IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| SA ballot comment resolution |
| Date: 2020-01-14 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Solomon Trainin | Qualcomm |  |  | strainin@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Alecsander Eitan | Qualcomm |  |  | eitana@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Assaf Kasher | Qualcomm |  |  | akasher@qti.qualcomm.com |

Abstract

Resolution of SA ballot comments CIDs 6113, 6114, 6110, 6111, 6112

| **CID** | **Page** | **Sub-clause** | **Line #** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution**  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6110 | 386 | 11.37.3  | 24 | "Issue an MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.indication primitive" The ResultCode is not defined for the case | Define value of the ResultCode | Revised, see below in the document  |
| 6111 | 94 | 9.2.4.5.4 | 1 | Wrong term "non-MPDU" | Replace by "non-A-MPDU" | Accept |
| 6112 | 131 | 9.4.2.142.6 | 28 | "This statistic is reset when the reset condition defined below in this subclause is met." The sentence and the following text that defines the reset conditions are not suitable for the Frame formats clause and shall be moved to the behavioral clause. | P130L23, P130L35, P131L5, P131L28, P131L53, P131L40, P132L24, P132L28. Remove sentence that starts with "This statistic is reset when the reset condition…"P132L7 change as follows: "The reset condition of the statistics is defined as follows:" Move the text from P132L7 till end of the subclause to the subclause 10.44.5 TDD link maintenance on P354L3. | Accept |
| 6113 | 245 | 10.26.11.5 | 14 | Text that starts with "For each unsolicited block ack extension agreement, the recipient…" and ends with "... the NextExpectedSequenceNumber for that unsolicited block ack extension agreement, then the MPDU shall be passed up to the next MAC process." is not needed. The NextExpectedSequenceNumber was formerly used in the IEEE Std 802.11-2016 and is not used anymore. The normative behavior of unsolicited block ack is fully defined in the current text and another variable is not needed. The commented text contains a lot of errors like "MSDU Starting Sequence Number subfield of the BAR Information field of the ADDBA Request frame that established the unsolicited block ack extension agreement." There is no such subfield, and the ADDBA request is not used to establish the unsolicited block ack extension agreement. I propose to remove the text. | Remove the text | Revised, see below in the document |
| 6114 | 364 | 11.1.7 | 10 | "The Clock Attributes field in the TDD Synchronization element of that frame scores better than .." it is unclear which of the two frames this applies to. | Change as follows: "The Clock Attributes field in the TDD Synchronization element of that last frame scores better than …"  | Accept |

CID 6110

Discussion. The MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.indication primitive is used by the responder in two different conditions, first to indicate receiving of the TDD sector switch request message and second to indicate receiving of the TDD sector switch acknowledge message. Use of “indication” is relevant for the first case at beginning of the sector switch procedure but in the second case use of the MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.confirm primitive is more suitable because of the primitive signals completion of the procedure. The proposal is to change use of the primitives as discussed. In this case, there is no need of the ResultCode in the MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.indication primitive.

***TGay editor change as follows:***

P21L20

remove ResultCode

P72L1

Remove the row in the Table

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ResultCode  | Enumeration  | SUCCESS, FAILURE  | Indicates the result of the TDD sector switch procedure, i.e., SUCCESS in case new sectors were adopted successfully and FAILURE otherwise.  |

P387L9

Replace

MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.indication by MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.confirm

P387L25

Replace

MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.indication by MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.confirm

P387L39

Replace

MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.indication by MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.confirm

P388L6

**Figure 11-58c – TDD sector switch procedure**

In the arrow that follows “Announce with TDD Sector Switch Acknowledge message” replace MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.indication by MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.confirm

In the arrow that follows “Any PPDU” replace MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.indication by MLME-TDD-SECTOR-SWITCH.confirm

CID 6113

Discussion. The justification of the text change is: Remove the text that describe the behavior of NextExpectedSequenceNumber as this variable is not needed for HT Immediate block ack extension in which the Unsolicited block ack extent, as in the comment because of the following explanation:

The unsolicited block ack behavior for reorder receive buffer is the same as defined 10.25.6.6 which the first paragraph under 10.25.11.5 indicates after (1) and in particular the following behaviors of the HT Immediate block ack are applicable and part of the Unsolicited block ack extension.

* + 1. “10.25.6.6.2 Operation for each received Data frame” and
		2. “10.25.6.6.3 Operation for each received BlockAckReq”

The reference in the section 10.25.11.5 paragraph that start with “The receive reordering buffer control… is wrong and shall be replaced by 10.25.6.6.

***TGay editor change as follows:***

**10.25.11.5 Receive reordering buffer control operation**

P245L14

Remove the text that starts with "For each unsolicited block ack extension agreement, the recipient…" and ends with "... the NextExpectedSequenceNumber for that unsolicited block ack extension agreement, then the MPDU shall be passed up to the next MAC process."

P245L3

Replace 10.25.6.5 by 10.25.6.6

**References:**

1. IEEE P802.11ay/D5.0, October 2019