IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| **TGba D3.0 Comment Resolutions for Data Field** |
| **Date:** 2019-07-15 |
| **Author(s):** |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name** | **Affiliation** | **Address** | **Phone** | **Email** |
| Eunsung Park | LG Electronics | 19, Yangjae-daero 11gil, Seocho-gu, Seoul 137-130, Korea  |   | esung.park@lge.com |
| Jinsoo Choi |  | js.choi@lge.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for comments of TGba D3.0 with the following 4 CIDs:

* 3086, 3292, 3293, 3294

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGba D3.0 Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGba D3.0 Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGba Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGba Editor” are instructions to the TGba editor to modify existing material in the TGba draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGba editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGba Draft.***

#### *CIDs 3086, 3292, 3293, 3294*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **PP.LL** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3086 | 29.9.1 | 118.11 | "A WUR AP shall not send a WUR Wake-up frame with HDR to associated WUR non-AP STA(s) that does not support HDR..." That seems sort of obvious, but the bigger question is why have HDR and LDR? What is the real benefit of having two rates? I can't imagine that there is anything major wrt speed or power save. It requires extra bits and rules such as this one. I suspect you will resist deleting this two data rate feature but I would be very interested to see if you really can justify it. | Unless you can spell out real benefit, get rid of the HDR and LDR feature and just settle on one fixed rate. Then go backand simplify the bits and text associated with this. | Rejected-First of all, LDR isnecessary to meet the range requirement of 11ba, i.e., LDR guarantees the same range as the primary connectivity radio. Also, LDR can be used for sending WUR data to the STAs which have a poor link condition, e.g., STAs located in the BSS edge. But, LDR has a 16us long symbol length and it is too much burden and waste for STAs which have good link quality, e.g., STAs located near the AP. In addition, too lengthy symbol time causes high power consumption as well as low throughput. Note that one of the objectives of 11ba is low power consumption. By using HDR, throughput and power consumption can be further improved. Hence, TGba decided to use both LDR and HDR. |
| 3292 | 30.3.5.8 | 145.7 | The sentence "The output of WUR encoder determines whether to take samples from On-WG or Off-WG, depending on the WUR\_DATARATE." is in accurate. Wheter to take samples from On-WG or Off-WG should depend on the output of the WUR encoder only, not on the WUR\_DATARATE. If it is the case, how it would depend on WUR\_DATARATE should be specified. | Change the sentence to "The output of WUR encoder determines whether to take samples from On-WG or Off-WG". | Accepted- |
| 3293 | 30.3.5.8 | 145.8 | There is no need to mention "The samples in Off-WG have zero energy". The last sentence of page 139 and 140 has clear description. | Remove "The samples in Off-WG have zero energy" | Accepted- |
| 3294 | 30.3.5.8 | 145.11 | Windowing is an implementation dependent operation. As long as the requirements in the Tx specficiation are met, either windowing or filtering can be applied. Suggest remove this sentence. | Remove this sentence. | Rejected-To meet the TX specification, a procedure needs to be specified for the waveform generation. Windowing is one of the methods and baseline spec also specifies this procedure in the PPDU encoding process. |

*TGba Editor: Please make the following changes in 145.8 of D2.1:*

b) The output of WUR encoder determines whether to take samples from On-WG or Off-WG. (#3292)(#3293)