2Dcomments-2Dfor-2Deditor-2Dad-2Dhoc.xls&d=DwMFAg&c=C5b8zRQO1miGmBeVZ2LFWg&r=NTHtA_KHOOrju0kuqznMMhn2PgeiJdiVcWeUfvVgSN4&m=RkeUuVtCTqpQVvj2uRlezmmWYlJ1rtyU9eJgWTtuTy4&s=HpeSKN-xZ22D5BFuQ1rYlvD2DXSQT-iuf2ZzGodl49Y&e=)

**b. Motion 17x: Editor2 CIDs**

Approve comment resolutions included in “Motion-EDITOR2-O” and "Motion-EDITOR2-P" in [https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2160-07-000m-revmd-editor2-standards-association-ballot-comments.xlsx](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__mentor.ieee.org_802.11_dcn_19_11-2D19-2D2160-2D07-2D000m-2Drevmd-2Deditor2-2Dstandards-2Dassociation-2Dballot-2Dcomments.xlsx&d=DwMFaQ&c=C5b8zRQO1miGmBeVZ2LFWg&r=NTHtA_KHOOrju0kuqznMMhn2PgeiJdiVcWeUfvVgSN4&m=D787rEGXDqqzItokcO2K7xS7fNSXmPTEHNEUn412F1E&s=03FAtq6f-LGW8Omt-E0wbbmNyLj-_y4IN-RT8T8j6zw&e=)

**c. Motion 17x: MAC CIDs**

Approve comments included in the "Motion MAC-AM" tab in: [https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0927-57-000m-revmd-mac-comments.xls](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__mentor.ieee.org_802.11_dcn_17_11-2D17-2D0927-2D57-2D000m-2Drevmd-2Dmac-2Dcomments.xls&d=DwMFaQ&c=C5b8zRQO1miGmBeVZ2LFWg&r=NTHtA_KHOOrju0kuqznMMhn2PgeiJdiVcWeUfvVgSN4&m=seC-T-zRC-4jxYyA8oLzvoGhDSz3zJVzeiWfVKNfS9I&s=xumLe91h9BfnJm2-5x0M_dYHiZCDWikrpIhSN268DIw&e=)

* + 1. Changes to Agenda plan: Move Andrew Myles to later in the call
    2. No objection – Approve Agenda as described.
  1. **Editor Report** Emily QI (Intel)
     1. No changes since Friday.
  2. **Review doc 11-20/225r2** Christopher Hansen (Peraso)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0225-02-000m-cid-4076-draft-text.docx>
     2. Abstract: Text changes to add optional 8 PSK MCS 10 and 11 to DMG SC PHY.
     3. CID 4076 (PHY)
     4. Review submission changes.
     5. Discussions on why this was not proposed to 802.11ay
        1. The EDMG PHY is defined in TGay, and the DMG PHY changes need to be done in TGmd.
        2. 8PSK mode is valuable for DMG, so that is why the TGmd was targeted.
        3. If this is a hardware change, then the TGay project may be the right place.
        4. Believe of support for having the changes be done in TGmd from the TGay community.
        5. The advantage of being in TGmd is a timeline benefit.
        6. Precedence is claimed for optional modes in the past.
        7. The 3-month timeframe may be significant.
        8. The TGay task group is trying to close their comments and trying to add this there may not be received well.
        9. 11ay is an amendment to 11md and cannot complete prior to 11md. 11md will be first then 11ax, then 11ay. We may get all three documents approved in the same meeting, so the timing is not a real valid issue.
        10. 11ay chair is happy to have it done in 11md
        11. Concern with getting a chance to provide some technical and editorial feedback.
        12. Data and Management frames are cited, but there should be something for extended frames.
        13. Concern with the “Note” after table 20-15a, and question on where the normative text is provided, and request to change the note to reference that location.
        14. How to spell the mode “8PSK” vs “8-PSK” -- “pi/2” is part of the name and may be difficult to include.
        15. Reschedule a review of changes on Wednesday April 8th Call.
  3. **Review doc 11-19/2024r4** Michael Montemurro (Blackberry)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2024-04-000m-mac-address-change.docx>
     2. CID 4039 (PHY)
     3. Review submission changes
     4. No feedback has been received since this was presented in February.
     5. Discussion –
        1. Missing “primitive” in the names of the primitive is an editorial change that was noted.
        2. “shall attempt to update” phrase is of concern, but no changes were offered.
        3. One solution: “Specifies the MAC address that is to be used by the MAC entity that is being reset”.
     6. R5 will be posted.
     7. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2020-03-25 20:49:39Z) Incorporate the changes in 11-19/2024r5 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2024-05-000m-mac-address-change.docx>> which provide a MAC address change purposes.
     8. Mark Ready for Motion
  4. **Review doc 11-20/507** – Christopher Hansen (Presaro)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0507-00-000m-cid-4041-resolution.docx>
     2. CID 4041 (PHY)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review submission discussion
        3. ATIMs are not useful in IBSS but are used by DMG.
        4. Therefore, a sufficient resolution for this comment is to make sub-clause 11.2.4 obsolete and to place a notice in sub-clause 11.2.8 that power management in IBSS is obsolete.
        5. Propose to only make the change in 11.2.8 with only the first two sentences and not any of the other changes.
        6. Some indicate a notice in 11.2.4 does need to be made.
        7. Put the same sentence proposed for 11.2.8 put into 11.2.4.
        8. Discussion on if 11.2.4.1 introduction that should include deprecate/obsolete.
        9. Discussion on the order of “deprecate” vs “obsolete”.
        10. Typically, the order is “deprecate” first and then “obsolete”.
        11. ACTION ITEM: Dorothy will put a request for Input will be put on the reflector about changing to deprecate vs obsolete
        12. A revision of the document will be made with today’s input and will be reviewed on a future telecon. – Target April 17, 2020 Telecon.
  5. **Review doc 11-20/458** Tomo Adachi (Toshiba)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0458-00-000m-resolution-to-cid-4043.docx>
     2. CID 4043 (EDITOR)
        1. Review the comment
        2. Table 10-8 covers the modulations for 802.11a/b/g/n/ac, but not for 802.11ad/ah/aj.
        3. Updates to the table need to include variable length frame types.
        4. Review proposed changes.
        5. We have a motion #168 which rejected the comment.
        6. Current status of the comment is rejected.
        7. Discussion on the sequence of getting the EIFS. Need to get the wording adjusted to match the intention.
        8. Discussion on how to determine which PPDU fails.
        9. Discussion on how the EIFS is calculated.
        10. The situation is that we have an alternate resolution that needs some more review.
        11. ACTION ITEM: Tomo to review with Menzo and bring back to the CRC.
        12. Propose to bring back on a targeted Telcon – April 17, 2020.
  6. MAC CIDs – Mark Hamilton (Ruckas/Arris)
     1. CID 4376 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accept
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     2. CID 4700 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Discussion on how the proposed change relates to similar changes with Encoding and ASCII cids.
        3. The Three cited sentences seem to include ISO 14962 and ISO 639 references. Rewording the sentences may make it clear.
        4. More research will be done and bring back later.
     3. CID 4234 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. P723.27 is the location of the sentence in error.
        3. Adding “Extension” frames is the major change in this CID.
        4. P889 has the definition for Extension Frames - 9.3.4.
        5. Concern that this may need to be applied to all Extension Frames.
        6. Editor ask that page number and line numbers for where the changes are to be made.
        7. More work to be done.
  7. Motions:
     1. **Motion 173: MAC CIDs**

Approve comments included in the "Motion MAC-AM" tab in: 11-17/0927r57 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0927-57-000m-revmd-mac-comments.xls>>  and for CID 4457, change the text “or a Flow Resumption frames” to “or Flow Resumption Frames”

* + - 1. Moved: Mark RISON
      2. Seconded: Mark HAMILTON
      3. Results: 9-0-1 Motion Passes
    1. **Motion 174: Editor2 CIDs**

Approve comment resolutions included in “Motion-EDITOR2-O” and "Motion-EDITOR2-P" in [https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2160-07-000m-revmd-editor2-standards-association-ballot-comments.xlsx](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__mentor.ieee.org_802.11_dcn_19_11-2D19-2D2160-2D07-2D000m-2Drevmd-2Deditor2-2Dstandards-2Dassociation-2Dballot-2Dcomments.xlsx&d=DwMFaQ&c=C5b8zRQO1miGmBeVZ2LFWg&r=NTHtA_KHOOrju0kuqznMMhn2PgeiJdiVcWeUfvVgSN4&m=D787rEGXDqqzItokcO2K7xS7fNSXmPTEHNEUn412F1E&s=03FAtq6f-LGW8Omt-E0wbbmNyLj-_y4IN-RT8T8j6zw&e=)

Adding to the end of CID 4766 “Note to commenter: The Figure only shows 28 us of symbols (not 32 us) and in any case is not specified as showing the minimum number of symbols in an OFDM PPDU”

* + - 1. Discussion – CID 4766 - The proposed resolution to CID 4766 is missing the important notes to the commenter to the effect that the figure only shows 28 us of symbols (not 32 us) and in any case is not specified as showing the minimum number of symbols in an OFDM PPDU.
      2. Moved: Emily QI
      3. Seconded: Michael MONTEMURRO
      4. Results: No Objection – Unanimous approval – Motion Passes.
  1. Review plan for Friday
  2. Thanks for joining – remember to us IMAT for attendance,
  3. Adjourned 4:02pm ET

**References:**

**March 25:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0234-18-000m-2020-jan-mar-teleconference-and-adhoc-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0225-02-000m-cid-4076-draft-text.docx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2024-04-000m-mac-address-change.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2024-05-000m-mac-address-change.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0507-00-000m-cid-4041-resolution.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0458-00-000m-resolution-to-cid-4043.docx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0927-57-000m-revmd-mac-comments.xls>
8. [https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2160-07-000m-revmd-editor2-standards-association-ballot-comments.xlsx](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__mentor.ieee.org_802.11_dcn_19_11-2D19-2D2160-2D07-2D000m-2Drevmd-2Deditor2-2Dstandards-2Dassociation-2Dballot-2Dcomments.xlsx&d=DwMFaQ&c=C5b8zRQO1miGmBeVZ2LFWg&r=NTHtA_KHOOrju0kuqznMMhn2PgeiJdiVcWeUfvVgSN4&m=D787rEGXDqqzItokcO2K7xS7fNSXmPTEHNEUn412F1E&s=03FAtq6f-LGW8Omt-E0wbbmNyLj-_y4IN-RT8T8j6zw&e=)