IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Resolution for CIDs related to UORA |
| Date: March 15, 2020 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Abhishek Patil | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | appatil@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |
| George Cherian | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | gcherian@qti.qualcomm.com |

 Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for following (4) CIDs received for TGax SA Ballot 1:

24164, 24026, 24382, 24383

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGax Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGax Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGax Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGax Editor” are instructions to the TGax editor to modify existing material in the TGax draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGax editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGax Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Pg/Ln** | **Section** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 24164 | Kandala, Srinivas | 119.09 | 9.3.1.22.1 | The sentence states that if there is at least one User Info in the Trigger frame then a broadcast address needs to be used. It seems to me that a broadcast address only makes sense if there are more than one User Info field, else one could use the unicast address (as in the immediately preceding item). This is probably editorial but currently classifying as Technical | Clarify why "at least one" is used instead of "more than one" or replace "at least one" with "more than one" | **Rejected**The sentence refers to a trigger frame carrying at least one RA RU (for associated or unassociated STAs). In such case, any associated STA that is not the recipient of a directed RU should be able to participate in UORA to use the allocated RA-RU. Further, an unassociated STA would parse the trigger frame directed to broadcast address to see if carries RA-RUs for unassociated STAs. Therefore the frame is transmitted with broadcast address. |
| 24026 | Fang, Yonggang | 363.15 | 26.5.4.1 | A HE STA may have two possible ways to access to the media: regular EDCA and UORA. Each access needs to maintain its own access parameters, which causes extra overhead via transmitting those parameters over the air. In addition, it may cause the fairness concern between the legacy STA and the HE STA as the HE STA has more chances to access to the media. No matter EDCA or UORA, the HE STA should be able to use the same set parameters to access to the media. | Proposed text change :"A non-AP HE STA that does not receive a UORA Parameter Set element from the AP with which it intends to communicate shall set the OCWmin to CWmin and OCWmax to CWmax as default values, and use them if contending for RA-RUs allocated by that AP." | **Rejected**There is no fairness concern for legacy because the HE STAs are responding to a Trigger frame sent by another HE STAs (the AP), which has gained a TXOP. |
| 24382 | RISON, Mark | 363.19 | 26.5.4.1 | [Resubmission of comment withdrawn on D5.0] "Each time a non-AP HE STA associates with a different AP (or a different BSSID for non-AP STA with dot11MultiBSSIDImplemented set to true)" -- the parenthesis is unclear/confusing, since the APs in a multi-BSSID context are different APs by definition | Delete the parenthesis | **Accepted****TGax editor, please implement the change as suggested by the comment.****“**Each time a non-AP HE STA associates with a different AP or a different BSSID for non-AP STA with dot11MultiBSSIDImplemented set to true**”** |
| 24383 | RISON, Mark | 363.19 | 26.5.4.1 | [Resubmission of comment withdrawn on D5.0] "Each time a non-AP HE STA associates with a different AP (or a different BSSID for non-AP STA with dot11MultiBSSIDImplemented set to true)" -- the parenthesis is unclear/confusing, since the APs in a multi-BSSID context are different APs by definition | Delete the parenthesis and add a "NOTE---Associating with a different AP includes associating to a different BSSID in a multiple BSSID set, for a non-AP STA withdot11MultiBSSIDImplemented set to true." | **Accepted****TGax editor, please implement the change as suggested by the comment.****“**Each time a non-AP HE STA associates with a different AP or a different BSSID for non-AP STA with dot11MultiBSSIDImplemented set to trueNOTE – Associating with a different AP includes associating to a different BSSID in a multiple BSSID set, for a non-AP STA with dot11MultiBSSIDImplemented set to true.**”** |