IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| 802.11ba Teleconference Minutes June/July 2019 |
| Date: 29-04-19 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Leif Wilhelmsson | Ericsson AB | Mobilvägen 1, 22632 Lund, Sweden | +46-706-216956 | leif.r.wilhelmsson@ericsson.com |

Abstract

This document contains minutes from TG 802.11ba teleconference in June/July 2019.

Rev 0: Minutes for TG 802.11ba teleconference on 24th of June 2019.

Rev 1: Minutes for TG 802.11ba teleconference on 1st of July 2019 added + some typos corrected.

Rev 2: Minutes for TG 802.11ba teleconference on 8th of July 2019 added + some typos corrected.

Rev 3: Errors in the text related to CIDs 3201 and 3158 are corrected.

**Teleconference on Monday, June 24, 2019, 10:00 –12:00 am (ET)**

**Agenda:**

1. Call meeting to order
2. Agenda setting
3. Patent policy (link at the end of the email)
4. Attendance: send email to the chair or secretary (leif.r.wilhelmsson@ericsson.com)
5. LB241 result review

6. Comment classification and assignment (Po-Kai Huang)
    - <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1020-00-00ba-comment-classification-for-draft-3-0.pptx>
7. Adjourn

Please note that teleconferences are bound by the conditions stipulated by the documentation below.  Please review them and bring up any questions/concerns you may have before proceeding with the teleconference:

IEEE Patent Policy - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>
Patent FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/faq.pdf>
LoA Form - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/loa.pdf>
Affiliation FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliationFAQ.html>
Anti-Trust FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/resources/antitrust-guidelines.pdf>
Ethics - <http://www.ieee.org/portal/cms_docs/about/CoE_poster.pdf>
IEEE 802.11 Working Group Operations Manual –
<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/09/11-09-0002-16-0000-802-11-operations-manual.doc>

The conduct of this meeting is governed by IEEE, IEEE-SA and IEEE LMSC policies, which include:
- IEEE Patent Policy
- Ethics
- 802 LMSC P&P
- 802LMSC Operations Manual (OM) Links to the documents or web-pages describing the policies may be found here: <http://www.ieee802.org/11/Rules/rules.shtml>.
The following documents provide additional information on the governing IEEE-SA policies:
- Patent FAQ (<http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/patents.pdf>)
- Affiliation FAQ (<http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliation.html>)
- Anti-Trust FAQ (<http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/antitrust.pdf>)
In addition, the conduct of this meeting is governed by IEEE 802.11 Operations Manual (OM), which is also linked from here: <http://www.ieee802.org/11/Rules/rules.shtml>.

1. **Chair Minyoung Park (Intel) calls the meeting to order at 10:03 am (ET).**
2. Minyoung goes through the proposed agenda and asks it there are any questions or additional items that should be added. No questions asked so the proposed agenda will be used.
3. Minyoung reminds about the IEEE patent policy and directs people to the links provided in the call in case of questions about the IEEE 802 and 802.11 Policy and Procedure.
4. Minyoung reminds about attendance.
5. Minyoung goes through the email sent out by Dorothy which summarizes the results of LB241. Of the 40 disapprove votes, 10 were carried over. Minyoung has sent an email to these and asked whether they still disapprove or if the resolutions in the last f2f would satisfy their concern. 4 has responded saying they are satisfied, so the approval rate can be viewed as slightly higher than the reported 85.2%.

The intention is to have resolved all comments in the September meeting.

**11-19/1020r1 “Comment Classification for Draft 3.0”, Po-Kai Huang (Intel):** Po-Kai goes through how he has classified and assigned the received comments on D3.0. The same approach as for earlier drafts is taken, i.e., the comments are group based on topic and a Point of Contact (PoC) is assigned in case more than one person is assigned for a group. If someone is interested in working on a comment, that person is encouraged to contact the PoC. Po-Kai has assigned the same person as has dealt with the corresponding comments previously.

Po-Kai asks if there are any questions on the procedure. No question from the group.

* MAC Intro: Minyoung
* WUR Capability Element: Suhwook?

Since there are relatively few persons on the call, Minyoung suggests that Po-Kai send out an email with the classification of the assignments of the comments.

Question (Q): What does WUR xxx channel refer to?

Answer (A): It relates to a new section that we created based on some comment we received in last meeting. Minyoung volunteers to take care of the corresponding comments.

Menzo is added to the comment group Protected WUR Frames

Joe Levy express that he is happy to help out with architectural questions if found helpful.

Q: There are a lot of commentss from Marc Emmelmann saying that his comments did not get enough time. I wonder if we can use some of the teleconference for these.

A: We will stick to the comment resolution procedure, unless the group has a different opinion. We are following the procedure, and it is up to the commenter to ensure that the comment is clear. If it not clear for the person resolving, that person should contact the commenter. If there is a request to add this to the agenda I will add this to the agenda, but I will not add this to the agenda myself.

Minyoung will send out a request for comment resolutions for the next telco.

1. **Meeting is adjourned at 10.57 am (ET).**

**List of Attendees:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Minyoung Park | Intel |
| 2 | Leif Wilhelmsson | Ericsson |
| 3 | Po-Kai Huang | Intel |
| 4 | Joseph Levy | Interdigital |
| 5 | Jae Seung Lee | ETRI |
| 6 | Vinod Kristem | Intel |
| 7 | Yunsong Yang | Huawei |
| 8 | Steve Shellhammer | Qualcomm |
| 9 | Eunsung Park | LGE |
| 10 | Jason Guo | Huawei |

**Teleconference on Monday, July 1, 2019, 5:00 –7:00 pm (ET)**

**Agenda:**

1. Call meeting to order
2. Agenda setting
3. Patent policy (link at the end of the email)
4. Attendance: send email to the chair or secretary (leif.r.wilhelmsson@ericsson.com)
5. Presentations:

- 19/1049r0 Comment Resolution for WUR Beacon and Synchronization (Po-Kai Huang, Intel)

- 19/1059 MAC-CR-Clause 11 (Alfred Asterjadhi (Qualcomm Inc.))

- 19/1058 MAC-CR-clause 29.5 and 29.9 (Alfred Asterjadhi (Qualcomm Inc.))

- 19/1057 Real clause 4 (Alfred Asterjadhi (Qualcomm Inc.))

- 19/1056 MAC-CR-clause 4 (Alfred Asterjadhi (Qualcomm Inc.))

-  19/1052r0 CR for Wake-up Operation (Po-Kai Huang, Intel)

- 19/1050r0 CR for WUR Duty Cycle (Po-Kai Huang, Intel)
6. Adjourn

Please note that teleconferences are bound by the conditions stipulated by the documentation below.  Please review them and bring up any questions/concerns you may have before proceeding with the teleconference:

IEEE Patent Policy - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>
Patent FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/faq.pdf>
LoA Form - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/loa.pdf>
Affiliation FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliationFAQ.html>
Anti-Trust FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/resources/antitrust-guidelines.pdf>
Ethics - <http://www.ieee.org/portal/cms_docs/about/CoE_poster.pdf>
IEEE 802.11 Working Group Operations Manual –
<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/09/11-09-0002-16-0000-802-11-operations-manual.doc>

The conduct of this meeting is governed by IEEE, IEEE-SA and IEEE LMSC policies, which include:
- IEEE Patent Policy
- Ethics
- 802 LMSC P&P
- 802LMSC Operations Manual (OM) Links to the documents or web-pages describing the policies may be found here: <http://www.ieee802.org/11/Rules/rules.shtml>.
The following documents provide additional information on the governing IEEE-SA policies:
- Patent FAQ (<http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/patents.pdf>)
- Affiliation FAQ (<http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliation.html>)
- Anti-Trust FAQ (<http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/antitrust.pdf>)
In addition, the conduct of this meeting is governed by IEEE 802.11 Operations Manual (OM), which is also linked from here: <http://www.ieee802.org/11/Rules/rules.shtml>.

1. **Chair Minyoung Park (Intel) calls the meeting to order at 5:02 pm (ET).**
2. Minyoung goes through the proposed agenda and asks if there are any questions or comments. No questions or comments received so the proposed agenda will be used.
3. Minyoung reminds about the IEEE patent policy and ask if there are any questions with respect to this. No questions asked.
4. Minyoung reminds about attendance.
5. Presentations:

**11-19/1049r0, “Comment Resolution for WUR Beacon and Synchronization”, (Po-Kai Huang, Intel):** This submission proposes resolutions for comments of TGba Draft D3.0 with the following CIDs: 3042, 3076, 3146, 3246, 3363, 3364

CID 3042: Question/Comment (Q): I believe this one can be rejected, referring to that it is described in 30.1.

Q: I believe this is not the right place to put the description.

As a result the resolution is updated to refer to 29.2 instead of 30.1, and the corresponding text is added to 29.2.

There was also a discussion whether Discovery Operating Class Field should be updated to Subfield. Po-Kai will look into this, but need to check so that such a change would not lead to any inconsistency in the document.

CID 3076: No discussion.

CID 3146: No discussion.

CID 3246: Q: I believe you always have a valid Transmitter ID by definition. As a result of this comment the resolution is changed from Accepted to Revised.

CID 3363: No discussion.

CID 3364: No discussion.

Document 11-19/1049r1 will be ready for motion.

**11-19/1056r1,” Comment resolutions for clause 4”, Alfred Asterjadhi (Qualcomm):** This submission proposes resolutions for multiple comments related to TGba D2.0 with the following CIDs (12 CIDs):

* 3113, 3136, 3139, 3143, 3147, 3161, 3162, 3163, 3350, 3351, 3352, 3353

CID 3113: No discussion.

CID 3136: Q: Note that the comment refers to the abbreviation table not to the text. Some discussion about what is allowed for an abbreviation. The resolution remained at least partly based on that there are other examples of abbreviations following he same approach.

CID 3139: No discussion.

CID 3143: No discussion.

CID 3147: No discussion.

CID 3161: No discussion.

CID 3162: No discussion.

CID 3163: No discussion.

CID 3350: No discussion.

CID 3351: No discussion.

CID 3352: No discussion.

CID 3353: No discussion.

Document 11-19/1056r1 is ready for motion.

**11-19/1057r0, “Comment resolutions for clause 4”, Alfred Asterjadhi (Qualcomm):**

This submission proposes resolutions for multiple comments related to TGba D2.0 with the following CIDs (4 CIDs): 3036, 3092, 3137, 3140

CID 3036: No discussion.

CID 3092: Some discussion regarding the reason for rejection the comment. The proposed text in the resolution is updated based on this discussion, but the comment is still Rejected.

CID 3137: No discussion.

CID 3140: No discussion.

Document 11-19/1057r1 will be ready for motion.

**11-19/1058r0, “Comment resolutions for 29.5 and 29.9”, Alfred Asterjadhi (Qualcomm):**

This submission proposes resolutions for multiple comments related to TGba D2.0 with the following CIDs (5 CIDs):

* 3051, 3078, 3099, 3102, 3060

CID 3051: Q: There is a typo in the proposed resolution. It says 212, rather than 2^12. Based on this comment the resolution is updated accordingly.

CID 3060: No discussion.

CID 3078: No discussion.

CID 3099: No discussion.

CID 3102: No discussion.

Document 11-19/1058r1 will be ready for motion.

**11-19/1058r0, “Comment resolutions for Clause 11”, Alfred Asterjadhi (Qualcomm):**

This submission proposes resolutions for multiple comments related to TGba D2.0 with the following CIDs (1 CIDs):

* 3400

CID 3400: Q: Should we add vendor specific?

 Answer (A): I don’t think so. It is not mentioned in the baseline text.

Document 11-19/1059r0 is ready for motion.

**11-19/1050r0, “11ba D3.0 MAC Comment Resolution for WUR Duty Cycle”, (Po-Kai Huang, Intel):** This submission proposes resolutions for comments of TGba Draft D3.0 with the following CIDs: 3033, 3107, 3110

CID 3033: No discussion.

CID 3107: No discussion.

CID 3110: No discussion.

Document 11-19/1050r0 is ready for motion.

**11-19/1052r0, “11ba D3.0 MAC Comment Resolution for Wake-up Operation”, (Po-Kai Huang, Intel):** This submission proposes resolutions for comments of TGba Draft D3.0 with the following CIDs: 3012, 3039, 3061, 3087, 3155, 3380, 3105, 3144, 3157, 3158, 3159, 3379

CID 3012: Q: How does the STA know it is in range?

 A: I did not realize this comment was about range.

As a result, this comment is deferred and removed from the document.

CID 3039: No discussion.

CID 3061: Q: Have you checked with security experts about this?

 A: I believe it is fine.

CID 3087: No discussion.

CID 3155: Q: Just to clarify. The main comment is not about what happens within a single TXOP, but rather that it can occur over several TXOPs.

Run out of time.

1. **Meeting is adjourned at 7.03 pm (ET).**

**List of Attendees:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Minyoung Park | Intel |
| 2 | Leif Wilhelmsson | Ericsson |
| 3 | Po-Kai Huang | Intel |
| 4 | Joseph Levy | Interdigital |
| 7 | Yunsong Yang | Huawei |
| 8 | Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm |
| 9 | Jeongki Kim | LGE |

**Teleconference on Monday, July 8, 2019, 11:00 pm –1:00 am (ET)**

**Agenda:**

1. Call meeting to order
2. Agenda setting
3. Patent policy (link at the end of the email)
4. Attendance: send email to the chair or secretary (leif.r.wilhelmsson@ericsson.com)
5. Presentations:

- 19/1052r0 CR for Wake-up Operation (Po-Kai Huang, Intel) - continue

        - 19/1029r0 D3.0 comment resolution on group ID (Lei Huang, Panasonic)

        - 11-19-1067: CRs for WUR Discovery CIDs (Rojan Chitrakar, Panasonic)

        - 11-19-1068: CRs for Clause 6.3 MLME SAP CIDs ( Rojan Chitrakar, Panasonic)

          -  19/1065r0 –“PHY CR for Clause 30” (Vinod Kristem, Intel Corporation)

            -  19/1124r0 CR for Comment Resolution for WUR Beacon and Synchronization Part II (Po-Kai Huang, Intel)
6. Adjourn

Please note that teleconferences are bound by the conditions stipulated by the documentation below.  Please review them and bring up any questions/concerns you may have before proceeding with the teleconference:

IEEE Patent Policy - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>
Patent FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/faq.pdf>
LoA Form - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/loa.pdf>
Affiliation FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliationFAQ.html>
Anti-Trust FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/resources/antitrust-guidelines.pdf>
Ethics - <http://www.ieee.org/portal/cms_docs/about/CoE_poster.pdf>
IEEE 802.11 Working Group Operations Manual –
<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/09/11-09-0002-16-0000-802-11-operations-manual.doc>

The conduct of this meeting is governed by IEEE, IEEE-SA and IEEE LMSC policies, which include:
- IEEE Patent Policy
- Ethics
- 802 LMSC P&P
- 802LMSC Operations Manual (OM) Links to the documents or web-pages describing the policies may be found here: <http://www.ieee802.org/11/Rules/rules.shtml>.
The following documents provide additional information on the governing IEEE-SA policies:
- Patent FAQ (<http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/patents.pdf>)
- Affiliation FAQ (<http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliation.html>)
- Anti-Trust FAQ (<http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/antitrust.pdf>)
In addition, the conduct of this meeting is governed by IEEE 802.11 Operations Manual (OM), which is also linked from here: <http://www.ieee802.org/11/Rules/rules.shtml>.

1. **Chair Minyoung Park (Intel) calls the meeting to order at 11:03 pm (ET).**
2. Minyoung goes through the proposed agenda and asks if there are any questions or comments. Po-Kai asks if contribution 1124 , which only contains one CID, can be presented directly after 1052. There are no objections to this request, so the agenda will updated accordingly.
3. Minyoung reminds about the IEEE patent policy and ask if there are any questions with respect to this. No questions asked.
4. Minyoung reminds about attendance.
5. Presentations:

**11-19/1052r2, “11ba D3.0 MAC Comment Resolution for Wake-up Operation”, (Po-Kai Huang, Intel):** This submission proposes resolutions for comments of TGba Draft D3.0 with the following CIDs: 3012, 3039, 3061, 3087, 3155, 3380, 3105, 3144, 3157, 3158, 3159, 3379

This is a continuation of the presentation from the last telco. The document is now in revision 2.

CID 3155: No discussion.

CID 3380: No discussion.

CID 3105: No discussion.

CID 3144: Resolution text slightly updated. The comment should be directed to TGmd, rather than revmd.

CID 3157: Question/Comment (Q): regarding the note, if this is the sentence as in 29.1, do we need to state it once again?

 As a consequence, the note is slightly updated, not so specifically refer to 29.1

CID 3201: Q: I believe the resolution does the opposite to what is suggested in the comment. Should it then not be Rejected, rather than Revised?

As a result, the resolution is slightly updated so that it reads agree in principle with the comment, rather than agree in principle with the commenter.

CID 3158: The resolution is updated along the same line as CID 3201, i.e., agree in principle with the comment rather than with the commenter.

CID 3159: No discussion.

CID 3379: Q: I believe you need to include Nontransmitter ID as well.

 Answer (A): I agree.

 Q: I believe you should remove “Agree in principle”

 A: OK.

Document 11-19/1052r3 will be ready for motion.

**11-19/1124r0, “11ba D3.0 MAC Comment Resolution for WUR Beacon and Synchronization Part II”, (Po-Kai Huang, Intel):** This submission proposes resolutions for comments of TGba Draft D3.0 with the following CIDs: 3029

Q: I don’t believe this can be normative text, but a note at most.

Q: I support making it a note.

A: I have tried to make this as a compromise. It is clear that the use case this relates to is very important for the commenter.

Q: I sympathize with the commenter, but I still believe it is a problem that he wants to make it a requirement.

Q: I believe this follows the process, and this is an attempt to satisfy the commenter such that he can vote Yes to the draft.

Based on the discussion the proposed test in the resolution is slightly updated.

Document 11-19/1124r1 will be ready for motion.

**11-19/1029r0, “11ba D3.0 Comment Resolution for Group ID”, Lei Huang (Panasonic):** This submission proposes resolutions for the following comments from the letter ballot on P802.11ba D3.0: 7 CIDs: 3079, 3093, 3108, 3118, 3142, 3197, 3376

CID 3376: No discussion.

CID 3197: No discussion.

CID 3079: Q: If you accept the proposed resolution, there is not need to specifically instruct the editor.

 Q: The work shall is typically not used like this.

 As a result of this comment, the resolution is changed from Accepted to Revised, and the text slightly updated.

CID 3118: No discussion.

CID 3093: Q: I don’t think your proposed resolution addresses the comment.

 After some discussion about the wording it is decided to defer this CID.

CID 3108: No discussion.

CID 3142: Deferred.

Document 11-19/1029r1 will be ready for motion (containing 5 CIDs as two of the original 7 have been deferred).

**11-19/1067r0, “Comment Resolutions for WUR Discovery CIDs”, Rojan Chitrakar (Panasonic):** This submission proposes resolutions of comments received from TGba comment collection (TGba Draft 3.0): CIDs: 3044, 3062, 3073, 3190 (4 CIDs)

CID 3044: No discussion.

CID 3062: No discussion.

CID 3073: No discussion.
CID 3190: Q: I believe the wording is not correct. It should not say “set to the length”, it should be “set according to the length” or similar.

 Based on this comment, the proposed resolution is updated. Also 9.10.3.4 is updated accordingly.

Document 11-19/1067r1 will be ready for motion.

1. **Meeting is adjourned at 1.05 am (ET).**

**List of Attendees:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Minyoung Park | Intel |
| 2 | Leif Wilhelmsson | Ericsson |
| 3 | Po-Kai Huang | Intel |
| 4 | Lei Huang | Panasonic |
| 5 | Yunsong Yang | Huawei |
| 6 | Rojan Chitrakar | Panasonic |
| 7 | Vinod Kristem | Intel |
| 8 | Bo Sun | ZTE |
| 9 | Al Petrick |  |