IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVmd - Jan 10-2020 | | | | |
| Date: 2020-01-10 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Michael Montemurro | BlackBerry | 4701 Tahoe Blvd, Mississauga, ON. Canada L4W0B4 | +1 289-261-4183 | [mmontemurro@blackberry.com](mailto:mfischer@broadcom.com) |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003-9036 | +1 801 376 5435 | jrosdahl@ieee.org |

Abstract

Minutes for the 2020-01-10 802.11md (REVmd) CRC telecon.

1. **802.11md – REVmd – CRC – Telecon, Friday 10 January 2020, 10:00-12:00 ET**
   1. **Call to Order** at 10:04am ET by the TG Chair, Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
   2. **Attendance:**
      1. Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
      2. Edward AU (Huawei)
      3. Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
      4. Michael MONTEMURRO (Blackberry)
      5. Graham SMITH (SR Technologies)
      6. Lili HERVIEU (Cablelabs)
      7. Emily QI (Intel)
      8. Jouni MALINEN (Qualcomm)
      9. Mark RISON (Samsung)
      10. Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
   3. Patent Policy review and Call for Essential Patents
      1. None given
   4. Review of Agenda (posted to the IEEE 802.11 reflector)
   * Call to order, attendance, and patent policy
     + Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:
     + Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA ([patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)); or
     + Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
     + Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents
   * If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair
   * b.      Policy reminders, see slides 9-11 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2134-00-000m-2020-january-tgmd-agenda.pptx>
   * 2. Status and Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU; see the comment spreadsheet, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156-00-000m-revmd-sponsor-ballot-comments.xls>  
     3. Comment resolution
   * (a) Edward AU - <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2163-03-000m-resolutions-for-some-initial-sa-ballot-comments-on-11md-d3-0.docx>
   * (b) Edward AU - <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2160-03-000m-revmd-editor2-standards-association-ballot-comments.xlsx>
   * 4. AOB, Plans for the 2020 January session, see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2134-00-000m-2020-january-tgmd-agenda.pptx> .  
     5. Adjourn
     1. Agenda is approved without objection.
   1. Editor Report – no updates
   2. Comment Resolution primary focus of the telecon.
   3. **Editor Comments – Edward AU** – doc 11-19/2160r3
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2160-03-000m-revmd-editor2-standards-association-ballot-comments.xlsx>
      2. Incorporating comments received from reflector
      3. Call for comments on the remaining 85 comments.
      4. The plan is to make a motion to approve the resolutions during a session on Thursday next week.
      5. CID 4748 moved to PHY and assigned to Mark Rison
      6. CID 4393 moved to MAC and assigned to Mark Rison.
   4. **Selected Editor comments** – Edward Au – doc 11-19/2163r3
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2163-03-000m-resolutions-for-some-initial-sa-ballot-comments-on-11md-d3-0.docx>
      2. CID 4769 (EDITOR2)
         1. CID 4769 (EDITOR2): Revised. Incorporate changes as shown in 11-19/2163r3 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2163-03-000m-resolutions-for-some-initial-sa-ballot-comments-on-11md-d3-0.docx), which makes the changes proposed, and also moves the associated comma.
         2. Ready for Motion
      3. CID 4478 (EDITOR2)
         1. CID 4478 (EDITOR2): Revised. Incorporate changes as shown in 11-19/2163r3 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2163-03-000m-resolutions-for-some-initial-sa-ballot-comments-on-11md-d3-0.docx) for CID 4478, which accomplishes the changes as proposed.
         2. Ready for Motion
      4. CID 4195 (EDITOR2)
         1. There is no style convention for field names therefore we should reject this comment.
         2. CID 4195 (EDITOR2): Rejected. Spurious underscores are not spurious because it is part of the name of the Peer Tx\_Sector ID subfield.
         3. Ready for Motion.
      5. CID 4497 (EDITOR2)
         1. The peer key enabled field cannot be marked reserved because it is used in TDLS.
         2. In the definition for RSNA key management, “PeerKey” should be replaced with TDLS Peer Key and consideration needs to be given to the AP Peer Key.
         3. These changes required significantly more review since we have to preserve TDLS Peer Key
         4. Move comment to PHY and assign the comment to Edward Au
      6. CID 4141 (EDITOR2)
         1. The draft cannot include a reference to a draft standard (IEEE 802.11ah D1.3).
         2. The text is not a reference – it’s a fact.
         3. Change “802.11ah” to “P802.11ah” and add a “the” before “IEEE”.
         4. Pending review of the cited draft reference with the IEEE 802 editor, the comment will be marked ready for motion and an announcement will be posted to the reflector.
      7. CID 4335 (EDITOR2)
         1. The comment suggested removing the hyphen. The term we are defining is MS.
         2. There are a number of occurrences of hyphenated SAPs in clause 4 and annex R that may be reviewed.
         3. There may be comments on MAC-SAP and PHY-SAP to remove the hyphens.
         4. CID 4336 and CID 4334 address the other hyphenated terms.
         5. The use of these terms in Clause 4 is inconsistent with the remainder of the specification.
         6. There is no objection to replacing the hyphen with a space.
         7. Assign CID 4334 and CID 4335 to EDITOR2
         8. CID 4334 and CID 4335 have been accepted.
         9. CID 4335 (EDITOR2) Accepted.
         10. Ready for Motion
         11. CID 4334 (EDITOR) Accepted.
         12. Ready for Motion
         13. CID 4336 (EDITOR) Accepted.
         14. Ready for Motion.
      8. CID 4517 (EDITOR2)
         1. We have discussed this issue before.
         2. CID 1280 and CID 2489 brings up this issue. We decided to leave SC – Sequence counter is the name of the field and restricted to that subclause.
         3. Sc is used as a variable name in clause 12.4.8.5.2.
         4. Edward will craft a rejection reason.
      9. CID 4398 (EDITOR2) and CID 4397 (EDITOR2)
         1. Proposed resolution for CID 4398:
         2. Accepted.
         3. Ready for Motion
         4. Proposed resolution for CID 4397:
         5. Revised. Replace “iff” with “if” at 2802.54, 2802.55, and 2802.56 in Draft 3.0.
         6. Ready for Motion
      10. CID 4273 (EDITOR2)
          1. The table is normative.
          2. CID 4273 (EDITOR2): Revised.
          3. Delete the sentence “The RSNE shall be present only if dot11RSNAActivated is true” at 2746.40, 2747.6, 2747.33, and 2748.34.
          4. Delete the sentence “The FTE shall be present only if dot11RSNAActivated is true” are located at 2746.55, 2747.19, 2747.46, and 2748.47.
          5. Ready for Motion
      11. CID 4219 (EDITOR2)
          1. There’s a case to be made for the formula in equation 10.18. However the second is written more like text. It would be better to use the first as a shape.
          2. In 1.5, the bracket notation can only be used for the single parameter form. The expression in 10.18 is the multiple parameter form so there is no equation operator.
          3. The Editor preference is to use Ceil.
          4. The line 44 item was not marked as an equation.
          5. Edward to prepare a rejection reason based on the discussion.
      12. CID 4257 (EDITOR2)
          1. Deprecated or obsolete features are not maintained.
          2. For medium occupancy limit, we removed text that describes what the parameter does. This text was mistakenly deleted.
          3. CID 4257 (EDITOR2) Rejected. Generally, features that are marked deprecated or obsolete are not maintained. PCF is obsolete.
          4. Ready for Motion.
      13. CID 4634 (EDITOR2)
          1. CID 4478 (EDITOR2): Revised. In Figure 10-99, replace “data frame” with “Data frame”, and “Pre-determined time” with “Predetermined time”..
          2. Ready for Motion
      14. CID 4428 (EDITOR2)
          1. There is a WinEndB and WinStartB in the subclause. Mark Hamilton will check to see of the changes are consistent with the remainder of the text.
      15. Chair asks Jouni to look at the changes to CID 4324.
      16. CID 4111 (EDITOR2)
          1. The resolution to this comment may be related to resolution to CID 4202
          2. The editorial guidelines specify that all words in a field name are capitalized.
          3. There was a general comment on this and the action is to go to the Editors meeting to discuss this.
          4. Edward AU to propose a resolution based on editor discussion.
      17. CID 4384 (EDITOR2)
          1. The DATA (PDU) field needs the greater than or equal to octet.
          2. There is no convention for whether a figure is bolded or not.
          3. CID 4384 (EDITOR2) Accepted.
          4. Ready for Motion
   5. **AoB. Plans for 2020 Session.**
      1. Review submissions and agenda for next week.
      2. Add PHY comment review to Wednesday PM2
   6. **Adjourn 10:03am ET.**

**References:**