IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| DMG Comment Resolutions |
| Date: 2020-05-01 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Christopher Hansen | Covariant Corporation | 1525 Miramonte Avenue, #3956 Los Altos, CA 94024 USA |  | chris@covariantcorp.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

DMG Comment Resolutions for CIDs 4283, 4480, 4486, and 4640

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Line** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 4283 | 1313.00 | 56 | 9.4.2.136 | "that contained the Channel Measurement request"-- no such request. Missing "DCS", I presume | Add "DCS " before "Channel" in the cited text |

**Resolution:** Revise

**Discussion:**

Channel measurements requests are a normal part of beamforming with SSW Feedback frames, SSW Ack frames, and are part of DCS. See .11md D3.2, Clause 10.42.3 General. However, the commenter is correct in that term “Channel Measurement request” is not used. Text can be clarified.

*Instruct the Editor to modify the text in 802.11md D3.2 Clause 9.4.2.136 Channel Measurement Feedback element as shown below:*

The Channel Measurement Feedback element is used to carry the channel measurement feedback in response to a BRP frame, SSW-Feedback frame, or SSW-Ack frame. It may contain data that the STA has measured on the TRN-T (#1025)subfields of the BRP PPDU(#1379) that contained the BRP frame, or a list of sectors identified during a sector sweep or during beam combination (10.42.6.3 (Multiple sector ID capture (MIDC) subphase)), respectively. The format and size of the Channel Measurement Feedback element are defined by the parameter values specified in the accompanying DMG Beam Refinement element.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Line** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 4480 | 2162.00 | 6 | 11.1.4.3.4 | "A STA that receives a Probe Request frame shall not respond if [...] c) The STA is a non-AP STA in an infrastructure BSS". Such a STA does not respond due to the rules in a) above, which mean that only an AP, IBSS STA, mesh STA, DMG STA or PCP responds. Hm, or maybe the "DMG STA" case allows this? This needs to be clearer, then | Change "The STA is a non-AP STA in an infrastructure BSS" to "The STA is a non-AP STA in a DMG infrastructure BSS" |

**Resolution:** Accept

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Line** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 4486 | 2162.00 | 58 | 11.1.4.3.4 | "The STA is a DMG STA that is not a member of a PBSS and that is performing active scan" makes no sense. Why would a scanning DMG STA respond to probe requests? | Delete list item 4) |

**Resolution:**  Revise

**Discussion:**

See .11md D3.2 Clause 11.1.4.3.3. Scanning DMG STAs may send both probe requests and probe response as described in the text on P2150L44, P2151L13 and as shown in Figure 11-6. Multiple DMG STAs may scan simultaneously and both transmit and respond to probe requests. However, the text would benefit from clarification.

*Instruct the Editor to Modify 802.11md D3.2 Clause 11.1.4.3.3 as follows:*

P2151L22 Change: “See Figure 11-6 (Active scanning for DMG STAs) for DMG STAs that generate DMG Beacon frames with the Discovery Mode field set to 1.” to “See Figure 11-6 (Active scanning for DMG STAs) for DMG STAs that generate DMG Beacon frames with the Discovery Mode field set to 1, where STA A and STA B are actively scanning at the same time and STA B is not a member of a PBSS. STA A may or may not be a member of a PBSS”

P2151L11 mmediately before step h) insert an extra step:

g') Respond with a probe response to any probe request received, subject to the conditions in 11.1.4.3.4 (Criteria for sending a response).

NOTE—The requirement to respond with a probe response also applies to a non-AP non-PCP DMG STA

that is not a member of a PBSS.

*Instruct the Editor to Modify 802.11md D3.2 Clause 11.1.4.2.2 as follows:*

At the end of 11.1.4.2.2 Passive scanning for DMG STAs add a new paragraph:

NOTE—Unlike a DMG STA that is actively scanning and that is not a member of PBSS (see 11.1.4.3.3),

a DMG STA that is passively scanning does not respond to probe requests (see 11.1.4.3.4).

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Line** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 4640 | 1298.00 | 30 | 9.4.2.127.4 | "the maximum time allowed to return beam tracking feedback to an initiator before it will beconsidered invalid" -- it is not clear what "it" refers to here. It's not the feedback, because it hasn't been returned | As it says in the comment |

**Resolution:** Revise

**Discussion:**

In .11md D3.2 Clause 9.4.2.127.4, dot11BeamTrackingTimeLimit does refer the feedback and is the maximum elapsed time allowed for the feedback data to be considered valid. However, better wording for the draft text is possible.

*Instruct the Editor to modify the text in 802.11md D3.2 Clause 9.4.2.127.4* *DMG STA Beam Tracking Time Limit field as shown below.*

The DMG STA Beam Tracking Time Limit field contains the value of dot11BeamTrackingTimeLimit. This field indicates the maximum time between a request for beam tracking feedback and the feedback response, such that the response will be consideredvalid. This use of this field is discussed in 10.42.7 (Beam tracking).